ł	<b>C-5</b>			
1 2 3 4	CLIVE S. MARTIN Attorney at Law SBN 40938 6318 Marina Pacifica Drive, No. Long Beach, CA 90803 Phone: (562) 436-2281 Fax: (562) 799-9194			
5 6 7	CLIVE S. MARTIN Hearing Officer, Administrative Appeal			
8	CITY OF LONG BEACH,			
9	CALIFORNIA			
10				
10	IN THE ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL ) FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF )			
12	FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT)REPORT OF FINDINGS,REVOCATION OF BUSINESS LICENSES)CONCLUSIONS AND			
13	BU20134560 & BU20447180 ISSUED TO ) DECISIONS. ACCO ENTERPRISES, d.b.a. GAMEPLAY, )			
14	6543 E. SPRING STREET, LONG BEACH ) Date: 08/05/2005			
15	Applicant and Appellant			
16				
17	CITY COUNSEL FOR THE CITY OF LONG BEACH: This is a consolidated appeal			
18	of the revocations of Business Licenses BU20134560 and BU20447180 issued to Gameplay and			
19	to ACCO Enterprises, d.b.a. Gameplay located at 6543 East Spring Street, Long Beach. On			
20	October 19, 2004 following a business license revocation hearing a decision was handed down			
21	by James A. Gooden, Business Services Director revoking the Business License BU20134560			
22	held by Gameplay. On November 23, 2004 following a business license revocation hearing a			
23	decision was handed down by Pamela Wilson-Horgan, Manager, Commercial Services Bureau			
24	revoking Business License BU20447180 issued to ACCO Enterprises, Inc. Pursuant to Long			
25	Beach Municipal Code Section 3.80.429.5, ACCO Enterprises doing business as Gameplay			
26	timely filed an appeal to both revocation decisions. Commencing April 6 concluding June 21,			
27	2005 a hearing was held on this consolidated appeal. The hearing consisted of the reported			
28	sworn testimony of eleven witnesses (including two appellant witnesses) and the introduction, by			

**F**...

both the City of Long Beach and appellants, of seventy-one exhibits. After review of all the
 testimony and exhibits, it is this hearing officers decision affirming both revocation decisions and
 recommend that both Business Licenses BU20134560 and BU20447180 remain revoked.

## **REGARDING BUSINESS LICENSE BU20134560**

## EVIDENCE AND TESTIMONY

In late 2003 and early 2004 the Long Beach Police Department were notified by security
investigators at Target Stores that they were experiencing a large number of thefts and burglaries
at local stores. These thefts were of video games, game systems and DVD movies and were
documented by surveillance photographs showing suspects committing these thefts. The
resulting police investigation resulted in the arrest of one of these suspects, John Leonard Gallow
on January 27, 2004.

Mr. Gallow was quite cooperative with the police in their investigation and after being 13 fully advised of his rights of silence and counsel by the detectives, he fully admitted to the 14 15 charges, and more, even to the extent of signing a written confession "...with no promises of leniency or reward" [City exhibit # 2]. Furthermore, Gallow identified himself in Target 16 17 surveillance photos of him entering the store located at 2270 Bellflower Blvd., Long Beach [City #2 & 3]. In essence Mr. Gallow said that he goes to stores like Target and steals video games 18 and game systems and sells them. He was in effect a sales agent and in this case he named a 19 video store called Gameplay as his principal. Gameplay is owned and operated by ACCO 20 21 Enterprises Inc., a California corporation, Appellant herein, and is located at a shopping mall at 22 6543 East Spring Street. To the employees there, Gallow is known only as "Poncho". Gallow, 23 who had been plying his trade for sometime, would regularly be provided with a list of desired items and he would simple go to the store and "fill" it. He would then return to Gameplay and 24 25 sell them for an agreed to price. Gallow told investigators that he would regularly deal with 26 "Walter" who he believe to be the store owner and "Henry", "Richard" and "Ramon". As part of

27 28

4

5

6

the follow up investigation Gallow agreed to introduce Detective Lawrence Arnwine to an 1 employee at Gameplay as his uncle. He then placed a recorded phone call to Ramon telling him 2 that his uncle would be bringing in some merchandise in his place. Target security personnel -3 provided Detective Arnwine with specific merchandise and on two occasions he went to 4 Gameplay and exchanged them for money. On the last, February 3, 2004, Detective Arnwine 5 was provided with \$3000 worth of cataloged and photographed video games, game systems and 6 DVDs. A team of officers and Target security personnel armed with a search warrant 7 (Appellant's Exhibit Q) were standing by as undercover Detective Arnwine returned to 8 Gameplay with the merchandise. These items were delivered to Gameplay employee Ramon 9 Lim in exchange for \$1,245. Officers immediately entered the store, arrested Mr. Lim recovered 10 the merchandise and money, searched the premises seizing numerous records, surveillance tapes, 11 equipment and items of merchandise. The merchandise was itemized on a property report 12 consisting of 187 pages (City Exhibit 41). While at the store detectives also interviewed several 13 employees. 14

Ramon Lim was also interviewed by detectives. Like Gallow, he also was very 15 cooperative and agreed to make a written statement which he signed after advisement of his 16 rights and again "...with no promises of leniency or reward" (City Exhibit # 10). Lim 17 acknowledged buying merchandise from a guy (Detective Arnwine) just before his arrest. The 18 guy told him that the merchandise was stolen and he called Griselda at the Venice store and 19 asked her if it was alright to buy it. She said that it was so he examined the items and checked 20 them against the list of wanted items and their prices, took the money from the back room safe, 21 \$1,245, and gave to the, soon to be discovered, detective. Lim told detectives much about store 22 procedure especially about the practice of buying stolen merchandise. He had worked at 23 Gameplay five days per week for three years, three days in the Long Beach store and two days in 24 the Venice store. He was considered a trusted employee and earned the title of "assistant 25 manager". During the time he has worked it was common to see black men come to the stores to 26

27 28

sell stolen merchandise. He always knew it was stolen. In both stores the procedure was the 1 2 same. Walter told him to refer to the black men as "kokujins", a sort of code word of uncertain origin. That was so other people would not know who was being referred to. These people 3 usually would come in and ask for Walter, Henry, Richard or Griselda. Money for the stolen 4 5 items came from a safe in the back room in the form of cash. Lim would usually not deal directly with the "Kokujins" unless no one else was available. For the detectives Lim identified some of 6 the record keeping books referred to as "buy back books" and pointed out the initials of Walter, 7 Henry and Richard and even his own. Lim also pointed out the "Goo Gone" which was used to 8 9 remove store labels off the cellophane wrappers on the stolen merchandise. He has seen store labels from Target, Circuit City, Blockbuster and other stores. In case the cellophane would tear, 10 11 there was a cellophane-wrapping machine.

The detectives also interviewed Richard Perez, a former Gameplay employee. Mr. Perez
only worked for Gameplay for a month in May of 2003. He quit when he found out that
Gameplay was buying stolen merchandise and selling it for a profit. However, what he had to
say strongly supported the accounts given by John Gallow and Ramon Lim.

16 As a result of this investigation a fourteen count felony complaint was filed in the Los 17 Angeles County Superior Court charging John Gallow with the crimes of burglary, grand theft 18 and attempted gand theft, case number NA 060050. On July 9, 2004, having pled nolo 19 contendere and by such plea stood convicted of four counts of burglary, imposition of sentence 20 was suspended and he was placed on five years probation and given credit for 241 days in jail 21 [City # 5]. In like fashion in case number NA060202 a two count felony complaint was filed 22 against Ramon Santos Lim charging him with receiving stolen property. On April 23, 2004 23 defendant Lim entered a nolo contendere plea to one count, the other count being dismissed, and 24 sentence being suspended, was placed on three years probation [City #12].

As a further result of this investigation, Anthony W. Batts, Chief of Police for the City of
Long Beach caused a letter dated May 12, 2004 to be sent to the Director of Financial

28

27

Management requesting that the business license issued to Gameplay be revoked because of 1 criminal activities. Upon application of Walter Sandoval, "president" and Henry Sandoval, "vice 2 president" a business license was issued to Gameplay, 6543 Spring St., Long Beach dated August 3 7, 2003 [City # 22]. Upon review and consideration the requested revocation was agreed to and 4 5 notice of a revocation hearing was conveyed to Gameplay on October 1, 2004. On October 12 6 pursuant to LBMC section 3.80.429.1 a hearing was held for Gameplay to show cause why their 7 business license should not be revoked. At the hearing testimony was given and evidence was receive. Upon due consideration a decision was rendered entitled "Notice of Final Action" dated 8 9 October 19, 2004 whereby the license was ordered revoked [City # 34].

