

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, JUNE 9, 2021  
TELECONFERENCE, 8:30 AM**

Joel Garnica, President  
Brandon Dowling, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner  
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**SPECIAL MEETING**

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE HELD VIA  
TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20  
ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM.**

**THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC.**

**PLEASE VIEW THE MEETING FROM YOUR COMPUTER, TABLET, OR  
SMARTPHONE VIA: [https://longbeach.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view\\_id=84](https://longbeach.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=84)**

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Garnica asked Principal Deputy City Attorney Gary Anderson to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond,  
**Present:** Brandon Dowling and Joel Garnica

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO  
ADDRESS THE COMMISSION BY SUBMITTING WRITTEN COMMENTS VIA EMAIL TO  
[MARLA.CAMERINO@LONGBEACH.GOV](mailto:MARLA.CAMERINO@LONGBEACH.GOV).**

There were no comments received from the public.

2. [21-173CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Special Meeting of May 19, 2021*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez  
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 9):**

Vice President Dowling pulled Agenda Item 3 and Commissioner Arias pulled Agenda Item 4 for separate discussions.

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve Consent Calendar Items (5 - 9), except for Items ( 3 - 4). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez  
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

3. [21-174CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Airport Operations Assistant I-II*  
*Civil Engineering Assistant Test #01*  
*Electrical and Instrumentation Supervisor Test #01*  
*Electrical and Instrumentation Technician I-II Test #01*  
*Planning Aide*  
*School Guard Test #03*  
*Senior Librarian Test #03*

Vice President Dowling asked staff to provide more information

regarding the Planning Aide examination result. He stated that out of the 300 applicants who applied, only 16 were qualified and more than 100 were eliminated during the Training and Education questionnaire. Ms. Tamura responded that due to the number of applicants and to make it more fair and equitable, a Training and Education questionnaire was added. She stated that a total of 54 individuals did not submit responses and another 112 individuals did not move forward in the process based on an analysis of their responses to the questionnaire and application. Of the 22 remaining applicants, six did not report. Ms. Pizarro Winting added that along with the application, analysts use supplemental questions. She stated that analysts work with the hiring departments and subject matter experts to identify specific questions that can be included as part of the supplemental questions in order to get more details from the candidates.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

4. [21-175CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**

*Laboratory Analyst I-III*

*Tree Trimmer I-II*

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if the word "school" could be removed from the Requirements to File section. She feels that this limits applicants who have been trained through the International Society of Arboriculture (ISA). She stated that ISA is not a school program but more of an association who provides training in tree science. She stated that applicants with ISA training would not be able to use it to substitute for the six months of required experience. Rob Pfingsthorn and Willie Owens of the Department of Public Works agreed that removing the word "school" should be okay. Mr. Owens stated that they look for arborists to be certified through ISA.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reiterated a change that was previously provided to the Commission. She stated that under the Requirements to File section, staff removed the words "recent, within 3 years" and added the word "professional."

A discussion took place with Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Mr. Anderson regarding whether the Tree Trimmer bulletin should be pulled. It was clarified that the changes Ms. Pizarro Winting discussed were previously approved by the bargaining unit. It was discussed that because the additional change is substantive, the item should be pulled and brought back to the Commission after the bargaining unit has had a chance to review it.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Agenda Item 4 as amended with removal of Tree Trimmer I-II bulletin. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

5. [21-176CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Patricia Feenstra, School Guard, Public Works Department  
(17 yrs., 5 mos.)*

*Catarino Grijalva, Welder, Financial Management Department  
(32 yrs., 8 mos.)*

*Ricky Lepire, Storekeeper II, Technology and Innovation  
Department (20 yrs., 3 mos.)*

*Zenaida Siruno-Savella, Environmental Health Specialist III,  
Health and Human Services Department (27 yrs., 11 mos.)*

*Gary Tabing, Senior Combination Building Inspector,  
Development Services Department (31 yrs., 1 mo.)*

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Pizarro Winting, acknowledged Catarino Grijalva for his 32 years, 8 months of dedicated service to the City of Long Beach. Ms. Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, and Mr. Ivan Ortega, Fleet Services Supervisor, both with the Financial Management Department, were on the call to congratulate and highlight Mr. Grijalva's career. The Commission congratulated Mr. Grijalva on his retirement.

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Pizarro Winting, acknowledged Zenaida Siruno-Savella for her 27 years, 11 months of dedicated service to the City of Long

Beach. Ms. Mozhgan Mofidi, Environmental Health Operations Officer with the Health and Human Services Department, was on the call to congratulate and highlight Ms. Siruno-Savella's career. The Commission congratulated Ms. Siruno-Savella on her retirement.

