

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, APRIL 1, 2020  
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD CIVIC  
CHAMBERS, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President  
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner  
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE HELD VIA  
TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20  
ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM.**

**THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC.**

**PUBLIC WILL HAVE THE OPTION TO USE eCOMMENT TO  
ADDRESS THE COMMISSION. WRITTEN COMMENTS  
MAY ALSO BE SUBMITTED VIA  
EMAIL TO CIVILSERVICE@LONGBEACH.GOV.**

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:39 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Vice President Morrison to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather  
**Present:** Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

1. [20-074CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Special Meeting of March 13, 2020*  
*Regular Meeting of March 18, 2020*  
*Dismissal Hearing 06-D-1819 Minutes of March 4 and March 11, 2020*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve the Special Meeting Minutes of March 13, 2020. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes of March 18, 2020. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve the Dismissal Hearing 06-D-1819 Minutes of March 4 and March 11, 2020. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 10):**

Ms. Pizarro Winting requested to pull Agenda Item No. 7 for a separate discussion. In addition, Commissioner Arias requested to pull Agenda Item No. 8 for a separate discussion.

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve the Consent Calendar as amended, to exclude Agenda Item Nos. 7 and 8. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

2. [20-075CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Civil Engineering Associate Test #11 (Established 03/18/20)*  
*Electrician Test #05 (Established 03/24/20)*  
*Refuse Operator Test #25 (Established 03/23/20)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. [20-076CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**  
*Terminal Services Representative*  
*Water Utility Mechanic*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [20-077CS](#)      **Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**  
*Jeffrey Brown, Administrative Analyst III, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine (14 yrs., 10 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. [20-078CS](#)      **Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**  
*Antonio Ibarra, Police Officer, Police Department (1 yr., 2 mos.)*  
*Rachel Masai, Police Officer, Police Department (6 mos., 21 days)*  
*John-Joseph Nakamura, Police Officer, Police Department (6 mos., 19 days)*  
*Nicholas Wright, Maintenance Assistant III, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine (3 yrs., 2 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [20-079CS](#)      **Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**  
*Suspension Appeal 04-S-1718*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [20-080CS](#)

**Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Maria Alvarez, Maria Armenta, Jose Castro Monico, Irma Gonzalez, Guadalupe Martinez, Maria Harris, Terri Myers, Pamela Shannon and Marcus Williford, Maintenance Assistants Non-Career  
*Communication from Robert G. Luna, Chief of Police, Police Department*  
*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this request. She informed the Commission the Police Department would like to revise the request removing all names except for Jose Castro Monico and Marcus Williford.

A discussion ensued with Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Garnica and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the extensions. Only those individuals who are close to their hour limits are being asked for an extension. It was discussed that the additional hours will take employees beyond nine months. It was discussed that employees listed would be assisting with the COVID-19 emergency.

Commissioner Arias believes it is important to revisit the Civil Service rule that discusses the extension and to make sure that we are following it. It would be a good opportunity to revisit some of the efficiencies that were made in the past and look at them with fresh eyes.

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve this item as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

8. [20-081CS](#)

**Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Alexis Miranda and Allison Fritz, Administrative Interns  
*Communication from Robert G. Luna, Chief of Police, Police Department*

*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Dowling, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. Marin Jordan.

It was discussed that this should have been two separate agenda items. Ms. Fritz appears to have enough hours to make it to her anniversary date. If her hours are extended, she does have the potential to be considered a fulltime employee. The concern is that we need to be careful with allowing non-careers to work fulltime. It was discussed that the interns have been given additional duties due to COVID-19. It was discussed that Ms. Fritz has already received specific training so that she could cover the responsibilities of the fulltime employee who is no longer able to continue working. By approving this request, the Police Department will be able to utilize sworn personnel in other areas rather than using them to cover this position.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**9. [20-037CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -  
Traffic Engineer**

*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works*

*Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the  
Consent Calendar.**

**10. [20-082CS](#)**

**Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible  
Lists (6 months)**

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

*Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #13 (04/30/2019)*

*Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-20) Test #16 (10/10/2019)*

Buyer (C13AN-19) Test #01 (1/22/2019)  
Civil Engineer (K11NN-19) Test #05 (4/3/2019)  
Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #09 (10/24/2019)  
Civil Engineering Associate (K13NN-20) Test #07 (10/24/2019)  
Deputy Fire Marshal (AT5NN-19) Test #01 (1/8/2019)  
Deputy Fire Marshal (AT5NN-19) Test #02 (1/29/2019)  
Housing Aide (HS1AN-18) Test #01 (9/14/2018)  
Housing Assistance Coordinator (C39NN-18) (9/11/2018)  
Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-19) Test #02 (10/17/2019)  
Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (Nd4AN-20B) Test #04 (10/7/2019)  
Permit Technician (ED6AN-19) (4/10/2019)  
Plan Checker - Fire Prevention (KA4NN-20) Test #07 (10/11/2019) -  
**1 Month**  
Plan Checker - Plumbing (K41AN-20) Test #05 (10/11/2019) - **4**  
**Months**  
Planner (F53AN-19) Test #02 (10/23/2018)  
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #01 (4/2/2019)  
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #08 (4/18/2019)  
Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #13 (10/24/2019)  
Public Health Nutritionist (G21AN-20) Test #03 (10/23/2019)  
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-18A) Test #01  
(4/23/2018)  
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test #08  
(10/10/2019)  
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-18B) Test #01  
(4/23/2018)  
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #08  
(10/10/2019)  
Refuse Operator (JA2AN-20) Test #21 (10/2/2019)  
Registered Nurse (G11AN-19) Test #08 (4/3/2019)  
Senior Program Manager - Water (MC5NN-19) Test #03 (4/29/2019)  
Senior Structural Engineer (K65NN-19) Test #03 (4/2/2019)  
Senior Traffic Engineer (K68NN-20) Test #04 (10/2/2019)  
Special Services Officer (F33AN-18) Test #26 (4/23/2018)  
Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #32 (10/4/2018)  
Special Services Officer (F33AN-20) Test #39 (10/3/2019)  
Systems Support Specialist (H69AN-18) Test #11 (4/2/2019)  
Systems Support Specialist (H69AN-20) Test #13 (10/29/2019)  
Systems Technician (H70AN-19) Test #02 (4/9/2019)

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

**11. [20-083CS](#) REQUEST TO AUTHORIZE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO SERVE AS  
DESIGNEE FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION TO APPROVE  
EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL AND NON-CAREER APPOINTMENTS  
DURING CITY STATE OF EMERGENCY**

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item. Authorizing Ms. Pizarro Winting to be the designee for extensions would assist departments in meeting staffing needs during the City's state of emergency.

A discussion ensued with Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Garnica and Ms. Pizarro Winting.

It was discussed that requests would follow the current process in place. The request would then be placed on the Consent Calendar for Commission to approve.

It was discussed that departments did not anticipate the City's state of emergency and that some departments may find a need to extend hours of non-career employees now where they would not have thought to do so previously. At this point it is difficult to predict what departments needs might be. Civil Service staff would like to take a proactive approach should the need arise. It will allow staff to tighten up requests that come before the Commission. It will also allow staff to do a better job with tracking requests.

President Gonzalez Edmond and Vice President Morrison thanked Ms. Pizarro Winting for trying to be proactive given the current situation of the City.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

12. [20-087CS](#)

**REQUEST TO AUGMENT PREVIOUSLY APPROVED REQUEST FOR A TEMPORARY TRANSFER OF PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE, REGISTERED NURSE AND MICROBIOLOGIST CLASSIFICATIONS TO THE UNCLASSIFIED SERVICE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES**

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this request. The Department of Health and Human Services found that there is a need for additional Microbiologists. Staff would like to augment the request previously approved and allow the department the authority to hire as many Public Health Nurses, Registered Nurses and Microbiologists as needed.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commission Dowling, Commissioner Arias and Ms. Pizarro Winting.

It was discussed that creating a blanket approval to allow departments to hire classified positions in the unclassified service would not be a good idea. It is preferred that requests come to the Commission for approval.

President Gonzalez Edmond requested to add “during the City State of Emergency” at the end of this agenda item.

**A motion was made by President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

13. [20-084CS](#)

**DISCUSSION ON UTILIZATION OF THE UNCLASSIFIED SERVICE IN THE HARBOR DEPARTMENT**

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this discussion. Ms. Pizarro Winting wanted to clarify what is allowed in the classified and the unclassified service. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that the City Charter gives the Harbor



Department the ability to create unclassified positions. She went over the information contained in the City Charter that is specific to positions in the Harbor Department. Ms. Pizarro Winting will be working together with the Harbor Department to ensure the threshold is being met in the specific areas.

Ms. Stacey Lewis, Director of Human Resources for the Harbor Department, was available for questions and thanked Ms. Pizarro Winting for her leadership.

Commissioner Arias commended the Civil Service and Harbor Departments for working together in this cooperative spirit.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to receive and file this item. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

14. [20-071CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE CIVIL SERVICE RULE 116 TO INCLUDE SPECIFIC LANGUAGE PERTAINING TO THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S PERFORMANCE EVALUATION AND TO DIRECT STAFF TO BEGIN THE NECESSARY PROCESS FOR CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL**

President Gonzalez Edmond briefed the Commission regarding this item. The Commission wanted to align the Executive Director's performance evaluation with the approval for the additional Executive Leave.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, Mr. Anderson and Ms. Pizarro Winting.

It was discussed that rather than making this a rule change, the Commission could create a policy to support the rule. It was discussed that Rule 116 is not specific as to when the evaluation should occur. It was clarified that there is a section related to staff administration in the Civil Service Policies and Procedures that the Commission did not have in their book. It was discussed that there is a policy on performance evaluations.

President Gonzalez Edmond recommended that the President and Vice President review the current Policies and Procedures to see if there is an appropriate place to include language pertaining to the Executive Director's performance evaluation.

After discussion, the Commission decided to pull this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to withdraw this item. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

15. [20-085CS](#)

**DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATION REGARDING  
TELECONFERENCING OR VIDEO CONFERENCING FOR HEARINGS**

President Gonzalez Edmond briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Attorneys at Law, Mike Peters, Jim Trott and Ken Yuwiler attended via teleconference to provide their recommendations regarding future hearings. There seemed to be a consensus that in person hearings would be in the best interest of both sides and to provide a continuance to hearings that have been scheduled. Teleconference and Video Conference hearings would not be sufficient as there could be potential for a variety of issues from technical to documentation. The Commission concurred with the recommendations of the attorneys as they made very good points.

It was discussed that since there is uncertainty as to when in person hearings would take place, continuing them until after May would be in the best interest of all who would be in attendance.

It was moved that hearings currently on calendar for April and May be continued to June, at which time Civil Service staff will reach out to attorneys for rescheduling.

**A motion was made by President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation to reschedule hearings to June. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**16. [20-086CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF**

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S REPORT - Disability**

Retirement Appeal 16-DR-1516 / Mailed to CSC on February 7, 2020

*Report prepared by Carmen D. Snuggs, Administrative Law Judge*

This item will be held over until the next Civil Service Commission meeting to provide an opportunity for all attorneys to speak as the attorney representing the appellant was not in attendance.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, that the item be laid over to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

**Absent:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**17. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

*A. Recruitment Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Ms. Slaten was not present to report as she is working full-time at the Emergency Operations Center (EOC). Ms. Slaten is tasked with managing spontaneous and affiliate volunteers as well as donations along with Maria Macias. In addition, Ms. Slaten is also tasked with coordinating staffing requests at the EOC. She is working with Human Resources to backfill positions within the departments as their staff are utilized in different areas of the city due to COVID-19.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald informed the Commission that in their efforts to support the COVID-19 emergency, staff is expediting exams. Newly appointed Personnel Analysts will be working with Ms. Sheree Valdoria to quickly post the Public Health Nurse and Public Health Nurse Supervisor bulletins.

While balancing requests and managing processes, Ms. McDonald has already completed 14.5 hours of training with the new Personnel Analysts with exam development and Civil Service action requests.

*C. Administration Support Services - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo provided an update on the budget to the Commission.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Civil Service staff are amazing. Civil Service staff have been telecommuting using Zoom and WebEx to train and meet. Staff are working very hard to meet the needs of the City.

Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked the Commission for their ability to allow flexibility in the rules. It will allow Civil Service staff to put departments at ease in a few areas. She reported that staff is still moving forward with classified recruitments and will have opportunities to see how examinations will be conducted using various forms of technology, such as Skype, Montage, online testing, etc. Although it has been challenging, it is definitely very rewarding to work with a team that is willing to come up with new ideas and move things forward. Staff is working very hard and we appreciate the support of the Commission.

Vice President Morrison thanked Ms. Pizarro Winting and stated that she appreciates her as well as staff with everything that is being done.

## **18. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

*A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service*

Commissioner Arias wanted if there has been any movement with the policy. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that there have been some conversations that took place with the union. Civil Service staff will now need to meet with Human Resources.

*B. Subcommittee to Study City Employee Credit System*

Commissioner Dowling provided an update. The Subcommittee met on Friday, March 27th. Subcommittee members are in the process of reviewing prior documents and

correspondence.

## **19. NEW BUSINESS**

The Commission discussed public comments. President Gonzalez Edmond informed everyone of the new process. Commissioners discussed keeping comments on the agenda so that there is a place for Civil Service staff to read them to the Commission.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Vice President Morrison adjourned the meeting at 11:05 a.m.

## **NO HEARING**

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។