

**LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
JEANNE KARATSU, PRESIDENT
JANUARY 11, 2012**

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, January 11, 2012, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Jeanne Karatsu, Charles Hicks Jr., Jonathan Gotz, Larry Keller

MEMBER EXCUSED: Carolyn Smith Watts

OTHERS PRESENT: Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary
Melinda George, Deputy Director
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant
Christina Checel, Senior Deputy City Attorney
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst
Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst
Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst
Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst
Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

President Jeanne Karatsu presided.

MINUTES: It was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of December 7, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

It was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Suspension Appeal 28-S-1011 & 32-S-1011 hearing minutes of November 9, 2011 and December 7, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Dismissal Appeal 22-D-1011 hearing minutes of October 19, 2011 and December 14, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-10):

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

EXAMINATION RESULTS:

Request to approve examination results.

Ambulance Operator
Capital Projects Coordinator
Environmental Specialist Assistant (12/22/11)
Gas Maintenance Supervisor (12/22/11)
Housing Specialist
Plan Checker - Plumber
Public Safety Dispatcher (12/22/11)

The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.

EXTENSION OF EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS:

Request to extend the following eligible lists for an additional six months:

Animal Health Technician
Deputy Chief Harbor Engineer
Deputy Fire Marshal
Electrical Engineer
Firefighter – Lateral
Neighborhood Services Specialist
Painter
Petroleum Engineering Associate
Police Officer – Lateral
Program Scheduler
Senior Electrical Inspector
Traffic Engineer
Transportation Planner

The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.

RETIREMENTS:

Request to receive and file retirements.

Martha Villacres/Development Project Manager III/DV
Phillip Coombs/Firefighter/Fire
Jason Hudson/Marine Safety Sergeant Boat Operator/Fire
George Jackson/Fire Boat Operator/Fire
Lester Lancaster/Fire Engineer/Fire
Louis Martinet/Marine Safety Captain/Fire

Michael Miller/Fire Captain/Fire
Daniel Mills/Fire Captain/Fire
Robert Robles/Fire Captain/Fire
Kirk Storey/Fire Engineer/Fire
Craig Weismann/Fire Captain/Fire
Ronald Wiggins/Firefighter/Fire
Marietta Jones/Microbiologist III/Health
Steven Nakauchi/Environmental Health Specialist
IV/Health
Mary Hopman/Department Librarian I/Library
O Karol Seehaus/Department Librarian II/Library
Julius Mondragon/Petroleum Operations Coordinator
I/LBGO
Albert Barber/Police Officer/Police
Ronald Board/Police Officer/Police
Patrick Burns/Police Lieutenant/Police
Robert Correia/Police Officer/Police
Richard Firman/Police Officer/Police
Darren Hall/Police Sergeant/Police
Tyrone Hatfield/Police Lieutenant/Police
Steve Lasiter/Police Officer/Police
Jose Orozco/Police Officer/Police
Randy Petersen/Police Officer/Police
Kenny Quaack/Police Officer/Police
Richard Ramos/Police Officer/Police
Gregory Roberts/Police Officer/Police
Craig Rose/Police Officer/Police
Ron Trott/Police Officer/Police
Victor Vidriales/Police Officer/Police
Paul Wegner/Police Sergeant/Police
Billy Hawkins/Refuse Operator III/PW
Jorge Ledesma Valdez/Equipment Mechanic I/PW
Jimmie Marshall/Garage Service Attendant III/PW
Enrique Reveles/Business Systems Specialist II/TS
Pedro Ybarra/Water Utility Supervisor I/Water

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

On behalf of the Commission, the Secretary presented Certificates of Appreciation to Tyrone Hatfield (28 years), Police Department and Enrique Reveles (38 years), Technology Services. Representatives from their respective departments were present and spoke on their behalves.

DISABILITY RETIREMENTS:

Request to receive and file disability retirements.

