

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 27, 2021
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
CIVIC CHAMBERS, 8:30 AM**

Joel Garnica, President
Brandon Dowling, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES

SPECIAL MEETING

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 8:46 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Garnica asked Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond,
Present: Brandon Dowling and Joel Garnica

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

- 2. [21-294CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
*Special Meeting of October 13, 2021***

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 10):

President Garnica and Commissioner Arias pulled Agenda Items 3 and 7 for separate discussions.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve Consent Calendar Items (4 - 6 and 8 - 10), except for Items (3 and 7). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

3. [21-295CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Carpenter

Civil Engineer Test #26

Mechanical Engineer Test #02

Park Maintenance Supervisor

Police Officer - Lateral Test #23

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Lateral Test #11

School Guard Test #11

Special Services Officer I-IV Test #58

A brief discussion took place with Commissioner Arias and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the examination result for Park Maintenance Supervisor. It was discussed that the result was revised due to an applicant being an incumbent. It was mentioned that staff plans to inform the applicant about the transfer process. It was also discussed that the recruitment could potentially reopen if the department is not able to make a selection from the current list.

A brief discussion took place with Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. McDonald regarding applicants who do not meet the minimum qualifications. It was discussed that applicants will apply even though

they do not meet the minimum qualifications or sometimes they apply to the wrong posting. NEOGOV is not designed to prevent applicants who do not meet the minimum qualifications from submitting their applications.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

4. [21-296CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Assistant Administrative Analyst I-II

Police Lieutenant

X-ray Technician

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [21-297CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Douglas Bacon, Police Officer, Police Department (29 yrs., 1 mo.)

Frederick Burkett, Gas Field Service Representative II, Energy Resources Department (15 yrs., 2 mos.)

Malvin Flowers, Gas Field Service Representative III, Energy Resources Department (24 yrs., 20 days)

Maricela Gray, Clerk III, Parks, Recreation and Marine (30 yrs., 3 mos.)

Glenda Toyer, Public Safety Dispatcher II, Disaster

Preparedness and Emergency Communications (25 yrs., 5 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [21-298CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Roman Acebedo, Registered Nurse, Health and Human Services Department (2 yrs., 4 mos.)

Jesse Araujo, Airport Operations Specialist I, Airport (2 yrs., 9

mos.)
Janice Becerra, Airport Operations Specialist II, Airport (4 yrs., 7 mos.)
Arantxa Chavarria, Public Affairs Assistant, Police Department (5 yrs., 8 mos.)
Michael Chung, Senior Civil Engineer, Harbor Department (7 yrs., 10 mos.)
Amanda Hasegawa, Public Health Nurse II, Health and Human Services Department (5 mos., 6 days)
Monica Maravilla, School Guard, Public Works Department (9 days)
Alex Mitoma, Environmental Specialist Associate, Harbor Department (2 yrs., 9 mos.)
Daniel Porter, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department (7 yrs., 28 days)
Edwin Sell, Battalion Chief, Fire Department (21 yrs., 2 mos.)
Jonathan Soto, Special Services Officer, Airport (2 mos., 13 days)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [21-299CS](#)

Recommendation to approve downgrade (voluntary):

Jose Robles - Gas Field Service Representative III to Gas Field Service Representative II, Energy Resources Department

A brief discussion took place with President Garnica and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding additional information regarding this item. It was discussed that the employee submitted a request to be downgraded.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

8. [21-300CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

Wanjira Maina - Administrative Analyst III, Financial

*Management Department to Administrative Analyst II, Harbor
Department*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

9. [21-301CS](#)

**Recommendation for Permanent Reassignment to Former
Classification** - Robert Pfingsthorn, Administrative Analyst
*Communication from Robert Pfingsthorn, Acting Personnel
Officer, Public Works Department
Staff reported prepared by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

10. [21-302CS](#)

**Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible
Lists (6 months)**
*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive
Director*

Accountant I-III (C01AN-21) Test #01 (5/26/2021)
*Accounting Clerk I-III (C02AN-19) (5/30/2019) **3 months****
*Ambulance Operator (F63N1-21) (10/15/2020) **1 month****
*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-20) Test #19
(5/14/2020) **3 months****
*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-20) Test #20
(7/28/2020) **3 months****
*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-20) Test #21
(9/9/2020) **3 months****
*Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #11 (2/19/2020) **3 months****
Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #12 (4/17/2020)
Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #13 (5/7/2020)
Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #14 (5/20/2020)
Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #15 (5/29/2020)
Civil Engineer (K11NN-21) Test #22 (5/12/2021)
*Clerk Typist I-IV (D04AN-19) (1/4/2019) **3 months****
Criminalist Supervisor (F66NN-21) (11/16/2020)
*Deputy Fire Marshal (AT5NN-19) Test #01 (1/8/2019) **2
months****

