# LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CAROLYN SMITH WATTS, PRESIDENT OCTOBER 3, 2012

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, October 3, 2012, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach. California.

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** 

Carolyn Smith Watts, Charles Hicks Jr., Jeanne Karatsu,

Jonathan Gotz, Larry Keller

MEMBER EXCUSED:

**OTHERS PRESENT:** 

Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary

Melinda George, Deputy Director Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant

Christina Checel, Senior Deputy City Attorney

Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst

Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human

Resources

## President Carolyn Smith Watts presided.

**MINUTES:** 

It was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of September 19, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote. Commissioner Gotz abstained from voting as he was not present.

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the minutes of the special meeting of September 26, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2-5):** 

It was moved by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**RETIREMENTS:** 

Request to receive and file retirements.

Kathleen Wade/Senior Records Clerk/Police Cynthia Smith/Housing Specialist II/Health

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

**DISABILITY RETIREMENT:** 

Request to receive and file disability retirement.

Charlotte Alu/Police Sergeant/Police

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

**RESIGNATIONS:** 

Request to receive and file resignations.

Adam Meirovitz/Clerk Typist II/Civil Service

Joseph Toney/Assistant Administrative Analyst II/Financial

Management

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent

Calendar.

**SCHEDULE FOR HEARING:** 

Request to approve hearing schedule.

Suspension Appeal 28-S-1112, February 6, 2013 Suspension Appeal 29-S-1112, February 13, 2013

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

REQUEST TO REINSTATE TO FORMER CLASSIFICATION:

ERIC CORNELL/SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER/POLICE TO POLICE RECRUIT

The Secretary presented a communication from Eric Cornell, Special Services Officer, Police, requesting Commission authorization to be reinstated to his former classification of Police Recruit. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the request be approved, pursuant to Sections 52 and 67(1) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

10/3/12 Page #2

# REQUEST FOR ORDER OF LAYOFF:

The Secretary presented an Order of Layoff to the Commission for the classifications of Combination Building Inspector, Planner, Gas Distribution Supervisor, Gas Field Service Representative, Gas Instrument Technician, Senior Accountant, Sr. Engineering Technician, Engineering Aide, Clerk Typist, Community Worker, Laboratory Assistant, Public Health Nurse, General Librarian, Library Clerk, Police Services Specialist, Special Services Officer, Community Services Supervisor, Park Ranger, Recreation Leader Specialist, Equipment Operator, Maintenance Assistant, Refuse Supervisor, Street Landscape Supervisor, Tree Trimmer, Business Systems Specialist and Systems Technician. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by him. The Secretary thanked the Parks and Recreation. Harbor and Human Resources Departments for the staff they provided to assist with the order of layoff. He briefed the Commission regarding the order of layoff, and stated that it was the complete list, which included the list provided to Human Resources on Friday. Commissioner Hicks thanked staff for their work in completing the order of layoff, acknowledging that it was a lot of work. He also thanked the departments that assisted staff. Ken Walker, Manager, Personnel Operations, Human Resources informed the Commission that Human Resources had taken some action from the order of lavoff list they were given on Friday, which had 16 positions, some of which resulted in employees being transferred to new classifications in the Harbor, Water and other departments due to current vacancies. He stated that of the 16 employees, seven are actually being lad off. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried to approve the Order of Layoff as prepared and to forward it to the City Manager. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

EXTENSION OF EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS:

The Secretary presented a staff report, prepared by him, requesting Commission approval of the following extension of eligible lists for six months, with the exception of Office Systems Analyst, to be extended for an additional five months. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the following eligible lists be extended for six months, with the exception of Office Systems Analyst, to be extended for an additional five months. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

Airport Public Affairs Assistant Hazardous Materials Specialist Office Systems Analyst (5 months)

Plumber (4/6/11, 4/13/11) Police Officer – Lateral

Public Health Professional (10/12/11, 4/18/12)

Senior Equipment Operator – Backhoe Senior Equipment Operator – Motor Grader

Senior Program Manager - Harbor (4/6/11, 4/20/11 &

4/27/11) Storekeeper

**MANAGERS' REPORT:** 

Melinda George, Deputy Director provided an update on the Police Recruit examination.

The Secretary thanked all of the departments that provided staff support for the Police Recruit examination and assistance with the order of layoff.

The President thanked staff for getting the order of layoff completed because of the impact it has on employees. She stated that she was pleased that Human Resources was able to move some of the employees on the order of layoff given to them on Friday to other positions.

