

January 25, 2022

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to convert an existing detached garage (411 square feet) with additions to the first story (101 square feet) and the addition of a second story (461 square feet) to create an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at a property located at 3435 Gaviota Avenue in the R-1-N Zoning District in the California Heights Historic District. The resulting ADU would be a detached, two-story, 973-square-foot ADU. The primary structure is a contributing structure to the California Heights Historic District. (District 7)

APPLICANT: Nori Fukuda
15435 Yukon Avenue
Lawndale, CA 90260
(Application No. COAC2109-02)

THE REQUEST

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two-story, 973-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) that consists of the conversion of an existing detached garage and first- and second-story additions to the garage structure .

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on the west side of Gaviota Avenue, between East 36th Street to the north and East Wardlow Road to the south, within the R-1-N zone (Single-Family Residential District with Standard Lots) (Attachment A - Vicinity Map). A 15-foot-wide alley abuts the rear property line. The subject property is 5,737.5 square feet in area (45 feet wide by 127.5 feet deep) and is developed with a 2,073-square-foot, two-story single-family dwelling and a 411-square-foot detached garage located in the rear of the lot.

The existing primary residence fronts Gaviota Avenue and is set back approximately 19 feet from the front property line with a front porch that projects approximately 4 feet into the front yard setback. The existing detached garage, constructed in 2001, is set back approximately 95 feet from the front property line and takes access from the existing driveway from Gaviota Avenue. Based on City and Assessor Records, the single-family residential structure was originally constructed in 1938, with additions in 1966 and 2001. The existing primary structure



is a contributing structure to the California Heights Historic District, which is based on a survey conducted prior to the 2001 addition and replacement garage.

The original residential structure onsite was a one-story residence constructed in 1938 in the Minimal Traditional architectural style. In 1966, a building permit was issued to build a one-story addition (349 square feet) to the rear of the structure. In 2001, a Certificate of Appropriateness and building permits were issued for a project consisting of the construction of new one-story and two-story additions, demolition and replacement of the detached garage, and addition of a new covered porch.

The body of the primary structure is clad with stucco and includes a brick façade treatment at the lower portion of the front elevation (Attachment B – Photographs). The original windows have been replaced with vinyl windows, which are not typical of the Minimal Traditional architectural style.

The primary structure features a gable roof system. The original 1938 structure featured a side facing gable. The 2001 addition of the second story introduced a front facing gable with a new gabled porch. The roof pitch of the primary structure is 4:12, and measures 24-feet-9-inches in height. The front facing gable ends and porch feature horizontal wood cladding,

The garage measures 20-feet-3-inches deep by 20-feet-4-inches wide (411 square feet). The garage also features a front-facing gable roof that measures 15-feet as measured to the top of ridge. The roof pitch of the existing detached garage is 8:12, which is steeper than the roof system found on the primary structure and typical of the Minimal Traditional architectural style.

ANALYSIS

The proposed project requires the approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because the proposed new construction exceeds 250 square feet of new area and is visible from the public right-of-way (Gaviota Avenue). To be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The existing primary residential structure at the front would remain in its existing location and orientation to the lot. There are no changes proposed to the primary structure as part of this application. The proposed ADU would be created through the conversion of the existing non-contributing detached garage with one- and two-story additions. The entry to the ADU would be at the location of the removed garage door under a covered porch (Attachment C - Plans). On the sides, the new second-floor would be set back 4-feet from the southern (side) property line and 18-feet-2-inches from the northern (side) property line. The first and second floors of the ADU would maintain the current front and rear building setbacks measured to property line (95-feet-2-inches and 12-feet-2-inches, respectively). The ADU would maintain a 10-foot-1-inch separation from the existing primary residence.

The proposed ADU would maintain a front facing gable roof with composition shingles similar to the roof style of the primary structure and materials characteristic of the Minimal Traditional architectural style. The new height of the structure with the proposed ADU is 22-feet-8-inches in height as measured to the top of the ridge. For reference, the existing two-story primary residence is 24-feet-9-inches in height measured to the top of ridge.

Several architectural features are incorporated into the ADU design to integrate the proposed structure with the existing primary residence, including stucco finish, covered porch, horizontal siding at gable ends, and composition roofing. The covered porch would feature wood posts and horizontal wood siding. A new planter would be added where the existing garage door is to be removed. The exterior of the proposed ADU has been conditioned to match the stucco finish of the primary structure.

The proposed windows for the ADU include hung wood windows. All proposed wood windows shall be constructed of wood and incorporate wood trim. As conditioned, Planning Bureau staff will coordinate with the applicant for the final window configuration along the interior property line to ensure the maintenance of privacy for the abutting property, in compliance with the ADU zoning regulations. As a result, the proposed hung windows on the south elevation may result in the application of obscured glazing/frosted glass or the conversion to awning windows above eye level. In addition, it is staff's recommendation that the front elevation is revised prior to plans being submitted for plan check review to adjust the porch to an offset configuration towards the interior property line and the incorporation of larger grouped windows or a picture window under the covered porch, and a condition of approval has been added to that effect (Attachment D – Conditions of Approval). This design recommendation is to provide an offset porch and window configuration that better aligns with the Minimal Traditional architectural style.

In addition to the offset porch, as conditioned, the portion of the existing garage to remain, shall maintain a sloped roof in the side yard setback to be parallel with the configuration of the roof and porch gables. The porch columns will be wood vertical columns with a suggested size of 6-inch by 6-inch.

The primary residence is currently painted a cream (off-white) color with teal trim. In order to ensure compatibility among the ADU and existing structures on the lot as well as compatibility of the proposed structure with the Secretary of Interior Standards and the California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines, the owner will be required to obtain a certificate of appropriateness paint the new ADU to match the primary residence; the structures will be required to be painted in colors that are appropriate for the Minimal Traditional architectural style, prior to issuance of final Certificate of Occupancy for the ADU.

The Design Guidelines for the California Heights Historic District provide guidance for ADUs. The guidelines state that ADUs shall be compatible with the primary structure, including maintaining a secondary orientation to the primary residence. While the project would be visible from the street and feature increased massing over the existing detached garage, the proposed ADU would be in conformance with all applicable ADU regulations (California Government

Code Sections 65852.2 and 65852.22). The overall height of the existing primary residence is 24-feet-9-inches measured to the top of the highest ridge and the highest point of the proposed ADU is 22-feet-8-inches in height. The combination of the offset configuration and the minor height difference from the primary residence would properly define the accessory structure as secondary to the primary residence.

The proposed ADU, as conditioned, would be compatible with the existing primary residence's Minimal Traditional architectural style and would not detract from the architectural style. The existing garage to be converted is not a historic structure, as it was constructed in 2001. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." and the standards also state that improvements should not give a false sense of the property's historical development. The new ADU has been designed to complement the design of the existing primary residence but has been designed with a differing roof slope from the modified primary residence. The proposed project will provide a cohesive design between the new ADU and the existing structures.

The proposed ADU will be consistent and in full compliance with the City's residential development standards for the R-1-N (Single-Family Residential, Standard Lot) zoning district, State ADU Regulations, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, California Heights Historic District Ordinance, and the Minimal Traditional Style Guide. The proposed ADU is located in the rear half of the property and will be compatible with and yet distinguishable from the primary structure. The proposed design is compatible with the primary structure (2-stories in height) and neighborhood context, as other properties along this portion of Gaviota Avenue within this California Heights Historic District are two-stories in height. Within the context of the district, project site, and as permitted by State ADU regulations, staff can make positive findings for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, State ADU Regulations, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, the California Heights Historic District Ordinance, and the California Heights Historic District Design Guidelines, and the Minimal Traditional Architectural Style Guide. With conditions, Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the conversion of an existing detached garage (411 square feet) with additions to the first story (101 square feet) and second story (461 square feet) that would result in a two-story, 973-square-foot ADU. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible with the architectural style of the existing structure on the site and with the context of the District (Attachment E – Findings). Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the conditions of approval.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorically Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

A total of 434 public notices were distributed on January 6, 2022. As of the preparation of this staff report, no public correspondence has been received in response to the noticing of this project.

Respectfully submitted,



MARYANNE CRONIN
PROJECT PLANNER



ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER



ALISON SPINDLER- RUIZ, AICP
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER



PATRICIA A. DIEFENDERFER, AICP
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

PD:ASR:AP:mc

Attachments: Attachment A – Vicinity Map
Attachment B – Photographs
Attachment C – Plans
Attachment D – Conditions of Approval
Attachment E – Findings