

**LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
JEANNE KARATSU, PRESIDENT
JANUARY 18, 2012**

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, January 18, 2012, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks Jr., Larry Keller

MEMBERS EXCUSED: Carolyn Smith Watts, Jonathan Gotz

OTHERS PRESENT: Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary
Melinda George, Deputy Director
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant
Christina Checel, Senior Deputy City Attorney
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst
Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst
Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

President Jeanne Karatsu presided.

MINUTES: It was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of January 11, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-5): It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

EXAMINATION RESULTS: Request to approve examination results.

Plan Checker Plumbing (1/12/12)

The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.

RETIREMENTS:

Request to receive and file retirements.

James Stein/Surveyor/Harbor
Lilanie Fabella/Accountant III/Financial Management
Phillip Rios/Maintenance Assistant III/Public Works

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

RESIGNATIONS:

Request to receive and file resignations.

Juliann Kahai/Public Safety Dispatcher II/Police
Eva Serrano-Garcia/Public Health Nutritionist I/Health

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

SCHEDULE FOR HEARING:

Request to approve hearing schedule.

Dismissal Appeal 03-D-1112, May 9 & 16, 2012

The motion was made to approve hearing schedule on Consent Calendar.

REQUEST TO AMEND ELIGIBLE LISTS:

DECEMBER 7, 2011 & JANUARY 11, 2012

The Secretary presented a staff report prepared by him, requesting the Commission to approve an amendment to the eligible lists of December 7, 2011 and January 11, 2012, by adding Electrician, retroactively to December 7, 2011, and deleting Supervisor – Facility Maintenance from the eligible list of January 11, 2012. The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried to approve the amendments to the eligible list. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

PROTEST OF WRITTEN EXAMINATION ITEMS:

ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST

The Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Melinda George, Deputy Director, regarding the protested questions from the Administrative Analyst examination which was administered on January 10, 2012. Ms. George briefed the Commission regarding the protests. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks,

seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried to approve the recommended disposition of the protested items. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Hicks suggested that staff carefully consider posting job bulletins during the holidays. Also, that staff should consider departments' requests for longer filing periods.

MANAGERS' REPORT:

The Secretary acknowledged Charlie Jones and Robert Creighton, two former City employees and Civil Service Commissioners who recently passed away.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION
(Government Code 54957.8)**

REVIEW OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES

Commissioner Hicks requested that this item be held over until at least four Commissioners are present. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried to hold this item over to February 15, 2012. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business before the Commission, President Karatsu adjourned the meeting.



MARIO R. BEAS
Secretary

MRB:meh

Becky Blair, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Leslie Gentile, Commissioner
Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:05 PM)

[see media](#)

At 5:05 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:05 PM)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

ROLL CALL (5:05 PM)

[see media](#)

Commissioners Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani
Present: Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Steven Valdez, Planner; Jorge Ramirez, Planner; Lynette Ferenczy, Planner; Mark Hungerford, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:05 PM)

[see media](#)

Commissioner Fox led the flag salute.

MINUTES (5:06 PM)

[see media](#)

[see media](#)

[12-001PL](#)

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of December 1, 2011.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Abstain: 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

Excused: 1 - Melani Smith

see media

12-002PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of December 15, 2011.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gentile, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Excused: 1 - Melani Smith

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:07 PM)

see media

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, provided the Director's Report.

Chair Blair spoke.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:10 PM)

see media

see media

1. 12-003PL Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit to allow an existing used car dealership to continue operation in compliance with performance standards codified in Long Beach Boulevard Planned Development District (PD-29). The used car dealership is located at 1470 Long Beach Boulevard. (District 6) (Application No. 1103-19)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Steven Valdez, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Steven Valdez responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Nassar Nuri, applicant, spoke.

Nassar Nuri responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Nassar Nuri responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Derek Burnham responded to a comment from Commissioner Van Horik.

Nassar Nuri responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Laurie Peterson provided public comment.

Laurie Peterson responded to queries from Commissioner Fox.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Nassar Nuri responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Chair Blair swore in a late arriving member of the public wishing to speak.

Liz Villa de la Puente provided public comment.

Liz Villa de la Puente responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Michael Mais advised Commissioner Smith that she must recuse herself from the item.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais responded to comments made by Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Derek Burnham spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to continue the item to March 15, 2012. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile,
Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Excused: 1 - Melani Smith

see media

2. 12-004PL

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit request to establish a trucking dispatch business located at 2605 E. 67th Street within the General Industrial (IG) zoning district. (District 9) (Application No. 1109-03)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Steven Valdez, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Francisco Hernandez, representing the applicant, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith, Francisco Hernandez, and Derek Burnham.

Steven Valdez and Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Francisco Hernandez responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Derek Burnham.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Francisco Hernandez responded to a query from Chair Blair.

A dialogue ensued between Francisco Hernandez, Chair Blair and Derek Burnham.

Francisco Hernandez responded to queries from Commissioner Gentile.

Francisco Hernandez responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Francisco Hernandez responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Commissioner Smith.

Rebecca Kelley, Property Manager, representing Los Angeles Real Estate Management, provided public comment.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Beverly Tyson, an employee of Superior Dispatch.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to strike Condition No. 8 requiring the use of two separate gates for truck ingress and egress. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

see media

3. 12-005PL

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit request to allow the sale of beer and wine for on-site consumption (Type 42 license), as well as wine tasting at a proposed wine bar located at 3848 Atlantic Avenue within the Commercial Neighborhood Pedestrian (CNP) zoning district. (District 8) (Application No. 1110-05)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Jorge Ramirez, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Jorge Ramirez responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Jorge Ramirez responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Ernie Henson, applicant, spoke.

Ernie Henson responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Ernie Henson responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith and Ernie Henson.

John Deats provided public comment.

Blair Cohn, Bixby Knolls Business Improvement Association, provided public comment.

Blair Cohn responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Fox, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

see media

4. 12-006PL

Recommendation to certify a Mitigated Negative Declaration (ND 03-11) and approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the technical demolition of a historic resource in conjunction with the restoration and reconstruction of the structure to its original condition with a 238-square-foot addition to the rear of the structure located at 3801 E. 5th Street within the Belmont Heights Historic District and the R-1-N zoning district. (District 3) (Application no. HP11-0296)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.

Lynette Ferenczy, Project Planner, presented the staff report.

Sean Coon, applicant, spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gentile, seconded by Commissioner Smith, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

see media

5. 12-007PL

Recommendation to sustain the Appeal from Tamara J. Van Duyne, overturning the Zoning Administrator's denial of a front setback Standards Variance, and uphold the Zoning Administrator's approval of a side setback Standards Variance and a Local Coastal Development Permit in conjunction with garage, second story and roof deck additions, to an existing single-family dwelling located at 20 Pomona Avenue in the R-2-S zoning district. (District 3) (Application No. 1101-03)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.

Mark Hungerford, Project Planner, presented the staff report.

Tamara Van Duyne, applicant, spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Tamara Van Duyne.

Walt Petrosky, architect, responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Mark Hungerford spoke.

Walt Petrosky responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Mark Hungerford responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Walt Petrosky responded to queries from Commissioner Van Horik.

Tamara Van Duyne responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Chair Blair spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Blair.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Fox, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

see media

6. 12-008PL

Recommendation to deny the Appeal from the Peninsula Beach Preservation Group and uphold the Zoning Administrator's November 14, 2011 decision to approve a Standards Variance request for a reduced garage setback off of Ocean Boulevard and a Local Coastal Development Permit in conjunction with the demolition of an existing two-story single-family home and construction of a new three-story residence located at 5517 E. Ocean Boulevard in the R-2-I zoning district. (District 3) (Application No. 1109-06)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Lynette Ferenczy, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Rocky Suarez, applicant, spoke.

Ron Hoover, architect, spoke.

Ron Hoover responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Rob Bellevue, representing the appellant, spoke.

Rob Bellevue responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Blair and Rob Bellevue.

Ron Hoover responded to a query from Commissioner Gentile.

Ron Hoover spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Ron Hoover responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Derek Burnham spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Fox, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Alan L. Fox, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith and Becky Blair

No: 2 - Phillip Joseph Saumur and Donita Van Horik

see media

7. 12-009PL

Recommendation to deny the Appeal from Larry Goodhue and uphold the Cultural Heritage Commission's November 14, 2011 decision to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new eelgrass beds adjacent to the northeast end of Marine Stadium, a designated historic landmark site, to mitigate the loss of eelgrass due to the Alamitos Bay Marina rehabilitation project. (District 3) (Application No. HP11-0289)

Commissioners Gentile and Smith recused themselves from the item.

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Lynette Ferenczy, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Mark Sandoval, Manager of the Marine and Beach Bureau of the Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine, spoke.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.

Mark Sandoval responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Larry Goodhue, appellant, spoke.

Bobbie Casado provided public comment.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Larry Goodhue spoke.

Larry Goodhue responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Excused: 2 - Leslie Fernald Gentile and Melani Smith

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (8:11 PM)

see media

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (8:14 PM)

see media

There were no comments from the Planning Commission.

ADJOURNMENT (8:14 PM)

At 8:14 p.m., Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge