

November 29, 2022

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS
City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow a 637-square-foot two-story addition to the rear of an existing two-story single-family home and a 56 square-foot expansion of the basement level of the dwelling. The scope of work includes a 215 square-foot single-car garage with an attached carport to the existing 2-car garage; and a 103 square-foot accessory addition to the garage. A 965-square-foot second floor accessory dwelling unit (ADU) over the garage is also a part of this project, however due to State legislation, it is deemed approved, as it has been over 61-days since application. Hence, it is not under their purview for review and consideration by CHC.

The property is located at 2749 E. Ocean Boulevard in the Two-Family Residential District with Large Lots (R-2-L) Zoning District. It is a Contributor to the Bluff Park Historic District. (District 2)

APPLICANT: Nagy Bakhoun, RA,
Obelisk Architects
3800 Pacific Coast Highway
Torrance, CA 90505
(Application No. COAC2203-01)

THE REQUEST

The applicant requests approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 637 square-foot two-story addition to the rear of an existing two-story single-family home, and a 56 square-foot addition at the basement level. Additional proposed work includes the construction of a 215 square-foot single-car garage with a carport attached to the existing two-car garage (total area of 699 square-feet), and 290 square-foot total of accessory space.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is bounded by Ocean Boulevard to the south, a 20-foot-wide alley to the north, Molino Avenue to the west, and Temple Avenue to the east (Attachment A – Location Map). It is located in the R-2-L zone (Two Family District with Large Lots). The lot size totals



CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

November 29, 2022

Page 2 of 9

11,000 square feet and is improved with a two-story 3,608-square foot, dwelling with a 506 square-foot basement, 280 square-foot deck, and a detached 483 square-foot two-car garage with an attached 186 square-foot accessory structure located at the rear of the lot.

Staff has received inquiries from the public regarding this case. Staff has responded to several inquire is and has held a meeting with the neighborhood association and Long Beach Heritage. We understand that there is considerable public interest in this public hearing. The various parties and applicant have been encouraged to meet with each other, but scheduling and other impediments may have prevented such meetings from occurring. Staff has proposed conditions and worked with the applicant on design changes in specific response to the valuable public input received.

Existing Front Dwelling with Detached Two-Car Garage

The residence was constructed in 1919 and was designed by architect Irving J. Gill. Irving Gill, born in Tully, New York on April 26, 1870, is recognized for his role in the Modern Architecture Movement through his creative use of forms and aesthetics by incorporated new ideas, materials, and technical advances. Considered a Master Architect, many of his works are located in the greater Los Angeles and San Diego areas. Gill's most recognizable work of the 1910s is characterized by the use of flat roofs without eaves, concrete as a primary construction material, casement windows with transoms above, white walls, rectangular massing, and ground-level arches creating transitional breezeways. Unfortunately, although extensive research was undertaken by staff to obtain copies of original plans of this building, they were unsuccessful in time for this Hearing.

The smooth white stucco dwelling incorporates flat roofs of varying heights, arches along the primary elevation, a portico, and porte-cochere. It measures 25-feet-1-inch in height, and 27 feet wide along the front (south) elevation, spanning to approximately 40 feet in width towards the rear (north/tertiary) elevation. The residence retains wood windows (fixed and casement with transoms). The primary elevation along East Ocean Boulevard features projecting glazed arched bays at the east and west of portions. The west arch incorporates a sunroom, and is topped by a high parapet wall, providing a rooftop a deck (Attachment B –Site Photos).

Irving Gill employed a distinct hierarchy of elevations, with a clearly defined primary elevation embodying the greatest architectural detail, with less so on the secondary, and even fewer ornamental features on the tertiary. The proposed addition is located on the latter. The tertiary (north / rear) elevation is defined by a single-story wing at the east dominated by paired French doors flanked by matching fixed windows. To the right, a five-part ribbon window, an arched door atop a flight of five stairs, followed by the arched port cochere wing recessed from the plane of the rear elevation. The second story is topped by two differing heights of a flat roof. A wrought iron balcony sits atop the single-story wing followed by a broad expanse of solid masonry, and by two slider windows of different heights.

