

C I T Y P L A N N I N G C O M M I S S I O N M I N U T E S
O C T O B E R 1 6 , 2 0 0 8

The regular meeting of the City Planning Commission and public hearing convened on October 16, 2008, at 5:01pm in the City Council Chambers, 333 W. Ocean Boulevard, Long Beach, CA.

PRESENT: COMMISSIONERS: Phil Saumur, Donita Van Horik,
Melani Smith, Becky Blair

ABSENT: EXCUSED: Leslie Gentile, Charles Durnin

CHAIRMAN: Phil Saumur

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT: Craig Beck, Director
Derek Burnham, Zoning Officer
Jill Griffiths, Advance Planning
Meredith Elguira, Planner
Jaime Ustin, Planner
Angie Zetterquist, Planner

OTHERS PRESENT: Amy Burton, City Attorney's Office
Marcia Gold, Minutes Clerk

P L E D G E O F A L L E G I A N C E

The pledge of allegiance was led by Commissioner Smith.

M I N U T E S

The minutes of August 21, 2008 were approved on a motion by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Chairman Saumur, and passed 4-0. Commissioners Gentile and Durnin were absent.

D I R E C T O R S R E P O R T

Craig Beck announced that the City website was being updated.

S W E A R I N G O F W I T N E S S E S

S T U D Y S E S S I O N

Angie Zetterquist gave the staff report on the planned 48-unit moderate-income housing development located at 2013-2149 Atlantic Avenue in the PD-25 (Atlantic Avenue Planned Development District) zone.

John O'Brien, 3090 Bristol Street, Costa Mesa, developer, presented an overall site plan and unit floor plans.

Commissioner Blair expressed concern that residents adjacent to the alley might find the project problematic, but said she thought the private and courtyard areas were well-designed to give residents open space, and that it would be an upscale addition to the area.

In response to a query from Commissioner Smith regarding community meetings, Mr. O'Brien said the main feedback was that residents wanted to know how to purchase a unit or even be part of the construction process, so he had added a consultant to reach out to local businesses to get them involved.

Chairman Saumur commented that he liked the architectural details, and that it was a very upscale moderate income development.

C O N S E N T C A L E N D A R

The Consent Calendar was approved on a motion by Commissioner Blair, seconded by Commissioner Smith and passed 4-0. Commissioners Gentile and Durnin were absent.

1. Application No. 101608-1

Applicant: Carri Matsumoto, Long Beach Unified School District
Subject Site: 1574 Linden Avenue (District 1)

Found the alley vacation relating to Roosevelt Elementary School in conformance with the General Plan.

2. Application No. 101608-2

Applicant: William T. Fujioka, Chief Executive Officer County of Los Angeles
Subject Site: 4510 E. Pacific Coast Hwy. (District 4)

Found the location of a Los Angeles County Mental Health Center in conformance with the General Plan.

R E G U L A R A G E N D A

3. Application No. 0807-07

Applicant: The Boeing Company
 S. Mario Stavale, Senior Real Estate Mgr.
Subject Site: 4900 Conant Street (District 5)

Meredith Elguira presented the staff report recommending approval of the requests since they will have a positive effect on the community by allowing the highest and best use for the site.

Mario Stavale, Boeing Company, 4900 Conant Street, applicant, stated they were in agreement with the staff report and dedication.

In response to queries from the Commissioners, Mr. Stavale confirmed that both buildings would be sharing parking as a result of the lot line change, to ensure adequate attached parking to make them more saleable, either together or separately.

Commissioner Blair moved to certify Negative Declaration 12-08; to approve a Subdivision Map, a Lot Line Adjustment and to recommend that the City Council approve a Zone Change from Douglas Aircraft District (PD-19) to Light Industrial (IL), with revised language on Condition #3 as presented by staff. Commissioner Smith seconded the motion, which passed 4-0. Commissioners Gentile and Durnin were absent.

The following item was taken out of order

5. Application No. 0708-18

Applicant: Trillium Consulting Inc. for T-Mobile
Subject Site: 4501 E. Carson Street (District 5)

Derek Burnham presented the staff report noting that the revised design alleviates the adverse visual impact that would otherwise have been created, and therefore they were recommending approval.

