

**LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CAROLYN SMITH WATTS, PRESIDENT
JUNE 6, 2012**

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, June 6, 2012, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Carolyn Smith Watts, Charles Hicks Jr., Jeanne Karatsu, Jonathan Gotz, Larry Keller

MEMBER EXCUSED:

OTHERS PRESENT: Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary
Melinda George, Deputy Director
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant
Christina Checel, Senior Deputy City Attorney
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst
Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst
Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

President Carolyn Smith Watts presided.

MINUTES: It was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of May 16, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Dismissal Appeal 08-D-1011 hearing minutes of April 25, 2012 and May 2 & 9, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-7): It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved, with the exception of item 5, which was deleted. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

EXAMINATION RESULTS:

Request to approve examination results.

Gas Construction Worker

The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.

RETIREMENTS:

Request to receive and file retirements.

Eugene Winters/Refuse Operator I/Public Works
Andrew Pringle/Police Officer/Police Department
Barbara Curtis/School Guard/Police Department
Roy Golightly/Fleet Services Supervisor II/Public Works

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

RESIGNATIONS:

Request to receive and file resignations.

Denise Wooldridge/Public Safety Dispatcher I/Fire
Department
Wan Lee/Civil Engineer/Water Department
Ladell White/Administrative Analyst II/Financial
Management
Leslie Griggs/Communications Center Supervisor/Police
Department
Chue Chang/Survey Technician/Harbor Department
Matthew Kennison/Police Officer/Police Department

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

WITHDRAWAL OF APPEAL:

Request to receive and file withdrawal of appeal.

Dismissal Appeal 03-D-1112

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

WITHDRAWAL OF APPEAL:

Request to receive and file withdrawal of appeal.

Suspension Appeal 08-S-1112

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENTS:

The Secretary presented a communication from Mike Sarjeant, Interim Fire Chief, requesting Commission authorization to appoint Cameron Abel, Aaron Fletcher, Mitchell Garrison, Jeffrey Gillot, David Guerra, Patrick Morrison, Omar Naranjo, Tyler Warzynski, and Ian Wenger to the classification of Marine Safety Sergeant on a provisional basis. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the request be granted in accordance with Civil Service Commission Policy 1.02 and Section 43 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND
NON-CAREER HOURS:**

**DENNIS ROUBEDEAUX, MAINTENANCE ASSISTANT/
AIRPORT**

The Secretary presented a communication from JC Squires, Manager, Finance & Administration, Airport requesting Commission approval to extend the non-career hours for Dennis Roubedeaux, Maintenance Assistant, for an additional 450 hours. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the non-career hours be extended for 450 hours, in accordance with Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND
NON-CAREER HOURS:**

**FRANCISCO VILLARREAL, ADMINISTRATIVE INTERN
HARBOR**

The Secretary presented a communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor, requesting Commission approval to extend the non-career hours for Francisco Villarreal, Administrative Intern, for an additional 240 hours. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the non-career hours be extended for 240 hours, in accordance with Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND
NON-CAREER HOURS:**

AUSTIN CHO, ADMINISTRATIVE INTERN/HARBOR

The Secretary presented a communication from Margaret Huebner, Director of Human Resources, Harbor, requesting Commission approval to extend the non-career hours for

Austin Cho, Administrative Intern, for an additional 240 hours. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the non-career hours be extended for 240 hours, in accordance with Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REVISED CLASSIFICATION
SPECIFICATION:**

PUBLIC HEALTH PROFESSIONAL

The Secretary presented a communication from Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources, requesting Commission approval to revise the classification specification for Public Health Professional. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried to approve the revised classification specification, pursuant to Section 1101(d) of the City Charter. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR SELECTIVE
CERTIFICATION:**

The Secretary presented a communication from Ronald R. Arias, Director of Health & Human Services requesting Commission authorization for the selective certification for individuals with knowledge and abilities to implement and oversee the administration of environmental health inspection programs from the Public Health Professional eligible list. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the request be approved, pursuant to Section 28 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR SELECTIVE
CERTIFICATION:**

The Secretary presented a communication from Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources requesting Commission authorization for the selective certification for individuals with occupational health clinic experience, from the Registered Nurse eligible list. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the request be approved, pursuant to Section 28 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO RECONSIDER
APPLICATION:**

GAS CONSTRUCTION WORKER

The Secretary presented a communication from Shawn Walls, requesting the Commission to reconsider his application for Gas Construction Worker. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Melinda George, Deputy Director. Ms. George briefed the Commission regarding this request. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the request be denied. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO RECONSIDER
APPLICATION:**

