

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
PLANNING COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 3, 2016
333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM**

Donita Van Horik, Chair
Erick Verduzco-Vega, Vice Chair
Mark Christoffels, Commissioner
Ron Cruz, Commissioner



Richard Lewis, Commissioner
Andy Perez, Commissioner
Jane Templin, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:09 PM)

At 5:09 p.m., Chair Van Horik called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:09 PM)

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager; Carrie Tai, Current Planning Officer; Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Art Sanchez, Deputy City Attorney; Heidi Eidson, Planning Bureau Secretary.

Commissioners Mark Christoffels, Ron Cruz, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane
Present: Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

FLAG SALUTE (5:10 PM)

Commissioner Perez led the flag salute.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:10 PM)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Cernyar, attorney representing the business owner, spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Chair Van Horik reconvened the meeting.

Michael Mais spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:17 PM)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:17 PM)

1. 16-076PL Recommendation to receive supporting documentation into the record, conclude the public hearing and accept Categorical Exemption CE 16-247, revoke the Conditional Use Permit and Standards Variance (Case No. 9505-01) for a tavern; revoke the business licenses for the operator (Enaid's Way Inc., DBA Miko's Sports Lounge, including but not limited to BU21338610, BU21338620 and BU21338630) and; revoke the property owner's business license (Ronald L. Mackey and Peggy C. Mackey Trust, including but not limited to BU90057720) for the property located at 710 W. Willow Street in the Community Commercial Automobile-Oriented (CCA) zoning district. (District 7)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided an overview of the item.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, provided a procedural discussion.

Michael Cernyar, attorney representing the business owner, spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Michael Cernyar responded to a query from Michael Mais.

Michael Mais spoke.

Amy Bodek and Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Lewis.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perez, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to deny the request for a continuance. The motion carried 7-0.

Michael Cernyar spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Cernyar responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, presented the staff report.

Art Sanchez, Deputy City Attorney, spoke.

Jason MacDonald, former Purchasing and Business Services Manager for the Business License Division of Financial Management, spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Art Sanchez spoke.

Ricky Oropeza, resident witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Ricky Oropeza.

Michael Mais spoke.

Chair Van Horik swore in Larry Cluff, attorney representing the property owner.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Ricky Oropeza.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Ricky Oropeza.

Ricky Oropeza responded to a query from Art Sanchez.

Tonette Kadrmas, resident witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Tonette Kadrmas.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Tonette Kadrmas.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Tonette Kadrmas.

Meeting went into Recess

Meeting Reconvened

Dolores Williams, resident witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Dolores Williams.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Dolores Williams.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Dolores Williams.

Dolores Williams spoke.

Ted Kane, resident witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Ted Kane.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Ted Kane.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Ted Kane.

Dana Dittman, resident witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Dana Dittman.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Dana Dittman.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Dana Dittman.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Larry Cluff responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Sgt. Jose Flores, Long Beach Police Department witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Sgt. Jose Flores.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Sgt. Jose Flores.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Sgt. Jose Flores.

Sgt. Jose Flores responded to queries from Art Sanchez.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Sgt. Jose Flores.

Officer Jose Vazquez, Long Beach Police Department witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Officer Jose Vazquez.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Officer Jose Vazquez.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Officer Jose Vazquez.

Officer Jose Vazquez responded to queries from Art Sanchez.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Larry Cluff responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Officer Jose Vazquez responded to queries from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Detective Laurie Barajas, Long Beach Police Department witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Detective Laurie Barajas.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Detective Laurie Barajas.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Detective Laurie Barajas.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Detective Laurie Barajas.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Detective Laurie Barajas.

Lori Voss, License Inspector with the Business License Division of Financial Management, City Department witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Lori Voss.

Lori Voss responded to a query from Larry Cluff.

Lori Voss responded to queries from Michael Cernyar.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Lori Voss.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Lori Voss responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

Lori Voss responded to a query from Commissioner Cruz.

Nelson Kerr, Manager of the Environmental Health Bureau of the Health Department, City Department witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Nelson Kerr.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Nelson Kerr.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Nelson Kerr.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Nelson Kerr responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Nelson Kerr responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Michael Duerr, Principal Building Inspector with the Building and Safety Bureau of the Department of Development Services, City Department witness, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Michael Duerr.