*Deputy Fire Marshal (AT5NN-19) Test #02 (1/29/2019) 2 months**

Electrical Engineer (K89NN-21) Test #02 (5/12/2021)

Electrician (I15NN-20) Test #06 (5/22/2020)

Environmental Specialist Associate (N26NN-20) Test #03 (5/27/2020)

Garage Service Attendant I-III (J23AN-19) Test #02 (5/20/2019)

*License Inspector I-II (C22AN-20) Test #01 (11/14/2019) 3 months**

Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-20) Test #06 (5/15/2020)

*Parking Control Checker I-II (F19AN-20) (2/25/2020) 3 months**

Plan Checker - Plumbing I-II (K41AN-20) Test #05 (10/11/2019)

Plan Checker - Plumbing I-II (K41AN-20) Test #06 (1/14/2020)

Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #02 (5/6/2019)

Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #03 (5/16/2019)

Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #09 (11/14/2019)

Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-20) Test #13 (5/28/2020)

Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-21) Test #20 (5/12/2021)

Police Recruit (F63NN-21) Test #20 (11/12/2020)

Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-20) Test #02 (5/21/2020)

Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-21) Test #10 (12/1/2020)

Public Health Nurse Supervisor (G20NN-20) Test #01 (5/8/2020)

Public Health Nurse Supervisor (G20NN-20) Test #02 (5/29/2020)

Public Health Nutritionist I-III (G21AN-20) Test #06 (5/6/2020)

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Lateral (J45AN-21C) Test #07 (11/2/2020)

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Lateral (J45AN-21C) Test #08 (5/12/2021)

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Lateral (J45AN-21C) Test #09 (5/26/2021)

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-21A) Test #22 (5/26/2021)

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #12 (5/22/2020)

Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-21) Test #27 (11/20/2020)
Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-21) Test #29 (5/12/2021)
Registered Nurse I-II (G11AN-19) Test #09 (5/24/2019)
School Guard (F31N1-21) Test #01 (5/12/2021)
School Guard (F31N1-21) Test #02 (5/26/2021)
Senior Librarian (E31NN-21) Test #01 (5/12/2021)
Senior Librarian (E31NN-21) Test #02 (5/26/2021)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-19) Test #37 (5/6/2019)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-20) Test #40
(11/15/2019)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-21) Test #53 (5/12/2021)
Special Services Officer I-IV F33AN-20) Test #43 (5/28/2020)
Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1AN-20) Test #03
*(11/6/2019) 1 month**
Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1AN-20) Test #04
*(3/9/2020) 1 month**
Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1AN-20) Test #05
*(5/7/2020) 1 month**

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

11. [21-303CS](#) **REQUEST TO FILE LATE APPLICATION - Carpenter**
Communication from Marvin Cruz
Staff reported prepared by Jami Kerr-Jenkins

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Kerr-Jenkins who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Mr. Cruz was available to answer questions.

A brief discussion ensued with Commissioner Arias and Ms. Kerr-Jenkins regarding the request. It was discussed that staff did its due diligence in ensuring that the request fell within the Civil Service rule related to filing a late application.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

12. [21-304CS](#)

REQUEST FOR CONTINUANCE - Dismissal Appeal 06-D-1920
Communication from Devin Osburn

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Osburn who addressed the Commission regarding his request to continue his appeal hearing.

After a discussion by the Commission, Ms. Pizarro Winting, Mr. Anderson and Mr. Osburn regarding this item, the Commission ultimately approved Mr. Osburn's request with the stipulation that Mr. Osburn returns to the Commission, with legal representation, no later than 90 days (or the last meeting in January 2022) to provide an update. Mr. Osburn's administrative hearing will be rescheduled to the next available date in April 2022.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to grant a continuance until the next available date in April 2022, contingent upon Mr. Osburn returning to the Commission with legal representation no later than 90 days from October 27, 2021. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

13. [21-305CS](#)

COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD - Jorge Alvarez, Gas Construction Worker I
Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Energy Resources Department
Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

14. [21-306CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR SELECTIVE CERTIFICATION -

Office Systems Analyst (Cybersecurity Engineer)

Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department

Staff reported prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

15. [21-307CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR SELECTIVE CERTIFICATION -

(Office Systems Analyst (Geographic Information Systems Applications Analyst)

Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department

Staff reported prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was available to answer

questions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

16. [21-308CS](#)

DISCUSSION REGARDING MEETING SCHEDULE

After a discussion regarding altering meeting dates in November and December due to the holidays, the Commission decided that they will meet on November 10th, November 17th, December 8th and December 15th. The Commission will be dark on November 24th and December 22nd. In addition, the Commission decided that they will continue meeting every two weeks in 2022 as there are still COVID-19 related items that come to the Commission.

The Commission set its follow-up planning meeting for Wednesday, November 10, 2021, from 12:00 p.m. to 1:30 p.m.