**COMMENTS FROM PUBLIC:** 

Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources, thanked Paul Heuchert, Personnel Analyst, for his assistance with the order of layoff.

**ADJOURNMENT:** 

There being no further business before the Commission, President Smith Watts adjourned the meeting.

MARIO R. BEAS

Secretary

MRB:meh



# **Long Beach Water Department**

The Standard in Water Conservation & Environmental Stewardship

Agenda Item No. 🥒

KLWattes

Date:

October 12, 2012

To:

Civil Service Commission

From:

Kevin Wattier, General Manager, Long Beach Water department

Subject: REQUEST FOR TRANSFER IN LIEU OF LAYOFF

On September 5, 2012, the Civil Service Commission approved the Request for an Order of Layoff from the City Manager for the FY 13 Budget.

With the Commission's approval, the Long Beach Water Department (Water), requests a transfer in lieu of layoff, to help mitigate the impact to the affected employees.

The Water Department has three openings for Water Utility Mechanics (WUM), and has interviewed three Gas Field Service Reps (GFSR) who meet the minimum requirements for WUM. Both LBGO and Water would like to move forward with the Order of Layoff given to Human Resources on October 3<sup>rd</sup>, and transfer Roman Arrona, Ali Corwin and Nicolas Davis from the GFSR classification to the WUM classification in lieu of layoff.

The transfer would allow the employees to remain employed by the City, and mitigate operational disruptions that the bumping process would have caused. Therefore, it is requested that the Civil Service Commission approve his transfer in lieu of layoff.

Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact Ken Bott, Administrative Officer, Water at 562-570-2364

cc: Deborah R. Mills, Director, Human Resources Kenneth Walker, Manager, Personnel Operations Christopher Garner, Director, LBGO

PRW:DRM:nb R:VPotSonnelSycs\EMPLOYEE RELATIONS\LAYOFFS\LAYOFFS FY 2013\Transfer in Lieu Memos to CSC

DATE:

October 17, 2012

TO:

Civil Service Commission

FROM:

Mario R. Beas Executive Director

SUBJECT:

STAFF REPORT - REQUEST FOR PERMANENT ASSIGNMENTS TO AVOID LAYOFFS - ROMAN ARRONA, ALI CORWIN AND NICHOLAS

DAVIS. GAS FIELD SERVICE REPRESENTATIVES

Correspondence has been received from Kevin Wattier, General Manager, Water Department, requesting Commission action to permanently assign and transfer Roman Arrona, Ali Corwin and Nicholas Davis, Gas Field Service Representatives, Long Beach Gas and Oil to Water Utility Mechanics, Water Department. Staff recommends approval of the request in accordance with Sections 67(5) and 64 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations.

On October 3, 2012, the Civil Service Commission approved the Order of Layoff for staffing reductions in multiple City departments including the Long Beach Gas and Oil Department. The classification of Gas Field Service Representative was included in the Order of Layoff and Roman Arrona, Ali Corwin and Nicholas Davis were identified as being impacted employees.

In the Order of Layoff, Mr. Roman Arrona, a probationary Gas Field Service Representative will revert back to Garage Service Attendant and be placed on a priority list. Ms. Ali Corwin, a permanent Gas Field Service Representative does not hold prior permanent status in any other classification, thus it was specified that she be laid off and placed on a priority list. Mr. Nicholas Davis, a permanent Gas Field Service Representative does not hold prior permanent status in any other classification, thus it was specified that he be laid off and placed on a priority list.

Personnel Requisition WD11-20 for three Water Utility Mechanic vacancies in the Water Department is on file in the Civil Service Department. The Water Department considered Roman Arrona, Ali Corwin and Nicholas Davis for these positions and believes they can successfully perform the necessary duties. Although Ali Corwin and Nicholas Davis did attain permanent status (passed probation) as Gas Field Service Representatives, all three employees will be required to complete a probationary period in their new classification of Water Utility Mechanic. In accordance with Section 97 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations, all three employees will continue to be placed on a priority list for the Gas Field Service Representative classification.

The Civil Service, Human Resources and Water Department staff will respond to questions from the Commission.



# City of Long Beach Working Together to Serve

# Agenda Item No.

1

Memorandum

Date:

October 9, 2012

To:

Civil Service Commissioners

From:

Curtis Tani, Director of Technology Services

Subject:

Request to Return to Classified Service and Transfer to Technology Services

Eugene Fong, Treasury Operations Officer

In accordance with the provisions of Section 69 of Civil Service Rules and Regulations, the department of Technology Services respectfully requests Civil Service Commission approval to transfer Eugene Fong from unclassified service to classified service.

