

# CITY OF LONG BEACH

DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

333 West Ocean Boulevard, 5th Floor • Long Beach, CA 90802 • (562) 570-6194 • Fax (562) 570-6068

March 14, 2016

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS
City of Long Beach
California

#### RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a modification to previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness No. HP13-0068 for exterior building improvements and the restoration of columns, pressed metal decorative building features and paint removal to expose original terra cotta tiles on an existing historic landmark building at 201 Pine Avenue (District 2).

APPLICANT:

John Thomas

280 Molino Avenue #101 Long Beach, CA 90803 (Application No. HP13-0068)

#### THE REQUEST

The applicant requests a modification to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the scope of work to include restoration of black granite columns, install new pressed metal bands over storefronts windows, install pressed metal window separators, and remove paint from original terra cotta tiles at 201 Pine Avenue.

#### **BACKGROUND**

A Certificate of Appropriateness approved in 2013 is still in effect for this project, and construction is currently underway. This modification request was presented on December 14<sup>th</sup>, 2015, and the Cultural Heritage Commission, after extensive discussion, voted to continue the item pending receipt of further information. Specifically, the applicant was directed to provide granite samples for the marble column cladding; a forensic paint color study; and a final paint color palette for the building.

Since the December 2015 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting, the applicant has secured granite material samples, completed the paint study and prepared a paint color palette. Staff and the applicant presented an update on the progress of the project during a January 11, 2016 Study Session. The applicant presented granite material samples and results of the forensics paint study. After Commission discussion, direction was given to

March 14, 2016
Page 2
staff to return with a project recommendation based upon the paint study results, final color palette and the granite material samples.

#### **ANALYSIS**

**CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION** 

The applicant's reasoning for using granite rather than marble is based on its durability as an exterior finish material because the column cladding will be at the street level in an active pedestrian area. The Commission found that granite can conceivably be an acceptable substitute for marble depending on the characteristics of the specific material. In this case, the direction was for the use of a darker granite with some veining to more closely resemble a marble finish. Staff has reviewed the granite sample and finds it to be consistent with the direction provided by the Commission.

The applicant removed portions of paint from the existing horizontal pressed metal band to determine its original paint color. The applicant met the Commission Chair and staff at the site to document completion of the forensic study which, revealed that the original paint was a gold color. While the original pressed metal color was determined, the colors for the metal band will be repainted the same mint color it's currently painted to remain consistent with the building. The applicant has prepared a list of custom paint colors and secured custom paint samples that will generally be a pink/beige and mint to complement the colors of the building's Art Deco detailing. (Exhibit B –Photographs).

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed modifications and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.070 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. Staff supports approval of the modified Certificate of Appropriateness for restoration of the decorative features on the building exterior. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements will not affect the overall scale, massing, proportions, but will use compatible materials and colors consistent with the Art Deco architectural style of the building. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions of approval (Exhibit C – Findings and Conditions of Approval).

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION March 14, 2016 Page 3

#### **PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE**

Public notices were distributed on February 18<sup>th</sup>, 2016. As of this date no letters have been received.

#### **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

In accordance with the 15331 Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), environmental review is not required for maintenance, repair, stabilization, rehabilitation, restoration, preservation, conservation or reconstruction of historical resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for treatment of historic properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitation, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

Respectfully submitted,

CHRISTOPHER KOONTZ, AICP ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER

unda . F. Jahum

LINDA F.TATUM, AICP

PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

LFT:CK:AP

Attachments:

Exhibit A – Location Map

Exhibit B – Photographs

Exhibit C - Findings & Conditions of Approval

# CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS HP13-0068 FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS 201 PINE AVENUE

#### **ANALYSIS:**

In compliance with Section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site is located at 201 Pine Avenue, on the northwest corner of Broadway and Pine Avenue (Exhibit A – Location Map). The property has a zoning designation of PD-30 and is improved with a two-story commercial building designed in an Art Deco Architectural style. This building is a locally designated historic landmark structure in City of Long Beach.

In compliance with Section 2.63.070 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), staff has analyzed the proposed project and the project meets these requirements and those of the City's zoning codes.

### FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.070(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the concerned property or of the landmark district in which it is located, is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.

The proposed project, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the property. The work will be conducted pursuant to the Guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The replication of materials are substantiated and based on historic photos, original building plan and will be distinguishable from the original building features. The project will restore original building features, and gently treat building exterior without damaging historic materials.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Department or the Development Services Department.

There are no active code enforcement cases at this site.

3. The proposed change is consistent with or compatible with the architectural period of the building.

The proposed restoration project is both consistent and compatible with the architectural period of the building. All proposed new architectural features have

been substantiated through original building plans and photos. The types of features proposed are also considered appropriate for the period of the building and Art Deco architectural style of the 1930's.

4. The proposed change is compatible in architectural style with existing adjacent contributing structures in a historic landmark district.

The property is a designated historic landmark, but is not located in a landmark district.

5. The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period and/or are compatible with adjacent structures.

The scale, massing, textures will not change. The original terra cotta tiles will have paint removed from surface to expose original tile color. The proposed decorative features are consistent with the period in which the building was constructed. The building and the proposed changes are compatible with the adjacent structures and a remaining example of Art Deco style within the downtown area.

6. The proposed change is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings by the U.S. Department of the Interior.

The project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Use – The commercial building use will not change.

Character – The character of the structure will not change, and instead will be preserved and restored to its original form with this project.

Changes to Historic Features – The remaining historic features of the structure will be preserved and not change. The new decorative features are based on evidence and records of the original building.

Historic Significance – The project will not change the historic significance of the property.

Distinctive Features – The project will not change the remaining distinctive features of the property.

Deteriorated Historic Features – Deteriorated historic features will be repaired and preserved.

Damage to Historic Materials – The project will not cause damage to the historic features on the structure and the restoration of historic building materials will be in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved.

Historic Material that Characterize the Property – The project will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.

Form and Integrity – The project will not cause damage to the essential form and integrity of the structure.

## **CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

Address: 201 Pine Avenue Application No.: HP13-0068 Hearing Date: March 14, 2016

- 1. This approval is for a modification of previously approved case no. HP13-0068 and includes restoration of exterior columns with black granite, pressed metal decorative bands over storefront windows, pressed metal decorative window separators, and paint removal from original terra cotta tiles. The improvements to the property shall be as shown on plans received by the Department of Development Services Planning Bureau originally submitted in November 2015, as amended. These plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
- 2. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission or by Planning Bureau staff before implementation. Upon completion of the project, a staff inspection must be requested by the Applicant to ensure that the approved plans have been executed according to approved plans and that all conditions have been implemented before occupancy hold can be released.
- 3. There is a ten calendar-day appeal period that will lapse at 4:30 p.m., ten calendar days after the action by the Cultural Heritage Commission is made. Appeal of the Commission's action will not be accepted after this time. A separate fee will apply to appeal an action taken by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
- 4. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from and after the date of the rendering of the decision by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.070(I), this approval shall expire within one year if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the applicant be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.070(I) for an additional 12 months maximum. The applicant must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the applicant will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
- 5. All required building permits shall be obtained by the applicant, as needed. Building and Engineering permits must be obtained prior to the implementation of any construction or rehabilitation work. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply.
- Any building materials, vents, architectural details, window and door trim used in the repainting project, shall be constructed or restored with the same or similar material as those existing features, finished to match.

- 7. The applicant shall obtain a separate Certificate of Appropriateness for any additional proposed exterior changes.
- 8. Any proposed changes to the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission and staff will need to be reviewed and approved by the Director of Development Services or their designee prior to implementation. Significant changes to the project's design will require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission before permits are issued by the Department of Development Services.
- 9. Any future exterior signs must obtain approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Planning Bureau or Cultural Heritage Commission.
- 10. The applicant shall submit a structural wall stabilization plan to protect the building during construction.
- 11. That the applicant shall obtain permits from the Public Works Department for any encroachments in the public right-of-way.
- 12. As a condition of any City approval, the applicant shall defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City and its agents, officers, and employees from any claim, action, or proceeding against the City or its agents, officers, or employees to attack, set aside, void, or annul the approval of the City concerning the processing of the proposal/entitlement or any action relating to, or arising out of, such approval. At the discretion of the City and with the approval of the City Attorney, a deposit of funds by the applicant may be required in an amount sufficient to cover the anticipated litigation costs.

#### ADDED CONDITIONS

- 13. The column cladding shall be granite slab, not tiles, with visible veining elements to resemble marble finishes as presented at the March 14<sup>th</sup> Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.
- 14. The final paint schedule shall be as presented at the March 14<sup>th</sup> Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.
- 15. The applicant shall preserve and protect the decorative glazed terra cotta tile features on the second floor.
- 16. Remove paint from the second floor terra cotta tile piers, and leave piers in natural terra cotta color.

.