

Joel Garnica, President
Brandon Dowling, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 8:44 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Garnica asked Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond,
Present: Brandon Dowling and Joel Garnica

1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

David Honey, Manager of the Fire Department’s Administration Bureau, introduced Sarah Green as their new Administrative Officer. Ms. Green stated that she looks forward to working with everyone. President Garnica welcomed Ms. Green and commented that she was part of the Fire Promotion Ceremony. President Garnica commented that it was wonderful to see the diversity at the ceremony.

2. [21-237CS](#) Recommendation to approve minutes: *Regular Meeting of August 18, 2021*

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 14):

Commissioner Arias pulled Agenda Item 8 for a separate discussion.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve Consent Calendar Items (3-7 and 9-14), except for Item (8). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

3. [21-238CS](#) **Recommendation to approve examination results:**
Harbor Patrol Officer I-III Test #02
Library Clerk I-IV
School Guard Test #09

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

4. [21-239CS](#) **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**
Mechanical Engineer

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [21-240CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

Pamela Buckner, Housing Aide II, Department of Health and Human Services (5 yrs., 5 mos.)
William Greco, Supervising Park Ranger, Police Department (30 yrs., 4 mos.)
Donald Leonhard, Gardener II, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine (33 yrs., 11 mos.)
Angelee Metzger, Systems Technician, Department of Technology and Innovation (33 yrs., 11 mos.)
Charleen Mirabal, School Guard, Department of Public Works (16 yrs., 5 mos.)
Robert Woods, Police Lieutenant, Police Department (25 yrs., 6 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [21-241CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Keon Abraham, Refuse Operator I, Department of Public Works (2 mos. 5 days)
Emilee Hoppe, Recreation Assistant, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine (4 yrs., 9 mos.)
Charles Lanning, Water Treatment Operator III, Water Department (16 yrs., 4 mos.)
Cynthia Maclean, Business Systems Specialist IV, Department of Technology and Innovation (1 yr., 6 mos.)
Rachel Richard, Public Safety Dispatcher II, Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (6 yrs., 2 mos.)
Ryan Riotdan, Police Officer, Police Department (19 yrs., 7 mos.)
Gianina Robinson, General Librarian, Department of Library Services (3 yrs., 11 mos.)
Candice Starr, Customer Service Representative II, Department of Financial Management (3 yrs., 10 mos.)
Jacquelyn Steybe, Special Services Officer III, Police Department (2 yrs., 11 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [21-242CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

Erika Ortega - Payroll/Personnel Assistant II, Department of Development Services to Payroll/Personnel Assistant III, Water Department

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

8. [21-243CS](#)

Recommendation to approve schedule for hearing(s):

Suspension Appeal 05-S-1920, Suggested Dates: September 22 & 29, 2021

A discussion took place with President Garnica, Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. Camerino regarding scheduling hearings of five days or less. Staff were reminded that suspensions of five days or less should not be coming to Commission but rather sent to a Hearing Officer. Staff were instructed to have a conversation with attorneys. It was mentioned that the attorneys were trying to get hearings on calendar. Commissioners agreed that the attorneys have had plenty of time to prepare for the hearings and that we should not schedule them just to schedule them and the policy should be followed regarding which hearings should be sent to a Hearing Officer or heard by the Commission.

Ms. Pizarro Winting later clarified that the suspensions on today's agenda consisted of a 12-day and a 16-day suspension and explained the file identification system.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

9. [21-244CS](#)

Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):

Suspension Appeal 07-S-1819, Suggested Date: September 8

& 15, 2021

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

10. [21-245CS](#) **COVID-19 Related: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Jonathan DeGroot, Administrative Analyst III-NC
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Department of Financial Management
Staff report prepared by Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

11. [21-246CS](#) **COVID-19 Related: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Yeselin Martinez, Recreation Leader Specialist VII-NC
Communication from Sheryl Bender, Administrative Officer, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine
Staff report prepared by Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

12. [21-247CS](#) **COVID-19 Related: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours (Expected to Exceed)** - David Castro Radilla, Carmen Valdes, Kevin Real Villa, Public Health Associates
Communication from Kelly Colopy, Director, Department of Health and Human Services
Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

13. [21-248CS](#) **Recommendation to Approve Provisional Appointment** - Toulip Toun, Senior Accountant
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Department of Financial Management

Staff report prepared by Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

14. [21-249CS](#)

Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)

Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-20) Test #21 (9/9/2020) **2 months****

Capital Projects Coordinator I-IV (EC6AN-20) Test #01 (9/18/2020)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #17 (9/18/2020)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-21) Test #21 (3/31/2021)

Criminalist I-IV (F06AN-20) Test #01 (3/6/2020)

Electrical Engineer (K89NN-21) Test #01 (3/31/2021)

*Environmental Health Specialist I-IV (G43AN-20) Test #02 (9/15/2020) **1 month****