10 Testimony in this combined administrative appeal hearing commenced April 6, 2005 with the sworn testimony of John Leonard Gallow. He identified both Walter and Griselda 11 12 Sandoval from Gameplay [RT 49]. He steals merchandise and brings it to them [RT 50]. He 13 knows what merchandise to steal because he is given a list by Walter or who ever is working 14 there. The list includes the hottest stuff, whatever is selling on the market, he would the go to a 15 store such as Target, Blockbuster or Circuit City and steal it [RT 51-53]. He has been doing this 16 for over a year and during this time Walter has paid him "a lot", over \$50,000 [RT 55]. Walter 17 only knew him as "Poncho" and never ask for other identification or address. The stolen 18 merchandise he brought back was always brand new, never used, and still had the store labels on 19 them. He would bring the items back to Gameplay in a bag or box and set them down behind the 20 counter. Walter would then take them into a back room and he would wait for him to return with 21 money in the form of cash in an envelope. He was never given a receipt [RT 56-57, 144, 145]. 22 If Walter wasn't there he would deal with other employees such as Richard and Ramon and they 23 also only knew him as "Poncho". Mr. Allow acknowledged his arrest and identified Detectives 24 Mario Razo and John Bruce [RT 63] He also identifies his voluntary signed statement and 25 identifies his signature on City Exhibit #2 and acknowledges the admissions he made [RT 63-26 75]. He recounts how he helped undercover Detective Arnwine contact people at Gameplay by

27 28

placing a phone call to Ramon and telling that his uncle would be coming in with some stolen 1 2 stuff [RT 75-78]. Mr. Allow was shown two photographs both dated 12/30/03 and marked as 3 City Exhibits 3 and 4 and he identified as him self entering the Target on Bellflower on the indicated date while on a mission to steal for Gameplay. On this occasion he delivered the stolen .4 merchandise to Walter [RT 78-83]. Besides Walter, Richard and Ramon, Allow has also 5 6 delivered stolen merchandise to Griselda. She also called him "Poncho" [RT 83-85, 143]. Mr. 7 Allow was not shy about being a thief. On cross examination he even described himself as a 8 "good thief" and a "smart thief" [RT 90]. He would change his appearance by stealing and 9 wearing different clothes in the store so as not to appear the same to security cameras as can be seen in the two photographs, City Exhibits #3 and #4, taken inside the store [RT 107-108]. He 10 11 was also quite adept by being able to dismantle the electrical system that locks the doors [RT 91-92]. He believes he has been a valued customer for Walter [RT 86] having known him for over 12 three years. During that time he has made "way over a hundred" sales to Gameplay [RT 101] 13 14 and admits to going to the Long Beach Target store to steal merchandise for Gameplay over a hundred times [RT 85]. Perhaps the most compelling part of Mr. Gallow's testimony was his 15 explanation of the video tape, City Exhibit 7, as captured on Gameplay's own surveillance 16 17 camera showing him entering the Gameplay store with the stolen merchandise, setting it down 18 behind the counter, Walter Sandoval picking it up, taking it into the back room, and then 19 returning with an envelope and handing it to him.

Next to testify was Curt Pamperin. He was a regional investigator for Target Stores. In
the later part of 2003 he was investigating a series of thefts of electronic items. Upon reviewing
the surveillance tapes he noticed a common method of operation, namely the entry through the
garden section, the disabling of the alarm systems off the fire exits, the stealing of comforters and
the hiding of merchandise in them and the pushing them off in shopping carts. He also began to
recognize the same individuals one or which was later identified as John Allow. He was
investigating perhaps eleven to fifteen thefts and attempted thefts, the average loss being being

27 28

between three and five thousand dollars per incident "with the most being almost twenty"[RT
 154-155]. He contacted the Long Beach Police Department, specifically Detectives Razo and
 Bruce

and participated in their investigation. He provided the merchandise that Detective Arnwine
used in his undercover operation at Gameplay and was present on February 3, 2004 after
execution of the search warrant and recovered them at Gameplay. However, upon inspection of
the premises after the search he was unable to identify any other merchandise as coming from
Target [RT 171-172]. He did notice a large percentage of new releases as compared to used
items which he thought was very unusual [RT 174-175].

