

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAS2109-07
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
761 Obispo Ave
November 30, 2021**

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission) and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings:

The subject site is located at 761 Obispo Avenue, on the west side of Obispo Avenue between East 8th Street and East 7th Street. A 10-foot-wide alley ends at the northwest corner of the site but does not provide vehicular access to the site. The subject site is located in the R-2-N (Two-Family Residential District with Standard Lots) Zoning District. The property is also located in the Rose Park Historic Landmark District (Ordinance C-7497), which was established in 1997.

The subject site totals 6,750 square feet of area (50'-0" x 135'-0"), and is developed with a two-story, 4-unit, multi-family dwelling. The buildings on the property also include a detached five-car garage at the rear.

The subject structure is located approximately 16 feet from the front property line along Obispo Avenue. The front and east building elevations are visible from Obispo Avenue due to the location of the driveway along the eastern side of the property. The structure was built in 1971 and is not listed as a contributing resource to the Rose Park Historic District. The structure maintains the massing, orientation and design of its original construction and features a shingle roof, stucco, stone façade treatment at the front facade, overhanging eaves, and aluminum windows. The structure still retains some of the original aluminum windows at the various elevations.

On April 10, 2020, the property owner was issued a Code Enforcement citation (Number CEPH268505) for unpermitted window and door replacement without the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness or the issuance of a building permit. A total of five (5) windows and one (1) patio sliding door were noted in the citation. Deteriorated roof fascia was also cited but is not subject to this appeal. On July 16, 2021, the property owner submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness (minor) application requesting the approval (retroactively) for the installation of the vinyl windows and door with a request to also paint the aluminum windows white to correspond with the vinyl windows that were installed.

LBMC Section 2.63.080 establishes specific regulations that permit staff to consider and issue (minor) Certificate of Appropriateness applications for projects such as the replacement of windows and doors with like materials. On October 1, 2021, staff denied the Certificate of Appropriateness application. LBMC Section 2.63.100 states that determinations made by staff on behalf of the Director of Development Services may be appealed by the Applicant to the Cultural Heritage Commission.

The approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness is subject to compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission) and the Rose Park Historic District Ordinance. Any replacement windows should be selected for their compatibility and appropriateness with the surrounding district context, character, and architectural styles.

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Rose Park Historic District Ordinance, and the Rose Park Historic District Design Guidelines, staff has analyzed the proposed project and found the project does not meet these requirements; therefore, it is appropriate to deny the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, legalizing the installation of five (5) vinyl windows and one (1) vinyl sliding door on the multi-family residential building would affect historical, architectural, and aesthetic features of the subject property and the Rose Park Historic District as a whole. The Rose Park Historic District Ordinance restates, "Demolitions, alterations, additions, and all environmental changes shall be regulated by the provisions of Chapter 2.63 of the Long Beach Municipal Code and in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's "Standard for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings." Alterations to windows qualifies as a change that requires a Certificate of Appropriateness and conformance with applicable historic guidelines and standards. Important architectural features, such as windows and doors, should be consistent with the original materials and architectural style of the building. Therefore, any alterations with substitute materials that are different from those that are characteristic of the style of the structure is not permitted. The vinyl windows are not compatible and are out of character with the building's architectural style, which retains some of the original aluminum windows from when the building was constructed in 1971. The approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to allow non-compatible, vinyl windows and a vinyl sliding door, is not consistent with the spirit or intent for the preservation of the structures nor the Rose Park Historic District as a whole.

The Certificate of Appropriateness application includes a proposal to paint the original aluminum windows to match the unpermitted vinyl windows and door that were installed to achieve a uniform look. While overall window/door compatibility and consistency is sought through the Certificate of Appropriateness review process, the vinyl material remains incompatible with the style of the structure. In this application, it is the use of incompatible materials, rather than window/door

color, that is the subject of the staff denial as the required findings cannot be made to support the legalization of vinyl windows/doors.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There is an active code enforcement case at this site (CEPH268505). The current vinyl windows and vinyl patio door were installed without the required building permits and Certificate of Appropriateness.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The Rose Park Historic District requires that all changes to the exterior of a building located in a historic district comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (the Standards). The objective and goals of the Standards are to preserve historic materials and features of buildings and retain and preserve the historic character of a property, as well as compatibility with the district as a whole. Secretary of the Interior Standard No. 6 requires: "Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence." Therefore, the removal of historic materials or the altering of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided and deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design and material. The proposed vinyl material does not match the original aluminum windows in design, color, or texture nor is it visually compatible with the architectural style of the subject structure or the district as a whole. Windows are considered important features of a building in historic districts that have ability to significantly alter character and replacing them with an incompatible material such as vinyl does not comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

The existing site is a developed site in the Rose Park Historic District. The proposed vinyl windows would be out of character with the architectural style of the subject building and period of period of significance of the of the District (adjacent structures). The existing site maintains original aluminum windows from the time of construction. Non-contributing buildings within the district are also subject to the Secretary of the Interior Standards and many non-contributing structures in the district maintain windows that are appropriate for and consistent with their architectural styles and periods of construction. Nearby properties are also required to maintain consistency with the district regulations pertaining to windows, and therefore, the legalization of vinyl windows at the subject site could

affect the integrity of the district (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9).

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The apartment building was first constructed in 1971, which is outside the period of significance for the historic district. However, although the property is classified as a non-contributing property within the Historic District, it is still subject to the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness and conformance with applicable historic guidelines and standards. The Rose Park Historic District and Secretary of the Interior Standards state that historic windows should always be regularly maintained, protected and repaired rather than replaced. The preservation of historically and/or architecturally appropriate windows is critical to maintaining the character of a property and its compatibility with the district as a whole. Any replacement of original (aluminum) windows, should have been with materials that are characteristic of the architecture style and the time of construction of the structure, which, in this case, is aluminum windows. The introduction of incompatible materials, such as vinyl, is out of character with architecture style of the apartment building and therefore does not comply with the Rose Park Historic District Ordinance and Rose Park Historic District Design Guidelines.