

July 28, 2020

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 70-square-foot addition to the main dwelling and a new attached 896-square-foot, four-car garage with a 782-square-foot second floor Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above. This property is located at 338 Wisconsin Avenue and is a contributing structure in the Bluff Heights Historic District. (District 2)

APPLICANT: Andrew Burne
338 Wisconsin Avenue
Long Beach, CA 90814
(Application No. COAC1911-01)

THE REQUEST

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 70-square-foot addition to the existing master bedroom on the rear portion of the main dwelling, construct an attached 896-square-foot, four-car garage (two, 2-car garages) and a new 782-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) above the garages with a 186-square-foot deck. The ADU will be located at the rear of the two-family residential lot.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on Wisconsin Avenue, between E. 3rd Street to the south and E. 4th Street to the north (Exhibit A - Location Map) within the R-2-A zone (Two-Family Residential, Accessory Second Unit). The property is developed with a single-family residence.

The subject 6,750 square-foot property is developed with a one-story, 1,224 square-foot single-family residence. The previous owner illegally demolished the original two-car garage and a condition of the home sale was to construct a new one- to two-car garage for the property as stated in the garage inspection resale report completed by the City (project #CERS 261414) to satisfy the parking requirements of the property. The original garage was a detached structure, similar to those commonly found in older, historic neighborhoods of the City. While ADUs and garages are typically accommodated in detached structures, the subject project proposes an attached garage with an ADU above, in order to maximize use of the lot and ensure compliance with applicable development standards and historic standards that encourage site planning and design that minimizes the project's visibility from the street.



The existing primary residence fronts Wisconsin Avenue. The proposed ADU is permitted by-right by State law and the R-2-A zoning of the property, subject to compliance with unit size requirements and other ADU development standards. This application is limited to design review by the CHC, pursuant to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (CHC), for consistency with historic district standards. The applicant has proposed to construct an ADU rather than a second dwelling unit (which is also permitted by the zoning) because the 20-foot Code-required rear yard setback for the second dwelling unit could not be accommodated. Since the time the application was submitted, staff has worked with the applicant on a redesign of the proposed project to construct an ADU, which can be better accommodated on the site due to the reduced yard requirements.

The existing residential building is a contributing structure in the Bluff Heights Historic District. Based on building permits and assessor records, the original primary residence was constructed in 1915. The existing main dwelling is in a Craftsman architectural style. The exterior cladding of the main dwelling consists of wood shake siding, double-hung and fixed wood windows, cross gable roof, and front porch area facing Wisconsin Avenue. The existing residence is well-preserved and retains most of its original features of the Craftsman architectural style.

ANALYSIS

The proposed project requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because most of the proposed construction is two-stories and exceeds 250 square feet. To be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The proposed 70-square-foot addition to the main dwelling master bedroom is located at the rear portion of the main dwelling approximately 5'6" from the side property line to the north, 24'7" to the side property line to the south, 55'10" from the rear property line to the east and 77'0" from the front property line to the west and will be completely flush with the existing building and, thus, screened from view. The new roof of the addition to the main dwelling would provide a 3:12 roof pitch and feature a gable roof with composite shingles to match the roof style and materials of the existing roof. The height of the main dwelling facing Wisconsin Avenue is 18'10" in height as measured to the peak of the roof and the height of the proposed addition is 15'8" to the highest peak of the roof.

The proposed four-car garage is located at the rear half of the property and would be attached to the main dwelling and consist of two, two car garages with separate entrances and a turning radius of 24'7" where a minimum of 24'0" is required and be located approximately 4'0" from the side property line to the north, 24'7" to the side property line to the south, 6'1" from the rear property line to the east and 82'11" from the front property line to the west behind the main dwelling and will not visible from the street. By proposing an attached garage and ADU, the project is able to comply with open space, yard and setback requirements as well parking

turning radii. The proposed design facilitates a project that is largely tucked behind the primary residence and, while atypical, is still in compliance with the Code requirements and the Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines and Craftsman Style Guide.

The proposed ADU over the garages consists of two bedrooms, two bathrooms, and common areas (living room, and kitchen/dining room) and 186-square-foot deck (Exhibit B - Plans). The proposed ADU will be located on the rear half of the property. The proposed ADU will be 782 square feet in size and be setback 4'0" from the side property line to the north, 24'7" from the side property line to the south, 14'0" from the rear property line to the east and be located 82'11" from the front property line to the west and provide a roof orientation, pitch and style to match the existing main dwelling to minimize visual impacts and provide compatibility with the main dwelling and the neighborhood. The design of the roof of the garage/ADU structure as proposed, with the 2 5/8:12 low roof pitch, the front-facing gable and the composite shingles to match the main dwelling, ensures that the proposed project is consistent with primary structure and compatible with surrounding properties. The height of the proposed garage/ADU structure is 24'1" to the highest peak of the roof and is 5'3" taller than the existing structure at its highest point; however, it is still consistent with variable building heights found in the vicinity of the subject site and the district as a whole.

Several architectural features are incorporated into the addition, new garages and ADU design to integrate the proposed structures with the existing residence's architectural style, including clapboard horizontal siding, roof pitch, gable roof, roof orientation, composite roof shingles, exposed rafter tails, triangular roof brackets, attic vents under gabled roof, carriage style garage doors, and craftsman style exterior sconce lighting. The ADU also includes a new deck area facing the rear property line with wood railing and concrete steps and are consistent with the Craftsman Style Guide, development standards of the Long Beach Municipal Code and Bluff Heights Historic District Ordinance. As conditioned, the applicant will be required to vary the type of wood siding used on the exterior of the addition and accessory structure in to order to differentiate the new construction from the existing structure, in accordance with the requirements of the Secretary of Interior Standards.

The proposed ADU has seven windows and the garages have one fixed window on the east elevation facing the rear property line. The ADU windows consist of two double hung wood windows and one fixed window on the north elevation, two double hung wood windows facing the east elevation and two tripartite windows (fixed central windows and double hung side windows). All proposed wood windows shall have wood trim to match the existing main dwelling and in accordance with the Craftsman Style Guide. As conditioned, all future windows in the proposed ADU shall be historically appropriate wood windows.

The primary dwelling is currently painted in an off-white color with green trims and highlights facing Wisconsin Avenue (Exhibit C - Photographs). The applicant has proposed to paint both the existing and proposed structures body in Ellis Mist (dark green), and trim, railing and highlights in Ballie Scott Sage (green with gray undertones) and Frank Lloyd White for the roof fascia and eaves. Said colors appear to be acceptable, however, in order to ensure compatibility among all the structures on the lot as well as compatibility of the proposed

structure with the Secretary of Interior Standards and the Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines, the owner will be required to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint the new addition, garages and ADU as well as the existing primary dwelling; the structures will be required to be painted in colors that are appropriate for the Craftsman architectural style, prior to issuance of final Certificate of Occupancy for the ADU.

Compatibility with Neighborhood

The Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines and ordinance provide guidance for ADUs and encourage that they be constructed in the rear of the properties and designed to minimize their visibility from the public right-of-way. The ordinance further states that ADUs should be architecturally compatible with the historic building design. As proposed, the project will maintain an appropriate scale with the context of the Bluff Heights Historic District and context of the block which consists of a mix of one-, two- and three-story structures, consisting of a variety of architectural styles ranging from Craftsman, and Minimal Traditional to Mid-Century multi-family apartment buildings. Two other contributing Craftsman residences on Wisconsin Avenue within the vicinity have two-story buildings with additional units in the rear of the property. As proposed, the scale and size of the project's addition, garages and ADU does not detract from the existing main dwelling as a contributing structure or as a primary structure and it preserve its historic character in compliance with Secretary of Interior Standards.

The proposed structures are compatible with the existing residence's architectural style, yet do not give a false sense of the property's historical development, in accordance with Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9, which states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." The new addition, garages and ADU have been designed to complement and match the architectural style of the main dwelling but use a change of material style by providing horizontal wood siding, where the existing building has shake wood siding, to differentiate the project from the original main dwelling. The proposed project will provide a cohesive design between the new garage/ADU and the existing structure.

As designed, the proposed project will have minimum visibility when viewed from the street along Wisconsin Avenue and will be compatible with the neighborhood and adjacent properties within the vicinity as there are several two-story and three-story residences. To the south on Wisconsin Avenue, there are other historic Craftsman residences with two-story buildings in the rear of the property with 2 and 3 units. Additionally, there are also two-story and three-story apartment buildings that were built outside of the period of significance on the same street and multiple two-story buildings on the same street. Given this varied existing context, the proposed project is compatible with the neighborhood. The proposed will be consistent and in full compliance with the City's residential development standards for the R-2-A (Two-Family Residential, Accessory Second Unit) zoning district, the Bluff Heights Historic District Ordinance C-7937 and the Craftsman Style Guide. The proposed addition, garages and ADU are in the rear half of the property and will be compatible with yet distinguishable from the original main dwelling.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City’s Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Bluff Heights Historic District Ordinance. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the conditions of approval (Exhibit D – Findings and Conditions of Approval), for the construction of a 70-square-foot addition to the main dwelling, construction of an attached 896-square-foot four car garage and a new 782-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) above the garages with a 186-square-foot deck. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions and materials to the architectural style of the existing structure on the property and with the context of the District. .

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorical Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (new construction or conversion of small structures) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

Public notices were distributed on July 14, 2020. As of this date, no letters were received in response to this project.

Respectfully submitted,



REFUGIO TORRES CAMPOS
PROJECT PLANNER



ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

JULY 28, 2020

Page 6 of 6



PATRICIA A. DIEFENDERFER, AICP
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER



CHRISTOPHER KOONTZ, AICP
DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

CK: PD: AP: RTC

Attachments: Exhibit A – Location Map
Exhibit B – Plans
Exhibit C – Photographs
Exhibit D – Findings and Conditions of Approval