

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 18, 2023  
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD  
CIVIC CHAMBERS, 9:00 AM**

Joen Garnica, President  
Erik Fallis, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**REGULAR MEETING**

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 9:18 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

Sandra Aguilar, representing Energy Resources, led the flag salute.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen  
**Present:** Garnica

**1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS REGARDING THE AGENDA.**

There were no public comments.

**2. 23-020CS      Recommendation to approve minutes:  
Regular Meeting of January 4, 2023**

**A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 - 8):**

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond requested that item 3 be pulled. Commissioner Arias requested that items 3 and 6 be pulled.

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Consent Calendar Items 4, 5, 7, and 8, except for items 3 and 6. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

3. 23-021CS      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Animal Health Technician (Registered Veterinary Technician) Test #03*  
*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (Software Developer) Test #06*  
*Civil Engineer Test #30*  
*Combination Building Inspector Test #05*  
*Community Services Assistant I-II Test #02*  
*Community Services Supervisor*  
*Electrician Test #03*  
*Housing Assistance Coordinator*  
*Permit Technician I-II Test #01*  
*Police Recruit Test #19*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV NTN EXAM Test #38*  
*Special Services Officer I-IV Test #69*  
*Street Maintenance Supervisor I-II*  
*Street Traffic Engineer Test #01*

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond questioned whether Civil Engineer was the classification with a significant number of applicants that did not meet the minimum qualifications and why a candidate would apply if they do not meet the minimum qualifications. Ms. Pizarro Winting explained that applicants submit applications without reading the specific minimum requirements, and Ms. McDonald added that applicants do not attach the required documents. Since it is open continuously, staff will send reminders to applicants to complete the application. At a certain point, applicants get screened out due to a lack of required documentation. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond understood and suggested adding a pop-up window to remind candidates to check if all minimum requirements are met before submitting their application, or the applicant will be screened out. Ms. McDonald suggested that an additional bullet point be added to the bulletin to show the number of applicants that “did not submit proofs.”

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond thanked the staff for how the data was presented for the Community Services Assistant I-II Test #02 since the data provided helped the Commission understand where the gaps are in this classification.

Commissioner Arias asked whether the number of openings on Civil Engineer Test #30 is the number of openings that the recruitment started

with or the current number of openings now. Ms. McDonald responded that the posting has been open for several years, and the number shown is the number of current openings. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked why this posting has been open for a long time, and Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. McDonald explained that there are a number of reasons why this posting has been open for a long time, including minimum qualifications, testing, and the ability for a candidate to apply when there is a vacancy.

Commissioner Arias asked whether there would be another round of testing for the Housing Assistance Coordinator since only three (3) candidates qualified. Ms. McDonald and Mr. Sinkler explained that the staff will be obligated to provide more names if the department does not hire from the list. Further discussion continued about the eligible list and recruitment for this position with the Commission and staff.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

4. 23-022CS **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**  
*Personnel Assistant I-II*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. 23-023CS **Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**  
*Jacqueline Mack, Clerk Typist III, Harbor Department, (27 yrs., 7 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 23-024CS

**Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**

*James Alejandro, Refuse Operator I, Public Works, (3 mos., 18 days)*

*Ana Vasquez, Permit Technician II, Development Services, (10 mos., 29 days)*

*Marcos Lopez, Planner II, Development Services, (4 yrs., 8 mos.)*

*Nubia Ocampo, Clerk Typist III, Public Works, (3 yrs., 4 mos.)*

Commissioner Arias commented that Human Resources was supposed to be conducting exit interviews to determine employee resignation patterns. Mr. Ficker explained that Human Resources started the exit survey process. The department continues to collect the data provided by these surveys and will provide the information in a format that can be easily read by all the departments and the City Manager's office. Human Resources will bring a presentation to the Commission regarding the survey once the data has been collected and formatted in the next couple of months.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

7. 23-025CS

**Recommendation to approve transfer(s):**

*Javier Sanchez Construction Inspector II, Public Works to Construction Inspector II, Harbor Department*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. 23-027CS **Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

ACCOUNTANT I-III (C01AN-21) TEST #02 (8/4/2021)  
 AIRPORT OPERATIONS ASSISTANT I-II (EF2AN-21)  
 (6/9/2021) **Extend 3 months\***  
 BUSINESS SYSTEMS SPECIALIST I-VII (CLOUD  
 ENGINEER) (H67AN-22) TEST #03 (2/16/2022)  
 BUSINESS SYSTEMS SPECIALIST I-VII (ERP FINANCIAL  
 SYSTEMS SUPERVISOR) (H67AN-22B) TEST #03 (8/3/2022)  
 BUSINESS SYSTEMS SPECIALIST I-VII (GIS PROGRAM  
 MANAGER) (H67AN-22H) TEST #03 (8/3/2022)  
 BUSINESS SYSTEMS SPECIALIST I-VII (PERMITTING  
 SYSTEMS ADMINISTRATOR) (H67AN-22F) TEST #03  
 (8/3/2022)  
 CIVIL ENGINEER (K11NN-22) TEST #29 (8/3/2022)  
 COMMUNICATION SPECIALIST I-VI (H68AN-21) (2/25/2021)

CONSTRUCTION INSPECTOR I-II (K14AN-21) (8/18/2021)  
**Extend 2 months\***  
 ELECTRICAL AND INSTRUMENTATION TECHNICIAN I-II  
 (MG6AN-21) TEST #03 (2/16/2022)  
 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH SPECIALIST I-IV (G43AN-22)  
 TEST #01 (8/31/2022)  
 EQUIPMENT OPERATOR I-III (J18AN-21) (2/25/2021)  
 GARAGE SUPERVISOR I-II (MA3AN-21) (2/25/2021)  
 GARDENER I-II (J24AN-22) (2/2/2022)  
 HARBOR PATROL OFFICER I-III (NM4AN-21) TEST #01  
 (8/4/2021)  
 HARBOR PATROL OFFICER I-III (NM4AN-21) TEST #02  
 (9/1/2021)  
 LIBRARY CLERK I-IV (D46AN-21) (9/1/2021)  
 LICENSED VOCATIONAL NURSE (G05NN-22) TEST #02  
 (8/3/2022)  
 LICENSED VOCATIONAL NURSE (G05NN-22) TEST #03  
 (8/17/2022)  
 LICENSED VOCATIONAL NURSE (G05NN-22) TEST #04

(8/31/2022)  
MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT STOCK CLERK I-II (D19AN-21)  
(6/23/2021)  
MICROBIOLOGIST I-III (G08AN-22) TEST #03 (8/3/2022)  
OFFICE SYSTEMS ANALYST I-IV (CYBERSECURITY  
ENGINEER) (ND4AN-22A) TEST #03 (8/17/2022)  
OFFICE SYSTEMS ANALYST I-IV (GIS APPLICATIONS  
ANALYST) (ND4AN-22B) TEST #02 (8/17/2022)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-21) TEST #19  
(2/24/2021)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-22) TEST #26  
(2/2/2022)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-22) TEST #28  
(8/3/2022)  
POLICE RECRUIT (F63NN-22) TEST #03 (2/2/2022)  
POLICE RECRUIT (F63NN-22) TEST #04 (2/16/2022)  
POLICE RECRUIT (F63NN-22) TEST #11 (8/3/2022)  
POLICE RECRUIT (F63NN-22) TEST #12 (8/31/2022)  
PORT SECURITY SYSTEM OPERATOR (NF4AN-21)  
(8/18/2021)  
PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE I-III (G19AN-22) TEST #02  
(8/3/2022) **Extend 5 months\***  
PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE I-III (G19AN-22) TEST #03  
(8/17/2022) **Extend 5 months\***  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I - IV - LATERAL  
(J45AN-22C) TEST #14 (8/17/2022)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - NTN EXAM  
(J45AN-20A) TEST #14 (8/20/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - NTN EXAM  
(J45AN-22A) TEST #32 (8/3/2022)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - NTN EXAM  
(J45AN-22A) TEST #33 (8/31/2022)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - POST WAIVER  
(J45AN-20B) TEST #14 (8/7/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - POST WAIVER  
(J45AN-20B) TEST #15 (8/20/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - POST WAIVER  
(J45AN-22B) TEST #25 (2/16/2022)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - POST WAIVER