Maria Martinez/Nutrition Aide I/Health
Christopher Bates/Police Officer/Police

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

RESIGNATIONS:

Request to receive and file resignations.

John Marinkovich/Library Clerk I/Library
John McCluskey/Equipment Mechanic II/Public Works
Rogelio Martinez/Special Services Officer III/Police

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

TRANSFER:

Request to approve transfer.

Nancy Villasenor/Administrative Analyst III/Human
Resources to Administrative Analyst III/Public Works

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

SCHEDULE FOR HEARING:

Request to approve scheduled hearing.

Suspension Appeal 42-S-1011, February 23, 2012

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

RESCHEDULE FOR HEARING:

Request to approve rescheduled hearing.

Suspension Appeal 30-S-1011, February 3, 2012

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

WITHDRAWAL OF APPEAL:

Request to withdraw Disability Retirement Appeal 28-DR-910.

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENTS:

The Secretary presented a communication from Deborah R. Mills, Director of Human Resources, requesting Commission authorization to appoint Maria Macias and Dana Kelly, to the classification of Personnel Assistants II - Confidential on a provisional basis. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the request be granted in accordance with Civil Service Commission Policy 1.02 and Section 43 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

REQUEST FOR TEMPORARY REASSIGNMENT FOR TRAINING:

ROSA LOPEZ/MAINTENANCE ASSISTANT TO PARKING METER TECHNICIAN

The Secretary presented a communication from Cynthia Stafford, Personnel Services Officer, Public Works, requesting Commission authorization to temporarily reassign Rosa Lopez, Maintenance Assistant to the classification of Parking Meter Technician for training. Ms. Stafford answered Commission questions regarding this matter. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the request for reassignment for training be approved, pursuant to Section 63(3) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

REQUEST FOR TEMPORARY REASSIGNMENT FOR TRAINING:

ROMAN ARRONA/GARAGE SERVICE ATTENDANT TO MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT STOCK CLERK

The Secretary presented a communication from Cynthia Stafford, Personnel Services Officer, Public Works, requesting Commission authorization to temporarily reassign Roman Arrona, Garage Service Attendant to the classification of Mechanical Equipment Stock Clerk for training. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the request for reassignment for training be approved, pursuant to Section 63(3) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR PERMANENT
ASSIGNMENT TO FORMER
CLASSIFICATION:**

**JENNIFER VAUGHN/DEPARTMENT LIBRARIAN TO
GENERAL LIBRARIAN**

The Secretary presented communications from Glenda Williams, Director of Library Services and Jennifer Vaughn, Department Librarian, requesting Commission authorization to return Ms. Vaughn to her former classification of General Librarian. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the request for permanent assignment to former classification be approved, pursuant to Section 67(1) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND
PROBATION:**

**NORMA PALOMERA/REFUSE FIELD INVESTIGATOR
PUBLIC WORKS**

The Secretary presented a communication from Cynthia Stafford, Personnel Services Officer, Public Works, requesting Commission approval to extend the probationary period of Norma Palomera, Refuse Field Investigator, for three months (522 hours). After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the request to extend probation be approved in accordance with Section 41(2) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations and Section 1.01 of the Civil Service Commission Policies and Procedures. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST FOR EXCEPTION TO
CIVIL SERVICE RULES AND
REGULATIONS – ARTICLE VIII
SECTION 115(3):**

**Requesting Exception to Article II, Section 7 of the
Civil Service Rules and Regulations – Qualifications
and Requirements for Office Services Assistant,
Limiting Applications to City Employees and Laid Off
City Employees**

The Secretary presented a staff report, prepared by him, requesting Commission approval for an exception to Article II, Section 7 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations – Qualifications and Requirements, for Office Services Assistant, as an open-competitive examination, limiting applications to City employees and City employees terminated due to layoffs. The Secretary briefed the Commission regarding this request. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by

Commissioner Keller and carried to approve the Exception to Civil Service Rules and Regulations, Section 115(3), Article II, Section 7 – Qualifications and Requirements. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

PROTEST OF WRITTEN EXAMINATION ITEMS:

AMBULANCE OPERATOR

The Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst, regarding the protested questions from the Ambulance Operator examination, which was administered on December 3, 5, 8 and 9, 2011. Ms. DeAraujo briefed the Commission regarding the protests. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried to approve the recommended disposition of the protested items. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

BULLETINS:

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the following Job Opportunity Bulletins be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

General Librarian
Marine Safety Captain
Office Services Assistant

CONSIDERATION OF HEARING OFFICER'S REPORT:

REDUCTION APPEAL HEARING 34-R-1011
(Mailed to CSC on 12/9/11)

The Secretary presented a report prepared by Hearing Officer Dolores Martin, Attorney at Law, to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on December 1, 2011. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the hearing officer's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSIDERATION OF HEARING OFFICER'S REPORT:

SUSPENSION APPEAL 26-S-1011 (Mailed to CSC on 12/2/11)

The Secretary presented a report prepared by Hearing Officer Linda Krieger, Attorney at Law, to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on October 28, 2011. After discussion, it was moved by

Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the hearing officer's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSIDERATION OF HEARING OFFICER'S REPORT:

REDUCTION APPEAL 21-R-1011 (Mailed to CSC on 12/21/11)

The Secretary presented a report prepared by Hearing Officer James Goff, Attorney at Law, to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on November 1 and 18, 2011. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the hearing officer's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Hicks requested that an item be placed on next week's agenda to discuss having someone from the City to come and speak with staff and management to give a report on what issues they believe exist in the department.

MANAGERS' REPORT:

The Secretary informed the Commission that he had completed the forecasting meeting with departments.

APPEAL OF DISQUALIFICATION FROM EXAMINATION:

GENERAL MAINTENANCE ASSISTANT

The Secretary presented a communication from Eric Wilson, Non Career Maintenance Assistant, appealing his disqualification from the General Maintenance Assistant examination, which was conducted on December 1, 2011. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst. The Secretary requested that the Commission recess the hearing to a closed session pursuant to Government Code 54957.8 to discuss the matter. It was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried to recess to a closed session. After discussion and consideration of Mr. Wilson's request, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried to reconvene to the regular meeting. It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried to deny Mr. Wilson's appeal of disqualification from the General Maintenance Assistant examination. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote. Mr. Wilson thanked the Commission for its consideration of his request.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business before the Commission,
President Karatsu adjourned the meeting.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Mario R. Beas', written in a cursive style.

MARIO R. BEAS
Secretary

MRB:meh

Becky Blair, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Charles Durnin, Commissioner
Leslie Gentile, Commissioner
Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:02 PM)

[see media](#)

At 5:02 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:02 PM)

[see media](#)

Boardmembers Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani

Present: Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Boardmembers Leslie Fernald Gentile

Absent:

Also present: Amy J. Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Ira Brown, Planner; Steve Gerhardt, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:03 PM)

[see media](#)

Commissioner Van Horik led the flag salute.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:03 PM)

[see media](#)

There was no Director's Report given.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:04 PM)

[see media](#)

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:05 PM)

see media

see media

1. 11-076PL Recommendation to find the proposed vacation of the east half of the east-west alley in the block south of 7th Street and west of Quincy Avenue in conformance with the adopted goals and policies of the City's General Plan. (District 3) (Application No. 120111)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Ira Brown, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Michael Dillon, applicant, spoke.

Diane Copeland, owner, spoke.

Jon Duston provided public comment.

Michael Dillon and Diane Copeland responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Ira Brown and Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

see media

2. 11-066PL Recommendation to:
- 1) Adopt a Resolution with Findings of Fact, a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program certifying a Final Program Environmental Impact Report;
 - 2) Recommend that the City Council approve a General Plan Amendment to designate all property within the Downtown Plan project area to Land Use Designation (LUD) #7, Mixed Uses; and
 - 3) Recommend that the City Council adopt the Downtown Plan as presented. (Districts 1, 2, and 6)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, introduced the item.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Amy Bodek spoke.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Chair Blair.