The Commission also discussed whether to meet virtually or in person. After discussion, the Commission decided to meet virtually when only conducting a business meeting and in-person when an administrative hearing follows its business meeting. The Commission also decided to move its business meetings to begin at 9:00 a.m. starting November 10th.

17. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

President Garnica reported that she and Vice President Dowling had a productive meeting with Chief Luna and Assistant Chief Hebeish where they discussed recruitment, diversity and retention. She stated that these are important things to understand how the Civil Service department can be of service and assist stakeholders in those areas. President Garnica reported that they will also be meeting with Fire Chief Espino to discuss the same. She also encouraged departments to reach out to Civil Service to advise staff on how the department could best help provide a diverse and qualified pool of candidates.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond reported that a virtual meeting has been scheduled for November 3rd.

C. Special Projects Committee

Vice President Dowling reported that the Special Projects Committee will be meeting on November 9th in the afternoon.

18. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten updated the Commission on events that her division will be attending. Staff will be at the Festival of Flights on Saturday, November 6th. Staff will also be attending the Black Health Expo and Job Fair at Houghton Park on November 6th.

Ms. Slaten shared a tablecloth and a few promotional items that have the new Civil Service logo on them and will be used at recruitment events.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond shared information on a program that provides employment training to justice youth and systems impacted youth and asked if the City participates in a similar program. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond defined justice youth as youth who were formerly incarcerated and have returned to their community. Mr. Anderson believes that the City Prosecutor does some work with this population. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond will provide Ms. Slaten with more information.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald updated the Commission on the Marine Safety Sergeant Boat Operator and the Administrative Aide promotional examinations which are taking place this week. She stated that Administrative Aide had a 90% show rate. She also reported that the Personnel Analyst examination will be conducted next week. She stated that both Civil Service and Human Resources have vacancies.

Ms. McDonald acknowledged the Human Resources and Health and Human Services Departments as well as the International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers for their collaboration in getting the bulletin approved for X-ray Technician

promptly due to a sudden vacancy.

Commissioner Arias commented that a 90% show rate is pretty good. She was reading an article about how applicants are not showing up to scheduled appointments.

C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo updated the Commission on the closing of fiscal year 2021, the opening of fiscal year 2022 and the building of fiscal year 2023.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked the Commission for their discussion and decision on the meeting schedule as staff is now able to move forward with additional scheduling. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she and Mr. Anderson will be meeting with the attorneys to discuss scheduling additional hearings as well as filling in dates when hearings have been rescheduled.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that the management team will be taking on staff reports to assist analysts so that they can focus on recruitments and so that departments do not feel any interruption in services. She thanked Ms. McDonald for getting the X-ray Technician bulletin ready so quickly. A revised classification specification should be coming to the Commission for approval soon. She also thanked all staff for everything that they have been doing. President Garnica thanked staff for their work as well.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond commented that she appreciates Ms. Pizarro Winting's leadership and the leadership of Civil Service with everyone stepping in. She wanted to know if there are plans to gather with the Civil Service staff as a form of appreciation. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she is currently discussing this with President Garnica.

Commissioner Arias asked if there was an update on the Library Clerk revised classification specification. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that it is scheduled to come back to the Commission's next meeting.

President Garnica asked Ms. Pizarro Winting to send the Commission a summary of the last planning meeting before the follow-up meeting. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she would.

19. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

There was no unfinished business discussed.

20. NEW BUSINESS

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked Ms. Pizarro Winting to provide the Commission with an update regarding information related to the pandemic. She commented that we continue to see COVID-19 related items but for different reasons and there has also been a surge in infections. She would like to know what is happening and the impacts that the Commission should be preparing for should things continue down this path. She would also like to know if the Commission should prepare to see additional COVID-19 related items and if the City is prepared this time around and if hearings will be impacted. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that she can prepare something for the next meeting.

A discussion took place with President Garnica, Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding hearings. It was discussed that an alternate location is being looked at due to the noise level from audio exhibits and so that there is more space to socially distance. It was also mentioned that the Commission is fully prepared to conduct a virtual hearing if necessary. It was discussed that the current health order is in effect until January.

Commissioner Arias asked if the Port building was still not available to be used. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Ms. Camerino has been in communication with staff from the Port and it is still not available for use.

President Garnica acknowledged Halloween and asked everyone to be safe and enjoy. She also acknowledged Dia de Los Muertos, which in Latin culture is a celebration of loved ones who have passed.

21. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

Joshua Hickman, Manager of the Business Operations Bureau for the Public Works Department, introduced himself and thanked the Commission for all their work. He also introduced Dawn Henderson, newly appointed Administrative Officer for the Public Works Department. Ms. Henderson stated that she is looking forward to working with the Commission. The Commission welcomed Ms. Henderson.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:06 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មើនគ្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។