(J45AN-22B) TEST #27 (8/17/2022)  
 REFUSE OPERATOR I-III (JA2AN-22) TEST #34 (8/3/2022)  
 REGISTERED NURSE I-II (G11AN-22) TEST #03 (8/3/2022)  
**Extend 5 months\***  
 REGISTERED NURSE I-II (G11AN-22) TEST #04 (8/17/2022)  
 SCHOOL GUARD (F31N1-21) TEST #07 (8/4/2021) **Extend 4 months\***  
 SCHOOL GUARD (F31N1-21) TEST #08 (8/18/2021) **Extend 4 months\***  
 SCHOOL GUARD (F31N1-21) TEST #09 (9/1/2021) **Extend 4 months\***  
 SCHOOL GUARD (F31N1-22) TEST #13 (2/16/2022) **Extend 4 months\***  
 SENIOR CIVIL ENGINEER (K52NN-22) TEST #03 (8/3/2022)  
 SENIOR PROGRAM MANAGER - HARBOR (NFOONN-21)  
 TEST #02 (2/24/2021)  
 SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-21) TEST #50  
 (2/10/2021)  
 SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-21) TEST #55  
 (8/4/2021)  
 SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-22) TEST #61  
 (2/2/2022)  
 SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-22) TEST #64  
 (8/3/2022)  
 SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-22) TEST #65  
 (8/31/2022)  
 TRAFFIC SIGNAL TECHNICIAN I-II (I66AN-21) Test #01  
 (8/18/2021)  
 TREE TRIMMER I-II (J66AN-22) TEST #02 (2/2/2022)

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

9. 23-029CS            **RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE**

- Iven Sorrells - Airport Operations Specialist I  
*Communication from Claudia Lewis, Administration & Finance  
Manager, Airport Department  
Staff report prepared by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Moses, who briefed the Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

10. 23-030CS            **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - Gas Construction Worker I -**

Julian Griego  
*Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Arias mentioned that a new classification specification has been in the works for the past seven (7) months and asked if the length of time is typical for this classification specification. Staff explained the reason for the delays and further discussion between the Commission and staff continued.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

**11. 23-031CS            RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - Gas Construction Worker I - Abraham Gudino**  
*Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked a follow-up question on the classification specification timeline and asked whether the length of time was caused by the Civil Service department, or the department since these types of delays are often blamed on the Civil Service department. Ms. Pizarro Winting reiterated that the delay was not caused by the Civil Service department. Ms. Aguilar further explained what the causes of the delay were for this classification, and further discussion continued between the Commission and staff regarding the classification specification.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

**12. 23-032CS            RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - Gas Construction Worker I - Pedro Hernandez**  
*Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

- 13. 23-033CS**            **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - Gas Construction Worker I - Christopher Somkhit-Perez**  
*Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

- 14. 23-034CS**            **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - Housing Specialist II - Lillian Ortega**  
*Staff report prepared by -Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

**15. 23-035CS      RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN - Police Recruit  
- REVISED**  
*Presentation by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who provided a presentation on this bulletin.

