

**LONG BEACH CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
JEANNE KARATSU, PRESIDENT
DECEMBER 7, 2011**

The regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was held at 8:00 a.m., Wednesday, December 7, 2011, in the Board Room of the Commission, 333 West Ocean Boulevard, Seventh Floor, Long Beach, California.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Jeanne Karatsu, Carolyn Smith Watts, Charles Hicks Jr., Jonathan Gotz, Larry Keller

MEMBER EXCUSED:

OTHERS PRESENT: Mario R. Beas, Executive Director & Secretary
Melinda George, Deputy Director
Christina Checel, Deputy City Attorney
Marilyn Hall, Executive Assistant
Salvador Ambriz, Personnel Analyst
Debbie McCluster, Personnel Analyst
Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst
Ken Walker, Personnel Operations Manager, Human Resources

President Jeanne Karatsu presided.

MINUTES: It was moved by Commissioner Gotz, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the minutes of the regular meeting of November 16, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

It was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the Dismissal Appeal 27-D-1011 hearing minutes of November 16, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

It was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Gotz and carried that the Dismissal Appeal 43-D-1011 hearing minutes of November 16, 2011, be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSENT CALENDAR (2-10): It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Smith Watts and carried that the Consent Calendar items be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

EXAMINATION RESULTS:

Request to approve examination results.

Aquatics Supervisor (12-1-11) – 26 Applied, 12 Qualified
Department Librarian – 48 Applied, 17 Qualified
Fingerprint Classifier – 123 Applied, 23 Qualified
General Maintenance Assistant – 227 Applied, 21 Qualified
Laboratory Assistant (11-16-11) – 61 Applied, 17 Qualified
Plan Checker – Plumbing – 7 applied, 5 Qualified

The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.

EXTENSION OF EXPIRING ELIGIBLE LISTS:

Request to extend the following eligible lists for an additional six months:

Accounting Clerk
Deputy Chief Harbor Engineer (6/22/11 & 6/29/11)
Deputy Fire Marshal
Electrical Engineer (6/8/11, 6/15/11 & 6/29/11)
Public Health Nutritionist (6/2/10 & 6/9/10)
Registered Nurse
Senior Civil Engineer
Senior Electrical Inspector
Senior Survey Technician
Supervisor – Facilities Maintenance
Survey Technician

The motion was made to approve request on Consent Calendar.

RETIREMENTS:

Request to receive and file retirements.

Larry Huffman/Firefighter/Fire
Lester Thompson/Park Maintenance Supervisor/Parks
Rick Colbert/Police Lieutenant/Police
David Foltz/Police Officer/Police
Kenneth Gonyea/Police Officer/Police
Lawrence Jones/Police Officer/Police
Thomas Keleher/Police Sergeant/Police
Thomas Marcoux/Police Sergeant/Police
Teresa Perry/Clerk Supervisor/Police
Belinda Castillo/Senior Engineering Technician I/Public Works
Terry McAlpine/Administrative Analyst III/Water

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent

Calendar.

DISABILITY RETIREMENT:

Request to receive and file disability retirement.

Thomas Cochran/Police Officer/Police

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

RESIGNATIONS:

Request to receive and file resignations.

Kevin Rodgers/Special Services Officer III/Harbor
Kyle Price/Ambulance Operator/Fire

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

TRANSFER:

Request to approve transfer.

Neal Stuart/Plumber/Airport to Plumber/Harbor

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

SCHEDULE FOR HEARINGS:

Request to approve hearing schedule.

Dismissal Appeal 01-D-1112, March 28, & April 4 & 11,
2012

Reduction Appeal 44-R-1011, March 14, 2012

Suspension Appeal 02-S-1112, April 18, 2012

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

RESCHEDULE FOR HEARINGS:

Request to approve reschedule for hearings.

Reduction Appeal 36-R-1011, January 13, 2012

Suspension Appeal 29-S-910, January 27, 2012

Suspension Appeal 31-S-1011, March 7, 2012

The motion was made to approve on Consent Calendar.

WITHDRAWAL OF APPEAL:

Request to receive and file withdrawal of appeal.

Suspension Appeal 13-S-1011

The motion was made to receive and file on Consent Calendar.

12/7/11

Page #3

**REQUEST FOR TEMPORARY
REASSIGNMENT FOR
REHABILITATION:**

**JOSE JUAN ROBLES, GAS FIELD SERVICE
REPRESENTATIVE TO CUSTOMER SERVICE
REPRESENTATIVE – LONG BEACH GAS & OIL**

The Secretary presented a communication from Debbie Mills, Director of Human Resources, requesting Commission authorization to temporarily reassign Jose Juan Robles, Gas Field Service Representative, to the classification of Customer Service Representative for rehabilitation. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Lourdes Ferrer, Personnel Analyst. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the request for reassignment for rehabilitation be approved, pursuant to Section 63(5) of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND
NON-CAREER HOURS:**

DANIEL MENDEZ/REFUSE OPERATOR/PUBLIC WORKS

The Secretary presented a communication from Cynthia Stafford, Personnel Services Officer, Public Works, requesting Commission approval to extend the non-career hours for Daniel Mendez, Refuse Operator, for an additional 200 hours. The Secretary informed the Commission that staff concurs with the request. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the non-career hours be extended for 200 hours, in accordance with Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**REQUEST TO EXTEND
NON-CAREER HOURS:**

**BOBBY RYAN AND MARK WICKER, ANIMAL CONTROL
OFFICERS CANDICE WICKER, YVONNE MORALES,
LAUREN NIXON, MICHELLE SANDOVAL, ERIK
SERRANO, ALBERTO NAVARRO AND CHERI
COSTIGEN, ANIMAL LICENSE INSPECTORS**

The Secretary presented a communication from George Chapjian, Director of Parks, Recreation & Marine, requesting Commission approval to extend the non-career hours for Bobby Ryan (100) and Mark Wicker (200), Animal Control Officers, Candice Wicker (250), Yvonne Morales (250), Lauren Nixon (200), Michelle Sandoval (250), Erik Serrano (300), Alberto Navarro (200) and Cheri Costigen (300), Animal License Inspectors, as indicated. The Secretary informed the Commission that staff concurs with

the request. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Smith Watts, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the non-career hours be extended as indicated, in accordance with Section 49 of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**APPEAL OF DISQUALIFICATION
FROM EXAMINATION:**

GENERAL MAINTENANCE ASSISTANT

The Secretary presented a communication from Eric Wilson, Non Career Maintenance Assistant, appealing his disqualification from the General Maintenance Assistant examination, which was conducted on December 1, 2011. In addition, the Secretary presented a staff report prepared by Donna de Araujo, Assistant Administrative Analyst. Ms. de Araujo briefed the Commission regarding this request. Mr. Wilson addressed the Commission, asking it to reconsider his denial from the examination process for General Maintenance Assistant. Stacey Lewis, Assistant Director of Human Resources, Harbor, also addressed the Commission. After questions from the Commission and discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried to continue this item to be considered in closed session at the January 11, 2012, Commission meeting. The Commission informed Mr. Wilson that he would not be allowed to attend the closed session. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

**PROTEST OF WRITTEN
EXAMINATION ITEM(S):**

HOUSING SPECIALIST

The Secretary requested that this item be pulled from the agenda because no protests were received.

**CONSIDERATION OF HEARING
OFFICER'S REPORT:**

SUSPENSION HEARING 11-S-910

The Secretary presented a report prepared by Hearing Officer Barbara Raileanu, Attorney at Law, to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on September 22, 2011. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the hearing officer's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

CONSIDERATION OF HEARING

SUSPENSION HEARING 18-S-1011

OFFICER'S REPORT:

The Secretary presented a report prepared by Hearing Officer Robert Kilpatrick, Attorney at Law, to the Commission, regarding the subject hearing which was conducted on November 4, 2011. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hicks and carried that the hearing officer's report be approved as prepared. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

COMMUNICATION REGARDING SCHEDULING OF HEARING:

The Secretary presented a communication from Jim McDonnell, Chief of Police, requesting the Commission to schedule Dismissal Appeal 08-D-1011, which has been placed on hold pending criminal charge(s). He also presented a communication from Rob Sergi, Attorney at Law, representing the appellant in this matter. Mike Peters, Attorney at Law, representing the City, informed the Commission that the District Attorney's Office was contacted on Tuesday and received from them a formal notice of objection letter, dated December 6, 2011, but retroactive to August 2010. He stated there is no case pending against the appellant and that he and Mr. Sergi agreed to calendar the hearing for April 25 and May 2, 2012, and if something changes in the interim, it could be taken up with the Commission at a later date and continued if good cause is found. However, at the present no good cause exists. Mr. Sergi stated that he and Mike also agreed that pending the review of the appellant and if he does not have any objections to the documents submitted by Mr. Peters that they agree to go forward. But, if there is some objection on the criminal attorney's part and this is not the incentive agreed or advised, they have agreed to consider extending beyond that date. He also addressed concerns regarding the Chief's letter that no criminal charges were pending. After discussion, it was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by commissioner Smith Watts to calendar the hearing for April 25 and May 2, 2012, with the stipulation that in the event that there is a change by the District Attorney, that the Commission would consider a continuance. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

BULLETIN:

ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST

It was moved by Commissioner Hicks, seconded by Commissioner Keller and carried that the subject Job Opportunity Bulletin be approved. The motion carried by a unanimous roll call vote.

MANAGERS' REPORT:

Melinda George, Deputy Director, attended training in Pasadena last week on NeoGov. Plan to meet with several other agencies possibly quarterly and share information.

The Secretary thanked staff for another productive year.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business before the Commission, President Karatsu adjourned the meeting.



MARIO R. BEAS
Secretary

MRB:meh

Karen Highberger, Chair
Irma Hernandez, Vice Chair
Laura H. Brassler, Commissioner
Shannon Carmack, Commissioner



Louise Ivers, Commissioner
Harvey Keller, Commissioner
Vacant, Commissioner

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:35 PM)

see media

At 5:35 p.m., Chair Highberger called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:35 PM)

see media

Boardmembers Laura H. Brassler, Karen L. Highberger, Irma Hernandez, Louise
Present: Ivers and Harvey Keller

Boardmembers Shannon Carmack
Absent:

Also present: Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director; Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer; Linda Trang, Deputy City Attorney; Angie Zetterquist, Planner; Heidi Eidson, Bureau Secretary.

FLAG SALUTE (5:35 PM)

see media

Commissioner Brassler led the flag salute.

MINUTES (5:35 PM)

see media

see media

11-034CH

Recommendation to receive and file the Cultural Heritage Commission minutes of October 10, 2011.

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Hernandez, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Laura H. Brassler, Karen L. Highberger, Irma Hernandez,
Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

Absent: 1 - Shannon Carmack

DIRECTOR'S REPORT (5:36 PM)

see media

Robert Zur Schmiede, Deputy Director, presented the Director's Report.

SWEARING OF WITNESSES (5:36 PM)

see media

Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the evidence you shall give in this Cultural Heritage Commission Meeting shall be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth.

REGULAR AGENDA (5:36 PM)

see media

see media

1. 11-037CH Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 498-square-foot, one-story addition to the back of an existing one-story residence located at 3481 Rose Avenue within the California Heights Historic District. (District 7) (Application No. HP11-0285)

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Angie Zetterquist, Project Planner, who presented the staff report.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Chair Highberger.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Angie Zetterquist responded to comments made by Commissioner Ivers.

Angie Zetterquist responded to queries from Commissioner Hernandez.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Commissioner Brassler.

Fred Sanchez, applicant, spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Fred Sanchez and Chair Highberger.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Chair Highberger.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Highberger, Angie Zetterquist, and

Fred Sanchez.

Fred Sanchez responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

Chair Highberger spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

Angie Zetterquist responded to queries from Chair Highberger.

Chair Highberger spoke.

Commissioner Hernandez spoke.

Commissioner Hernandez responded to a query from Chair Highberger.

Commissioner Brasser spoke.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Commissioner Brasser.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Brasser, Commissioner Ivers, Chair Highberger and Commissioner Hernandez.

Commissioner Hernandez responded to a query from Chair Highberger.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hernandez, seconded by Commissioner Ivers, to approve the recommendation with an amendment to eliminate Condition No. 10 and also to specify that the aluminum clad wood windows in the addition match the existing wood windows in the front of the home to the satisfaction of staff. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Laura H. Brasser, Karen L. Highberger, Irma Hernandez, Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

Absent: 1 - Shannon Carmack

see media

2. 11-035CH

Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new eelgrass beds adjacent to the northeast end of Marine Stadium, a designated historic landmark site, to mitigate the loss of eelgrass due to the Alamitos Bay Marina Rehabilitation Project. (District 3) (Application No. HP 11-0289)

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, provided a brief introduction to the project.

Mark Sandoval, Manager of the Marine Bureau with the Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine, applicant, spoke.

Mark Sandoval responded to queries from Chair Highberger.

Mark Sandoval responded to queries from Commissioner Brassler.

Mark Sandoval responded to queries from Commissioner Hernandez.

Mark Sandoval responded to queries from Commissioner Brassler.

Rick Ware of Coastal Frontiers Management, consultant, responded to a query from Commissioner Brassler.

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

John Yemens provided public comment.

Commissioner Keller spoke.

Don Bogart provided public comment.

Mark Sandoval responded to public comment.

Mark Sandoval and Glen Estrella, Project Manager, responded to queries from Commissioner Brassler.

Don Bogart provided public comment.

A motion was made by Commissioner Keller, seconded by Commissioner Brassler, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Laura H. Brassler, Karen L. Highberger, Irma Hernandez, Louise Ivers and Harvey Keller

Absent: 1 - Shannon Carmack

see media

3. 11-036CH

Recommendation to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to add a two-story 1,800-square-foot addition to the rear of an existing two-story residence and construct a new detached 2,530-square-foot two-story residence with an attached two-car garage located at 2907 East Ocean Boulevard in the Bluff Park Historic District. (District 3) (Application No. HP11-0113)

Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, presented the staff report.

Jill Griffiths responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

Don Khalighi, applicant, spoke.

Don Khalighi responded to queries from Commissioner Brassier.

Commissioner Hernandez spoke.

Chair Highberger spoke.

Commissioner Keller spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Brassier and Chair Highberger.

Ken Briden provided public comment.

Helena Segelhorst provided public comment.

Wendy Harn, representing the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association, provided public comment.

Sasha Witte, President of the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association, provided public comment.

Commissioner Hernandez spoke.

Commissioner Ivers spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Ivers, Chair Highberger, Commissioner Brassier and Commissioner Hernandez.

Jill Griffiths spoke.

Ken Briden responded to a query from Jill Griffiths.

Jill Griffiths spoke.

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Brassier, Chair Highberger and Commissioner Hernandez.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hernandez, seconded by Commissioner Highberger, to approve the recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Karen L. Highberger, Irma Hernandez and Louise Ivers

No: 2 - Laura H. Brassler and Harvey Keller

Absent: 1 - Shannon Carmack

STUDY SESSION (7:22 PM)

see media

see media

4. 11-038CH Recommendation to conduct a study session on the property located at 3801 E. 5th Street.
Jill Griffiths, Planning Officer, introduced Angie Zetterquist, Project Planner, who discussed the study session item.
- Sean Coon, property owner, spoke.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Chair Highberger.
- Commissioner Ivers spoke.
- Sean Coon and Jon Udoff, Architect, responded to queries from Commissioner Keller.
- A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Hernandez, Jon Udoff and Sean Koon.
- A dialogue ensued between Chair Highberger, Jill Griffiths, and Angie Zetterquist.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Commissioner Keller.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Commissioner Brassler.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Chair Highberger.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Chair Highberger.
- Sean Coon responded to a query from Commissioner Keller.
- Commissioner Ivers spoke.
- Commissioner Ivers responded to a query from Commissioner Keller.

Sean Coon responded to a query from Chair Highberger.

Angie Zetterquist responded to a query from Chair Highberger.

Chair Highberger spoke.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION: (7:46 PM)

see media

Larry Goodhue provided public comment.

A dialogue ensued between Chair Highberger and Larry Goodhue.

COMMENTS FROM THE CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION (7:50 PM)

see media

A dialogue ensued between Commissioner Keller, Chair Highberger and Robert Zur Schmiede.

Jill Griffiths spoke.

Jill Griffiths responded to a query from Commissioner Ivers.

ADJOURNMENT (7:51 PM)

see media

At 7:51 p.m., Chair Highberger adjourned the meeting.

JP