Mr. Fong was a classified Administrative Analyst from August 3, 1992 through April 26, 2002 in the Department of Financial Management. On April 27, 2002, Mr. Fong accepted a management position and voluntarily transferred to the unclassified service as Treasury Operations Officer.

At this time, Mr. Fong is requesting to return to the classified service as an Administrative Analyst in the Department of Technology Services. Both departments support this request. Approved requisition number TS 12-003 for a classified Administrative Analyst was used for the recruitment process.

Thank you for your consideration of this request. Please contact Administrative Officer Amy Manning at extension 6976 should you or your staff have any questions regarding this request.

CT:AM

**Attachments** 

cc:

John Gross, Director of Financial Management
Sandra Palmer, Administrative Services Officer, Financial Management

### CIVIL SERVICE DEPARTMENT

REQUEST FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ACTION GUIDELINES

# REQUEST TO TRANSFER FROM UNCLASSIFIED TO CLASSIFIED

Civil Service Rules and Regulations Section 69
Civil Service Commission Policy Not Applicable

| Form completed by: Amy Manning Date: 10-09-20  Name/Title/Department   | 2012  |                                     |  |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| Section 1: To be completed by requesting department.   | To be completed by department                 | Civil Service Dept.<br>Verification |  |
| A requisition is required. The requisition number is: #_TS12 - 003.  Has the requisition been received in the Civil Service Department?  | Yes No  |                                     |  |
| Have all required documents been submitted to the Civil Service Department?  Request signed by employee. Corresponding request from hiring department  A request for transfer must be included in the request to Commission if the appointee will move between departments. Is a transfer necessary? | Yes No<br>Yes No                              |                                     |  |
| Section 2: Points to be addressed in request.  | X   |                                     |  |
| Formal name and current classification title of employee.  | Eugene Fong<br>Treasury Operations<br>Officer |                                     |  |
| Title of classification to which employee has requested to return.   | Admin<br>Analyst                              |                                     |  |
| Does the employee hold prior status in the request to return?  | Yes No<br>Employee                            |                                     |  |
| Reason for return to former classified service.  | Request                                       |                                     |  |
| The employee was notified of impacted Civil Service rights.  | Yes No  |                                     |  |
| The employee was referred to the Human Resources Department and/or hiring department regarding any changes to benefits, salary, department status, working conditions, etc.  | Yes No  |                                     |  |
| The following should be in attendance at the Civil Service Commission meeting:  Requesting department.  Any other impacted department.  The employee requesting return to former classification (attendance is recommended.)   |   |                                     |  |
| Notes:   |   |                                     |  |



## City of Long Beach Working Together to Serve

### Memorandum

Date:

October 3, 2012

To:

**Civil Service Commission** 

From:

Eugene Fong.

Subject:

**Reversion to Classified Status** 

I have accepted a position as an Administrative Analyst III in the Technology Services Department. I request to revert back to the classified status of Administrative Analyst as of November 3, 2012.

Agenda Item No.

DATE:

October 17, 2012

TO:

Civil Service Commission

|| FROM:

Deborah McCluster, Personnel Analyst

SUBJECT:

**EXTENSION OF PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT - MARIE** 

BARNIDGE-McINYRE, PARK NATURALIST

The Civil Service Commission approved the provisional appointment of Marie Barnidge-McIntyre to the classification Park Naturalist on February 15, 2012. Due to the delay in the revision of the classification specification by Human Resource and Parks, Recreation and Marine Departments, staff is requesting the Commission approve an extension of the provisional appointment, which expires October 24, 2012.

A 60 business day extension will allow sufficient time for the Civil Service Department to complete the examination process for the classification of Park Naturalist. Recruitment for the examination will open November 10, 2012. Staff anticipates the examination process to be completed by November 30, 2012 with results going before the Commission for approval in mid December.

It is recommended that the Commission approve the extension of the provisional appointment, pursuant to Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations.

The Parks, Recreation and Marine Department and Ms. Barnidge-McIntyre have been informed that this item is on today's agenda.

DWM: Extension of Provisional Appointment - Barnidge-McIntyre (PRM 10.17.12)



Agenda Item No.

