

January 25, 2022

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS
City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

A Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a two-story, 444-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU), with a 113-square-foot, first-floor and a 331-square-foot second-floor, a portion of which will be constructed above an existing detached garage on the rear half of the lot. The property is a Contributing Structure and is located at 3754 Lewis Avenue within the California Heights Historic District. (District 7)

APPLICANT: Deborah Smith
3754 Lewis Avenue
Long Beach, CA 90807
(Application No. COAC2107-01)

THE REQUEST

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two-story, 444-square-foot total accessory dwelling unit (ADU), consisting of a 113-square-foot first-floor and a 331-square-foot second-floor, a portion of which will be constructed above the existing detached garage located to the rear of a single-family residence. No additions or modifications are proposed to the existing main residence fronting Lewis Avenue.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on Lewis Avenue, between E. Bixby Road to the north and E. 37th Street to the south (Attachment A – Vicinity Map) within the R-1-N zone (Single-family Residential, Standard Lots). The property is developed with a single-family residence and a 366-square-foot two-car garage in the rear of the property. The primary residence fronting Lewis Avenue is a one-story, 1,306-square-foot single-family structure, built in 1935 situated on a 6,375-square-foot lot. The applicant is proposing to construct a new two-story, 444-square-foot ADU consisting of a new 113-square-foot first-floor entrance area, and a 331-square-foot second-floor area (living room with a kitchen area and full bathroom). Only 218-square-feet are proposed over the existing garage on the second-story. The proposed ADU is permitted by-right under State law, subject to compliance with unit size requirements and other



limited ADU development standards. This application is limited to design review by the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC), pursuant to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code for consistency with historic district standards.

The existing two-car garage and main residence are in a Tudor Revival architectural style and are contributing structures in the California Heights Historic District. The exterior cladding of the main residence consists of white stucco with brick accents, decorative half timbering, tripartite and multi-light casement wood windows, window shutters, high pitch cross gable roof, side chimney with chimney caps and a porch area facing Lewis Avenue. Like the main residence, the existing garage has a high pitch gable roof, white stucco cladding, casement wood windows and decorative half timbering. The existing residence is well-preserved and retains most of its original Tudor Revival architectural style features.

ANALYSIS

The proposed project requires approval of the CHC because the size exceeds 250 square feet and is visible from the public right-of-way. To be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The proposed project consists of an ADU to be constructed adjacent to and partially above the existing garage, which will be maintained. Approximately 218-square-feet of the ADU will be placed over the existing garage and will utilize the high-pitched roof to accommodate the living area. The ADU will be located in the rear half of the lot and will be setback 85'-7" from the front property line to the west, 21'-3" from the rear property line to the east, 4'0" from the side property line to the south, and approximately 17'-3" from the north side property line. The ADU will largely be screened from view from Lewis Avenue by the main residence and the existing two-car garage and will only minimally be visible from the street. The proposed ADU consists of a first-floor entrance area of 113-square-feet and a 331-square-foot second-floor area with common areas, living room, kitchen/dining room and full bathroom (Attachment B - Plans). The proposed project complies with lot coverage, open space, yard, height and setback requirements. As proposed, the project is in compliance with the Zoning Code requirements and the California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines and Tudor Revival Style Guide in terms of materials, site placement, massing and decorative features.

The primary residence fronting Lewis Avenue features a cross gable roof and the existing garage has a gable roof with a roof pitch of 12:12. The new roof over the ADU would provide a cross gable roof with a primary side property line roof orientation as opposed to the front facing orientation of the primary structure and existing garage. The ADU also provides roof pitch variations to include 2 ½:12, 4/12 and 12:12 which are compatible with the existing structures on-site. The roof material will consist of asphalt composition shingles to match existing. The height of the primary residence facing Lewis Avenue is 20'-1" to the peak of the roof, and the height of the garage is 17'-9", and the ADU is proposed with a 16'-9" height. The

height of the second-story addition is lower than existing structures to minimize its bulk and massing as compared to the structures on the lot and is consistent with the variable building heights found in the vicinity and the district as a whole. Only a portion of the new roof over the garage will be visible from Lewis Avenue on the west elevation with the rest of the proposed improvements fully screened behind the high roof pitch of the existing garage and main residence. The second-story provides dormers for the ADU on both sides of the gable roof which are minimally visible from Lewis Avenue. To further minimize visibility, a special condition of approval shall be added to recess the dormers further back from the face of the existing garage and reduce their size in equal parts to bring balance to the building from the public right-of-way.