Michael Mais spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Steve Gerhardt, Project Planner, spoke.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

see media

2. 11-067PL

Recommendation to adopt a Resolution with Findings of Fact, a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program certifying a Final Program Environmental Impact Report. (Districts 1, 2, and 6) (1)

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Charles Durnin, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

No: 1 - Alan L. Fox

Absent: 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

see media

2. 11-068PL

Recommendation to recommend that the City Council approve a General Plan Amendment to designate all property within the Downtown Plan project area to Land Use Designation (LUD) #7, Mixed Uses. (Districts 1, 2, and 6) (2)

A dialogue ensued between Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, and Chair Blair.

Chair Blair spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Durnin, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

see media

2. 11-069PL

Recommendation to recommend that the City Council adopt the Downtown Plan as presented. (Districts 1, 2, and 6) (3)

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation with an amendment that the City Council consider inclusionary housing and other aspects of economic benefits to residents on a citywide basis.

Chair Durnin spoke.

A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Durnin, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation as presented by staff.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, and Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Derek Burnham responded to comments from Commissioner Smith.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to a comment made by Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Susanne Brown of Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles.

Chair Blair spoke.

An additional recommendation to be presented to the City Council with the Downtown Plan was discussed as follows:

Amy Bodek spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to recommend City Council consider funding a citywide inclusionary housing study.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Smith and Michael Mais.

Commissioner Van Horik accepted a friendly amendment to her motion by Commissioner Smith to recommend City Council consider funding a citywide community benefits study to include inclusionary housing, commercial linkage fees and local hiring practices. Commissioner Saumur seconded the motion.

Susanne Browne, Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

Gary Shelton provided public comment.

Zahirah Mann, Legal Aid foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Allison Bost provided public comment.

Estelle Delvaya provided public comment.

Francis Emily Dawson Harris provided public comment.

Chair Blair spoke.

Cindy Soto provided public comment.

America Aceves, Housing Long Beach, provided public comment.

Chair Blair swore in late arriving members of the public wishing to speak.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Tom Crow, representing St. Luke's Episcopal Church and CSULB School of Social Work, provided public comment.

Michael Mais spoke.

Adrian Martinez, Natural Resource Defense Council, provided public comment.

Don Darnauer, representing the Downtown Residential Council, provided public comment.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Susanne Browne, Zahirah Mann and Adrian Martinez responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Durnin.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

The motion to recommend City Council consider funding a citywide community benefits study to include inclusionary housing, commercial linkage fees and local hiring practices passed by a vote of 4 to 2 with Commissioners Fox, Van Horik, Smith and Saumur voting for and Commissioners Blair and Durnin voting against.

A substitute motion was made by Commissioner Durnin, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation as presented by staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Absent: 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (7:05 PM)

Susanne Browne, Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles, provided public comment.

Bob Ladd, ASLA, provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Larry Goodhue responded to a query from Commissioner Durnin.

Amy Bodek responded to comments from Larry Goodhue.

Larry Goodhue responded to a query from Commissioner Durnin.

Francis Emily Dawson Harris provided public comment.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (7:18 PM)

see media

Chair Blair spoke.

ADJOURNMENT (7:18 PM)

At 7:18 p.m, Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge

Becky Blair, Chair
Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Charles Durnin, Commissioner
Leslie Gentile, Commissioner
Phil Saumur, Commissioner
Melani Smith, Commissioner
Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:05 PM)

At 5:05 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:05 PM)

Boardmembers Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Phillip Joseph
Present: Saumur, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Also present: Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director; Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney; Steve Gerhardt, Planner; Cuentin Jackson, Planner; Angie Zetterquist, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:06 PM)

see media

Commissioner Durnin led the flag salute.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:06 PM)

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

MINUTES (5:06 PM)

see media

11-075PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of November 10, 2011.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Durnin, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Abstain: 1 - Leslie Fernald Gentile

Excused: 1 - Melani Smith

see media

11-077PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of November 17, 2011.

