

Attachment D

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS COAC 2111-02 FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS 3726 LEMON AVENUE

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The project site is located within the California Heights Historic District, which was first established in February 1990 and adopted under Ordinance C-5364 and expanded in May 2000, under Ordinance number C-7202. The subject property is located on the east side of Lemon Avenue, between Bixby Road and 37th Street, within the R-1-N zone (Single Family Residential, Standard Lots). The subject property is 6,375 square feet in area (50 feet wide by 127.5 feet deep) and is developed with a 1,153-square-foot, single-story, single-family house which is a contributing structure to the California Heights Historic District, and a detached 330-square-foot garage. Based on building permits, the house and detached garage was constructed in 1927. The project meets these requirements and those of the City's Zoning Code, subject to conditions.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. All work will be conducted pursuant to the Guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The applicant is proposing to add 720 square feet to the ground floor the existing single-story residence through rear and side additions. The majority of the addition will be located at the rear of the house and a smaller addition is proposed on the side of the house. The rear addition will consist of 659 square feet of new area and will create a new master bedroom, bathroom, walk in closet, enlarge the kitchen and add a new laundry room. The side addition will be achieved by enclosing the existing alcove. This expansion on the side of the house will increase the interior square footage of the dining room and will measure 4-feet 2-inches by 11-feet 6-inches, totaling 48 square feet of area.

The additions have been sensitively designed to address concerns of bulk and mass. The rear addition will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The side addition is small in nature and will be screened from view by the new gate and fence located across the driveway. The rear addition is located entirely behind the house. The existing house is larger in size than the proposed addition and the

addition as proposed is broken into three separate areas, which will not create the same bulk and mass concerns as a single larger addition would create. The larger rear addition is 17 feet in width, which is less than half the total width of the existing house. The height of the new addition will have a flat roof which will be 6 inches higher than the height of the flat roof of the existing house. The height difference is intended to provide a visual distinction where the existing house 's flat roof joins the flat roof in the addition. This is intended to avoid a false sense of history by creating a continuous roof line. The height difference also occurs at a part of the house where it is minimally visible. The project will not demolish the existing house. The new addition has been carefully designed to be distinguishable from the existing historic house as the addition's flat roof line is proposed with a four-inch taller parapet height and the larger addition will feature a gable roof system with composite roofing material. The parapet wall is in accordance with the Standards to distinguish original structure and the new addition. The proposed project is compatible with the existing residence's scale, mass and architectural style and the district as a whole.

The addition features exterior stucco walls, double hung and casement wood windows, and terracotta roof drains. The design of the new addition is compatible with the existing developments within the neighborhood and the district in general. The addition has been conditioned to incorporate specific design features such as the use of high-quality wood windows and the incorporation of wood trims and sills on all new windows. Thus, the addition to the single-family residence is consistent with the spirit and intent of the historic district.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The proposed one-story addition is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- Use – The site is currently development with single family residential uses and the use will not change. The project will enlarge the existing single-family residence.
- Character – Single-family structures are found throughout the neighborhood and throughout the California Heights Historic District. The proposed addition will not change the character of this residence, neighborhood or the district. The new addition will incorporate similar character-defining features found within California Heights such as wood windows, stucco exteriors and clay roof tiles, a flat roof and a gable roof. The conditions of approval will

require that new windows be high quality wood windows as was characteristic of the historic houses of this architectural style. The proposed addition is compatible in size, scale and exterior building materials to the adjacent properties and other buildings in the district.