Next to testify was Lawrence Arnwine, a detective with the Long Beach Police
Department. He testified that on February 3, 2004 he went to Gameplay and made direct contact
with Ramon Lim. He told Mr. Lim that he was Pancho's uncle [RT 182]. Earlier he had been
provided with a list of items that Gameplay wanted. Mr. Pamperin assembled the items on the
list. Detective Arnwine then took those items contained in a brown paper bag and delivered
them to Mr. Lim. He told Lim that the items were stolen [RT 181]. In return, Lim handed him a
white envelope containing \$1,245.

Ramon Santos Lim testified on April 6th and 14th, 2005 He identifies Walter and 17 18 Griselda Sandoval seated in the hearing room. He also knows Henry Sandoval, Walter's brother, 19 "I used to work for them"....at "Gameplay" [RT 188, 224] in Long Beach. Hired by Walter he 20 worked there for almost three years reaching the position of assistant manager. As such he was 21 familiar with the policy regarding the purchase of stolen property. After his second year on the 22 job, Walter taught him the procedure for buying back stolen merchandise [RT 189,195, 225, 23 246, 338, 348]. Walter would prepare a list called a "buy-back list" of the top selling games [RT 24 190]. Walter would establish the prices [RT 348]. These list would be given to African-25 Americans, who Walter referred to as "Kokujins" or "Koko", who in turn would go out and steal 26 the items and sell them back to Gameplay, thus the term "Kokujin buyback" [RT 196, 250-251,

27 28

260, 262, 356]. This was occurring almost every day for thousands of dollars [RT 266]. The 1 money used for these stolen buy backs was in the form of cash kept in a back room safe as 2 opposed to legitimate transactions from the front cash register [RT 251-252, 253, 342]. It was 3 different from the legitimate transactions [RT 364]. The safe was also used for safekeeping of 4 register money as exhibited by Appellants Exhibit C [RT 310]. The money given to the Kokujins 5 was less than for legitimate wholesalers [RT 349]. No receipts were ever given for the buy backs 6 7 [RT 348]. The accounting for these transactions, that is stolen property, was made in buyback 8 books called "X files" [RT 250,256, 261, 275, 341]. All of the transactions in the buy back books were for illegal or stolen merchandise [RT 345]. Mr. Lim identified four pages of these files 9 introduced into evidence as City Exhibit 13 which were seized by police upon execution of their 10 search warrant on February 3rd from Gameplay [RT 311]. As an example, he identifies a 11 12 document (City Exhibit # 17) in his hand writing, dated January 27, 2004 which was for stolen 13 property received from a Kokujin and for which he paid \$1,008.76 [RT 355]. He also identified a green notebook entitled "Buy Back 2003" and introduced in evidence as City Exhibit # 15. 14 15 These were buy back list of what the store wanted and generated by Walter [RT 275-276]. In City Exhibit #13 he identified the initials as the persons who were making the buy backs: HS for 16 17 Henry Sandoval, GS for Griselda Sandoval, RS for Richard, W for Walter Sandoval and of 18 course RL and RA for himself [RT 248, 257-259, 314]. These were forms that Walter provided 19 and taught him how to use. They were kept in the back office [RT 263]. Mr. Lim explains the 20 meaning of the various notations in these two exhibits including the various persons who made 21 the buy backs [RT 275-292]. Walter taught Mr. Lim how to remove the tags from other retail 22 stores off of the stolen merchandise by using Goo Gone and the heat gun and the cellophane 23 wrapping machine [RT 233, 235, 247, 292]. He is shown a group of four DVDs, City Exhibit # 24 16, where he is able to show markings on the cellophane as being caused by the removal of these 25 tags [RT 292-293]. On cross examination Mr. Lim gives some conflicting testimony. For 26 example, he states that no one ever told him that it was Gameplay policy to buy stolen stuff.

27 28

Neither Walter, Griselda nor Henry ever told him to buy stolen stuff [RT 333-334]. Also, he testified that Poncho never told him he was a thief or that he was selling stolen merchandise, "If he did I wouldn't buy it" [RT 336].

Mr. Lim testified about his well documented arrest on February 3, 2004. He was present 4 5 and heard Detectives Arnwine's testimony. When asked if he knew the property he received from Poncho's uncle was stolen he replied "yes" [RT 228, 244]. When asked how he knew it 6 was stolen he again becomes inconsistent. He doesn't recall being told it was stolen [RT 227]. 7 He was told it was stolen [RT 228, 351]. He was not told it was stolen [RT 226, 327, 351-352]. 8 9 Regardless of whether or not he was told the merchandise was stolen, after receiving it from Detective Arnwine he phoned Griselda who was at the Venice store. This was because no one 10 else was present in authority and he had to get her permission to make the buy [RT 268-269]. He 11 would only call Griselda to get authorization to buy stolen property [RT 352]. Whether or not he 12 told Griselda the items were stolen is again in dispute [RT 329]. He made an inventory of the 13 items, introduced into evidence as City Exhibit #9, and faxed it to Griselda "attn Yani", her 14 15 nickname [RT 225-226 229-230, 285]. Or did he [RT 328]? She then gave him permission to 16 buy it [RT 243]. He took the cash from the safe [RT 230] and handed it to Detective Arnwine. 17 Shortly thereafter the police entered, he was arrested and the premises was searched [RT 254]. 18 He was taken to the police station and questioned by detectives. He made a voluntary statement 19 the contents of which are true and correct which was entered into evidence as City Exhibit # 10 20 [RT 318]. Eventually, he was convicted of receiving stolen property in case number NA060202, 21 a certified copy of which was entered into evidence as City Exhibit #12 [RT 241-242, 296].

Ricardo Perez testified on April 14, 2005. He worked for Gameplay for about a month,
in May of 2003. He worked in both the Long Beach and the Los Angeles (Venice) stores, five
days per week, three days in the Long Beach store [RT 372, 392]. He identifies both Walter and
Griselda Sandoval as sitting in the hearing room [RT 373]. He also knows Henry Sandoval and
knows Ramon Lim and Richard Ramirez [RT 390]. He learned the word "Kokogin" to mean

28

27

1

2

3

black persons who would bring in merchandise from Walter and Henry. They would come in 1 and be given a bag then they would go out and return with the bag full of merchandise and set it 2 3 beside the counter. He mostly saw Henry take the items into the back room and inventory them. Then he would see Henry hand them an envelope, he never saw cash [RT 376-378]. He mainly 4 5 worked with Henry but he saw Walter make a couple of "Kokogin" buys [RT 379]. He also saw Walter hand an envelope to a Kokogin [RT 380]. He saw Griselda make buy backs but not in the 6 7 Long Beach store [RT 386]. Both Walter and Henry instructed him how to use Goo Gone and the heat gun to remove labels [RT 381]. He was shown the four games previously marked as 8 9 City Exhibit #16 and he identified the markings on them as the type that would be caused by use 10 of the heat gun to remove the tags [RT 381-382]. During the month that he worked at Gameplay 11 he saw both legitimate and illegal transactions [RT 387]. He saw perhaps ten or so Kokugin buy 12 backs of thirty to fifty items, often with the same title [RT 383-384]. Walter explained how the 13 business was operated, that is to say, by buying back stolen property was how they made their money [RT 389-390]. At one point Walter offered to teach him how to do buy backs but he quit .14 15 before that happened [RT 396]. He never participated in a buy back purchase [RT 395]. He stopped working for Gameplay because he could see what was going on, the buying of stolen 16 17 merchandise, it was "very obvious", "you know common sense to realize this product is stolen". 18 It "doesn't take a rocket scientist" [RT 374, 376, 388].

19 Walter Sandoval testified as proceedings resumed on May 3, 2005. He has been in the 20 game store business since 1989. Gameplay was his first business beginning about 2000 in Los 21 Angeles. He doesn't remember when he decided to open a store in Long Beach but thinks he 22 submitted a business license application in about 2001. His business engaged in the sale of both 23 used and new games, game systems and DVDs. That is to say about 70-60% new, 30-40% used. 24 He would acquire his new merchandise from wholesalers and distributers. He would also take 25 advantage of other retail stores "close-out" sales and "going out of business sales and various 26 sales practices such as "buy one get one free". Reference was made to Appellant's Exhibit L, a

28

purchase from Wal Mart dated November 28, 2003 and M, a purchase from Circuit City dated 1 March 19, 2003 and Appellant's Exhibit N, O and P three purchases from Toys R Us dated 2 March 20, 2003, October 30, 2002 and September 4, 2004 respectively and Appellant's Exhibit 3 H, an invoice from Star City in Los Angeles, dated January 28, 2004. Sellers of used 4 merchandise would get credit and sellers of new merchandise would get cash. He initiated the 5 buy back list similar to what other stores used. It was available to everyone. It was never 6 7 intended to be used to buy stolen merchandise. There was never a policy to buy stolen merchandise. He personally instructed employees not to buy stolen merchandise, especially 8 Ramon Lim. On cross examination Mr. Sandoval stated that Ramon Lim lied when he testified 9 10 that he taught him how to buy stolen property, that he was to contact Griselda for permission to buy stolen property and that the money in the safe was only to be used to buy stolen property. 11 The X file books were used to keep balances he received from customers. Mr. Sandoval referred 12 to documents to illustrate his method to inventory, Appellant's Exhibits E and G. When he would 13 buy merchandise from other retail stores they would have labels on them and he used Goo Gone 14 15 and other devises to remove them. Goo Gone is a common product that can be purchased at 16 hardware stores. He recalls John Allow who he knew as "Poncho". He doesn't recall when he 17 first met him. He believed he was a wholesaler. Wholesalers are a casual crowd. Poncho never 18 said he was selling stolen merchandise. Store managers approval was not necessary for buy 19 backs. In reference to City Exhibit # 41, the 187 page Long Beach Police property report 20 consisting of merchandise recovered from Gameplay on February 3, 2004, Mr. Sandoval said it 21 was all acquired legitimately. The safe in the back room was used to keep cash and important 22 documents. He did not keep large amounts of money in the register. From January 15 until 23 March, 2004 he was out of the country. Griselda was the manager of the Los Angeles store and 24 had no involvement with the Long Beach store. Richard was manager of the Long Beach store. 25 He recalls hiring Ricardo Perez who had been a frequent customer, but he never told him it was 26 okay to buy stolen items.

27 28

Griselda Sandoval testified that she first became connected with Gameplay in 2004. She
became manager of the Los Angeles store. She was never in charge of the Long Beach store and
other than to deliver merchandise she had no real duties there. She never met John Gallow and
had no conversations with him. She recalls receiving a call from Ramon Lim about buying a
game system. There was no fax sent. She never gave him permission to purchase stolen property.
She learned of the search warrant by being told by a detective.

## FINDINGS

- I find that ACCO Enterprises Inc., d.b.a. Gameplay, Walter Sandoval, Griselda Sandoval,
   Henry Sandoval and other Gameplay employees were actively and knowingly engaging in
   the practice of purchasing stolen merchandise for sale.
- 13 2. I find that the above practice was for the purpose for profit.

8

9

27

- I find that the above practice was a criminal activity of receiving stolen property in
  violation California Penal Code section 496 (a).
- I find that the testimony of John Allow was credible. In making this finding I am not
  satisfied with the phase at the end of his signed admission "with no promises of leniency
  or reward" (City Exhibit # 2) and I am mindful of the light sentence he received as a
  result of his conviction in case number NA060050. Rather I am basing my finding on the
  overall character and quality of his testimony and his demeanor while testifying on both
  direct and cross examination.
- I find the testimony of Ramon Lim generally credible though at times inconsistent. Again
  I am not satisfied with the phase "with no promises of leniency or reward" at the end of
  his signed statement and I am also mindful of the relatively light sentence he received as a
  result of his conviction in case number NA060202. Again I find that the overall character
  and quality of his testimony was more than sufficient to meet the City's burden of proof.
  - 12

1	6. I find the credibility of the testimony of Ricardo Perez was strong. As to what was going			
2	on at Gameplay "it was very obvious", it didn't "take a rocket scientist".			
3	7. I find the effect of the testimony of Detective Arnwine and Curt Pamperin to be			
4	devastating to Appellant's case.			
5	8. I find that the corroborative evidence presented by the City was probative and more than			
.6	enough to support any weakness in witness testimony. This is especially true the with			
7	regard to the DVD Surveillance, City Exhibit # 7.			
8	9. I find the testimony of Walter and Griselda Sandoval to be weak, unconvincing and			
9	insufficient to overcome the City's burden of proof.			
10	10. I find that the City has met it's burden of proof by a preponderance of evidence, "such			
11	evidence as, when weighted with that opposed to it, has more convincing force and the			
12	greater probability of truth".			
13	CONCLUSIONS			
14	The business license BU20134560 should remain revoked.			
15				
16	REGARDING BUSINESS LICENSE BU20447180			
17	EVIDENCE AND TESTIMONY			
18	On October 8, Griselda Sandoval applied for a new business license in the name of			
19	ACCO Enterprises, Inc., d.b.a. Gameplay to be located at 6543 East Spring Street, Long Beach.			
20	The business license was submitted to Customer Service Representative Lori Franz. Ms. Franz			
21	ran an address history for the location and learned that there was already an existing license for			
22	Gameplay at this location, BU20132560, but it was delinquent with penalties. On the new			
23	application Griselda Sandoval represented that she was the only officer for ACCO			
24	Enterprises, Inc., and had nothing to do with Gameplay. However, Ms Franz learned that			
25	Grizelda Sandoval was already listed as a corporate officer for Gameplay. Lori Franz testified on			
26	April 26, 2005 at which time she identified Griselda sitting in the hearing room as well as the			
27				
28	13			

.

•

۰,

application she submitted, City Exhibit #18. She testified that Ms. Sandoval seemed anxious and 1 wanted to expedite the new issuance and therefore agreed to pay all the penalties attached to the 2 existing license. Ms. Franz proceeded with the application and assigned the number 3 BU20447180. However she needed until the following week to complete the actual mailing of 4 5 the license, the time being after 4:00 on a Friday afternoon. The following week Ms. Franz was 6 contacted by Jeannine Montoya, her supervisor and learned that the license could not be issued for two reasons. First, a new license can not be issued if there is an existing one and secondly, a 7 business license revocation hearing was pending regarding the existing license, Gameplay having 8 9 been given notice on October 1, just one week before. She testified that if she had known of 10 these facts she would not have proceeded with the new application.

11 Although Griselda said she had nothing to do with Gameplay, the City offered a lot of 12 evidence that indicated the opposite was true. Jeannine Montoya testified that she is the Long Beach Business Services Supervisor. She became concerned after reviewing the new business 13 licence application and concluded that the license was definitely issued in error. She identified 14 15 the Application for Gameplay issued August 3, 2001 naming Walter Sandoval as president and Henry Sandoval as vice president and that it will deal in second hand property (City Exhibit 22). 16 17 Business that deal in second hand property requires a police investigation. On October 12 during 18 the Gameplay business license revocation hearing she saw both Walter and Griselda Sandoval 19 and remembers Walter handing James Gooden, the hearing officer, a business card identifying 20 himself as C.E.O. for ACCO Enterprises (City Exhibit # 23). She identified the State of 21 California Certificate of Domestic Corporation for ACCO Enterprises filed June 18, 2004 which 22 list Walter Sandoval as president and Griselda Sandoval as secretary and chief financial officer 23 and Walter, Henry and Griselda Sandoval as directors (City Exhibit # 26). She identifies a check 24 payable to the City of Long Beach issued by ACCO Enterprises, Inc. DBA Gameplay with a 25 signature very similar to the signature of Griselda Sandoval on the October 8 business license 26 application (City Exhibit # 27). She identified the Seller's Permit issued by the State Board of

27 28

Equalization to Gameplay ACCO Enterprises, Inc at 10939 Venice Blvd., Los Angeles which 1 includes the names of Walter, Henry and Griselda Sandoval on page 8 and which is dated April 2 5, 2005 (City Exhibit # 30). She testified that these permits are only good at the Los Angeles 3 location and the City of Long Beach requires a valid seller's permit at its location. She noticed 4 5 that the type of business described was "retail video games - new/used", however the box relating to "second-hand property" was not checked. If it had been, a police investigation would have 6 been required. Finally she testified that Lori Franz made an error in failing to hold issuance of 7 8 the license.

9 James Allen Gooden testified that he was he hearing officer who conducted the business license revocation hearing on October 12, 2004. He identifies City Exhibit # 34 as his "Notice of 10 Final Action" regarding BU20132560. At the hearing Walter Sandoval was present and handed 11 him a business card identifying himself as C.E.O. of ACCO Enterprises and giving an address of 12 13 10937 Venice Blvd., Los Angeles, CA 90034 (City Exhibit # 23). He identifies the notice of the license revocation hearing sent to Walter Sandoval dated October 1, 2004 set for October 12, 14 15 2004 on grounds of criminal activity. This notice included a copy of the letter from Chief of 16 Police Anthony W. Batts dated May 12, 2004. He also identifies City Exhibit # 25, as the notice 17 of a Business License Revocation Hearing set for November 17, 2004 regarding BU20447180 on grounds that this license was issued in error which he authored and caused to be sent to ACCO 18 19 Enterprises, Inc. ATTN: Griselda Sandoval, 6543 Spring Street, Long Beach, CA 90808.