A dialogue ensued between Larry Cluff and Michael Duerr.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Michael Duerr.

Meeting went into Recess

Meeting Reconvened

Michael Cernyar spoke.

Dede Yancey, owner of Miko's Sports Lounge, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Dede Yancey.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Dede Yancey.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Dede Yancey responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Dede Yancey.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Dede Yancey.

Vivian Session, witness for the business owner, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Vivian Session.

Priscilla O'Quinn, bartender at Miko's, witness for the business owner, provided testimony.

A dialogue ensued between Michael Cernyar and Priscilla O'Quinn.

A dialogue ensued between Art Sanchez and Priscilla O'Quinn.

Priscilla O'Quinn responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Joan Greenwood provided public comment.

Susan Redfield provided public comment.

Cari Sanders provided public comment.

Janell Lewis provided public comment.

Mark Lyles provided public comment.

Ajah Yancey provided public comment.

Kathy Parsons presented a videotaped statement from Steven Kirkpatrick as public comment.

Bobby Richardson provided public comment.

Karla Byndon provided public comment.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Linda Tatum, Planning Bureau Manager, spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Linda Tatum spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Lewis spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Meeting went into Recess

Meeting Reconvened

Michael Mais responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Michael Cernyar spoke.

Larry Cluff spoke.

Art Sanchez spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Cruz.

Commissioner Cruz spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Art Sanchez spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Commissioner Lewis spoke.

Art Sanchez responded to a query from Commissioner Lewis.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perez, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to deny the request for a continuance.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mark Christoffels, Ron Cruz, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to approve the recommendation to revoke the property owner's business license, Ronald L. Mackey and Peggy C. Mackey Trust, including but not limited to BU90057720 for the property located at 710 W. Willow Street.

The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Ron Cruz, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

No: 2 - Mark Christoffels and Richard Lewis

A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to approve the recommendation revoke the business licenses for the operator (Enaid's Way Inc., DBA Miko's Sports Lounge, including but not limited to BU21338610, BU21338620 and BU21338630). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Ron Cruz, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

No: 1 - Mark Christoffels

A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to approve the recommendation to revoke the Conditional Use Permit and Standards Variance (Case No. 9505-01) for a tavern. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Mark Christoffels, Ron Cruz, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (1:58 AM)

There was no public comment given.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (1:58 AM)

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

ADJOURNMENT (2:00 AM)

At 2:00 a.m., Chair Van Horik adjourned the meeting.

hge

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មើនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

Donita Van Horik, Chair
Erick Verduzco-Vega, Vice Chair
Mark Christoffels, Commissioner
Ron Cruz, Commissioner



Richard Lewis, Commissioner
Andy Perez, Commissioner
Jane Templin, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:08 PM)

At 5:08 p.m., Chair Van Horik called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:08 PM)

Also present: Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Mark Hungerford, Planner; Ira Brown, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Planning Bureau Secretary.

Commissioners Mark Christoffels, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin,

Present: Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

Commissioners Ron Cruz

Absent:

FLAG SALUTE (5:09 PM)

Commissioner Christoffels led the flag salute.

MINUTES (5:09 PM)

16-075PL Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of October 20, 2016.

A motion was made by Commissioner Templin, seconded by Commissioner Perez, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mark Christoffels, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin and Erick Verduzco-Vega

Abstain: 1 - Donita Van Horik

Absent: 1 - Ron Cruz

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:10 PM)

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, provided the Director's Report.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:13 PM)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:13 PM)

1. 16-079PL Recommendation to deny the appeals from Melinda Cotton, Aileen Colon, and Susan Miller and uphold the decision of the Zoning Administrator to accept Categorical Exemption CE 16-022 and approve a Local Coastal Development Permit in conjunction with the proposed vacation of the 131.2-foot-long, 15-foot-wide alley west of 4100 E. Ocean Boulevard. (District 3) (Application No. 1602-01)

Commissioner Lewis recused himself from the item.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, introduced Mark Hungerford, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Mark Hungerford responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Christopher Koontz responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Mark Hungerford responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Susan Miller, appellant, spoke.

Melinda Cotton, appellant, spoke.

Aileen Colon, appellant, spoke.

Kurt Schneider, applicant, spoke.

