

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, JULY 7, 2021
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
CIVIC CHAMBERS, 8:30 AM**

Joel Garnica, President
Brandon Dowling, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Garnica asked Lieutenant Lee Debrabander of the Long Beach Police Department to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Brandon Dowling and Joel

Present: Garnica

Commissioners Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Absent:

President Garnica welcomed Commissioner Wheeler to her first in-person meeting. Commissioner Wheeler stated that it has been a pleasure working with the Commission as well as staff.

President Garnica wanted to give a shout out to Civil Service staff as well as to all city employees for hanging in there during one of the toughest times of our lives, for pivoting and for jumping through hoops and challenges with adjusting. She asked everyone to stand and applaud each other as well as themselves for such great work.

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

2. [21-199CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
Special Meeting of June 23, 2021

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 7):

President Garnica pulled Agenda Item 3 for a separate discussion.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve Consent Calendar Items (4 - 7), except for Item (3). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

3. [21-200CS](#) **Recommendation to approve examination results:**
Administrative Analyst I-IV
Aquatics Supervisor I-II
Civil Engineering Assistant Test #02
Fire Engineer (PROMOTIONAL)
Geographic Information Systems Supervisor
Housing Aide I-II
School Guard Test #05

*Senior Librarian Test #04
Stock And Receiving Clerk*

To gain a better understanding on the makeup of the examination results, President Garnica asked staff to provide more information for Administrative Analyst I-IV, Aquatics Supervisor I-II, Housing Aide I-II, Senior Librarian and Stock and Receiving Clerk. Staff provided additional information on the following: the difference between those who applied and those who qualified, provided information on minimum requirements and explained the reasoning as to why applicants and/or candidates were not successful.

For the Aquatics Supervisor examination results, Commissioner Arias wanted to know if the recruitment will be reopened since we normally provide the department with a minimum of five candidates. Ms. McDonald responded that if the department is unable to make a selection, Civil Service will run the recruitment again to meet its obligation.

Commissioner Arias stated that since there have been questions regarding the Administrative Analyst position in the past, she would like to receive a detailed report that provides information regarding the position as well as demographics. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that once the list has been certified, she will bring back information to the Commission.

A discussion took place with President Garnica, Vice President Dowling and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding how to best present future examination results in terms of those who applied and those who qualified. It was mentioned that perhaps providing information on candidates who move forward, and not just those that were disqualified, would be a better way to present the examination results. It was discussed that staff will look into the feasibility of changing the way the examination results are presented.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

4. [21-202CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Jose Binuya, Supervisor-Waste Operations, Public Works Department (31 yrs., 5 mos.)

Gregory Krabbe, Police Officer, Police Department (26 yrs., 5 days)

Jack Manu, Police Officer, Police Department (18 yrs., 8 mos.)

Patrick Randle, Refuse Operator III, Public Works Department (23 yrs., 3 mos.)

Dana Rena Rhoads, Marina Agent III, Parks, Recreation and Marine Department (31 yrs., 1 mo.)

Ronald Windsor, Special Services Officer III, Harbor Department (30 yrs., 8 mos.)

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Pizarro Winting, acknowledged Gregory Krabbe for his 26 years, 5 days of dedicated service to the City of Long Beach. Lieutenant Lee Debradander of the Long Beach Police Department was present to highlight his career. The Commission congratulated Mr. Krabbe on his retirement and asked what his plans were for the future. Mr. Krabbe stated that he plans to refocus on one of his hobby's as an artist. He plans to continue oil painting and sketching.

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [21-203CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Chia-Ling Chang, Accounting Clerk I, Financial Management Department (1 yr., 8 mos.)

Cristina Espinosa, Public Safety Dispatcher I, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications Department (11 mos. 4 days)

Tracey Foster, Systems Analyst I, Technology and Innovations Department (21 yrs., 11 mos.)

Denise Gonzalez, Personnel Analyst III, Human Resources Department (2 yrs., 11 mos.)

James Ly, Accounting Clerk III, Harbor Department (9 yrs., 4 mos.)

Demaya Moore, Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Police Department (1 yr., 5 mos.)

Jonathan Raspa, Port Planner III, Harbor Department (2 yrs., 7 mos.)

Mary Raymundo, Clerk Typist III, Police Department (3 yrs., 6 mos.)

Carla Shares, Refuse Operator I, Public Works Department (1 yr., 3 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [21-204CS](#)

Recommendation to approve schedule for hearing(s):

Reduction Appeal 09-R-1819, Suggested Dates: July 14, 2021 and July 21, 2021

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [21-205CS](#)

Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)

Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Building Services Supervisor (J10NN-20) (7/31/2020)

*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-20) Test #17 (1/16/2020) **3 months****

*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-20) Test #20 (7/28/2020) **4 months****

Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-21) Test #24 (1/12/2021)

*Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #10 (1/17/2020) **3 months****

*Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #11 (2/19/2020) **3 months****

Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #16 (7/7/2020)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-21) Test #18 (1/27/2021)

*Civil Engineering Associate (K13NN-20) Test #09 (1/29/2020) **3 months****

*Clerk Typist I-IV (D04AN-19) (1/4/2019) **3 months****

Electrician (I15NN-20) Test #07 (7/9/2020)

Emergency Medical Education Coordinator (G45NN-20) Test #01 (1/30/2020)

Environmental Health Specialist I-IV (G43AN-20) Test #01

(7/24/2020)
Environmental Specialist Associate (N26NN-20) Test #01
(1/17/2020)
Garage Service Attendant I-III (J23AN-20) Test #03 (1/6/2020)
Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter (I61NN-19) Test #01
(7/19/2019)
Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter (I61NN-19) Test #02
(8/1/2019)
Painter I-II (I33AN-19) (6/13/2019)
Plumber (I38NN-20) Test #01 (7/24/2020)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #06 (7/24/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #08 (8/30/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-20) Test #10 (1/27/2020)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-20) Test #14 (7/30/2020)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-21) Test #18 (1/25/2021)
Police Property & Supply Clerk I-II (D51AN-19) (1/10/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #05 (1/10/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #06 (1/23/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #07 (2/28/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #08 (4/18/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #10 (7/9/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #11 (7/25/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #12 (9/6/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #13 (10/24/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #14 (1/17/2020)
Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #15 (1/23/2020)
Port Financial Analyst I-III (ND1AN-19) Test #01 (7/3/2019)
Port Financial Analyst I-III (ND1AN-19) Test #02 (7/17/2019)
Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-20) Test #05 (7/21/2020)
Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-21) Test #11 (1/6/2021)
Public Health Nutritionist I-III (G21AN-19) Test #01 (7/22/2019)
Public Health Nutritionist I-III (G21AN-20) Test #04 (1/6/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I - IV - Lateral (J45AN-20C) Test #05
(7/22/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test
#12 (7/2/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test
#13 (7/24/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-21A) Test

#19 (1/27/2021)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test
#13 (7/2/2020)
Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-21B) Test
#20 (1/27/2021)
Refuse Operator I-III (JA2AN-20) Test #26 (7/15/2020) 2
months*
Senior Civil Engineer (K52NN-19) Test #04 (3/13/2019) 1
month*
Senior Program Manager - Harbor (NFONN-21) Test #01
(1/26/2021)
Senior Traffic Engineer (K68NN-20) Test #08 (7/7/2020) 2
months*
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-19) Test #35 (1/16/2019)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-20) Test #45 (7/30/2020)
Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-21) Test #49 (1/14/2021)
Supervisor-Stores & Property (C35NN-19) Test #01
(7/17/2019)
Traffic Engineer (K76NN-20) Test #01 (7/15/2020)
Transportation Planner I-III (NC6AN-20) Test #01 (1/16/2020)

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

REGULAR AGENDA

8. [21-206CS](#) **RECEIVE AND FILE RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION
COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION TO THE CIVIL SERVICE
COMMISSION REGARDING PROTEST OF WRITTEN
EXAMINATION ITEM(S) - Police Sergeant**

Commissioner Wheeler informed the Commission that the Recruitment and Selection Committee concurred with staff recommendation to deny the protest.

**A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by
Commissioner Arias, to receive and file this item. The motion
carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

9. [21-207CS](#)

APPROVE RECOMMENDATION(S) REGARDING PROTEST OF WRITTEN EXAMINATION ITEM(S) - Police Sergeant

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Ramos who briefed the Commissioner regarding this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

10. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

The Executive Committee did not have any information to report.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

The Recruitment and Selection Committee did not have any further updates to report.

C. Special Projects Committee

Commissioner Arias reported that the Special Projects Committee had the opportunity to tour the Board Room and the Assembly Room at the Water Department. Committee members decided that the Board Room is better suited to host upcoming hearings as well as business meetings should they both coincide on the same day. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that the Harbor Department will not be open to the public until later.

President Garnica wanted clarification that hearings will be held at the Water Department until the Harbor Department is available. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that she was correct.

11. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten announced that the city has launched its new Events Calendar. She provided an overview and stated that all events happening citywide can be located on the calendar. She will send commissioners a link after the meeting.

Ms. Slaten also announced that the city is partnering with the Long Beach Community Internship Project to give seniors from the California State University, Long Beach, who are also part of the Long Beach Promise, an opportunity to work within the city. She stated that she is excited as this is a pipeline for future applicants.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald stated that it is great to be back and see everyone in person and to formally meet Commissioner Wheeler. She thanked staff and expressed appreciation for their work during the pandemic. She thanked Ms. Goings as well as staff who assisted with putting together the examination results for Fire Engineer. Ms. McDonald provided an update on Administrative Analyst as it is close to completion. She stated that this examination typically takes five months to complete and she was able to get it done within three months and thanked Russ Ficker, Sandra Aguilar, Eileen Hunter and Rob Pfingsthorn for their assistance.

C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo provided an update on budget. She stated that we are currently building the budget for fiscal year 2022 and provided an overview. She stated that we are also reviewing the Budget Chapter Book for the department, which provides a summary of each division as well as accomplishments.

Ms. Alamo provided an update on the LB Coast Project. She stated that the group is currently working on building and testing a template for electronic performance appraisals for general staff as well as for public safety staff. She stated that they are also testing various levels of an electronic approval process for the performance appraisals.

Commissioner Arias asked Ms. Alamo to provide a review of the appraisal template when available. Ms. Alamo responded that she will provide a review.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated it was a pleasure to see staff and the Commission this morning. She thanked the management team, led by Ms. McDonald, for their work on Administrative Analyst. She stated that the Commission approved a healthy list that will be quickly utilized by departments.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that the attorneys have provided staff with dates for additional hearings. Commission will approve more dates at its next meeting.

Ms. Pizarro Winting provided an update regarding the permitting process. She stated that staff is working with Human Resources, Development Services and Technology and Innovation on ways to improve the process. She stated that Civil Service staff has identified some innovations to enhance the existing recruitment plan. Ms. Tamura oversees the examination for Permit Technician and is working diligently to provide the department with candidates. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that people are not applying for entry level positions as in past years. She reported that Recruitment and Outreach along with Employment Services staff have been working on various innovative techniques. She hopes that as the federal aid ends, we will see an increase in applicants.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she reviewed the special authority that was given to her by the Commission to help things progress during the pandemic. She stated that the authority was granted through the emergency order, which is set to expire on September 30, 2021. Ms. Pizarro Winting will update the Commission on any changes. She stated that she has not had to recently invoke the authority as we are past the crisis part of the pandemic.

Ms. Pizarro Winting invited the Commission to the upcoming Fire Promotion on July 16, 2021, and asked Commissioners to contact her if they would like to attend.

President Garnica wanted to know if hearings will be scheduled on a continuous basis after the August dates. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that we are trying to fill the dates. She stated that the attorneys have been made aware that the Commission is available and is expecting to meet each week.

President Garnica stated that the Commission will continue with the special authority and directed staff to advise the Commission whenever it is used. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that she will be sure to provide a report when it is used.

12. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

President Garnica asked if the stipulated agreement that was signed by the attorneys regarding the postponement of hearings was still active or if it has lapsed. Mr. Anderson responded that as of October 9, 2020, the agreement had lapsed, and is working with the attorneys to extend the agreement to July 14, 2021. President Garnica would like staff to speak with attorneys to see if there is any hesitation from witnesses or clients regarding having in-person hearings. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that she will have a discussion with the attorneys.

13. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business discussed.

14. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

There were no comments from the public.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 9:35 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មើនគ្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។