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [21-177CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file disability retirement(s):**

*James Kloss, Police Officer, Police Department (27 yrs., 8 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [21-178CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**

*Daisy Gonzalez, School Guard, Public Works Department (9 mos., 8 days)*

*Stephanie Gunawan-Piraner, Senior Civil Engineer, Harbor Department (4 yrs., 10 mos.)*

*Shaun Healy, Office Systems Analyst III, Harbor Department (5 yrs., 1 mo.)*

*Shannon Julius, Business Systems Specialist IV, Technology and Innovation Department (1 yr., 9 mos.)*

*Roya Khouie-Vargas, Criminalist II, Police Department (8 yrs., 11 mos.)*

*Christian Moody, Police Officer, Police Department (16 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Shannon Troutman, Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Harbor Department (3 yrs., 1 mo.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. [21-179CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve transfer(s):**

*Carolyn Pen-Chhuon - Administrative Analyst III-CNF, Civil Service Department to Administrative Analyst II, Harbor Department*

*Elise Roberts-Jannsch - Administrative Analyst I, Harbor*

*Department to Administrative Analyst II, Development Service  
Department*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the  
Consent Calendar.**

**9. [21-180CS](#)**

**Recommendation to Approve Provisional Appointment -**

Jorge Escobar, Payroll/Personnel Assistant II

*Communication from Paula Gallegos, Personnel Administrator,  
Police Department*

*Staff report prepared by Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the  
Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

**10. [21-181CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL  
APPOINTMENT - Senior Accountant**

*Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer,  
Financial Management Department*

*Staff report prepared by Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Davalos who briefed the  
Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the Financial Management Department was  
on the call to answer questions.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond believes that this should have  
been considered a COVID-19 related item as these positions will be  
playing a key role as it relates to the federal grants the City will be  
receiving. She stated that the City is collecting data related to the  
amount of time spent on COVID related items and Civil Service  
should also include its data so that the City can see how many items  
were COVID related. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that the  
Commission will begin to see a lot of requests for positions related to  
the Long Beach Recovery Act. She stated that the Long Beach

Recovery Act is still a part of COVID related items and will be sure to continue to flag future items.

**A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

11. [21-182CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO ADOPT NEW CLASSIFICATION, NEW CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION AND DIVISION OF CLASSIFICATION - Harbor Patrol Officer I-III**

*Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Human Resources Department*

*Staff report prepared by Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Ramos who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Representatives from the Human Resources and Harbor Departments were on the call to answer questions.

A discussion took place with Commissioner Wheeler, Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, Ms. Pizarro Winting, Mr. Anderson and Mr. Schneider regarding the probationary period of existing employees as well as training. It was clarified that existing employees would retain their seniority and salary and will not need to go through another probationary period, only newly hired employees. It was also clarified that if there are any newly hired employees still on probation in the current classification, they will complete their probation in their new classification. It was discussed that the training that is being referenced in the staff report, is the same type of training that required Commission approval to extend the probationary period. It was also discussed that if operations allow, existing employees could potentially be afforded the opportunity to participate in additional training. It was clarified that new hires would have one year to complete post training and field training.

Ms. Pizarro Winting pointed out that there are two requests within this item. She stated that one is to approve the classification and

the other is to divide the classification. She stated that a header should have been placed to show the separation.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if the special training that is required for grade levels II and III will be an in-service training. Mr. Schneider and Mr. Goldschmidt provided an overview of the special training. Mr. Goldschmidt stated that unlike previous training where the department was dependent on other agencies schedules, an internal training academy was developed through partnership with Long Beach City College exclusively for the Harbor Department. Commissioner Arias wanted clarification regarding the college course while working full-time. Mr. Goldschmidt responded that while employees are in training, they will not have additional employment duties assigned to them. Commissioner Arias asked for clarification regarding training for the different grade levels. Mr. Schneider responded that employees who are hired as a grade level II or III will go through the comprehensive training and those hired as a grade level I will go through a more abbreviated training program. He stated that if an employee who is in grade level I promotes to a higher grade, the employee will, at that time, go through the comprehensive training program which is a practice that the department currently uses.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know the difference between Harbor Patrol Officer and Special Services Officers. Mr. Schneider stated that Harbor Patrol Officer is a newly created position and is specific to the Harbor Department.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond recognized all the time and work that has been dedicated to this classification as it has been in the process for years. She wanted to make sure that what the Commission approves today reflects what the Commission's intent is. She stated that she liked the idea that Ms. Pizarro Winting suggested regarding separating the information and asked for clarification. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that there were two requests in this item. The first one is a request to adopt the classification and the second one is a request to divide the classification.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond made a motion to amend Page 2 of the staff report. A header will now be placed between the second and third bullets that will say Division of Classification.



**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation with the amendment of Page 2 of the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know if all the duties listed in the Example of Duties section apply to all grade levels or are there some specific to the different grade levels. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that typically with classification specifications the Examples of Duties section lists duties for the entire classification. She stated that staff have been working to identify the grade levels within this section so that people know what the expectations are. She stated that from a recruitment standpoint, staff want potential candidates to see the full scope of the classification. She said that we are working to also help define the various grade levels. Mr. Schneider stated that grade levels are separated under the Distinguishing Characteristic section. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that it would have been helpful to see the example of duties separated for each grade level as well. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that some duties go across all grade levels, but staff will look at it and have a discussion.

In the future, Commissioner Arias would like the training program for grade level I under Minimum Qualifications made a little clearer so that applicants are aware of what they are getting into. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that staff will look at this.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation as previously amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

**12. [21-183CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED  
CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Planner I-V**  
*Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Human*

*Resources Department*

*Staff report prepared by Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Tamura who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Representatives from the Human Resources and Development Services Departments were on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

**13. [21-184CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED**

**CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION** - Traffic Signal Coordinator

*Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Human*

*Resources Department*

*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Goings who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Representatives from the Public Works and Human Resources Departments were on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

**14. [21-185CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN(S):**

*Harbor Patrol Officer I-III*

*Planner I-V*

President Garnica stated that now that the revised classification specifications for Harbor Patrol Officer I-III and Planner I-V have been approved, she would like a motion to approve the bulletins.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

**15. [21-186CS](#)**

**REPOPULATION OF CITY FACILITIES**

*Communication from Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

**A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

**16. STANDING COMMITTEES**

*A. Executive Committee*

The Executive Committee did not have any new information to report.

*B. Recruitment and Selection Committee*

The Recruitment and Selection Committee did not have any new information to report. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that a meeting will be scheduled soon to discuss the minimum qualifications regarding education.

*C. Special Projects Committee*

Commissioner Arias reported that the Special Projects Committee met on June 2nd, where they took a tour of several rooms at the Harbor Department and City Hall. She stated that the committee would prefer to use the rooms at the Harbor Department to conduct the next in-person hearing that has been planned for July 7th, if the building will be open. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that it has not been made clear when Harbor will open its building. Commissioner Arias stated that the Commission may need to look at a third preference which is in City Hall. Commissioner Arias stated

that the committee also discussed the need to move forward with hearings and which hearing would be next. She stated that the committee is basically awaiting additional information from the City as to its protocols as well as Cal/OSHA's determination regarding wearing masks indoors, which is basically if all employees are vaccinated then masks are not necessary, but if even just one employee is not vaccinated, all employees would need to wear masks. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that her information is the same as what Commissioner Arias reported and confirmed that the City is still in the process of putting together its protocols. She stated that Mr. Anderson is involved in the discussion and will be able to lead and guide the Commission as it relates to protocols.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that the Water Department was an option in the past and asked if they were being looked at for hearings. President Garnica stated that the committee did not physically look at the site but did touch on it during its meeting. She stated that the location at City Hall was not satisfactory and proposed looking for another option if the Harbor Department is not open.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond is aware that City Council will be meeting in-person and asked if that meant that the Commission will be meeting in-person, where will the Commission meet and if there was a timeline. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that as soon as City Council begins meeting in-person, all Boards and Commissions will follow suit. She stated that Webex and Zoom meetings will no longer be an option. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that City Council is expected to meet in-person, with the public in attendance, on July 6th. President Garnica stated that the Commission's first in-person meeting will be on July 7th and stated that continuing virtual Commission meetings and hearings will no longer be an option. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that safety protocols are being worked on by the City to ensure safety for live meetings in the Civic Chambers.

Commissioner Arias stated that while virtual hearings are off the table, a lot of work has been done to see what it would look like. She stated that the Commission will be prepared to meet virtually should the need arise. President Garnica echoed Commissioner Arias' comments and stated that the Commission has done the testing to ensure hearings can continue virtually should anything change. President Garnica stated that if the Harbor Department is not available, the Special Projects Committee will meet to look at additional sites.

## 17. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

### *A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Slaten did not have any new information to report.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald did not have any new information to report.

*C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo did not have any new information to report.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting acknowledged Ms. McDonald for her 30 years of service with the City and highlighted her career. Ms. McDonald stated she has been blessed to have a career with the City and that it is not just a job. She stated that she has developed lasting relationships and has a passion for her work. She stated that her last 10 years with Civil Service have been about defending the Civil Service rules as well as the merit system. Although it is not the most glamorous part of the job, it is rewarding when you are able to educate the organization on the importance of the Civil Service rules. She stated that she plans to be around for more years to come and looks forward to doing more as she is just getting started. The Commission congratulated Ms. McDonald for her years of service, for her passion and dedication as she truly represents the peoples commission. Ms. McDonald thanked staff, the Commission and her family for being on the call. Ms. Pizarro Winting will be sure to take a picture of her presenting Ms. McDonald with her pin.

**18. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

The Commission did not have any unfinished business to discuss.

**19. NEW BUSINESS**

The Commission did not have any new business to discuss.

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:29 a.m.

**NO HEARING**

---

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មើនគ្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។