

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAC 2203-01
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
2749 E. Ocean Boulevard**

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards)*:

The subject property is bounded by Ocean Boulevard to the south, a 20-foot-wide alley to the north, Molino Avenue to the west, and Temple Avenue to the east (Attachment A – Location Map). It is located in the R-2-L zone (Two Family District with Large Lots). The lot size totals 11,000 square-feet. The lot is improved with a two-story 3,608-square foot, single-family dwelling with a 506 square-foot basement, 280 square-feet of deck area, and a detached two-car garage with an attached accessory structure located at the front of the lot, and a detached 483 square-foot two-car garage with an attached 186 square-foot accessory structure located at the rear.

The residence was constructed in 1919 and was designed by architect Irving J. Gill. Irving Gill, born in Tully, New York on April 26, 1870, is recognized for his role in the Modern Architecture Movement through his creative use of forms and aesthetics by incorporated new ideas, materials, and technical advances. Considered a Master Architect, many of his work is located in the greater Los Angeles and San Diego areas. Gill's most recognizable work of the 1910s is characterized by the use of flat roofs without eaves, concrete as a primary construction material, casement windows with transoms above, white walls, rectangular massing, and ground-level arches creating transitional breezeways. Unfortunately, although extensive research was undertaken by staff to obtain copies of original plans of this building, they were unsuccessful in time for the December 29, 2022 hearing. Staff as well as the applicant continued researching the original plans, the document was determined to be unavailable.

The smooth white stucco dwelling incorporates flat roofs of varying heights, arches along the primary elevation, a portico, and porte-cochere. The dwelling measures 25-feet-1-inch in height, and 27 feet wide along the front (south) elevation, spanning to approximately 40 feet in width towards the rear (north/tertiary) elevation. The residence retains wood windows (fixed and casement with transoms). The primary elevation along East Ocean Boulevard features projecting glazed arched bays at the east and west of portions. The west arch incorporates a sunroom, and is topped by a high parapet wall, providing a rooftop a deck.

Irving Gill employed a distinct hierarchy of elevations, with a clearly defined primary elevation embodying the greatest architectural detail, with less so on the secondary, and even fewer ornamental features on the tertiary elevation. The proposed addition is located on the latter. The tertiary (north / rear) elevation is defined by a single-story wing at the east dominated by paired French doors flanked by matching fixed windows. To the right, a five-part ribbon window, an arched door atop a flight of five stairs, followed by the arched

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

FINDINGS

January 31, 2023

Page 2 of 8

port cochere wing recessed from the plane of the rear elevation. The second story is topped by two differing heights of a flat roof. A wrought iron balcony sits atop the single-story wing followed by a broad expanse of solid masonry, and by two slider windows of different heights.

The existing detached two-car garage is accessed from a curb-cut and semi-curbed driveway from Ocean Boulevard, as well as an existing 20-foot wide alley along the rear (north) of the site. The two-car garage measures 483 square-feet in size and approximately 11-feet in height, as was designed to match the historic home incorporating a smooth white stucco finish. The garage is located within the northwesterly most portion of the site, along the interior side and rear property lines. The garage space features a bedroom with a closet, $\frac{3}{4}$ bathroom and that has access from the garage and French doors on the western elevation that will be removed as a part of this project.

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards)*, staff has analyzed the proposed project and determined that the project meets these requirements and those of the City's zoning codes.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural, or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, as Conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural, or aesthetic features of the subject property. All work will be conducted pursuant to the *Guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. The lot size totals 11,000 square feet of area.

The lot is improved with a two-story 3,608-square foot, and a detached two-car garage with an attached accessory structure located at the front of the lot, and a detached 483 square-foot two-car garage with an attached 186 square-foot accessory structure located at the rear of the lot.

The Bluff Park Historic Ordinance requires that "Construction shall conform to the bulk and mass, scale and height of the majority of existing structures on both sides of the street on the block on which the new structure is to be erected...The style of architecture, use of materials and landscape treatment shall not be uncharacteristically different from the predominant style of the immediate surroundings." The existing primary dwelling is two-stories in height and the proposed addition is similar in size and shape to the primary dwelling. The dwelling

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

FINDINGS

January 31, 2023

Page 3 of 8

is not uncharacteristically different from the architectural styles in the Historic District on a whole.

The Bluff Park Design Guidelines state: “the addition should not envelop or be larger than the existing building and should be no wider than the existing footprint, shall not be taller than the existing roofline, should be planned and constructed in a way that does not involve removing, obstructing, or damaging any existing historic features, and should be compatible with, yet distinguishable from, the original building style.