*Environmental Health Specialist I-IV (G43AN-20) Test #03 (9/23/2020) **1 month****

*General Maintenance Supervisor I-II (J78AN-19) Test #01 (9/3/2019) **1 month****

Hazardous Materials Specialist I-II (G42AN-20) Test #01 (9/10/2020)

Hazardous Materials Specialist I-II (G42AN-20) Test #02 (9/23/2020)

Licensed Vocational Nurse (G05NN-20) Test #01 (9/30/2020)

Permit Center Supervisor (ED9NN-20) (3/3/2020)

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention I-II (KA4NN-19) Test #06 (5/8/2019)

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention I-II (KA4NN-20) Test #07 (10/11/2019)

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention I-II (KA4NN-20) Test #08 (1/14/2020)

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention I-II (KA4NN-20) Test #09 (3/3/2020)

Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-20) Test #15 (9/2/2020)

Port Planner I-V (N55AN-20) Test #01 (9/3/2020)
Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-20) Test #07 (9/8/2020)
Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-21) Test #13 (3/8/2021)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test #15 (9/23/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-21A) Test #20 (3/17/2021)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #16 (9/4/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #17 (9/24/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-21B) Test #21 (3/17/2021)
*Recreation Assistant (H52NN-19) Test #01 (3/1/2019) 3 months**
*Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-20) Test #23 (12/19/2019) 2 months**
*Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-20) Test #24 (2/7/2020) 2 months**
*Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-20) Test #25 (3/23/2020) 2 months**
*Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-20) Test #26 (3/23/2020) 4 months**
Senior Combination Building Inspector (K90NN-20) (9/18/2020)
Senior Electrical Inspector (K56NN-20) Test #03 (3/10/2020)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-19) Test #36 (3/19/2019)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-20) Test #46 (9/4/2020)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-21) Test #51 (3/17/2021)
Traffic Engineering Associate I-II (K79NN-20) (3/10/2020)
*Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1An-20) Test #04 (3/9/2020) 2 months**

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

15. [21-250CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL

APPOINTMENT - Community Information Specialist
*Communication from Sheryl Bender, Administrative Officer,
Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine
Staff report prepared by Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Tamura who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Sheryl Bender, Administrative Officer with the Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine, was available to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias asked when an eligible list would be available for this classification. Ms. Tamura responded that they anticipate a list sometime in November.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

16. [21-251CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - Clerk I
*Communication from Sheryl Bender, Administrative Officer,
Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine
Staff report prepared by Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Tamura who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Sheryl Bender, Administrative Officer with the Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine, was available to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias asked when an eligible list would be available for this classification and if this was an internal and external recruitment. Ms. Tamura responded that the recruitment is for both internal and external applicants. Ms. Davalos responded that she anticipates having an eligible list available sometime in the next year.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond commented that traditionally Animal Care Services has a high turnover and hopes that we are

working with the department so that they have adequate staffing.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

17. [21-252CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED

CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Carpenter

Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Department of Human Resources

Staff report prepared by Jami Kerr-Jenkins, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Kerr-Jenkins who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Representatives from various departments were available to answer questions.

President Garnica thanked staff for keeping the update process going as it has been years since some of the Classification Specifications have been revised.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

18. [21-253CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE CIVIL SERVICE BUDGET PRESENTATION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2022

Communication from Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item. She advised them of a change to the staff report and clarified that the budget was approved by City Council on August 24, 2021, and not 2022. She then introduced Ms. Alamo who provided a presentation on the budget.

Commissioner Arias stated that some time ago Civil Service received an increase in funds for employee benefits so that appeals related to suspensions of 5 days or less could be sent to a hearing officer and asked if it is reflected in the line item of the budget. Ms. Alamo responded that we do. She would need to verify if this was an ongoing increase but confirmed that it was received for this fiscal year.

A discussion took place with Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding receiving the budget prior to it being approved by City Council. Staff will ensure the Commission is kept updated. It was discussed that staff are currently keeping track of COVID-19 related items. Information will be provided to the Commission prior to the annual report coming out.

Commissioner Garnica clarified Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond's request. She stated that the Commission should be more inclusive of the entire budget process journey. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that she would like staff to keep the Commission updated on information related to the budget and not just dates.

A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

19. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

The Executive Committee did not have any information to report.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond reported that the Recruitment and Selection Committee has a meeting scheduled following today's Commission meeting.

C. Special Projects Committee

The Special Projects Committee did not have any information to report.

20. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten reported that the Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications is rebranding their Public Safety Dispatcher recruitment and will be partnering more with Civil Service. Additionally, she reported that Civil Service will be the recipient of an intern as part of the Long Beach College Promise Internship Program. Ms. Slaten also provided information on an upcoming partnership opportunity with Long Beach City College regarding certification courses and how it ties in with Civil Service recruitment efforts.

Ms. Slaten provided the Commission with updates regarding several community events that her division has participated in over the past couple of weeks. She reported that her division plans to participate in the Grand Prix and they are working out logistics regarding another youth event happening the same weekend.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond complimented Ms. Slaten on all the work that she has been doing. She appreciates her giving the Commission highlights on community events as this was something she requested.

Commissioner Arias commented that she is happy to hear of another partnership with Long Beach City College. She suggested that staff work with the academic arm of the college and not just with Workforce Development. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that a discussion took place regarding curriculum development during a meeting with Long Beach City College. Commissioner Arias stated that the curriculum process for degrees and certificates is very long and suggested that staff work with the Academic Senate and their Curriculum Committee. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she will follow up with them. Commissioner Arias stated that she can assist as well.

President Garnica informed the Commission that she previously sat on the Board of Governors for the Foundation and has been asked to come back. She will also be heading a new committee that involves similar work as that of the Commission. She stated there are great hands at the table to make great things happen with the community college.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond added that Centro CHA has an existing relationship with Long Beach City College and Workforce in the building trades area and suggested that Ms. Slaten reach out to Jessica as she could be a good resource.

Ms. Slaten stated that she will.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald reported that we are embarking on a new normal and how we pivoted over the last year and now we are in the driver seat and we know what to do.

Ms. McDonald thanked the Commission for approving the provisional request as it will assist staff with assisting their customers. She stated in the last year and a half staff has been updating classification specifications and ensuring Knowledge, Skills and Abilities that are listed on job bulletins link to existing duties and are in line with the classification specifications. Additionally, Ms. McDonald provided an update on the Administrative Aide promotional recruitment and examination process. Ms. McDonald also thanked Administration Support Services for their assistance with contracts and budget.

President Garnica stated that she appreciates Ms. McDonald's feedback on all the work that is taking place. She stated that it is an exciting time for Civil Service to be doing so much work and to have gone through the pandemic.

C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo updated the Commission on the closing process of fiscal year 2021 and hopes to provide a presentation to the Commission in December.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond commented that there is a possibility we spent less in certain categories as a result of the pandemic and suggested that we take that into consideration when preparing for future budgets. Ms. Alamo responded that she has taken into consideration the variations as a result of the pandemic.

A brief discussion ensued with Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Ms. McDonald regarding the negotiation of contracts for online testing platforms and the increase in costs for using them.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting commended staff for doing such an amazing job. She also thanked Commissioner Wheeler for her partnership in reaching out to the African American community. Commissioner Wheeler commented that she was alarmed when she found out that there are no African American females and very few African American males working in the Fire Department. She stated that a priority of The Black Women's Collective, an organization Commissioner Wheeler works with, will

be to recruit African American female Firefighters for the City of Long Beach.

Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked President Garnica and Commissioner Arias for their ideas and talking points regarding the partnership with Long Beach City College. Additionally, she will be providing the Commission with staffing updates at its next meeting.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond commented that Trustee Chico was part of the Latino Cultural Center's Steering Committee call and stated that Civil Service has another advocate at the trustee level at Long Beach City College. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated she made a note of it while on the call.

21. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked for an update on data from the Police Department as it relates to the hearings and the number of people of color who have been dismissed or have had a suspension higher than 5 days. She also wanted an update regarding items that were listed in the Reconciliation Initiative related to Civil Service.

Commissioner Arias wanted an update regarding if a high school diploma or GED should be listed as a desirable across all positions. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that this is being discussed today.

President Garnica stated that staff is working to combine all outstanding items, which will be reviewed more in depth at the retreat.

22. NEW BUSINESS

President Garnica provided information on graduation rates for high school students and how low they are in areas with people of color. She thanked staff and the Commission for taking a holistic approach to understand our demographics in certain areas. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond suggested that the Commission collaborate with the Long Beach Board of Education to discuss opportunities from a recruitment standpoint. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she and Ms. Slaten plan to bring forth a program where city employees speak with students about their jobs in the next fiscal year.

President Garnica stated that the Commission's goal is to understand the data and the information. She stated that we need to understand where we are so that we have measurable data to improve in certain areas and to discover opportunities.

President Garnica stated that the Commission would like to understand where we are with scheduling hearings and asked Ms. Pizarro Winting to have that discussion with the attorneys. She would like a report at the next meeting regarding the outcome. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that we should be able to schedule out in advance but there has been a challenge with getting witnesses onboard and preparing the cases. President Garnica commented that out of the three cases that were scheduled, two of them settled which is a higher percentage rate than pre-pandemic. Mr. Anderson commented that it is frustrating to go through the process just to have hearings and then have them settle the day of. He stated that he will speak with the attorneys about trying to get more cases on the calendar. Commissioner Arias would like staff to remind the attorneys of our rules and policies that clearly states that they are supposed to consult with each other to try and settle prior to the hearing date. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond commented that they could fill the calendar with cases even if it means moving cases around.

23. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

There were no public comments.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:08 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។