The existing detached two-car garage is accessed from a curb-cut and semi-curbed driveway from Ocean Boulevard, as well as an existing 20-foot wide alley along the rear (north) of the site. The two-car garage measures 483 square-feet in size and approximately 11-feet in height, it was designed to match the historic home incorporating a smooth white stucco finish. The garage is located within the northwesterly most portion of the site, along the interior side and rear property lines. The garage space features a bedroom with a closet, $\frac{3}{4}$ bathroom and that has access from the garage and French doors on the western elevation that will be removed as a part of this project.

ANALYSIS

The proposed rear addition will be recessed from the side the existing historic home and will embed a newly-minted coin signifying the associated date, such that the new construction is clearly discernable. No modifications are proposed to the single-story wing. The addition will be located to the immediate right (west) of the ribbon window and will incorporate a flat roof at a lower height to that of the existing building. It requires removal of an arched door on the first story of the rear elevation, The door location will be noted via a reveal or molding, while the door itself will be recorded in photographs and drawings, and will be integrated as an interior feature, and thus allow for future restoration. One of two windows on the second story will be infilled, while a window will be added to the right of the chimney addition. Gill's differentiation and hierarchy of elevations through architectural detail will be maintained, including the solid to void relationships, and asymmetry of the rear elevation.

The proposed 215 square-foot attached third garage space will match the principal structure and existing garage exterior smooth white stucco finish, will include a new aluminum roll-up sectional garage door and a stain grade wood door leading into the proposed vestibule. As proposed, the new garage will be attached to the existing footprint and will match the interior clearance of 9-feet-5-inches of the two-car garage. The interior of the proposed garage space will include a width of 9-feet-4-inches and depth of 20-feet-8-inches, which aligns with the minimum space requirements of a standard parking space.

The proposed project requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because the project includes additions to a Contributor to the Bluff Park Historic District. In order for approval to be granted, the project must comply with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* (for Rehabilitation and New Construction) and meet the Criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

DISCUSSION

The proposed addition has been designed to be compatible with the historic building's architecture. The rear addition measures 21-foot 10-inch in height, lower than the existing building (25 foot 1 $\frac{7}{8}$ inches). The addition will incorporate a smooth stucco finish, windows matching the existing on the tertiary elevation, a second chimney, bi-folding doors along the at the east elevation, and will include a balcony on the second story with railing to match the existing. The western side elevation has been 1-foot to help further differentiate the addition

from the original. The addition will accommodate an interior remodel of the residence, as well as include a new family room on the first floor and an additional bedroom on the second floor.

The existing garage footprint will remain, and will be retrofitted to allow the construction of the ADU on the second floor. The existing access from East Ocean Boulevard will be retained; while the garage door along the alley will be increased by 18-inches in compliance with the City’s required turning radius. A workshop with a half-bathroom, and a gym will be incorporated into the existing two-car garage, which will also match the existing garage doors. The third garage will be constructed adjacent to the workshop, and be set back 4-feet from the rear property line. A carport is proposed attached to the east of the garage, that will include an arched opening similar to that on the residence (Attachment C – Plans).

This project complies with development standards per Long Beach Municipal Code Section 21.31 as illustrated in Table 1 below:

Table 1 – Code Compliance

Development Standards	Required		Proposed	
Setbacks	Addition	Front	30'	30'-11 1/2" (existing)
		Sides	4'	12'-5 1/2" (west) 26'-11 3/4" (east)
		Rear	10' (measured from centerline of the alley)	88'-0 1/2"
	ADU	Front	30'	162'-7 1/2"
		Sides	4'	4'-9 1/16" (west) 4'-0" (east)
		Rear	4' (measured from centerline of the alley)	14'
Building Height	Addition	35'-0"/ 2 stories		21'-10 3/16"
	ADU	25f'-0"/2 stories		22'-3 7/8"
Lot Coverage	40% max (4,400 SF)		2,524 SF (22%)	
Floor Area Ratio	N/A		N/A	
Parking	2 spaces (ADU is exempt)		3 spaces	
Open Space	8% (880 SF)		2,269 SF (20%)	

Consistency with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards*:

- 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.**

The proposed project will not change the use of the property. The property will remain a residence.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

No modifications are proposed for the primary elevation. Minor alterations to the rear (tertiary) elevation of the dwelling will occur to accommodate the two-story expansion. As these features are located on the tertiary elevation, they are of less significance, than those on the primary or secondary elevations. An arched door is proposed to be removed, however it will be documented and relocated as an interior architectural element. The smallest window at the second story will also be removed. Again, it is not a significant historic feature.

