

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2022
LONG BEACH WATER DEPARTMENT
1800 E. WARDLOW RD. LONG BEACH, CA
90807, 9:00 AM**

Joen Garnica, President
Erik Fallis, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISH AGENDA AND MINUTES

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 9:16 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

Tarsha Moses representing Civil Service led the flag salute.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler,
Present: Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

There were no comments from the public at this time.

**2. [22-260CS](#) Recommendation to approve minutes:
*Special Meeting of August 31, 2022***

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond,
seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve
recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne
Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 - 7):

Passed the Consent Calendar

Commissioner Arias pulled items 3 & 4, and Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond pulled item 5.

A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve Consent Calendar Items 6 and 7, except for items 3, 4, and 5. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

3. [22-262CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Public Health Nutritionist I-III

Senior Survey Technician - REVISED

Commissioner Arias wanted an explanation about the date, May 31, by which the applicants had to meet all requirements to file. Commissioner Arias explained that she assumes that on a bulletin, the closing date would be the date by which the applicant would have had to have met the required experience. Still, in this case, it looks like the date was retroactively added, which could be arbitrary. Ms. Pizarro Winting explained that it is very common in promotional exams because the staff wants to ensure that all employees qualify at the appropriate time. In some instances, the staff and department set a date but later found out that an employee was a month short of qualifying for an exam, and Ms. Pizarro Winting expressed that departments need to assist the staff with this information. Ms. Cano added the need for transparency as to when an applicant should have met those requirements and the maximum number of applicants to be eligible for the exam. Ms. Pizarro Winting mentioned that it also allows the staff to start the exam process, as opposed to waiting for candidates to meet the time period, and the exam does not get started until after the fact. Commissioner Arias commented that it would have been fine had it been in the original bulletin but now adding a day seemed to be anti-merit based and asked if the candidates that met the May 31 deadline are included in the exam results. Ms. McDonald responded that the exam did not occur until after the actual administration, meaning the candidate would have met the requirements before the test was administered. Further discussion between the Commission and staff continued about the exam results. Commissioner Arias wanted the Commission to be aware that when the Senior Survey Technician promotional exam results had been reported that the candidate affected had been included.

The Commission thanked the staff for their transparency by bringing this item forward and correcting the error. President Garnica summarized that this was an error by the Civil Service department but checks and balances within the department allowed the staff to fix this error.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

4. [22-261CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Animal Health Technician (Registered Veterinary Technician) Test #01

Combination Building Inspector Test #01

Police Recruit Test #13

Refuse Operator I-III Test #35

Senior Survey Technician (Promotional)

Special Services Officer I-IV Test #66

Supervisor - Waste Operations (Promotional)

Commissioner Arias thanked the staff for adding the number of openings and each exam result report because it helps to provide an important perspective on the lists. President Garnica reiterated Commissioner Arias' comments.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

5. [22-263CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Jackie Gantt, School Guard, Public Works, (19 yrs., 10 mos.)
Israel Ramirez, Police Sergeant, Police Department, (23 yrs., 3 mos.)
Usha Pocha, Public Health Nutritionist I, Health and Human Services (14 yrs., 4 days)
Richard Davis, Senior Equipment Operator, Parks, Recreation and Marine, (40 yrs. 1 mo.)
James Owen, Fire Captain, Fire Department, (22 yrs., 5 mos.)
Tamara Reed, Accounting Clerk III, Energy Resources, (36 yrs., 4 mos.)

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond and President Garnica highlighted the individuals on the retirement list and thanked for the many years of service to the City.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

6. 22-264CS

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Johan Linares-Vazquez, Police Recruit, Police Department, (1 day)
Antonio Ochoa, Clerk Typist III, Police Department, (3 yrs., 6 mos.)
Sydney Stoddard, Police Recruit, Police Department, (8 days)
Saira Qazi, Systems Technician II, Technology Services, (4 yrs., 5 mos.)
Terese Torres, Personnel Analyst I-CONF, Human Resources, (1 yrs., 1 mos.)
Sergio Ramon, Refuse Operator I, Public Works, (1 yr., 3 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. 22-265CS **Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):**
Suspension Appeal 02-S-2021, Suggested Date November 30, 2022

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

8. 22-256CS **RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF HEARING OFFICER'S REPORT** 13-S-1920, August 23, 2022
Report prepared by Richard R. Terzian, Attorney at Law

President Garnica emphasized a typographical error on the last page of the report. The report says "Richard Luna" when it should read "Robert Luna." Staff acknowledged the error and assured the Commission it would be reflected in the minutes.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

9. [22-257CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REINSTATEMENT OF
NAME TO ELIGIBLE LIST** - Alexis Martinez, Electrical and

Instrumentation Technician

*Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager,
Water Department*

Staff report prepared by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Moses, who briefed the Commission on the item.

President Garnica asked if this case was that the candidate might not be the right fit since past requests have included employees that might have missed an exam. Ms. Stoudenmire responded that the department did extend his probation period, but the department had reached its limit of extensions. If the candidate receives one of the certifications, the department will consider reselecting the candidate. President Garnica commented that it would be helpful if that information is provided in the staff report so that the Commission knows that an opportunity was given to the candidate. Ms. Pizarro Winting mentioned that the final opportunity for the candidate is to return to the list and applauded the department for not requesting a third extension because the Commission has questioned continued extensions. President Garnica reiterated Ms. Pizarro Winting's comments and added that this information should be added to the reports.

**A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by
Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The
motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne
Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

10. [22-258CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL
APPOINTMENT** - Recycling Specialist I-II, Dalia Gonzalez

Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the Commission on the item.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked if a provisional appointee has the opportunity to apply for the position and Ms. Pizarro Winting answered that an appointee can apply for the position.

A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

11. [22-259CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL
APPOINTMENT** - Recycling Specialist I-II, Michelle Anna Keshishia

Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the Commission on the item.

A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

12. STANDING COMMITTEES

- A. Executive Committee**
- B. Recruitment and Selection Committee**
- C. Special Projects Committee**

A. Executive Committee

President Garnica informed the Commission that the committee is looking for a new date.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that the committee is looking for a new date.

C. Special Projects Committee

No report at this time.

13. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division – Crystal Slaten

B. Employment Services Division – Caprice McDonald

C. Administration and Support Services Division – Maria Alamo

D. Executive Director – Christina Pizarro Winting

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten updated the Commission on the events that the team is participating in such as the Engineering and Technology job fair, the USC job fair, Beach Streets, and the Asian Pacific Islander festival. Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that any details for upcoming events would be provided by Ms. Smay.

Vice President Fallis asked if the team was aware of the Fourth Fridays on Fourth Street, and Ms. Slaten commented that she was aware and would connect with Vice President Fallis for more details. President Garnica mentioned the First Fridays in Bixby Knolls. Ms. Slaten mentioned that the team has spoken about this event and is trying to determine if attendance is possible.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald updated the Commission about the NeoGov training offered to the Administrative Officers and the attendance and information provided during this meeting. President Garnica asked if there were a lot of questions from those attending this meeting. Ms. McDonald answered that there were six follow-up questions, and the staff provided a handout prior to training, so questions were minimal.

C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo informed the Commission that the City Council adopted the budget, which means the department will be able to hire two Personnel Analysts and one Personnel Assistant. Ms. Alamo provided additional information on the close of the fiscal year and stated she will bring a presentation to the Commission on this matter closer to December or January. President Garnica expressed her excitement about the new positions being added to the department.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting reiterated the excitement to have these roles added to the department. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that more training will be provided for the next fiscal year now that the department will be fully staff. This will allow the Recruitment and Outreach Division to continue doing the outreach while training and educating potential candidates as they attend events.

Ms. Pizarro Winting updated the Commission on the work being done by the Long Beach Coast Executive Steering Committee. The Committee has decided to change vendors and not use MUNIS for the HRMS system.

Ms. Pizarro Winting provided information on the disruption to meetings law that was recently brought to City Council. Ms. Kilaita added that she had recently written a memo about this matter and will share it with Ms. Pizarro Winting to share with the Commission.

Ms. Pizarro Winting shared that she attended the 9/11 Memorial on behalf of the Commission and added that the City is celebrating Hispanic Heritage Month.

14. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

No unfinished business at this time.

15. NEW BUSINESS

No new business at this time.

16. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

There were no comments from the public at this time.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:13 a.m.

I, Julia Smay, Executive Assistant, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

HEARING 10:00 A.M.

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។