Memorandum

2012 OCT -9 PH 1: 02

BECEIVED

Date:

October 8, 2012

CIVIL SERVICE DEPT.

To:

Civil Service Commission

From:

Ronald R. Arias, Director of Health & Human Services

Subject: Request to Extend Probation: Eric J. Avila, Housing Specialist I and Jimmy A.

Oporta, Housing Specialist I

The Department of Health and Human Services (Health Department) respectfully requests the extension of the probationary period for Eric J. Avila, Housing Specialist I and Jimmy A. Oporta. Housing Specialist I, in accordance with Section 41 (2) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations and Section 1.01 of the Civil Service Policies and Procedures.

Both Eric J. Avila and Jimmy A. Oporta started their employment with the City of Long Beach as Housing Specialist I's on May 14, 2012 in the Housing Assistance Division of the Housing Authority, in the Department of Health and Human Services. In order to complete their probationary time in these positions they must complete and pass the certification test for Housing Choice Voucher(HCV) Specialist and HQS (Housing Quality Standards). Mr. Avila and Mr. Oporta cannot take the certification test until they take the courses that lead to the certification. The Housing Authority is hosting the HCV Specialist course and testing at the end of October. It is expected that there will be an HQS course offered in California before the end of 2012. If the schedule goes as expected, Mr. Avila and Mr. Oporta can finish their certification by the end of the year. The probationary period for Mr. Avila and Mr. Oporta is scheduled to end on or about November 13, 2012.

Therefore, I am requesting that their probationary time be extended at least 90 days to provide these individuals with the time needed to complete the required courses and certification.

Thank you for your consideration of this request. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me at extension 8-4016.

Mario R. Beas, Executive Director, Civil Service Department Darnisa Tyler, Manager, Housing Authority, Department of Health and Human Services S. Michael Johnson, Manager, Support Services Bureau, Department of Health and Human Services Roberto Uranga, Administrative Officer, Department of Health and Human Services

# CIVIL SERVICE DEPARTMENT REQUEST FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ACTION GUIDELINES

Re: Avila

# REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATION CIVIL Service Rules and Regulations Section 42 (2) GIVIL Service Commission (Rolley Section 101

Date: 10-10-12 ohnsod Form completed by: Name/Title/Department To be complete by department Section 1: To be completed by requesting department. Correct A requisition is not required. No Is any other department impacted? Yes If yes, which department: A completed Employee Performance Evaluation is required. Has the form been a. No received in the Civil Service Department? Section 2: Points to be addressed in request: Formal name and current classification title of employee. Enc Avila Summary of employee's work history, specifying all classification titles and dates, including date(s) permanent status was attained in each classification. The date the employee will complete probation. Date: Request must be submitted 30 days prior to completion of probation. A statement of the problem and specific reasons for request. Rationale as to how/why an extension will allow employee to pass probation. an extension will allow employee to pass probation. Which policy critieria is being utilized and how the request meets the criteria required in A.a. the policy. 40ders Length of extension requested. (A maximum extension of 3 months may be requested; a second 3- month extension may be requested at a later date, if necessary.) The following should be in attendance at the Civil Service Commission meeting: J.a. Requesting department. The impacted employee's attendance is optional. Notes:

# CIVIL SERVICE DEPARTMENT REQUEST FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ACTION GUIDELINES

Re: Opons

FREQUESTATOR EXTENSION OF PROBATION CIVILS AND COMMISSION 1-2 (2)

Form completed by: Michael Tamson, Myr, DH17 Date: 10-10-12

| Matthey rule Department   |                                  | Augusta e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e |  |
|---|----------------------------------|---|--|
| Section 1: To be completed by requesting department.  | To be completed<br>by department | Civil Service Dept.<br>Varification           |  |
| A requisition is not required.  | Correct                          |   |  |
| Is any other department impacted? If yes, which department:   | Yes (No                          |   |  |
| A completed Employee Performance Evaluation is required. Has the form been received in the Civil Service Department?  | Yes No                           | Ja.   |  |
| Section 2: Points to be addressed in request:   |                                  |   |  |
| Formal name and current classification title of employee. Timy Oparta, House  | is Spec 1                        | s.a   |  |
| Summary of employee's work history, specifying all classification titles and dates, including date(s) permanent status was attained in each classification. | Yes                              | J.a.  |  |
| The date the employee will complete probation. Date: 2/13/13  Request must be submitted 30 days prior to completion of probation.                           | /                                | Sa  |  |
| A statement of the problem and specific reasons for request. Rationale as to how/why an extension will allow employee to pass probation.                    |                                  | J.a.  |  |
| Which policy critieria is being utilized and how the request meets the criteria required in the policy.   |                                  | sa  |  |
|   | days                             | ja  |  |
| The following should be in attendance at the Civil Service Commission meeting:  Requesting department.  The impacted employee's attendance is optional.     | Yes                              | J.a.  |  |
| Notes:  |                                  |   |  |
|   |                                  |   |  |
|   | •                                |   |  |
|   |                                  |   |  |
| •   |                                  |   |  |
|   |                                  |   |  |

