

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 3, 2022
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
CIVIC CHAMBERS, 9:00 AM**

Joen Garnica, President
Erik Fallis, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES

President Garnica called the Civil Service Commission's meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

Michelle Wilson representing Financial Management led the flag salute.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Present:

Commissioners Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Absent:

1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION'S JURISDICTION

There were no comments from the public at this time.

2. [22-215CS](#)

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of July 20, 2022

Commissioner Arias made an amendment to Agenda Item 10. The minutes read as follow:

A discussion occurred between Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the selective certification process, how it works, whether the selection process, and the Commission's role in the authorization of the names of that meet the higher level for consideration.

Commissioner Arias suggested that a comma be added to simplify the statement. The new suggested changes will read as follow:

A discussion occurred between Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the selective certification process, and the Commission's role in the authorization of the names.

A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve the minutes for the Regular Meeting of July 20, 2022, as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 - 11):

Passed the Consent Calendar

Commissioner Arias pulled items 3 and 7.

Ms. Pizarro Winting pulled item 4.

A motion was made by to approve Consent Calendar Items 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, & 11, except for items 3, 4, & 7. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

3. [22-216CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Business Systems Specialist I-VII (ERP Financial Systems Supervisor) Test #03
Business Systems Specialist I-VII (GIS Program Manager) Test #03
Business Systems Specialist I-VII (Permitting Systems Administrator) Test #03
Civil Engineer Test #29
*Fire Engineer (**PROMOTIONAL**)*
Licensed Vocational Nurse Test #02
Microbiologist I-III Test #03
*Parking Control Supervisor (**PROMOTIONAL**)*
Police Officer - Lateral Test #28
Police Recruit Test #11
Public Health Nurse I-III Test #02
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN EXAM Test #32
Refuse Operator I-III Test #34
Registered Nurse I-II Test #03
Senior Civil Engineer Test #03
Special Services Officer I-IV Test #64

Commissioner Arias mentioned she was pleased 11 candidates qualified for the Fire Engineer exam.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

4. [22-217CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Animal Health Technician

Aquatics Supervisor I-II

Buyer I-II

Environmental Health Specialist I-IV

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that a revision was made to the Buyer I-II bulletin. The final bulletin should reflect the date following this Commission Agenda since the bulletin needs approval from the Commission.

A motion was made Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve item number four, recommendation to approve the bulletins, from the consent calendar, as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

5. 22-218CS

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Sokhom In, School Guard, Public Works, (8 yrs., 24 days)

Williams Gidget, Customer Service Representative II, Health and Human Services (21 yrs., 11 mos)

Juan Mercado Gas, Construction Worker II, Energy Resources (24 yrs., 1 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. 22-219CS

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst III, Civil Service, (6 yrs., 10 mos)

Dian Tanuwidjaja, Senior Program Manager-Water, Water Department, (8 yrs., 3 mos)

Bradley Rohrer, Water Treatment Operator II, Water Department, (5 yrs., 10 mos)

Eric Jensen Water, Treatment Operator III, Water Department, (3 mos., 24 days)

Olegario Rodriguez, Combination Building Inspector, Development Services, (3 yrs., 8 mos)

Laura Ishizaka, Senior Librarian, Library Services, (1 yr., 5 mos)

Matthew George Maintenance Assistant I, Parks, Recreation, and Marine (2 yrs., 6 mos)

Matthew Calub, Public Safety Dispatcher III, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications Department (11 yrs., 9 mos.)

Monique Contreras Systems Technician II, Technology Services (1 yr., 5 mos.)

Luis Loera-Martinez, Traffic Signal Technician I, Public Works, (2 yrs., 10 mos.)

Beau Ligon, Traffic Signal Technician I, Public Works, (5 mos, 29 days)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [22-220CS](#)

COVID-19: RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND NON-CAREER

HOURS - Jorge Martinez, Public Health Associate-NC

*Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer,
Human and Health Services*

Staff Report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

Commissioner Arias pointed out that this extension is retroactive, and the results have brought a new threshold for the Health Department to evaluate the number of hours accumulating for Non-Career. Ms. Pizarro Winting agreed and mentioned that the staff is working with the Health Department so this situation will not happen again and acknowledged the importance of these positions to the ongoing pandemic.

Commissioner Wheeler asked if there has been any consideration in making these individuals permanent employees since extensions continue to be brought to the Commission. Ms. Pizarro Winting mentioned that this would be up to the Health Department. These are not budgeted positions, and the roles were formed as a result of the emergency, so once the emergency is over, the position would also be over. Mr. Bruhanski added that the department initially did not consider these roles to be full-time due to funding limitation. He explained that part of the reason why these individuals continue to be Non-Career is that they may not always be working full time, but if an individual works an average of 40 hours each week, there might be a better case to seriously consider the full time option. He concluded that he would discuss with management, within the Bureau, and see how to address this matter and mitigate the number of requests that have come before the Commission. President Garnica thanked Mr. Bruhanski for taking this matter back to the Health Department team.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

8. [22-221CS](#) **COVID-19: RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND NON-CAREER HOURS** - Vivian Magallanes, Public Health Associate-NC
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Human and Health Services
Staff Report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

9. [22-222CS](#) **COVID-19: RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND NON-CAREER HOURS** - Vanessa Nappi, Public Health Associate-NC
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Human and Health Services
Staff Report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

10. [22-223CS](#) **COVID-19: RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND NON-CAREER HOURS** - Lizbeth Orozco, Public Health Associate-NC
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Human and Health Services
Staff Report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

11. [22-224CS](#) **COVID-19: RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND NON-CAREER HOURS** - Melissa Palacios, Public Health Associate-NC
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Human and Health Services
Staff Report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

12. [22-227CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL

APPOINTMENT -Recreation Assistant, Michael Quijada

*Sheryl Bender, Personnel and Training Superintendent, Parks,
Recreation and Marine Department*

Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Herrera who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Arias asked about the difficulty in the time it took for Mr. Quijada to apply and to come to the Commission for approval. Ms. Martinez, representing the department, explained that this is one of three provisional appointments and, in the time it took to go through the provisional process, other vacancies became available. Along with this recruitment, the department was processing requisitions and submitting provisional requests for two additional vacancies. The Department found it best to wait a few weeks until the other provisional appointments were completed and place the proper candidates in the right positions and submit them all at the same time. Commissioner Arias asked if any of the candidates have started in the position of Recreation Assistant, and Ms. Martinez confirmed that they have not started in the position, but they might have been assisting in the roles to fill the duties because the positions have been vacated, but the position has not been filled yet. Commissioner Arias asked if the signed Provisional Appointment of Conditions form is always completed prior to the item coming to Commission for approval, and Ms. Pizarro Winting confirmed that this form is signed prior to approval.

A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

13. [22-226CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL

APPOINTMENT -Recreation Assistant, Jasmine Smith

*Sheryl Bender, Personnel and Training Superintendent, Parks,
Recreation and Marine Department*

Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Herrera who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

14. [22-225CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL

APPOINTMENT -Recreation Assistant, Maria Gutierrez

*Sheryl Bender, Personnel and Training Superintendent, Parks,
Recreation and Marine Department*

Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Herrera who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

15. [22-228CS](#)

**REPORT FROM CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION SPECIAL
PROJECTS COMMITTEE REGARDING MODIFICATION TO
CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

*Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive
Director*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Vice President Erik Fallis who
briefed the Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by
Commissioner Wheeler, receive and file the recommendation
from Civil Service Commission Special Projects Committee
regarding modification to consent agenda items. A formal
recommendation to modify the consent agenda items will be
brought to the next Commission meeting for approval. The
motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen
Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**16. 22-229CS PRESENTATION REGARDING AN OVERVIEW OF THE
RECRUITMENT AND OUTREACH SERVICES DIVISION**

Presentation by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director

President Garnica introduced Ms. Slaten who briefed the commission on this item.

President Garnica congratulated Ms. Slaten on being fully staffed, while Vice President Fallis asked Ms. Slaten to introduce her staff. She introduced Ociris Lugo, who's in charge of the Bilingual Skill Pay Assessment Program and highlighted all the great contributions that Ms. Lugo has brought to the team. She introduced Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst, who's in charge of Recruitment and Marketing, and highlighted Ms. Tamura's work in implementing new recruitment and marketing strategies. Although not present, Ms. Slaten introduced Isela Gonzalez, who she described as the "backbone of the unit". Ms. Gonzalez oversees front desk operations as well as all administrative work for the unit and is also the first point of contact for the organization. Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that this team is very well versed in the City and they come with broad knowledge but intimate awareness of what the City does and needs.