Kristin Galardo, Trillium Consulting, representing T-Mobile, 4501 E. Carson Street, stated her agreement with the staff recommendation.

Commissioner Blair complimented the applicant on the successful camouflage job on the antennas.

Commissioner Smith said she thought the building still looked unbalanced, but that it was better than the original design.

Commissioner Smith moved to uphold the appeal to amend a condition of approval restricting the location of roof-mounted panel antennas and equipment cabinets. Commissioner Van Horik seconded the motion, which passed 4-0. Commissioners Gentile and Durnin were absent.

4. Application No. 0711-16

Applicant: Pacific Baptist Church
Subject Site: 3332 Magnolia Avenue (District 7)

Jaime Ustin presented the staff report recommending approval of the variance requests since the height of the building would be appropriate given its use and compatibility with the surrounding area. Ms. Ustin also presented slides detailing the size, scope and architectural design of the project, plus findings from the parking study, CEQA and public comments, and details about the planned off-site parking shuttle.

Glen Trematore, Pacific Baptist Church Development Services, 3332 Magnolia Avenue, detailed their community outreach efforts, and listed the community-friendly features of the existing and future church.

Richard Lazo, project architect, 2114 Linden Avenue, listed the energy-management features of the new building, to be donated at cost by his architectural firm.

Mr. Trematore added that they had more than twice the required parking at their satellite lots, and in response to community input had added staff to oversee the parking operation.

Mr. Lazo pointed out that area residents had been given a phone number to call in case of problems.

Members in the audience in support of the project were asked to stand up, and they numbered about 150.

In response to a query from Commissioner Van Horik regarding drop off zones for students at the church school, Mr. Trematore said there was a designated area at the back of the church for that use to eliminate traffic congestion, with the parking lot shuttle drop off in the front of the church, along with two conditioned loading and unloading spots

Commissioner Van Horik expressed concern about the overly massive south side elevation. Mr. Trematore said they were planning on using architectural features to break up the building following staff recommendations, but they could further mute the colors to attempt to soften the effect. Commissioner Van Horik said she felt the building would be more acceptable to the community if all the on-site structures blended in color and structure to look like a campus.

Commissioner Van Horik also expressed concern about the need to shuttle members to and from satellite parking areas, since she felt that process flew in the face of sustainability.

Chairman Saumur asked about the guarantee on the satellite parking areas, and Mr. Lazo stated they had signed agreements with the building owners, and could make money leasing out unused parking spaces during the week. Mr. Trematore added that the shuttle routes did not travel through residential areas.

Dara Choub, Bellflower resident and Los Angeles Police officer, no address given, expressed support for the church expansion, saying he gave credit for his success to the church's youth outreach program, and felt it was important to build new facilities for today's disenfranchised youth.

Mike La Quantra, 2926 Eucalyptus Avenue, Wrigley area resident, spoke against the expansion due to its scope and size, and said he had concerns about the shuttles and parking that had not yet been addressed. Mr. La Quantra added that he thought the influx of new members in an already underparked block would have a huge impact on area residents in terms of traffic, air quality and quality of life. Mr. La Quantra also said he thought the church should keep their architectural features within the height limits dictated by City code.

Jay Barrington, 3337 Magnolia, adjacent resident, spoke in favor of the expansion request, saying he purchased his house due to its proximity to the church and found it a positive influence on his family.

Joseph Ledwiege, Bellflower resident and Los Angeles Police officer, no address given, detailed the church's outreach efforts which he felt had helped deter criminal activity in the area, and he said the new building would help extend these capabilities.

Sally Ramirez, 3191 Daisy Avenue, also spoke in support of the church, saying she agreed with the previous speakers.

Joan Greenwood, 2901 San Francisco Avenue, spoke in favor of the expansion, saying that the diesel emissions of the shuttles were comparable to the City's clean air vehicles, and would not negatively affect air quality in the area.

Joshua Barker, 3075 Eucalyptus Avenue, spoke in support of the church expansion, saying it would be a safe, family-friendly addition to the Wrigley community.

John Deats, 3600 Pacific, said that although he was not a church member, he supported their expansion project since the church leadership had demonstrated a great desire to be a good neighbor, and were always available to address any and all concerns raised by the community. Mr. Deats said he felt the planned satellite parking was not a problem since traffic was light on weekends anyhow, and with all negative issues mitigated to less than significant, the outreach efforts of the church were even more crucial given the loss of similar City programs.

Henry Fong, Lakewood resident and Long Beach Police officer, no address given, spoke in support of the church expansion, testifying that his family was saved by their outreach efforts years ago, and that they taught valuable character lessons.

Ilah Hardesty, 5949 Grayton, read a letter in support of the church expansion from an adjacent elder care facility, in which the building owner detailed his personal and business dealings with the church, which he said were above reproach, along with the high quality of the facility and operation.

Rudy Orozco, 2570 Golden Avenue, Wrigley resident, also spoke in support of the church, saying it was an invaluable resource to the community and has created a safe neighborhood while improving a blighted area and property values.

Lee Fukudi, 2925 Pacific Avenue, said he appreciated the church and its efforts, but thought the planned facilities were too

large for the lot and area, and way too underparked. Mr. Fukudi suggested reevaluating the project and reducing its scope.

Michael and Leslie Gonyea, 3267 Eucalyptus, expressed mixed feelings about the church expansion, saying they had been impacted for years by the parking situation, and that they would support the expansion if the church made accommodations for adjacent neighbors such as preserving privacy by making parkway improvements on City land.

Jill Hill, 2075 San Francisco Avenue, presented a letter to the Commission applauding the applicant's efforts to appease community concerns such as shuttle emissions, and Ms. Hill said she felt the expansion represented a benefit for the Wrigley area and would help preserve historical buildings on the site.

Vince Matardo, 5373 Walton Street, CEO, Coastline Environmental Solutions, Inc., expressed support for the expansion, saying the church will be able to bring more inner city youths off the streets to safely learn life skills and turn them into taxpaying citizens.

Maria Norvell, 2411 San Francisco Avenue, Wrigley resident, spoke in favor of the church requests, saying they were an outstanding neighbor and helpful to residents.

Commissioner Smith then suggested additions to the Conditions of Approval to include requiring clean-air shuttles and a re-examination of shuttle routes and drop-off areas to ensure lesser impacts on neighbors. Ms. Smith agreed that the proposed building on 33rd Street was monolithic, and asked that the applicants and their architect continue to work on the façade articulation to significantly improve the project and neighborhood interface.

Chairman Saumur said he felt the shuttles were preferable to 500 cars descending into the neighborhood, and thought the steeple height was typical for a church use. Mr. Saumur agreed that the façade on 33rd was too massive, and needed a larger setback along with landscaping.

Commissioner Blair noted that all historic churches had a parking issue and she acknowledged the church's efforts to continue to be a vital force in the community. Ms. Blair added that she felt that in this case the benefit outweighed impacts, and that it was more important to bring troubled children back into the community as productive citizens.

Commissioner Van Horik asked the applicant to work with the staff to accommodate bike and motorcycle parking onsite to encourage use of alternative transportation.

Commissioner Blair moved to certify Negative Declaration 08-08, and to approve Site Plan Review for a two-story, 45,101 sq.ft. church with Standards Variance requests for a 28' height limit for the building and a 59' height limit for the steeple (instead of the required 25'), and the use of shared and joint parking facilities, along with amended conditions requiring architectural articulation and landscaping to address the massing issue of the building on the 33rd Street side. Commissioner Van Horik seconded the motion, which passed 4-0. Commissioners Gentile and Durnin were absent.

**R E P O R T O N O T H E R D E P A R T M E N T
M A T T E R S**

There were no reports on other Departmental Matters.

**M A T T E R S F R O M P L A N N I N G C O M M I S S I O N
M E M B E R S**

There were no reports from Planning Commission members.

A D J O U R N M E N T

The meeting adjourned at 7:20pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Marcia Gold
Minutes Clerk