GAS CONSTRUCTION WORKER

The Secretary presented a communication from Tauruson McMillian, requesting the Commission to reconsider his application for Gas Construction Worker. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Melinda George, Deputy Director. Ms. George briefed the Commission regarding this request. Mr. McMillian was present and addressed the Commission. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the request be denied. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR EXCEPTION TO
CIVIL SERVICE RULES AND
REGULATIONS – ARTICLE VIII
SECTION 115(3)**

**Requesting Exception to Article II, Section 7 of the
Civil Service Rules and Regulations – Qualifications
and Requirements for Buyer, Limiting Applications to
City Employees and Laid Off City Employees**

The Secretary presented a staff report, prepared by him, requesting Commission approval for an exception to Article II, Section 7 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations – Qualifications and Requirements, for Buyer, as an open-competitive examination, limiting applications to City employees and City employees terminated due to layoffs since 2009. The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried to approve the Exception to Civil Service Rules and Regulations, Section 115(3), Article II, Section 7 – Qualifications and Requirements. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

REQUEST FOR ORDER OF LAYOFF:

The Secretary presented an Order of Layoff to the Commission for the Community Information Specialist and Development Project Manager Classifications in the Human Resources Department. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by him. The Secretary informed the Commission that because of the time between Commission meetings staff was able to prepare the order of layoff in advance of their directive. As a result, it is requested that the Commission take the following motions regarding this item. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried to direct staff to prepare the order of layoff. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote. After further discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried to approve the Order of Layoff as prepared and to forward it to the City Manager. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

EXTENSION OF EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS:

The Secretary presented a staff report, prepared by him, requesting Commission approval of the following eligible list for six months. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the following eligible lists be extended for six months. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

Accounting Clerk
Department Librarian
Deputy Chief Harbor Engineer (6/22/11 & 6/29/11)
Deputy Fire Marshal
Electrical Engineer (6/8/11, 6/15/11 & 6/29/11)
Electrician
Plan Checker – Plumbing
Public Health Nutritionist – 6/2/10 & 6/9/10)
Public Safety Dispatcher
Senior Civil Engineer
Senior Electrical Inspector
Senior Survey Technician
Survey Technician

BULLETINS:

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the following Job Opportunity Bulletins be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

Buyer
Engineering Aide

Oil Field Gauger
Petroleum Operations Coordinator
Public Health Professional
School Guard
Special Services Officer

**CONSIDERATION OF
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
REPORT:**

DISABILITY RETIREMENT HEARING 18-DR-910

The Secretary requested that the Commission recess to closed session pursuant to Government Code 54957.8. It was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried to recess to closed session. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote. The Secretary presented a report prepared by Administrative Law Judge Vincent Nafarrete to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on December 7, 2011 and an Objection to the Administrative Law Judge report, prepared by Richard Silber, Attorney at Law, representing the appellant. In addition the Secretary provided the Commission with a copy of the City of Long Beach's Request to Adopt Proposed Decision and Response to Appellant's Objection. Mr. Silber was present and addressed the Commission. Geoffrey Allred, Deputy City Attorney, representing the City, was present and addressed the Commission. After discussion it was moved by Commissioner Hicks and seconded by Commissioner Karatsu to reconvene the meeting and announce the Commission's decision. It was moved by Commissioner Hicks and seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the administrative law judge's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business before the Commission, President Smith Watts adjourned the meeting.



MARIO R. BEAS
Secretary

MRB:meh

Becky Blair, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Leslie Gentile, Commissioner
Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:00 PM)

At 5:00 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:00 PM)

Commissioners Leslie Fernald Gentile, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani Smith,
Present: Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Commissioners Alan L. Fox

Absent:

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Amy Webber, Deputy City Attorney; Cuentin Jackson, Planner; Steve Gerhardt, Planner; Jorge Ramirez, Planner; and Wendy Andersen, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:01 PM)

Commissioner Smith led the flag salute.

MINUTES (5:02 PM)

see media

12-034PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of May 3, 2012.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Alan L. Fox

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:02 PM)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, presented the Director's Report.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:03 PM)

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:04 PM)

see media

1. 12-038PL Recommendation to recommend City Council approve a General Plan Amendment to change the land use designation from Open Space & Parks (LUD 11) to Mixed Use (LUD 7), for a 25-acre parcel located at 3860 N. Lakewood Boulevard in the Douglas Aircraft Planned Development District (PD-19). (District 5) (Application No. 1203-02)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Cuentin Jackson, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Stephane Wandel, applicant's representative, spoke.

Stephane Wandel responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Gentile, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Alan L. Fox

see media

2. 12-039PL Recommendation to concur with the Planning Administrator's Classification of Use determination, and receive and file for final action

as follows: find that trucking and general warehousing uses as referenced in the Douglas Aircraft Planned Development (PD-19) District be defined according to the Interpretation of Ordinance. (District 5) (Application No. 1203-30)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Cuentin Jackson, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Derek Burnham.

Chair Blair spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Smith, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Alan L. Fox

see media

3. 12-035PL

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit request to allow the operation of a pet boarding and day care facility within an existing industrial warehouse located at 1321 W. 17th Street in the IG zoning district. (District 1) (Application No. 1203-19)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Steve Gerhardt, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Shawnte Marquez, applicant, spoke.

Shawnte Marquez responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Shawnte Marquez responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gentile, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Alan L. Fox

see media

4. 12-036PL

Recommendation to adopt findings for denial for a Conditional Use Permit request to allow the sale of beer and wine for off-site consumption (Type 20 License), at an existing convenience store located at 1821 Martin Luther King Junior Avenue within the Single-Family Residential (R-1-N) zone. (District 6) (Application No. 1203-09)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Jorge Ramirez, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Gentile, Paline Soth, applicant, and Derek Burnham.

Derek Burnham and Paline Soth responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Michael Baker provided public comment.

Tina Wiley provided public comment.

Tony Gibson provided public comment.

Dr. Lydia Hollie provided public comment.

Leon Hollie provided public comment.

Che Parker provided public comment.

Karina Carbajal provided public comment.

James Ya provided public comment.

Jacqueel Ballinger provided public comment.

John Rambeau provided public comment.

Paline Soth spoke.

Jorge Ramirez responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Paline Soth responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Gentile, Derek Burnham and Jorge Ramirez.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Derek Burnham spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to continue the item to June 7, 2012 and direct staff to return with negative findings. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Alan L. Fox

see media

5. 12-037PL

Recommendation to adopt findings for denial for a Conditional Use Permit request to allow the sale of beer and wine for off-site consumption (Type 20 License), at an existing convenience store located at 1030 E. Pacific Coast Highway within the Commercial Highway (CHW) zone. (District 6) (Application No. 1202-18)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Jorge Ramirez, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Quen Ma, applicant, spoke.

Michael Baker provided public comment.

Dr. Lydia Hollie provided public comment.

Leon Hollie provided public comment.

Che Parker provided public comment.

Karina Carbajal provided public comment.

Ofer Grimwald, representing the landlord for the property, provided public comment.

Jacqueel Ballinger provided public comment.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Gentile spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Vincent Tien, Attorney representing the applicant, spoke.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to continue the item to June 7, 2012 and direct staff to return with negative findings. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Alan L. Fox

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (6:51 PM)

see media

Leon Hollie provided public comment.

Dr. Lydia Hollie provided public comment.

Che Parker provided public comment.

Karina Carbajal provided public comment.

Michael Baker provided public comment.

Jacqueel Ballinger provided public comment.

Sophie Carbajal provided public comment.

Idahly Carbajal provided public comment.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (7:01 PM)

see media

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

ADJOURNMENT (7:01 PM)

see media

At 7:01 p.m., Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge

Becky Blair, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Leslie Gentile, Commissioner
Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

SPECIAL MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:05 PM)

[see media](#)

At 5:05 p.m., Chair Blair called the Planning Commission meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:05 PM)

[see media](#)

Commissioners Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani

Present: Smith and Becky Blair

Commissioners Donita Van Horik

Absent:

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Jeff Winklepleck, Planner; Thelinjoris Roberts, Clerk.

FLAG SALUTE (5:05 PM)

[see media](#)

Commissioner Saumur led the flag salute.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:06 PM)

[see media](#)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided the Director's report.

Chair Blair spoke.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:08 PM)

[see media](#)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:09 PM)

see media

see media

1. 12-040PL Recommendation to approve the Resolution certifying an Addendum to the Downtown Plan Program Environmental Impact Report (SCH#2009071006) for a proposed six-story, approximately 127,000-square-foot office building that will retain the north and west elevations of the Meeker-Baker Building, a designated local historic landmark. (District 1)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, introduced Jeff Winklepleck, who presented the staff report.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith and Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator.

Chair Blair spoke.

John Molina, Applicant, spoke.

John Molina responded to a query from Vice Chair Fox.

John Molina responded to queries from Chair Blair.

Robert Ladd, Resident, provided public comment.

Diane McNinch, Resident, provided public comment.

Eric Ray, representing the Downtown Residential Council and Historic Old Pine Avenue, provided public comment.

Nick Edwards, Pine Avenue business owner, provided public comment.

Jim Dano, representing the Willmore City Heritage Association, provided public comment.

Kraig Kojian, representing the Downtown Long Beach Associates, provided public comment.

Cheryl Perry, Resident, provided public comment.

Elliot Gonzalez, Resident, provided public comment.

Bill Pearl, Publisher of Long Beach Report.com, provided public comment.

Amy Bodek responded to comments made by Bill Pearl.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Saumur and Derek Burnham.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Gentile and Amy Bodek.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith and Derek Burnham.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Commissioner Gentile.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Gentile, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Donita Van Horik

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (5:54 PM)

see media

There was no public comment given.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (5:55 PM)

see media

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

ADJOURNMENT (5:55 PM)

see media

At 5:55 p.m., there being no objection, Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

Becky Blair, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:05 PM)

see media

At 5:05 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:05 PM)

see media

Commissioners Alan L. Fox, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Donita Van Horik and Becky

Present: Blair

Commissioners Melani Smith

Absent:

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Jorge Ramirez, Planner; Craig Chalfant, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:05 PM)

see media

Commissioner Saumur led the flag salute.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:06 PM)

see media

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided the Director's Report.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:09 PM)

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

CONTINUED ITEMS (5:10 PM)

see media

see media

1. 12-036PL Recommendation to adopt findings for denial for a Conditional Use Permit request to allow the sale of beer and wine for off-site consumption (Type 20 License), at an existing convenience store located at 1821 Martin Luther King Junior Avenue within the Single-Family Residential (R-1-N) zone. (District 6) (Application No. 1203-09)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.

Lydia Hollie provided public comment.

Che Parker provided public comment.

Robyn Sword provided public comment.

Leon Hollie provided public comment.

Karina Carbajal provided public comment.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Melani Smith

see media

-
2. 12-037PL Recommendation to adopt findings for denial for a Conditional Use Permit request to allow the sale of beer and wine for off-site consumption (Type 20 License), at an existing convenience store located at 1030 E. Pacific Coast Highway within the Commercial Highway (CHW) zone. (District 6) (Application No. 1202-18)
- Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.
- Quen Ma, applicant, spoke.
- Quen Ma responded to a query from Chair Blair.
- Johnny Henry provided public comment.
- Ofer Grimwald, landlord of the property, provided public comment.
- Ofer Grimwald responded to queries from Chair Blair.
- Joyce Frasier provided public comment.
- Anthony Newman provided public comment.
- Brendan Dodson provided public comment.
- Che Parker provided public comment.
- Robyn Sword provided public comment.
- Leon Hollie provided public comment.
- Karina Carbajal provided public comment.
- Lydia Hollie provided public comment.
- Chair Blair spoke.
- Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.
- Chair Blair swore in a late arriving member of the public wishing to speak.
- Michael Baker provided public comment.
- Quen Ma spoke.
- Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.
-

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Melani Smith

REGULAR AGENDA (5:55 PM)

see media

see media

3. 12-042PL

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow a used car dealership at the property located at 1991 E. Spring Street. (District 7) (Application No. 1204-01)

Chair Blair recused herself from the item and Vice Chair Fox chaired the item.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Craig Chalfant, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

A dialogue ensued between Vice Chair Fox and Derek Burnham.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Rod Zand, applicant, spoke.

Rod Zand responded to a query from Vice Chair Fox.

Rod Zand responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Rod Zand.

Rod Zand responded to a query from Vice Chair Fox.

Rod Zand responded to a query from Derek Burnham.

Rod Zand responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Saumur and Derek Burnham.

Vice Chair Fox spoke.

Derek Burnham spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to a comment from Commissioner Van Horik.

John Eddy provided public comment.

Rod Zand responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik responded to a query from Vice Chair Fox.

Commissioner Van Horik responded to queries from Amy Bodek,
Director of Development Services.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by
Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The
motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox and Donita Van Horik

Excused: 1 - Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Melani Smith

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (6:26 PM)

see media

There were no comments from the public.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (6:26 PM)

see media

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a comment from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, responded to a comment from Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

ADJOURNMENT (6:35 PM)

see media

At 6:36 p.m., Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge