

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 8, 2021  
TELECONFERENCE, 9:00 AM**

Joel Garnica, President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner  
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES**

**SPECIAL MEETING**

**HELD VIA TELECONFERENCE  
PURSUANT TO AB 361  
(GOV. CODE SECTION 54953(e)(1)-(2))**

**WEB LINK: <https://longbeach-gov.zoom.us/j/97494198406>  
DIAL IN NUMBER: (213) 338-8477 / MEETING ID: 974 9419 8406**

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Garnica asked Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer for Energy Resources, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond  
**Present:** and Joel Garnica

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

2. [21-348CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve minutes:**

*Special Meeting of November 10, 2021*

*Special Meeting of November 17, 2021*

Commissioner Arias changed the title of Agenda Item 12 to the following:

***RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE PROVISIONAL  
APPOINTMENT - RETROACTIVE - Renee Royer, Clerk***

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation as amended to include Retroactive as part of the title. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica**

Commissioner Arias changed Agenda Item 13, third paragraph to the following:

*A brief discussion took place with Commissioner Arias and Ms. McDonald regarding the potential for additional requests to come to the Commission due to the State's backlog in the administration of Water Operator certification examinations due to the pandemic. It was mentioned staff will be discussing this with the department as this is the first time having a situation like this. It was commented that the more information staff can provide in advance, the better.*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation as amended to include additional language in the third paragraph. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 8):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve Consent Calendar Items (3 - 8). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

3. [21-349CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Combination Building Inspector Aide I-II*  
*Maintenance Assistant I-III Test #01*  
*Marine Safety Sergeant - Boat Operator (PROMOTIONAL)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral Test #24*  
*Principal Construction Inspector (PROMOTIONAL)*  
*School Guard Test #12*  
*Special Services Officer I-IV Test #59*  
*Traffic Signal Technician I-II Test #02*  
*X-Ray Technician Test #03*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [21-350CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**

*Payroll/Personnel Assistant*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. [21-351CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Walter Arce, Water Utility Mechanic III, Water Department (29 yrs., 22 days)*  
*Michael Davis, General Maintenance Supervisor II, Energy Resources Department (33 yrs., 8 mos.)*  
*Jim Khith, School Guard, Public Works Department (10 yrs., 8 mos.)*

---

*Karen Thomas, Customer Service Representative III, Financial Management Department (36 yrs., 5 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [21-352CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file disability retirement(s):**

*Sean Parilla, Police Officer, Police Department (21 yrs., 6 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [21-353CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**

*Sarah Adams, Recycling Specialist II, Public Works Department (3 yrs., 2 mos.)*

*Jennifer Ly, Planner III, Development Services Department (2 yrs., 8 mos.)*

*Alejandro Palafox, Garage Service Attendant II, Financial Management Department (4 yrs., 8 mos.)*

*Brandon Pastor, Water Utility Mechanic I, Water Department (2 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Joe Pirooz, Police Officer, Police Department (24 yrs., 1 day)*

*Lisa Sosa, Payroll/Personnel Assistant II, Police Department (3 mos., 2 days)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. [21-354CS](#)

**Recommendation for Permanent Assignment to Former**

**Classification** - *Dan Nguyen, Senior Accountant*

*Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Department of Energy Resources*

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

## REGULAR AGENDA

9. [21-355CS](#)      **COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT** - Building Maintenance Engineer  
*Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer, Department of Public Works*  
*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Staff will correct the title of the agenda item, so that it reflects it is COVID-19 related.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

10. [21-356CS](#)      **COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Jennifer Hayes, Public Safety Dispatcher  
*Communication from Daniel Cunningham, Communications Center Officer, Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications*  
*Staff Report prepared by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A brief discussion took place with Commissioner Arias, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. Runnels regarding the extension. It was mentioned that this item is COVID related because the hiring process slowed down due to the pandemic. It was also mentioned that the department did not want to lose Ms. Hayes, so training components were moved around. The extension will provide additional time for Ms. Hayes to complete the on the job training.

Commissioner Wheeler expressed concern about extending an employee's probationary period as it impacts their morale. She commented that in reviewing her evaluation, it appears that she met all of the requirements and asked why Ms. Hayes' probationary period was being extended beyond the one year. Ms. Runnels explained the training process and is hopeful that she will pass. She has approximately 10 to 12 weeks of training left. Ms. Hayes will also take part in a shadowing phase to ensure there is no regression and to eventually have her work independently.