As proposed, the project will require relocation the existing rear door at first story rear to the proposed bathroom just north of the original door’s location. The door will be documented prior to removal and relocation. In addition, the proposed addition will require placement modification of two existing casement windows on the second-floor of the tertiary elevation. The modifications will include shifting the large casement window further the east to accommodate the addition. The second smaller casement window will be removed and relocated to the rear of the second-floor addition.

The scope of work also includes the construction of an additional 215 square-foot one car garage with an attached carport to the existing 2-car garage; a 103 square-foot first-floor accessory space addition to the garage; and an addition of a 965-square-foot second floor accessory dwelling unit (ADU) over the garage (not under CHC purview). The proposed project requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because the proposed new construction exceeds 250 square-feet.

The new 750-square-foot two-story addition to the rear dwelling will not be visible from the right of way as the structure will be setback 12 feet 5 ½ inches from the western (side) property line, which is 1-foot further recessed from the original building footprint. The addition will also be set-back approximately 98 feet from the front property line. The proposed addition has been designed to be compatible with the historic building’s architecture. The addition measures approximately 21-feet 10-inches in height, which is approximately 3-feet 5-inches lower in height in comparison to the highest point of the dwelling (25 foot 1 7/8 inches) and one (1) foot lower than rear elevation of the existing building. An approximately 2-foot 6-inch hyphen has now been incorporated to separate the massing of the rear two story addition and is 6-inches lower in height than the proposed addition. The hyphen incorporates a 2-foot-wide by 9-foot 6-inch high wood fixed window on the first and second floors of the east and west elevation of the addition.

The expanded detached accessory structure, additional one (1) car garage have also been designed to be compatible with the principal Irving Gill building. The existing garage footprint will remain intake and will be retrofitted to allow the construction of the ADU on the second floor.

The existing access from East Ocean Boulevard will be retained and the garage door along the northern elevation that abuts the alley will be increased by 18-inches to further comply with the City's required turning radii. A workshop with a half bathroom, and gym will be attached to the existing two-car garage, matching the existing roll-down overhead garage doors.

A third garage will be constructed adjacent to the workshop, set-back 4-feet from the rear property-line. Directly attached to the east of the garage, a carport is proposed that will include an arch opening similar to that on the historic residence.

2. **(It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.**

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. **(It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.**

The proposed project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Consistency with the ***Secretary of the Interior's Standards***:

1. **A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.**

The proposed project will not change the use of the property. The property will remain a residence.

2. **The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.**

No modifications are proposed for the primary elevation. Minor alterations to the rear (tertiary) elevation of the dwelling will occur to accommodate the two-story expansion. The project will relocate one (1) rear door to the proposed bathroom north of the original location which will be documented and reused. As these features are located on the tertiary elevation, they are of less significance, than those on the primary or secondary elevations. The proposed addition will require placement modification of two existing casement windows on the second-floor of the tertiary elevation. The modifications will include shifting the large casement window further the east to accommodate the addition. The second smaller casement window will be removed and relocated to the rear of the second-floor addition.

The existing two-car garage is will remain and will be structurally retrofitted to allow the construction of the ADU on the second floor. Additional accessory space and third garage space has been included as a part of this project and will not affect the historic characteristics of the primary building as a Contributor to the Bluff Park Historic District.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project has been designed to be compatible with the architectural style of the historic dwelling, while incorporating design features to differentiate the new construction. The northern (rear) elevation includes a fixed casement window with transoms above to match the existing windows on the dwelling. The large window as proposed on the tertiary elevation is inappropriate and does not comply with the Secretary of The Interior Standards as this window is a duplicate of the front main elevation, which is inconsistent with Gill's clearly defined hierarchy of elevations. A condition of approval has been included to require a simplified window on the rear tertiary elevation to ensure consistency with the SIS.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

There are no noted changes-over-time associated with this building.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

The project will relocate one (1) rear door to the proposed bathroom north of the original location which will be documented and reused. While the smallest second-story window requires removal. The proposed addition will require placement modification of two existing casement windows on the second-floor of the tertiary elevation. The modifications will include shifting the large casement window further the east to accommodate the addition. The second smaller casement window will be removed and relocated to the rear of the second-floor addition.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The project does not include removal of any deteriorated historic features.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Not applicable. No chemical or physical treatments are proposed.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