Commissioner Arias began the discussion by thanking Ms. Cano for the presentation and mentioned that the opening remarks of the presentation in which Ms. Cano provided background about the position were helpful. Ms. Pizarro Winting explained that the Special Projects Committee was looking at whether to bring all bulletins from the consent calendar to the regular agenda. The Committee asked the staff to bring one sample presentation to assess whether the bulletin would be best in the regular agenda. This will go back to the Special Projects Committee, and the Committee will bring a recommendation to the Commission.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

16. 23-036CS      **RECOMMENDATION FOR TEMPORARY REASSIGNMENT  
FOR TRAINING** - Nahin Anaya-Zavala, Special Services Officer  
III-Armed to Clerk Typist III  
*Communication from Elsa Ramos, Acting Personnel  
Administrator, Police Department  
Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst*

Commissioner Arias asked about the reassignment agreement dated October 2022 and whether that had been previously approved by the Commission. After further discussion between the Commission and staff on this item, it was determined that the title of the recommendation needed to reflect what was being asked from the department, and clarification needed to be made on this item before it was approved. Staff acknowledged the oversight in the staff report and agenda.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation for temporary reassignment and rehabilitation of Nahin Anaya-Zavala, Special Services Officer III-Armed to Clerk Typist III.. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Erik Fallis and Joen Garnica

17. 23-037CS            **CLOSED SESSION: RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S REPORT - Disability Retirement Appeal 12-DR-1617**  
*Report prepared by Eric Sawyer, Administrative Law Judge*

President Garnica moved this item to the end of the agenda.

President Garnica announced that the Commission was going into closed session for item number seventeen (17), recommendation for consideration of Administrative Law Judge's report - Disability Retirement Appeal 12-DR-1617, in accordance with Paragraph (b) (1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code.

Commission was back on the record at 12:02 p.m. After deliberation, the Commission voted to adopt the recommendation of the Administrative Law Judge in the matter of Disability Retirement Appeal 12-DR-1617.

18. **CLOSED SESSION – Executive Director's Performance Evaluation (Pursuant to Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code)**

President Garnica moved this item to the end of the agenda.

President Garnica announced that the Commission was going into a closed session for item number eighteen (18), Executive Director's Performance Evaluation, in accordance with Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code.

Commission was back on the record at 12:20 p.m. The Commission requested that a closed session be scheduled for January 25th and a closed session for the next Civil Service Commission meeting on February 1st to finalize the review. Mrs. Smay acknowledged the request.

## 19. STANDING COMMITTEES

- A. Executive Committee**
- B. Recruitment and Selection Committee**
- C. Special Projects Committee**

### *A. Executive Committee*

President Garnica provided an update on the pending items that the Committee has been working on which included the following: starting the strategic planning process, follow up with the Reconciliation report, meetings with Council members and review of sunset clause for Article VIII, Section 115.

### *B. Recruitment and Selection Committee*

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond began her remarks by asking Ms. Pizarro Winting about the information to be disseminated to the Labor Management Committee so the subcommittee can provide feedback before meeting again. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond would like to meet with the subcommittee in February. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked if Commissioner Fallis would remain on the Recruitment and Selection Committee and Ms. Pizarro Winting explained that he would until a fifth Commissioner gets appointed to the Commission and the Commission appoints the new Commissioner to the Committee.

### *C. Special Projects Committee*

Commissioner Arias reiterated that the Committee will be meeting soon and will bring back a recommendation to the full Commission about whether to move the bulletins to the regular agenda from the consent agenda.

## 20. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

- A. Employment Services Division – Caprice McDonald**
- B. Administration and Support Services Division – Maria Alamo**

### *A. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald updated the Commission on current exam planning and recruitment for the Personnel Analyst position.

### *B. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo provided a response to a previous question asked about the budget from Commissioner Arias.

**21. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

No unfinished business.

**22. NEW BUSINESS**

President Garnica acknowledged Martin Luther King Jr. Day and thanked the staff that worked and attended the parade.

**23. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Garnica adjourned the meeting 12:21 p.m

I, Julia Smay, Executive Assistant, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

**NO HEARING**

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។