MY NAME IS DAVID JAMES DOUGHERTY, I AM

A MEMBER OF THE CALIFORNIA NATIONAL GUARD.

I AM CURRENTLY SERVING AT THE "JOINT FORCES

TRAINING BASE" IN LOS ALAMITOS AS A SERGEANT

IN ALPHA COMPANY 19th SPECIAL FORCES GROUP.

I AM WRITING THIS LETTER AS A REQUEST TO

PARTICIPATE FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SERVE THE

CITY OF LONG BEACH AS A POLICE OFFICER.

MANE ATTEMTED TO SUBMIT MY APPLICATION

ONLINE BUT WAS WABLE TO ATTACH THE REQUIRED

DOCUMENTS NEEDED, MORE SPECIFICALLY MY DOG 14

WHICH SHOWS MILITARY SERVICE BACKBROWND. AS

STATED IN THE POLICE RECRUIT APPLICATION, "DO NOT

SUBMIT INCOMPLETE APPLICATIONS" TO THE CIVIL SERVICE

DEPT. I TRIED NUMEROUS TIMES TO ATTACH THE

NECESSARY DOCUMENTS BUT THERE SEEMED TO BE

A GLITCH IN THE SYSTEM AND WAS UNABLE TO DO SO.

FURTHER MORE, I WAS ON NATIONAL GUARD ORDERS TO BRIDGEPORT, CA. FOR THE ENTIRE APPLICATION WINDOW AND WAS UNABLE TO HAND CARRY AN APPLICATION TO THE CIVIL SERVICE DEPT.

YOUR CONSIDERATION IS APPRECIATED, SET DAVID DOUGHERT TO THE CONSIDERATION IS APPRECIATED, SET DAVID DOUGHERT TO THE CONSIDERATION IS APPRECIATED, SET DAVID DOUGHERT TO THE CONSIDERATION IS APPRECIATED.

2

DATE:

October 17, 2012

TO:

**Civil Service Commission** 

FROM:

Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst

SUBJECT:

**REQUEST TO FILE LATE APPLICATION - SGT. DAVID** 

DOUGHERTY, POLICE RECRUIT EXAMINATION

5 6

7

8

9

1 0

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Correspondence has been received from Sgt. David Dougherty requesting the Civil Service Commission's approval to submit a late application for the position of Police Recruit. The following facts are presented for the Commission's consideration.

### Facts for Consideration:

- On September 5, 2012, the Civil Service Commission approved the job opportunity bulletin for Police Recruit. The job opportunity bulletin was posted for two weeks, from September 7 through September 21, 2012. All completed application packets were due into the Civil Service office by 4:30 p.m., September 21, 2012. During the filing period, 3075 applications were received of which 2972 have been accepted into the testing process.
  - Sgt. Dougherty came to the Civil Service Department on Monday, September 24, 2012, requesting guidance on how to submit his late application packet. He stated that he was unable to attach his DD214 with his application, which he contributed to a "glitch" in the system. He further stated that the Police Recruit application packet instructed applicants to submit all required documents with their applications. Therefore, without the ability to attach his DD214, he did not submit his application within the filing period. He also stated that he was on National Guard orders to Bridgeport, California during the entire application filing period and was unable to visit the Civil Service Department to complete a paper Police Recruit application.

 He has included a copy of his National Guard orders and DD214 as supporting documentation for his request.