The proposed ADU includes seven (7) new casement wood windows to match the existing garage windows, and one (1) new exterior entrance door. The first floor includes two (2) casement wood windows, one on the north and one on the west elevation. The second floor includes three (3) casement wood windows facing the north elevation and two (2) facing the east rear elevation towards the alley. Several other architectural features are incorporated into the new ADU design to integrate the proposed with the architectural style of the existing residence, including roof pitch, gable roof, asphalt composition shingles, overhangs, fascia, and decorative half timbering. The result is a contemporary design which complements the original Tudor Revival style and does not detract from the original architecture when viewed from Lewis Avenue. As proposed, and consistent with applicable historic district design guidelines, all windows in the proposed structure shall be historically appropriate wood windows and shall have wood trim to match the existing window trim on the existing garage.

The primary dwelling and garage are currently painted in an off-white color with dark brown trims facing Lewis Avenue (Attachment C - Photographs), and the owner is proposing to paint the proposed ADU to match paint colors of the existing structures. The proposed paint colors shall be compatible with the existing structures on the lot and comply with the with the Secretary of Interior Standards and the California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines. As conditioned, the proposed ADU shall be painted to match the existing structures on-site prior to the final inspection.

The California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines provide guidance for ADUs and encourage that they be constructed in the rear of properties and designed to minimize their visibility from the street. The ordinance further states that ADUs should be architecturally compatible with the primary residence on the site in terms of design, materials and architectural style and have lower massing than the primary structure. As proposed and conditioned, the proposed ADU has minimal visibility from the street and is not larger than the main residence and would be architecturally compatible.

The proposed ADU is compatible with the existing residence and garage architectural style, yet does not give a false sense of the property's historical development, in accordance with Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9, which states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale

and architectural features...” The new ADU has been designed to complement and match the architectural style of the primary residence and garage, yet it is a lower height than existing structures on-site. The proposed project represents a simplified, contemporary interpretation of the Tudor Revival architectural style that will provide a cohesive design between the proposed addition and the existing structures. As conditioned, the proposed ADU will provide a smooth stucco finish to further differentiate new from original.

Compatibility with Neighborhood

The project will maintain an appropriate scale with the context of the California Heights Historic District and context of the block which consists of a mix of one-story and two-story residences in a Spanish Colonial Revival and Minimal Traditional Architecture. As proposed, the scale and size of the proposed ADU does not detract from the existing main residence as a contributing structure or as a primary structure, and it preserves the historic integrity of the primary residence and the surrounding area, in compliance with Secretary of Interior Standards.

As designed, the proposed project will have minimal visibility from Lewis Avenue and will be compatible with the neighborhood and adjacent properties within the vicinity as the properties on the block have a mix of one-story and two-story residences. Given this context, the proposed project is compatible with the neighborhood. The proposed ADU will be consistent and in full compliance with all applicable ADU regulations (California Government Code Sections 65852.2 and 65852.22), the California Heights Historic District Ordinance C-7702, and the Tudor Revival Style Guide. The proposed ADU is located on the rear half of the property and will be compatible in massing and size yet distinguishable from the original main residence and existing garage. As designed, the proposed two-story ADU will have minimal visibility when viewed from the front of the street on Lewis Avenue.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City’s Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the California Heights Historic District Ordinance. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the conditions of approval (Attachment D – Conditions of Approval), for the construction of a two-story, 444-square-foot ADU, with a 113-square-foot first-floor and a 331-square-foot second-floor area of which 218-square-feet are proposed over an existing detached garage on the rear half of a single-family lot. All the findings (Attachment E – Findings) can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions, and materials to the architectural style of the existing structures on the property and with the context of the District.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorical Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (new construction or conversion of small structures) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

On January 11, 2022, public notices were mailed pursuant to the requirements of Chapter 2.63. As of this date, no letters were received in response to this project.

Respectfully submitted,

REFUGIO TORRES CAMPOS
PROJECT PLANNER

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Alejandro Plascencia'.

ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Alison Spindler-Ruiz'.

ALISON SPINDLER-RUIZ, AICP
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Patricia A. Diefenderfer'.

PATRICIA A. DIEFENDERFER, AICP
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

PAD:ASR:AP:RTC

Attachments: Attachment A – Vicinity Map
Attachment B – Plans
Attachment C – Photographs
Attachment D – Conditions of Approval
Attachment E – Findings