The existing two-car garage will remain and will be structurally retrofitted to allow the construction of the ADU on the second floor. Additional accessory space and third garage space has been included as a part of this project and will not affect the historic characteristics of the primary building as a Contributor to the Bluff Park Historic District.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project has been designed to be compatible with the architectural style of the historic dwelling while incorporating design features to differentiate the new construction.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

No change-over-time has been noted.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

The proposed project will remove one arched door (which will be documented and reused). While the smallest second-story window requires removal.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The project does not include removal of any deteriorated historic features.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Not applicable. No chemical or physical treatments are proposed.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

No known archeological resources are located at this property. However, if archeological resources are encountered during excavation and demolition, they will be treated as deemed appropriate.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project has been designed to be compatible with the Irving Gill historic residence, while including design features to differentiate the new construction by a lower building height. A newly minted coin will be embedded into the corner of the new addition. The addition and new garage are compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the original home. The proposed door to be removed will be recorded and reused.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The new addition to the rear of the dwelling and new detached construction could be removed in the future without destroying the essential form and integrity of the historic property or its environment. The arched door removed for construction of the rear elevation will be documented and reused within the interior, such that if restoration is planned in the future, it can be returned to its original location. Only the small second story window proposed to be removed, would require reconstruction.

The Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance states:

- All exterior modifications require compliance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - Project conforms, as indicated above
- New construction in the District conforms to the bulk and mass, scale, and height of the majority of existing structures on both sides of the street on the block on which the new structure is to be erected.
 - The new construction will not be visible in any direction.

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

November 29, 2022

Page 7 of 9

- The style of architecture, the use of materials and the landscape treatment shall not be uncharacteristically different from the predominant style for the immediate surroundings.
 - The proposed addition incorporates materials of the Irving Gill dwelling.
- New structures shall not be painted or otherwise finished on the exterior in colors and architectural details which would be out of character with the general architecture style of the predominant on the block on which the new structure is to be located
 - The materials and colors proposed are consistent with this historic home.
- Driveways and garage entrances shall conform to the existing standard on the block on which the new building is erected.

The project incorporates the principles of the Bluff Park Historic District Design Guidelines as follows:

- The addition should not envelop or be larger than the existing building and should be no wider than the existing footprint.
 - The addition is significantly smaller than the existing dwelling.
- Rear additions should not be taller than the existing roofline.
 - The rear addition has a lower height than the historic residence.
- The addition should be planned and constructed in a way that does not involve removing, obstructing, or damaging any existing historic features.
 - As previously stated, will remove one arched door (which will be documented and reused. While the smallest second-story window requires removal.
- All additions should be compatible with, yet distinguishable from the original building.
 - The proposed project has been designed to be compatible with the architectural style of the historic dwelling while incorporating design features to differentiate the new construction.
- Additions should always add to the existing footprint of the building; new construction should never involve removal of a portion of the original residence or site features.
 - As previously stated, will remove one arched door (which will be documented and reused. While the smallest second-story window requires removal.

The two-story addition to the rear of the existing dwelling, the new garage, and the expanded accessory structures comply with the requirements of the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance and Design Guidelines. The project will maintain an appropriate building scale compatible with the context of both the Historic District, and the immediate block. The addition and new detached accessory structures have been designed to be compatible with the existing home. As proposed, this project will not adversely affect the overall character of the Historic District and will blend into the surrounding neighborhood.

As detailed above, the proposed project is consistent with the City's development standards for the R-2-L Zoning District, the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance, and the Bluff Park Historic District Design Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

November 29, 2022

Page 8 of 9

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code, the *Secretary of the Interiors' Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance, and the Bluff Park Historic District Design Guidelines (Attachment D - Findings).

With the recommended Special Conditions, staff supports approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness request. All the Findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions, materials, and colors to the existing building on the property and in the context of the Historic District. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Conditions of Approval (Attachment E - Conditions of Approval).

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorically Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (new construction or conversion of small structures) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

Public notices were distributed on November 11, 2022. As of this date, no letters were received in response to this project.

Respectfully submitted,



SERGIO GUTIERREZ
PROJECT PLANNER



ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER



ANDRÉA URBAS, AICP CEP CUD
ACTING ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

November 29, 2022

Page 9 of 9

Attachments: Attachment A – Location Map
Attachment B – Site Photos
Attachment C – Plans
Attachment D – Findings
Attachment E – Conditions of Approval