- After discussion with Sgt. Dougherty, on September 28, 2012, Civil Service staff contacted NEOGOV to determine the circumstances and present state of Sgt. Dougherty's job application. NEOGOV staff stated that on September 9, 2012, Sgt. Dougherty created his profile in governmentjobs.com (NEOGOV) website where he entered his personal information, and preferences. NEOGOV also confirmed that Sgt. Dougherty had answered agency-wide questions, however it was not confirmed whether or not he had worked on the Police Recruit supplemental questions. As a result, NEOGOV staff confirmed that Sgt. Dougherty did not submit an application to the Police Recruit job posting. According to NEOGOV staff a technical issue or "glitch" did not occur during that period which would have prevented Sgt. Dougherty from attaching his DD214 to his online application.
- Had Sgt. Dougherty contacted the Civil Service Department at any time during the filing period, staff would have provided assistance to Sgt. Dougherty to enable his application to be submitted on time as well as offer options for submitting his DD214. Staff would also have informed Sgt. Dougherty that his DD214 was not a required document and could have been submitted at a later date and by other methods.
- Sgt. Dougherty's request falls under Civil Service Commission Policy 1.05, which states that the Civil Service Commission may consider a late application 1) due to a death of an immediate family member, 2) a catastrophic natural disaster, or 3) an error by Civil Service Department staff.
- A review of the circumstances involved in Sgt. Dougherty's situation indicates that his request does not meet the criteria of the Commission's policy to allow a late

submittal of his documentation. As such, staff recommends denial of the request since it does not meet the criteria.

 Should the Commission approve Sgt. Dougherty's request, staff would be able to accommodate Sgt. Dougherty in the testing process for Police Recruit.

Sgt. Dougherty has been informed that this request is on today's agenda.

**DMD** 

Late application Dougherty (10-17-12)

### LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CAROLYN SMITH WATTS, PRESIDENT OCTOBER 3, 2012

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, October 3, 2012, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Carolyn Smith Watts, Charles Hicks Jr., Jeanne Karatsu,

Jonathan Gotz, Larry Keller

**MEMBER EXCUSED:** 

**OTHERS PRESENT:** 

Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary

Melinda George, Deputy Director Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant

Christina Checel, Senior Deputy City Attorney

Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst Caprice McDonald, Personnel Analyst Robert Pfingsthorn, Personnel Analyst Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst

Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human

Resources

President Carolyn Smith Watts presided.

MINUTES:

It was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Karatsu and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of September 19, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote. Commissioner Gotz abstained from voting as he was not present.

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the minutes of the special meeting of September 26, 2012, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-5):

It was moved by Commissioner Karatsu, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

# CITY OF LONG BEACH PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 20, 2012 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:00 PM

Becky Blair, Chair Alan Fox, Vice Chair



Molly Campbell, Commissioner Mark Christoffels, Commissioner Phil Saumur, Commissioner Melani Smith, Commissioner Donita Van Horik, Commissioner

### FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:03 PM)

see media

At 5:03 p.m., Chair Blair called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:03 PM)

see media

Commissioners Alan L. Fox, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani Smith, Donita Van Present: Horik, Becky Blair, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

Also present: Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services; Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Michael Mais, Deputy City Attorney; Steven Valdez, Planner; Scott Kinsey, Planner; Mark Hungerford, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:04 PM)

see media

Commissioner Smith led the flag salute.

**MINUTES (5:05 PM)** 

see media

see media

12-065PL

Recommendation to receive and file the Planning Commission minutes of September 6, 2012.

A motion was made by Smith, seconded by Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Alan L. Fox, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik, Becky Blair, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:05 PM)** 

<u>see media</u>

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

### **SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:06 PM)**

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Planning Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

#### **CONTINUED ITEM (5:06 PM)**

see media

#### see media

#### **1.** 12-060PL

Recommendation to: 1) Adopt findings for denial of a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) request to allow a financial service operation (Title Loan Company) to locate within an existing one-story commercial building located at 201 West Pacific Coast Highway in the Community Automobile-Oriented (CCA) and the Regional Highway (CHW) zoning districts; or 2) Adopt findings for approval of a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) request to allow a financial service operation (Title Loan Company) to locate within a one-story commercial building at 201 West Pacific Coast Highway in the Community Automobile-Oriented (CCA) and Regional Highway (CHW) zoning districts. (District 6) (Application No. 1203-06)

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, spoke.

David Carlat, representing the applicant, spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Jack Smith, representing CPAC, provided public comment.

Michael Mais responded to a remark from Jack Smith.

Jack Smith spoke.

Lisa Wibroe provided public comment.

Lee Fukui provided public comment.

Chair Blair spoke.

Barbara Sinclair provided public comment.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Commissioner Fox responded to a query from Chair Blair.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Michael Mais.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Blair and Michael Mais.

Chair Blair spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Commissioner Campbell.