President Garnica wanted to clarify if this item should be labeled as COVID related. Ms. Pizarro Winting confirmed that it should be labeled as such. Staff will relabel this item to reflect that it is COVID related.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

11. [21-357CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR SELECTIVE CERTIFICATION -**

Business Systems Specialist III (Permitting Systems Administrator)

*Communication from Lea Eriksen, Director, Department of Technology and Innovation*

*Staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Employment Services Officer*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

12. [21-358CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR SELECTIVE CERTIFICATION -**

Business Systems Specialist IV (Permitting Systems Business Analyst)

*Communication from Lea Eriksen, Director, Department of Technology and Innovation*  
*Staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Employment Services Officer*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**13. [21-359CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION FOR SELECTIVE CERTIFICATION -**

Business Systems Specialist VI (ERP Financial Systems Business Analyst Supervisor)

*Communication from Lea Eriksen, Director, Department of Technology and Innovation*

*Staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Employment Services Officer*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**14. [21-360CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED**

**CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - General Maintenance Assistant**

*Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Department of Human Resources*

*Staff report prepared by Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Tamura who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

President Garnica commented that she is happy that staff is updating the classification specifications.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**15. [21-361CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN(S):**

*General Maintenance Assistant*

Commissioner Arias commented that this is a good example of a position that should have as a desirable qualification a diploma or G.E.D. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the Commission will be receiving a report regarding the education requirements.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**16. [21-362CS](#)**

**APPROVE RECOMMENDATION TO RETURN TO THE FORMER PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT PROCESS**

*Communication from Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Commissioner Arias who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Commissioner Arias explained the Special Projects Committee recommends returning to the one-step process. With minor revisions to the form used by staff to request and verify provisional meets all requirements. Certification of selection by the commission should suffice for doing due diligence. Rules state Commission certifies the selection rather than approve the request for the provisional. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that an updated form was provided.



**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

## **17. STANDING COMMITTEES**

### *A. Executive Committee*

The Executive Committee did not have any new information to report.

### *B. Recruitment and Selection Committee*

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond reported that the Recruitment and Selection Committee will be meeting on Thursday, January 13, 2022, to discuss educational requirements.

### *C. Special Projects Committee*

The Special Projects Committee will schedule another meeting once a new member is appointed.

## **18. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

### *A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Slaten was not present to report.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond wanted to thank Ms. Slaten and her team for participating in Supervisor Holly Mitchell's webinar that was geared towards the recruitment of justice youth and systems impacted youth in the foster care system. The webinar consisted of 30 participants thanks to Ms. Slaten spreading the word in Long Beach. She also thanked Ms. Pizarro Winting for her participation as well. Ms. Pizarro Winting will ask Ms. Slaten to provide an update when she returns.

### *B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that staff is hard at work.

*C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo provided an update on the work being performed within her division. She stated this is a busy time for them.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that the department held interviews for the Personnel Analyst vacancies, which were successful. Ms. Pizarro Winting also thanked the Commission for the revision to the provisional appointment process as it will be helpful to the departments. Staff will be sure to work closely with departments as well to ensure all questions are asked. She reported that the business meeting scheduled for next week is the last meeting of the year and we have another full agenda.

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Ms. Camerino was recognized at City Council as Employee of the Month for December. The Commission congratulated Ms. Camerino for her recognition.

President Garnica also thanked Civil Service team for getting the agenda items together while there is so much taking place.

**19. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

There was no unfinished business to discuss.

**20. NEW BUSINESS**

President Garnica announced that due to personal and professional commitments, Vice President Dowling has resigned from his position as a commissioner. Commissioner Arias is sorry to see him leave as he brought a unique perspective to the Commission. She hopes that a celebration or gathering can be arranged after the holidays. Commissioner Wheeler stated that Vice President Dowling will be sorely missed. Although her time with the Commission has been short, she enjoyed his perspective on some of the issues. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond will miss his perspective and his words. Although he did not speak much, his words were impactful to the point where she shifted her thought process on an item. President Garnica added that she enjoys everyone's perspective, but Vice President Dowling offered a new one. She is not certain when Mayor Garcia will appoint a new commissioner but for the purpose of discussion, she announced that Commissioner Wheeler will be moving into the Vice President position. She informed the

Commission that approval for the appointment will be placed on the next business meeting agenda.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond hopes that staff will be able to take the time to gather and celebrate this holiday season. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that she plans to have a discussion with staff. President Garnica also looks forward for the Commission and staff getting together when time permits.

**21. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:01 a.m.

**NO HEARING**

---

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។