- Changes to Historic Features – The 720-square-foot addition is proposed on the back and the side of the existing home. The distinctive features on the home, the front and side gable roof lines, , bay window along the side elevation, and the recessed porch will not be modified.
- Historic Significance – The addition will not change the historic significance of the property or impact the integrity of the district. The project has been sensitively designed to preserve the historic significance of the home. the rear addition will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The side addition is small in nature will be screened from view by the new gate and fence located across the driveway and the rear addition is located entirely behind the house.
- Distinctive Features – The front elevation of the home is asymmetrical in design and the structure features exterior stucco, wood windows and a large front facing gable and a stepped back, covered entry door. A large chimney flanked by two fixed widows is centered on the front facing gable roof. The front portion of the house features a large front facing gable and two side facing gables topped with red clay tiles. The rear portion features a flat roof with a parapet capped with red tile coping. The addition will not modify these features. The addition will feature stucco walls, double hung and casement wood windows, and terracotta roof drains, similar to the features found on the existing house. The design of the addition is compatible with the existing developments within the neighborhood and the district in general. The addition has been conditioned to incorporate specific design features such as the use of high-quality wood windows and requires that all the new windows feature wood trims and sills.
- Deteriorated Historic Features – No deteriorated historic features are found on the existing structure.
- Damage to Historic Materials – The project will enlarge the existing home at the rear and the side. No historic materials are damaged or will be damaged as a result of the project.
- Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known. No major excavations or grading is proposed.
- Historic Materials that Characterize the Property – The contributing resource, a Spanish Colonial Revival single story house, retains distinctive architecture features. It is asymmetrical in design and features exterior stucco and wood windows, and a large front facing gable and a stepped back covered entry door. A large chimney flanked by two fixed widows is centered on the front facing gable roof. The front portion of the house features a large front facing gable and two side facing gables topped with red clay tiles. The rear portion features a flat roof with a parapet capped with red tile coping. No changes are proposed to the front elevation of the

home. The proposed project will not destroy existing historic materials that characterize the property.

- Form and Integrity – The single-story addition will not cause damage to the essential form and integrity of the contributing resource or the district. The addition is consistent in massing and size with the adjacent single-story homes and the other single-story homes found within the district.

In accordance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." In compliance with Standard No. 9, the proposed one-story addition features similar exterior features such as the existing house but is also differentiated by the different roof system and four-inch higher parapet height. The higher roof height of the addition factors in the moderate ceiling height of the one-story addition. The change in roofline occurs in a part of the building where it will be minimally visible from the street. Moreover, the new addition will be located at the rear of the lot and will be properly screened from view from Lemon Avenue.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The subject property is a contributing property within the California Heights Historic District. The Design Guidelines for the California Heights Historic District require that projects comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The Design Guidelines specify that "side additions are considered in instances where the site conditions allow for the side addition to not be highly visible from the street...Constructing an addition to the rear of a residence is acceptable for all properties provided that it is sensitively designed and is not highly visible from the public right of way...the addition should not envelop or be larger overall than the existing building, and should be no wider than the existing footprint. Single-story rear addition roof lines should not be taller than the existing rooflines of the residence...Additions should always add to the existing footprint or the building [and] new construction should never involve removal of a portion of the original residence...A rear addition should be designed to be compatible with the historic building, but avoid duplicating the original building materials and detailing so that the addition is not mistaken for an original part of the residence in the future."

The addition has been sensitively designed to address concerns of bulk and mass and is not be highly visible from the public right-of-way. The side addition is small in nature and will be screened from view by the new gate and fence located across the driveway. The rear addition is located entirely behind the house. The existing house is larger in size than the proposed addition and the addition is comprised of three separate areas which will not create the same bulk and mass concerns as a single larger addition would create. The larger rear addition is 17 feet in width, which is less than half the total width of the existing house and thus addresses bulk and mass concerns. The height of the new addition is not higher than the height of the existing house. The project will not demolish any portions of the

CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

JANUARY 25, 2022

Page 5 of 5

existing house. The addition has been carefully designed to be able to distinguish it from the existing historic house as the portion of the addition featuring a flat roof line proposed with a slightly different height and the larger addition will feature a gable roof system with Spanish roofing tiles. The proposed project is compatible with the existing residence's scale, mass and architectural style and the district.