Commissioner Campbell recused herself from the item.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, spoke.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik affirmed that she had watched the video of the August 2nd Planning Commission meeting.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, presented the staff report.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Blair and Amy Bodek.

Steven Valdez, Project Planner, presented the staff report.

Amy Bodek responded to a query from Commissioner Van Horik.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Chair Blair.

David Carlat spoke.

Jack Smith, representing CPAC, provided public comment.

Lee Fukui provided public comment.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Mauna Eichner provided public comment.

Colleen McDonald, President of the Wrigley Association, provided public comment.

Lisa Wibroe provided public comment.

John Deats provided public comment.

Barbara Sinclair provided public comment.

Linda Mendoza, representing the property owner, spoke.

David Carlat spoke.

Michael Mais spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Amy Bodek responded to queries from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Christoffels spoke.

Michael Mais responded to a query from Chair Blair.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Michael Mais restated the motion.

Michael Mais spoke.

Michael Mais responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Chair Blair spoke.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Christoffels, to approve the recommendation to adopt findings for denial of a Conditional Use Permit. The motion failed by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani Smith and Mark Christoffels

No: 3 - Alan L. Fox, Donita Van Horik and Becky Blair

Excused: 1 - Molly Campbell

### **REGULAR AGENDA (6:25 PM)**

see media

#### see media

#### 2. 12-066PL

Recommendation to approve a Conditional Use Permit request for the establishment of a new wireless telecommunications facility on the rooftop of a four-story apartment building located at 4205 East Anaheim Street in the CCN zoning district. (District 4) (Application No. 1111-02)

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Scott Kinsey, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Scott Kinsey responded to a query from Commissioner Christoffels.

Tim Miller, representing the applicant, spoke.

Tim Miller responded to a query from Commissioner Smith.

Yolanda Verrecchia, President of the Recreation Park Neighborhood Coalition, provided public comment.

Patricia Blomgren provided public comment.

Kirt Ramirez provided public comment.

Tim Miller responded to comments made by the public.

Tim Miller responded to a query from Chair Blair.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Derek Burnham.

Scott Kinsey responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Michael Mais, Assistant City Attorney, responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Scott Kinsey responded to queries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Smith, seconded by Commissioner Saumur, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Alan L. Fox, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Melani Smith, Donita Van Horik, Becky Blair, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

### <u>see media</u>

### 3. 12-067PL

Recommendation to approve a Standards Variance re-establishing nonconforming density rights related to the rebuild of a demolished single-family home and deny a Standards Variance request for the rebuild to exceed the allowable height limit of 25 feet measured from grade at 237 Roycroft Avenue. (District 3) (Application No. 1207-12)

Amy Bodek, Director of Development Services, recused herself from the item.

Derek Burnham, Planning Administrator, introduced Mark Hungerford, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Dale Ramezani, applicant, spoke.

John Fries provided public comment.

Dianne Sundstrom, President of the Belmont Heights Community Association, provided public comment.

Gordana Kajer provided public comment.

Todd Hawke provided public comment.

Gordon Byles provided public comment.

Lois Byles provided public comment.

Tobi Castillo provided public comment.

Dale Ramezani spoke.

Sam Ramezani, applicant, responded to a query from Commissioner

Saumur.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Fox and Dale and Sam Ramezani.

Derek Burnham spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Van Horik and Derek Burnham.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Fox.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to a query from Commissioner Saumur.

Commissioner Van Horik spoke.

Commissioner Fox spoke.

Derek Burnham responded to gueries from Commissioner Christoffels.

Commissioner Smith spoke.

Commissioner Campbell spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Christoffels and Michael Mais.

Commissioner Saumur spoke.

Chair Blair spoke.

Derek Burnham spoke.

A motion was made by Commissioner Van Horik, seconded by Commissioner Fox, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 6 - Alan L. Fox, Phillip Joseph Saumur, Donita Van Horik, Becky Blair, Mark Christoffels and Molly Campbell

No: 1 - Melani Smith

### **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (7:50 PM)**

see media

Bob Ladd, ASLA, provided public comment.

### **COMMENTS FROM THE PLANNING COMMISSION (7:53 PM)**

see media

Derek Burnham responded to a request from Chair Blair.

Derek Burnham responded to queries from Chair Blair.

### **ADJOURNMENT (7:55 PM)**

see media

At 7:55 p.m., Chair Blair adjourned the meeting.

hge