Vice President Fallis asked if there has been in a thought in partnering with community organization like the LGBTQ+ Pride Center for further outreach, and Ms. Slaten confirmed that partnering with LGBTQ+ Pride Center can happen and she will keep the Commission posted on outreach efforts with this organization.

Commissioner Arias asked if Ms. Slaten could provide examples of some current ongoing relationships with community organizations. Ms. Slaten mentioned partnerships with organizations like Centro CHA, the Neighborhood Resource Center, and the team has been in talks to join all the neighborhood associations. Ms. Slaten also mentioned that the team is working on their recruitment list, which would help send current and future opportunities to individuals and organizations. Commissioner Wheeler mentioned the groups that she has referred to the team, such as The Taste of Soul and Uptown Jazz Festival and asked the team if the Commission can continue to refer more organizations to the team. Ms. Slaten was happy to receive referrals from the Commission and mentioned that the team

will be at the Uptown Jazz Festival.

President Garnica asked about the work being done with the Long Beach City College, and Ms. Slaten mentioned that team will be meeting Dr. Munoz, Superintendent-President of Long Beach City College, to discuss better recruitment from LBCC directly. The LBCC team provided Ms. Slaten with a list of all the certification programs that LBCC offers, and Ms. Slaten will meet with LBCC to provide them with the classifications that City currently has that match LBCC's current certification programs to provide students a potential opportunity with the City. President Garnica mentioned that this could potentially identify any opportunities where there may not have a program or certification available in high need jobs for the City of Long Beach, and Ms. Slaten agreed that with these opportunities the organization can create further opportunities for the City and the students.

President Garnica mentioned Margaret Madden with the Neighborhood Resource Center, who worked was the point person for the rent relief program, and asked Ms. Slaten if she knew how Ms. Madden was distributing the information about jobs to the public. Ms. Slaten explained that Ms. Madden has an email distribution list with 10,000 individuals on it, as well as various groups and an online neighborhood directory. President Garnica asked if Neighborhood Resource Center has a schedule on the email blasts, and Ms. Slaten explained that the team will be sending the center information about hard to recruit positions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to receive and file the presentation regarding an overview of the Recruitment and Outreach Services Division. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

17. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

C. Special Projects Committee

A. Executive Committee

President Garnica informed the Commission that the Executive Committee will be meeting after the Commission meeting.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

There are no reports at this time.

C. Special Projects Committee

There are no reports at this time.

18. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division – Crystal Slaten

B. Employment Services Division – Caprice McDonald

C. Administration and Support Services Division – Maria Alamo

D. Executive Director – Christina Pizarro Winting

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten updated on work being done with Centro CHA, the military recruitment event for current military and veterans at the Convention Center, the upcoming Uptown Jazz Festival, and the Second Annual Female Firefighter Recruit Information Session. Vice President Fallis asked if a complete calendar of events could be provided to the Commission, and Ms. Slaten acknowledged the request.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald thanked Ms. Slaten for a great presentation. She also thanked her team for the great exam results since all the hard work ensures that there are qualified candidates for open recruitment opportunities. Ms. McDonald highlighted her newest team member, Tarsha Moses, for her work as lead in the Civil Engineer exam. Ms. McDonald informed that another in person Police Recruit Pellet B exam, was hosted at the police academy and it was well attended and is expected to continue on a monthly basis. Ms McDonald also thanked her staff for all the work done and the fast turnaround on critical job bulletins.

President Garnica asked the Civil Service staff to please stand and thanked everyone for their hard work and expressed the Commission's appreciation for what they do. She also wanted to make sure that the message is passed along to the staff members not present at the meeting.

C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo provided answers to the questions posed by President Garnica and Vice President Fallis during her Non-Career presentation. President Garnica inquired about the statistics of the scheduled hours presented for 2014, and Ms. Alamo explained that the findings showed that there was an increase of 67 Non-Career and an increase of 4300 Non-Career hours. While looking at the different departments, the biggest increase came from the departments of Public Works, Police, Parks, Recreation, and Marine. The department of Parks, Recreation, and Marine had an increase in recreation leaders, and the Police Department doubled their investigator's hours which triggered the increase in 2014. Vice President Fallis asked about the history of the Non-Career title, and the team found that the former Director of Human Resources, Bill Story, worked with the Civil Service management to create the Non Career work status to assist departments in meeting temporary

workload as referenced in Civil Service procedure 2.32. As to the origin of the term Non-Career, the team was not able to determine where the term originated but mentioned that other government agencies use it as well. Ms. Alamo expressed her excitement for the upcoming Fiscal Year 2023 Budget presentation that she and her team are working on for the August 17 Commission meeting and invited the Commission to participate in the Budget Hearings starting on August 9. She will have Ms. Smay send out the hearing dates to the Commission.

Vice President Fallis expressed that there was no reason to call a position Non-Career and would be interested in the scope of work it would take to change that language. Ms. Alamo will reach out to Human Resources to look at the class specification and perform further research on a potential name change. Ms. McDonald added that Non-Careers are best described as temporary contingent employees with the City.

President Garnica asked, in regard to her question about the 2014 increase in Non-Career, if the staff knew why there was an increase of hours for the Parks and Recreation Department. Ms. Alamo explained that the department received additional funding in 2014 to fund the youth programs that year. President Garnica expressed her appreciation that Ms. Alamo brought this information back to the Commission.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting wanted to recognize the Personnel Analysts for all the exam results, and congratulations to Ms. Moses for getting her first exam result on the books. Ms. Pizarro Winting highlighted all the work that each division is doing for the department.

Ms. Pizarro Winting discussed the recent budget press conference and the questions about new positions being introduced to the City while there are many vacancies that currently exist and how this will be addressed. The City Manager shared that because the City is a public entity and has a merit system, which creates a fair process, but takes a little longer to hire, more resources are being given to the Civil Service Department to assist with the hiring process. She expressed her enthusiasm for the upcoming budget presentation, the communication specialist report, the race and gender designation report, and the presentation from the Office of Constitutional Policing.

President Garnica expressed her excitement about the race and gender designation report.

19. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

President Garnica asked if the staff has a timeline with the request from Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond from the previous meeting, and Ms. Pizarro Winting confirmed that a meeting is scheduled for August 31 as requested by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond.

20. NEW BUSINESS

Commissioner Arias inquired about potentially moving Commission meetings to hybrid mode and having a report on the status of requirements for meetings.

President Garnica announced that, based on the room capacity, the next Civil Service hearing has been moved to the Water Department, as well as the next Civil Service Commission Meeting. President Garnica informed the Commission that Ms. Pizarro Winting is gathering information in regard to having hearings virtually and the potential of having virtual Commission meetings on dates that do not have scheduled hearings. Ms. Pizarro Winting clarified the Commission can have Commission meetings virtually or hybrid. Hearings cannot be done virtually because the meet and confer process has not been completed. Ms. Pizarro Winting is waiting on an update from Human Resources on this matter. President Garnica wanted to confirm that this is the only piece pending since there is a policy and procedure. Ms. Pizarro Winting agreed and mentioned that there must be a meeting with the impacted bargaining groups now.

A discussion took place between the Commission, Ms. Pizarro Winting, and Mr. Anderson in regard to the potential of having virtual meetings, the Commissioner's preferences on meetings going forward, and the use of Personal Protective Equipment during meetings for the Commission, staff, and audience. Further discussion about this matter will take place at the next Commission meeting.

President Garnica reiterated that the next hearing and Commission meeting will be at the Water Department and will highly encourage everyone to wear a mask.

President Garnica announced changes to the current procedures for recognizing retirees. Beginning this month, the Commission will recognize retired employees with 20 years of service or more. Staff will reach out to retirees with 20 years or more years of service on today's agenda and invite them to the next meeting. President Garnica expressed her appreciation for everyone that gives to the City of Long Beach.

21. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

There were no comments from the public at this time.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:34 a.m.

I, Julia Smay, Executive Assistant, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។