Mario Razo testified that he is a detective with the Long Beach Police Department
currently assigned the "Career-Criminal Apprehension Team" (C-CAT). As such he was one of
the investigating officers involved in the arrests and prosecution of John Allow and Ramon Lim.
He was present on February 3, 2004 at the Gameplay premises at 6543 Spring Street, Long Beach
during the execution of the search warrant, arrest of Ramon Lim and the subsequent search of the
location. Although most of his testimony related to the Gameplay license revocation proceedings
he did testify that Griselda Sandoval did appear at the location with her attorney while the search

was in progress.

1

2 Walter Sandoval testified on May 4, 2005 relevant to these license proceedings. Gameplay was his first business enterprise, first opening in Los Angeles about 2000. ACCO 3 Enterprises, Inc. incorporated in April, 2002 (Appellant's Exhibit D). He applied for a business 4 5 license August 18, 2001 at 6543 Spring Street, Long Beach (City Exhibit # 22). He recalls giving his business card to James Goodin. Griselda was the manager of the Los Angeles store 6 and had no involvement in the Long Beach store. In reference to City Exhibit # 26, the corporate 7 documents for ACCO Enterprises and page 3 of which is entitled "Statement of Information" 8 filed June 18, 2004, he did acknowledge that he was the Chief Financial Officer and Griselda 9 was listed as the Secretary and Chief Financial Officer. Also that He, Henry and Grizelda 10 Sandoval are directors. He testified that he is no longer affiliated with Gameplay and has sold all 11 12 of interest to Griselda. City Exhibit # 48 includes an ACCO Enterprise, Inc share certificate in the name of Walter Sandoval, dated May 15, 2002 for thirty four thousand shares. This 13 certificate was transferred to Griselda Sandoval on October 8, 2004. 14

15 Griselda Sandoval testified that she became the manager of the Los Angeles store she 16 thinks in 2002. She had no duties in the Long Beach store and was never in charge of it. She 17 currently owns all the shares of ACCO Enterprise, Inc. On October 8, 2004 she applied for a new business license and turned the application in to Lori Franz who told her that Gameplay no 18 longer existed, Ms. Franz also told her that no articles of incorporation were required. About a 19 week later Ms. Sandoval was contacted by a man named Gene Rodriguez who asked for articles 20 of incorporation. He came by Gameplay and picked up the license and she was told that to get it 21 22 back she would have to call Jeannine Montoya. Ms. Montoya told her she needed articles of incorporation and that part of the application needed to be completed. She went to City Hall and 23 24 spoke to Ms. Montoya and delivered to her ACCO Enterprises, Inc corporate minutes. Ms. 25 Montova received them and game her license back. She was never told that her license application was deficient in any way. With reference to City Exhibit # 26 she acknowledges that 26

27 28

1 she was corporate secretary for ACCO Enterprises, Inc.

2		
3		FINDINGS
4	1.	On October 1, 2004 notice of business licence revocation hearing for BU20132560 was
5		set for October 12 was provided to Gameplay located at 6543 E. Spring Street, Long
6		Beach.
7	2.	On October 8, 2004 Griselda Sandoval applied for a new business license in the name of
8		ACCO Enterprises, Inc., d. b.a Gameplay located at 6543 Spring Street, Long Beach.
9	3.	On October 8, 2004 Business License BU20447180 was issued to ACCO Enterprises Inc.
10		for 6543 Spring St. Long Beach CA 90808
11	4.	On October 8, 2004 Gameplay was operating at 6543 Spring Street, Long Beach under a
12		valid business BU20132560.
13	5.	I find that as late as June 10, 2004 Walter, Henry and Griselda Sandoval were listed on
14		state corporate records for ACCO Enterprises, Inc. as corporate officers and directors.
15	6.	I find that on October 12, 2004 Walter Sandoval represented himself as Chief Executive
16		Officer for ACCO Enterprises, Inc.
17	7.	I find that the witnesses Lori Franz, Jeannine Montoya, James Gooden and Long Beach
18		Police Detective Razo to be credible.
19	8.	I find that Business License BU20447180 was issued in error.
20	9.	I find that the testimony of Walter and Griselda Sandoval was insufficient to overcome
21		the City's burden
22	10.	I find by a preponderance of evidence that Walter and Griselda Sandoval were jointly
23		engaged in the operation and management of ACCO Enterprises, Inc doing business as
24		Gameplay located at 6543 Spring Street in the City of Long Beach from August 3 through
25		November 11, 2004.
26		CONCLUSIONS
27		
28		17
	l)	1