Jared Tooley provided public comment.

Ann Cantrell provided public comment.

Ray Bonaventura provided public comment.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Christopher Koontz.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Christopher Koontz.

Mark Hungerford spoke.

Christopher Koontz spoke.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Melinda Cotton spoke.

Aileen Colon spoke.

Susan Miller spoke.

Kurt Schneider spoke.

Kurt Schneider responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Perez spoke.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Perez, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Mark Christoffels, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

Absent: 1 - Ron Cruz

Recused: 1 - Richard Lewis

2. 16-077PL

Recommendation to receive and file the 2016 Mobility Element Annual Report and instruct the Director of Development Services to submit the Annual Report to the City Council and State Office of Planning and Research. (Citywide)

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Lewis spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Lewis.

Steve Gerhardt, Walk Long Beach, provided public comment.

A motion was made by Commissioner Christoffels, seconded by Vice Chair Verduzco-Vega, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Mark Christoffels, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

Absent: 1 - Ron Cruz

3. 16-078PL

Recommendation to accept Categorical Exemption CE 16-268 and recommend that the City Council adopt a Resolution approving the draft Communities of Excellence in Nutrition, Physical Activity and Obesity Prevention (CX3) Pedestrian Plan as a technical appendix to the Mobility Element of the Long Beach General Plan. (Districts 1, 2, 6, and 7)

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, introduced Lara Turnbull of the Health Department and Brian Ulaszewski of City Fabrick.

Lara Turnbull, Healthy Active Long Beach Project Coordinator, presented the CX3 Pedestrian Plan.

Brian Ulaszewski, City Fabrick, spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to queries from Chair Van Horik.

Brian Ulaszewski responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Lara Turnbull responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Commissioner Lewis spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Lewis and Christopher Koontz.

Commissioner Perez spoke.

Brian Ulaszewski responded to queries from Commissioner Perez.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Brian Ulaszewski responded to queries from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Lara Turnbull responded to a comment from Commissioner Christoffels.

Steve Gerhardt, Walk Long Beach, provided public comment.

Commissioner Lewis spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Lewis, seconded by Commissioner Templin, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Mark Christoffels, Richard Lewis, Andy Perez, Jane Templin, Erick Verduzco-Vega and Donita Van Horik

Absent: 1 - Ron Cruz

STUDY SESSION (7:20 PM)

16-080PL Conduct a Study Session regarding the Bicycle Master Plan.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the Bicycle Master Plan study session.

Ryan Johnson, consultant, discussed outreach for the Bicycle Master Plan.

Nate Baird, Mobility Officer, Public Works Department, discussed the development of the bikeway network.

Ira Brown spoke.

Sheila Nim, Co-Chair of Walk Bike Long Beach, provided public comment.

Danny Gamboa provided public comment.

Alan Crawford provided public comment.

Alison Vote, representing San Pedro CD 15 Bicycle Advisory Committee, provided public comment.

Manu Niep provided public comment.

Susanna Siem, Executive Director of United Cambodian Community, provided public comment.

Amocha Dochli provided public comment.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Eric Widstrand, City Traffic Engineer, spoke.

Nate Baird spoke.

Nate Baird responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Eric Widstrand responded to queries from Commissioner Verduzco-Vega.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Nate Baird responded to queries from Commissioner Templin.

Christopher Koontz spoke.

Commissioner Perez spoke.

Nate Baird responded to a query from Commissioner Perez.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to comments made by Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Christopher Koontz responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

PLANNING COMMISSION TRAINING (8:10 PM)

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, presented a training session on the Brown Act and Planning Commission Rules and Procedures.

Commissioner Templin spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Templin.

Christopher Koontz, Advance Planning Officer, spoke.

Michael Mais discussed the Planning Commission Rules and Procedures.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Lewis.

Michael Mais spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Verduzco-Vega and Michael Mais.

Christopher Koontz spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Lewis.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Van Horik.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (8:09 PM)

(Item taken out of order)

Written correspondence was received into the record from Larry Goodhue.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (8:49 PM)

Commissioner Verduzco-Vega spoke.

Chair Van Horik spoke.

ADJOURNMENT (8:51 PM)

At 8:51 p.m., Chair Van Horik adjourned the meeting.

hge

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។