No known archeological resources are located at this property. However, if archeological resources are encountered during excavation and demolition, they will be treated as deemed appropriate.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project has been designed to be compatible with the Irving Gill historic residence, while including design features to differentiate the new construction by a lower building height. A newly-minted coin will be embedded into the corner of the new addition. An approximately 2-foot 6-inch hyphen has now been incorporated to separate the massing of the rear two story addition and is 6-inches lower in height than the proposed addition. The hyphen incorporates a 2-foot-wide by 9-foot 6-inch high wood fixed window on the first and second floors of the east and west elevation of the addition. The addition and new garage are compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the original home. The proposed door to be removed will be recorded and reused. The northern (rear) elevation includes a fixed casement window with transoms above to match the existing windows on the dwelling. The large window as proposed on the tertiary elevation is inappropriate and does not comply with the Secretary of The Interior Standards as this window is a duplicate of the front main elevation, which is inconsistent with Gill's clearly defined hierarchy of elevations. A condition of approval has been included to require a simplified window on the rear tertiary elevation to ensure consistency with the SIS.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The new addition to the rear of the dwelling and new detached construction could be removed in the future without destroying the essential form and integrity of the historic property or its environment. The project will relocate one (1) rear door to the proposed bathroom north of the original location which will be documented and reused such that if restoration is planned in the future, it can be returned to its original location. The proposed

addition will require placement modification of two existing casement windows on the second-floor of the tertiary elevation. The modifications will include shifting the large casement window further the east to accommodate the addition. The second smaller casement window will be removed and relocated to the rear of the second-floor addition.

The ***Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance*** states:

- All exterior modifications require compliance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation
 - Project conforms, as indicated above.
- New construction in the District conforms to the bulk and mass, scale, and height of the majority of existing structures on both sides of the street on the block on which the new structure is to be erected.
 - The new construction will not be visible in any direction.
- The style of architecture, the use of materials and the landscape treatment shall not be uncharacteristically different from the predominant style for the immediate surroundings.
 - The proposed addition incorporates materials of the Irving Gill dwelling.
- New structures shall not be painted or otherwise finished on the exterior in colors and architectural details which would be out of character with the general architecture style of the predominant on the block on which the new structure is to be located.
 - The materials and colors proposed are consistent with this historic home.
- Driveways and garage entrances shall conform to the existing standard on the block on which the new building is erected.
 - The driveway as proposed will be restored back to its original conditions and the garage addition will match the existing detached garages architectural style, mass, size and existing location.

The project incorporates the principles of the Bluff Park Historic District Design Guidelines as follows:

- The addition should not envelop or be larger than the existing building and should be no wider than the existing footprint.
 - The addition is significantly smaller than the existing dwelling.
- Rear additions should not be taller than the existing roofline.
 - The rear addition has a lower height than the historic residence. The addition measures approximately 21-feet 10-inches in height, which is approximately 3-feet 5-inches lower in height in comparison to the highest point of the dwelling (25 foot 1 7/8 inches) and one (1) foot lower than rear elevation of the existing building. An approximately 2-foot 6-inch hyphen has now been incorporated to separate the massing of the rear two story addition and is 6-inches lower in height than the proposed addition.
- The addition should be planned and constructed in a way that does not involve removing, obstructing, or damaging any existing historic features.

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

FINDINGS

January 31, 2023

Page 8 of 8

- As previously stated, the project will relocate one door to the proposed bathroom north of the original location which will be documented and reused. Only the small second story window is proposed to be removed and relocated to second floor rear addition to keep the original features within the structure. The proposed addition will require placement modification of two existing casement windows on the second-floor of the tertiary elevation. The modifications will include shifting the large casement window further the east to accommodate the addition. The second smaller casement window will be removed and relocated to the rear of the second-floor addition.
- All additions should be compatible with, yet distinguishable from, the original building.
 - The proposed project has been designed to be compatible with the architectural style of the historic dwelling while incorporating design features to differentiate the new construction. An approximately 2-foot 6-inch hyphen will separate the proposed addition on the tertiary elevation and will be 6-inches lower in height than the proposed addition.
- Additions should always add to the existing footprint of the building; new construction should never involve removal of a portion of the original residence or site features.
 - As previously stated, the project will relocate one (1) door to the proposed bathroom north of the original location which will be documented and reused. The proposed addition will require placement modification of two existing casement windows on the second-floor of the tertiary elevation. The modifications will include shifting the large casement window further the east to accommodate the addition. The second smaller casement window will be removed and relocated to the rear of the second-floor addition.