

August 30, 2022

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS
City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 371 square-foot single-story rear addition with a 33 square-foot rear porch, to a single-family residence. The property is located at 922 Molino Avenue, in the R-2-N Zoning District. The existing dwelling is a Contributor to the Rose Park Historic District. (District 2)

APPLICANT: Ohana Builders
34921 Calle Del Sol
Capistrano Beach, CA 92624
(Application No. COAC2204-02)

THE REQUEST

The applicant requests approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 371 square-foot single-story rear addition with a 33 square-foot porch to the rear of an existing one-story single-family residence and demolish an existing rear patio cover.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on the east side of Molino Avenue, between 8th Street and 10th Street (Attachment A – Location Map), within the R-2-N zone (Two-family Residential, standard lot). The subject property is improved with a 1910 one-story, 966 square foot single-family residence and 330 square foot detached garage, on a 6,750 square foot lot. The property is a Contributor to the Rose Park Historic District.

The existing residence was designed in a Craftsman Bungalow architectural style. The home retains its original architectural features. Its exterior is clad in multiple finish materials common to this architectural style, including wood shingles, vertical wood siding, horizontal wood siding, brick accents, and a concrete front porch.

The front of the residence (west elevation) is designed with a central front gable roof, and a second gable roof (perpendicular to the primary,) covering the porch. The roof is covered with brown composition shingles, and accented by exposed rafters and a decorative attic vent. The



windows along the front elevation consist of a tripartite window and an exterior 12-light wood double doors located within the porch area.

The north elevation, adjacent to the driveway is defined by two 4-light casement windows, four 1-over-1 double-hung wood windows, and a small sash window. This elevation's existing cladding consists of wood shingles, horizontal wood siding, and brick veneer closer to the front corner of the residence.

The existing south elevation includes a 4-light exterior wood door located within the front porch area, a tripartite 4-over-1 double-hung wood window, and two double-hung windows. The façade also contains a combination of wood shingles, vertical wood siding, and brick veneer.

The east (rear) elevation is defined by a gable roof with a decorative vertical attic grill and an attached rear patio cover (proposed to be removed to accommodate the rear addition.) Fenestration consists of one wood window hinged at the top referred as an "awning" in a 2017 Certificate of Appropriateness, at the center, and a 9-light rear exterior wood door to the south of the facade. The rear cladding consists of wood shingles, vertical wood siding with a brick veneer.

The residence is well preserved and retains most of the original Craftsman Bungle features. (Attachment B – Photography)

ANALYSIS

The proposed project is a 371 square-foot addition with a 33 square-foot rear porch and demolish an attached rear patio cover, to the rear of the existing dwelling. The addition requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because the addition exceeds 250 square feet in size. In order for approval to be granted, the project must comply with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* (for Rehabilitation, New Construction) and meet the Criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

DISCUSSION

Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The existing use is a single-family residence that consists of a one-story structure. The proposed one-story addition and porch will not alter the residential use

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The remaining character-defining-features of the primary residence will remain unchanged. As proposed, the rear addition is compatible with the existing architectural design of the dwelling and the Rose Park Historic District

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed improvements will be made at the rear of the dwelling, and maintain the existing architectural features on the original building.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

The proposed improvements will not change the historic significance of the property or impact the integrity of the District.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

The proposed improvements will not change the distinctive features of the existing building or property. The proposed height of the addition will be lower than existing residence, maintaining the original envelope of the significant structure and will be incorporated into the design of the original residence. The proposed rear porch's location will not be visible from public view.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

No deterioration has been observed. Existing building conditions do not display deteriorated historic features. Any future deterioration will be addressed through appropriate Historic city review.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

With the exception of the demolition of a non-original attached rear patio cover to accommodate addition, the proposed project will not cause damage to the historic features of the existing structure one-story addition to the rear of the residence will not cause damage to the historic features of the existing structure. Based on recent street survey, the building is in fair condition and well maintained.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

No major excavations or grading is proposed.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

To accommodate the construction of the addition, some Craftsman architectural features at the rear will be removed. This includes the removal of a decorative vertical attic vent and wood siding. However, as these features are located on the rear façade (tertiary), and are not visible from the public right-of-way, their loss would not be deemed significant.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed addition and porch will not cause damage to the essential form and integrity of the existing structure or the District, and is consistent with surrounding one and two-story structures in the vicinity

The project will maintain an appropriate building scale compatible with the context of both the Rose Park Historic District and the immediate block, which consists of a mixture of one-story and two-story buildings and a mixture of architectural styles along Molino Avenue.

The proposed addition is consistent and fully compliant with the City's residential development standards for the R-2-N zoning district, the City's Historic Design Guidelines, and the Rose Park Historic District Design Guidelines, and the Craftsman Style Guide.

The Design Guidelines for the Rose Park Historic District provides direction for rear additions, indicating state that an addition to the rear of the residence is acceptable, provided that the addition is "sensitively designed and is not highly visible from the public right-of-way...and compatible with the historic character of the residence, should not envelop or be larger overall than the existing building, and should not be wider than the existing footprint or taller than the existing roofline." The remaining of the structure, specifically the front façade, will not be structurally altered and will maintain its original historic appearance. The applicant is also proposing a new color palette. The new paint will complement the character of the residence by providing appropriate earth tone colors. The color palette is included as part of the conditions of approval in 'Attachment E'.

The overall height of the existing primary residence is approximately 16 feet – 14 ½ inches and will not be altered. As proposed, the rear addition will be setback approximately 61 feet from the front property line, 7 feet from the south side property line, 17 feet - 6 inches from the north side property line, and approximately 58 feet from the rear property line. The proposed addition

will not be wider than the existing footprint and will use compatible exterior materials, including horizontal wood siding, wood shingle cladding, and Class 'A' composition shingles to match existing conditions. The new roof will also incorporate brackets supporting the roof overhang at the rear gable with a framed decorative rectangular attic grill. Staff is also including a condition of approval requiring rafter tails to be exposed along the sides (north and south) of the roof overhangs to ensure a more compatible roof appearance and design.

The addition will also incorporate double-hung wood windows along the north side façade, a wood double-hung window and a rectangular wood window hinged at the top referred as an "awning" window at the rear, and a 9-light, 2 panel exterior wood door within the new rear porch consistent in design with the architectural style of the residence. Lastly, a small, fixed window will be provided on the south side of the addition to provide light within the rear vestibule. Furthermore, the addition will not envelop or be designed to be taller than the existing roofline, as it will be designed to 6 ¼ inches lower than the overall height of the existing residence as measured from the roof ridgeline (Attachment C – Plans).

In accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states the new addition will not destroy prominent historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. As proposed, the addition meets all current zoning regulations, the Craftsman Style Guide and the Rose Park Historic District Design Guidelines (Attachment D – Findings).

Standard No. 9. also states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." While the proposed one-story, 371 square-foot addition will incorporate consistent materials and elements compatible with existing in order to maintain the original Craftsman architectural style character, to differentiate between the old and the new as required from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the addition is proposed to be stepped in along the north side façade to ensure it is visually distinguishable from the original footprint of the building. Although the applicant is proposing horizontal siding, smooth stucco at the base on the addition and fascia boards along the north and south roof eaves, staff is requiring more appropriate materials and design. Therefore, Staff has included conditions of approval requiring that the addition continue wood shingle cladding and exposed rafter tails, similar to the existing north, south and west façades. With regards to the proposed rear concrete rear porch, the applicant is proposing to apply a smooth stucco finish also found at the existing front porch. Therefore, the proposed rear addition and rear porch is compatible in design, height, scale, massing and the overall context of the Rose Park Historic District.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interiors' Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, the Craftsman Style Guide, and the recent adopted California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

Respectfully submitted,

IRVING ANAYA
PROJECT PLANNER

ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER

ANDREA URBAS, AICP CEP CUD
ACTING ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER

Attachments: Attachment A – Vicinity Map
Attachment B – Photographs
Attachment C – Plans
Attachment D – Findings
Attachment E – Conditions of Approval