A motion was made by Commissioner Saumur, seconded by Commissioner Gentile, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Excused: 1 - Melani Smith

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:10 PM)

see media

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, presented the Director's Report.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

(Commissioner Smith arrived at 5:10 p.m.)

REGULAR AGENDA (5:12 PM)

see media

see media

1. 11-078PL Recommendation to approve a modification that would upgrade a previously approved Conditional Use Permit that allows alcohol sales for off-premises consumption from a Type 20 License (beer and wine only) to a Type 21 License (beer, wine and distilled spirits) in conjunction with an existing convenience market and accessory deli located at 443 Pine Avenue within the Downtown Planned Development District (PD-30) zone. (District 1) (Application No. 1109-09)

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, introduced Angie Zetterquist, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Robert Zur Schmiede responded to a query from Commissioner Van

Horik.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Commissioner Durnin.

Javier Ortiz, applicant, spoke.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Javier Ortiz responded to a comment from Commissioner Durnin.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Javier Ortiz.

Commissioner Blair spoke.

Javier Ortiz spoke.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Commissioner Gentile spoke.

Steve Gerhardt, Senior Planner, and Robert Zur Schmiede responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Tony Peresey, representing the Kress Lofts Homeowners Association and the North Pine Neighborhood Alliance, provided public comment.

Kristopher Larsen, Vice President of the Downtown Long Beach Associates, provided public comment.

Kristopher Larsen responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Eric Ray, representing the Residents' Council and HOPA, provided public comment.

Kirk Salen, owner of Pine Avenue Studio Kirk Salen Photography, provided public comment.

Logan Crowe, representing Long Beach Cinematheque, provided public comment.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais responded to comments made by Commissioner Van Horik.

Commissioner Van Horik responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Robert Zur Schmiede responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Robert Zur Schmiede responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

A dialogue ensued between the Commission and staff.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Commissioner Gentile responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Durnin and Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Chair Blair spoke.

Robert Zur Schmiede responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Chair Blair spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Durnin, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to allow the sale of larger sized craft beers. The permit would be reviewed by staff after one year. If a problem with loitering and/or consumption of alcohol outside of the market were found to exist, then a prohibition on the sale of distilled spirits in sizes smaller than 375 mls. would be imposed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 7 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

see media

2. 11-079PL

Recommendation to approve a Site Plan Review for the construction of three new industrial buildings of 131,423 square feet, 168,271 square feet, and 106,275 square feet located at 3788 Conant Street in the Douglas Park South Planned Development District (PD-32). (District 5) (Application No. 1109-11)

Chair Blair recused herself from the item. Vice Chair Fox chaired the item.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, introduced Cuentin Jackson, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Steve Gerhardt, Senior Planner, responded to a query from Commissioner Durnin.

Steve Gerhardt responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Steve Gerhardt spoke.

Patrick Russell, applicant, spoke.

Cuentin Jackson responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

A motion was made by Commissioner Durnin, seconded by Commissioner Van Horik, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to remove the first sentence of Condition No. 7. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 6 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Alan L. Fox, Charles Durnin, Leslie Fernald Gentile, Melani Smith and Donita Van Horik

Excused: 1 - Becky Blair

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (6:05 PM)

see media

There was no public comment given.

COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (6:05 PM)

see media

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Steve Gerhardt, Senior Planner, spoke.

Steve Gerhardt responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Steve Gerhardt spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Commissioner Durnin spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Steve Gerhardt responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

ADJOURNMENT (6:16 PM)

see media

At 6:16 p.m., Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge