

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS  
Application No. HP14-265  
3441 Gardenia Avenue  
September 8, 2014**

**ANALYSIS:**

**In Compliance with section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* (the Standards), and the California Heights Historic District ordinance (Ordinance No. C-6704):**

Staff has analyzed the proposed project in accordance with Chapter 2.63.070 of the Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance), the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, and the California Heights District ordinance. Staff has also reviewed the plans for consistency with the City's zoning codes and has found that the project complies with the R-1-N development standards.

The subject site, 3441 Gardenia Avenue, is located on the west side of Gardenia Avenue between Wardlow Road and East 36<sup>th</sup> Street (Exhibit A - Location Map). The site is within the California Heights Historic District and has a zoning designation of R-1-N (Single-family Residential District with standard size lots). The parcel is 5,737.5 square-feet in area (45 feet by 127.5 feet) and is improved with an 886 square-foot, one story Neo-Traditional home built in 1951. A detached 480 square-foot two car garage is located towards the rear of the lot with access provided from the alley. The California Heights Historic District was adopted in 1990 (C-6704) and expanded in 2000 when Gaviota, Rose, and Gardenia Avenues between Wardlow and Bixby Roads were added to the district (C-7702). The home is classified as a contributing structure.

The applicant is requesting approval for a one and two story 1,202 square-foot addition to the rear of the existing residence. The plans call for the removal of the rear (west) wall of the home and eight feet of the south wall. The first story addition at the rear of the home will provide a larger kitchen and dining area, larger bedroom and relocate a full bathroom. The 780 square foot second story addition will provide a master bedroom with master bath and walk in closet and another bedroom with a full bathroom and sitting area. The existing home has two bedrooms and one bathroom. The addition will provide a total of four bedrooms, three full bathrooms, a larger kitchen and dining area for a total of 2,088 square feet.

The home is classified as a Neo-Traditional. These homes were mostly developed between 1935-1948 and typically are one-story with a stucco finish or clapboard siding and hipped roof. Windows were often multipaned sash with bay windows and window shutters.

As currently proposed, the scale and mass of the addition may negatively impact the integrity of the original home. The proposed second story addition of 780 square feet is nearly the same size as the existing home of 886 square foot home. Although the second story addition is setback 15 feet 6 inches from the front of the home and 44 feet 6 inches

from the front property line the massing is large relative to adjoining properties. In addition, all the original windows locations will be removed or altered and the square footage of the addition is 135 percent of the existing home. If approved, this sized expansion substantially changes the scale and mass of the home.

**FACTS FOR FINDINGS:** (from Section 2.63.070(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the concerned property or of the landmark district in which it is located and that issuance of the certificate is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed change may adversely affect the aesthetic character of this property and the historic district in which it is located. The intent of the chapter is to protect and enhance historic districts and ensure any changes are consistent with the cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property or the historic district in which the property is located.

The applicant is requesting approval for a one and two story 1,202 square-foot addition to the rear of the existing residence, removal of the rear (west) wall of the home, eight feet of the south wall and removal of all the original windows on the side and rear elevations. The addition will result in a 2,088 square foot home, much larger than the typical home found on this block of predominately Neo-Traditional homes constructed between the 1930's through early 1950's. This change is inconsistent with the spirit and intent of the ordinance.

- 2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Department or the Director of Development Services.**

The existing property is not considered dangerous or unsafe. Therefore, this finding is not relevant for this particular property.

- 3. The proposed change is consistent with or not incompatible with the architectural period of the building.**

As conditioned, the addition will be consistent with the architectural period of the structure although the size of the addition may jeopardize the historic integrity of the structure. The divided light wood windows, low-pitched hip roof and stucco finish are consistent with the architectural period of this home. The change from an 886 square foot home to a 2,088 square foot home may create a structure incompatible in size and mass with the typical architectural of that period.

- 4. The proposed change is compatible in architectural style with existing adjacent contributing structures in a historic landmark district.**

As proposed, the two-story 1,202 square foot addition will create a home substantially larger than the vast majority of homes in the immediate neighborhood, which are mostly two or three bedroom one-bath homes in the area of 1,000 to

1,500 square feet. The home to the south was constructed in 1941, the home to the north in 1939 and across the street in 1941. These homes are one-story with low-pitched roofs and between 1,000 to 1,500 square feet. The proposed change is not compatible in terms of mass and scale with the adjacent contributing structures, which are generally smaller homes typically of the 1930's, and 1940's era of construction. The proposed plans are not consistent with the spirit of the California Heights Historic District and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- 5. The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period and/or are compatible with adjacent structures.**

As conditioned, the two-story 1,202 square-foot addition has a scale and mass much larger than adjacent structures. Although there is one other two-story home on the northern portion of the block constructed prior to adoption of the historic district, the surrounding homes are generally much smaller in size. The architectural features and fenestration can be conditioned to be compatible and appropriate.

- 6. The proposed change is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings by the U.S. Department of the Interior.**

As required by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation additions to historic properties should be subordinate to the historic structure. The proposed addition may not be consistent with the standards due to the height, mass and scale of the proposed addition and will change the front elevation and appearance of the home from the public right-of-way.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS  
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL  
Application No. HP14-265  
3441 Gardenia Avenue  
September 8, 2014**

1. This approval is for expansion and associated exterior improvements proposed on plans received by the Department of Development Services - Office of Historic Preservation dated June 30, 2014. The approved exterior improvements are limited to a 1,202 square-foot one and two story addition to the rear of the existing home with the exterior to match. The plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
2. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission or the Cultural Heritage Commission staff before implementing. Upon completion of the project, a Cultural Heritage Commission staff inspection must be requested by the Applicant to ensure that the plans have been executed according to approved plans and that all conditions have been implemented before the OCCUPANCY hold can be released.
3. There is a ten day appeal period that will lapse at 4:30 p.m., 10 calendar days after the action by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Appeal of the Commission's action will not be accepted after this time. A separate fee will apply to appeal an action made by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
4. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from the date of the rendering of the decision by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.070(I), this approval shall expire within one year if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the applicant be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.070(J) for an additional 12 months maximum. The applicant must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the applicant will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
5. This permit shall be invalid if the owner(s) and/or applicant(s) have failed to return written acknowledgment of their acceptance of the conditions of approval on the *Conditions of Approval Acknowledgment Form* supplied by the Planning Bureau. This acknowledgment must be submitted within 30 days from the effective date of approval (final action date or, if in the appealable area of the Coastal Zone, 21 days after the local final action date).

6. Any changes to the plans reviewed by the Cultural Heritage Commission and staff will need prior approval by applicable staff before implementing. Significant changes to the project's design will require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission before permits are issued by the Department of Development Services.
7. All required Building permits shall be obtained by the applicant. Building permits must be obtained prior to the implementation of any construction or rehabilitation work. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply. Plans submitted for Building plan check shall be drawn to scale and include details on all areas of restoration and reconstruction, and shall include a window and door schedule.
8. The materials used shall be as shown on the elevations and materials packet submitted as part of the application process. Any substitutions proposed shall be of a similar or higher quality than originally identified to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services. Requests for significant changes in materials will have to be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
9. Exterior security bars and roll-up doors applied to windows and pedestrian building entrances are prohibited.
10. The proposed alterations should not destroy historic materials or architectural features that characterize the property as a contributing historic structure.
11. Any damages caused to the building during any phase of the project shall be reported to the Planning Bureau and repaired immediately in a manner that is consistent with the Standards.
12. Any other exterior work not specifically included in the approved scope of work reviewed herein shall require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
13. The Certificate of Appropriateness is valid for one (1) year from the date of issuance. It may be extended by the Department of Development Services upon request by the applicant prior to the date of expiration.
14. Any new exterior light fixtures shall be period appropriate subject to approval by the Director of Development Services.
15. All roofing materials, vents, architectural details, and window recess, details and profile shall be constructed to match those existing features on the home. The addition may be clad in a smooth sand stucco finish that shall be used on the entire house.
16. The applicant shall remove the two white vinyl-sliding windows on the front elevation and replace the windows with multipaned wood sash windows to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.

17. All utilities shall be noted on the plans submitted for plan check. Any exterior conduit shall be painted to match the house and any new utilities shall be located in a stucco doghouse enclosure.
18. The existing front six panel wood front door shall be maintained. If the original door has been removed the new door shall be a wood six-panel door. The existing metal security grill over the front door shall be removed and if a new screen door is proposed, the door shall be wood and subject to review and approval by the Director of Development Services.
19. The eaves shall not be boxed in nor shall fascia boards shall be applied to the eave. The home shall have exposed wood rafter tails.
20. Existing vinyl on the underside of the eave and on the diagonal porch columns shall be removed to the satisfaction of the Director of Development Services.
21. The two windows on the proposed front elevation of the second story for the two bathrooms shall be reduced in size to approximately the size of the existing bathroom window of 18 to 24 inches wide and 30 inches high.
22. All conditions of approval must be printed verbatim on all plans submitted for plan review to Long Beach Development Services. These conditions must be printed on the site plan or a subsequent reference page.