

Joen Garnica, President  
Erik Fallis, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner  
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES**

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 8:43 a.m.

### **FLAG SALUTE**

Stephanie Herrera representing the Civil Service Department led the flag salute.

### **ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne  
**Present:** Wheeler and Joen Garnica

### **1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

Erik Maitland addressed the commission regarding the Communication Specialist classification. President Garnica asked for a follow-up from Ms. Pizarro Winting on this matter for the next meeting. Ms. Pizarro Winting said she would report back to the Commission.

2. [22-178CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve minutes:**

*Regular Meeting of June 8, 2022*

*Suspension Hearing 07-S-1819 Minutes of September 8, 2021*

President Garnica requested an amendment to the previous amendment on agenda item 20. The minutes of the Regular Meeting of May 25 reflected that “President Garnica “requested” baseline information on the Police Department, however, President Garnica pointed out that this was a “follow up request” and not a “request” and would like the minutes to reflect the change.”

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of June 8, 2022, as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Commissioner Arias to approve Suspension Hearing 07-S-1819 Minutes of September 8, 2021. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 - 11):**

Commissioner Arias requested to pull consent calendar items 4, 9 & 10

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Vice President Fallis, seconded by Commissioner Arias to approve consent calendar items 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, & 11, except for items 4, 9, & 10. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

3. [22-190CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Assistant Administrative Analyst I-II*

*Gardener I-II*

*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN EXAM Test #30*

*Systems Support Specialist I-VI*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [22-179CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**

*Senior Equipment Operator- Bulldozer & Backhoe*

*Senior Equipment Operator- Crane*

Commissioner Arias, Ms. Goings, and Ms. Pizarro Winting had a brief discussion about the new diversity statement on the bulletin. They discussed the content of the statement, as well as when it began in circulation and the approval process prior to the statement being included in the bulletin.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

5. 22-180CS

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Theresa Woolhether, Permit Center Supervisor, Development Services, (9 yrs., 2 mos.)*

*Sigmund Jacoby, Administrative Analyst III, Harbor Department, (21 yrs. 4 mos.)*

*Lynne Kasuda, Terminal Services Representative II, Harbor Department, (14 yrs., 8 mos.)*

*Christopher Acosta, Library Clerk II, Library Services, (25 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Ronald Groves, Senior Civil Engineer, Harbor Department, (5 yrs., 2 mos.)*

*Ernest Armond, Police Officer, Police Department (29 yrs., 5 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. 22-181CS      **Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**  
*Robert Anderson, Firefighter, Fire Department, (16 yrs., 9 mos.)*  
*John Colquhoun, Maintenance Assistant III, Water Department, (14 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Deneane Santillano, Customer Service Representative III, Energy Resources, (8 yrs., 4 mos.)*  
*Jeffrey McRae, Water Utility Mechanic II, Water Department, (10 yrs., 8 mos.)*  
*Paul Tovar, Police Officer, Police Department, (14 yrs., 8 mos.)*  
*Michael James Mulligan, Police Officer, Police Department, (3yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Trevor Costin, Police Officer, Police Department, (5 yrs., 8 mos.)*  
*Tyler Bailey, Police Officer, Police Department, (3 yrs., 6 mos.)*  
*Alfonoso Garcia, Police Officer, Police Department, (19 yrs., 14 days)*  
*Brian Sanchez, Police Officer, Police Department, (3 yrs., 5 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. 22-182CS      **Recommendation to approve transfer(s):**  
*Kory Lawton, Safety Specialist I-Human Resources to Safety Specialist II- Harbor Department*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. [22-183CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):**  
*Dismissal Appeal 01-D-2021, Suggested Date June 22 & July 13, 2022*  
*Suspension Appeal 13-S-1920, Suggested Date August 5, 2022*  
*Dismissal Appeal 03-S-1920, Suggested Dates September 14, 21, & 28, 2022*  
*Dismissal Appeal 02-D-2122, Suggested Date October 12, 19 & 26, 2022*  
*Dismissal Appeal 04-D-2021, Suggested Date November 9 & 16, 2022*  
*Suspension Appeal 04-S-1920, Suggested Date December 7 & 14, 2022*  
*Suspension Appeal 05-S-1920, Suggested Date January 11 & 18, 2022*  
*Suspension Appeal 12-S-1920, Suggested Date February 1 & 8, 2022*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

9. [22-184CS](#)      **Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours - Eddie Medrano, Ambulance Operator- NC**  
*Communication from Sarah Green, Administrative Officer, Fire Department*  
*Staff Report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Commissioner Arias asked where the team is currently when it comes to the selection of Ambulance Operator. Ms. Goings informed the commission that the eligible list was established in March of 2022 and the Fire Department is currently making selections from the established list.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

10. [22-185CS](#)

**Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Jasmine Smith, Recreation Leader Specialist X-NC  
*Communication from Sheryl Bender, Superintendent of Personnel & Training- Parks, Recreation & Marine*  
*Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst*

Commissioner Arias asked why Ms. Smith went from a permanent to a non-career position and whether this was accurate. Ms. Herrera clarified that she has always been a non-career and that she made a mistake in the staff report.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

11. [22-189CS](#)

**Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**

*Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST I-IV (EA8AN-21) (7/9/2021) - **2 months\***  
BUILDING SERVICES SUPERVISOR (J10NN-20) (7/31/2020)  
BUSINESS SYSTEMS SPECIALIST I-VII (CLOUD ENGINEER) (H67AN-22) TEST #02 (1/19/2022)  
CIVIL ENGINEER (K11NN-21) TEST #18 (1/27/2021)  
CIVIL ENGINEER (K11NN-21) TEST #24 (7/21/2021)  
CIVIL ENGINEER (K11NN-22) TEST #27 (1/5/2022)  
CIVIL ENGINEERING ASSISTANT (K12NN-21B) (7/7/2021)  
EMERGENCY MEDICAL EDUCATION COORDINATOR (G45NN-20) TEST #01 (1/30/2020)  
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH SPECIALIST I-IV (G43AN-20) TEST #01 (7/24/2020) **1 month\***  
GARAGE SERVICE ATTENDANT I-III (J23AN-20) TEST #03 (1/6/2020) - **1 month\***  
GEOGRAPHIC INFORMATION SYSTEMS SUPERVISOR (NL5NN-21) (7/7/2021)  
HOUSING AIDE I-II (HS1AN-21) (7/7/2021) - **1 month\***  
NURSE PRACTITIONER (G12NN-20) TEST #03 (12/20/2019) - **1 month\***  
PLUMBER (I38NN-20) TEST #01 (7/24/2020)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-20) TEST #10 (1/27/2020)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-20) TEST #14 (7/30/2020)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-21) TEST #18 (1/25/2021)  
POLICE OFFICER - LATERAL (F23NN-22) TEST #25 (1/5/2022)  
POLICE RECRUIT (F63NN-22) TEST #01 (1/5/2022)  
POLICE RECRUIT (F63NN-22) TEST #02 (1/19/2022)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I - IV - LATERAL (J45AN-20C) TEST #05 (7/22/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - NTN EXAM



(J45AN-20A) TEST #12 (7/2/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - NTN EXAM  
(J45AN-20A) TEST #13 (7/24/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - NTN EXAM  
(J45AN-21A) TEST #19 (1/27/2021)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - POST WAIVER  
(J45AN-20B) TEST #13 (7/2/2020)  
PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCHER I-IV - POST WAIVER  
(J45AN-21B) TEST #20 (1/27/2021)  
REFUSE OPERATOR I-III (JA2AN-22) TEST #31 (1/5/2022)  
SCHOOL GUARD (F31N1-21) TEST #05 (7/7/2021)  
SCHOOL GUARD (F31N1-21) TEST #06 (7/21/2021)  
SENIOR PROGRAM MANAGER - HARBOR (NFONN-21)  
TEST #01 (1/26/2021)  
SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-20) TEST #45  
(7/30/2020)  
SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-21) TEST #49  
(1/14/2021)  
SPECIAL SERVICES OFFICER I-IV (F33AN-22) TEST #60  
(1/5/2022)  
STOCK AND RECEIVING CLERK (D37NN-21) (7/7/2021)  
TERMINAL SERVICES REPRESENTATIVE I-II (N43AN-20)  
TEST #01 (4/20/2020)  
TRAFFIC ENGINEER (K76NN-20) TEST #01 (7/15/2020)  
TRANSPORTATION PLANNER I-III (NC6AN-20) TEST #01  
(1/16/2020)  
TREE TRIMMER I-II (J66AN-22) TEST #01 (1/5/2022)  
X-RAY TECHNICIAN (G30NN-22) TEST #04 (1/19/2022)

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the  
Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

12. [22-186CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY**

**PERIOD** - Christian High, Animal Control Officer I

*Communication from Sheryl Bender, Superintendent of  
Personnel & Training- Parks, Recreation & Marine*

*Staff Report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Herrera who briefed the Commission on this item. A representative from the department was available for questions.

Commissioner Arias pointed out that in some of the communication, the department is requesting a 6-month extension and wanted to know if the department is aware that the Commission can only grant 3 months, and will the Commission be receiving this again for an additional 3-month extension. Ms. Herrera clarified that the department is aware that it is only a 3-month request, and an additional request is not anticipated.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

**Excused:** 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

13. [22-187CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED**

**CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION-** Parking Control Supervisor

*Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Human Resources*

*Staff Report prepared by Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Goings who briefed the commission on this item. A representative from the department was available for questions.

Vice President Fallis voiced concerns about increasing the minimum qualifications during a tight labor market, and whether the adjustment and the lack of one year of supervisory experience would be exclusionary. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that the idea that a candidate is expected to supervise staff without any experience sets them up to not be very successful, so the inclusion of at least one year of supervisory experience helps the candidate to be successful. Vice President Fallis understood the reasoning behind it but pointed out that one of the challenges in entry-level management is that it often requires a candidate to have had entry-level management and wants to make sure that this does not become a cycle. Commissioner Arias commented that what helps, in this case, is the inclusion of the word “lead”, which is an assignment that is not supervisory but allows a candidate entry into this position. Ms. Pizarro Winting reiterated that this allows the candidate to know about the expectations of this position prior to accepting it.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

14. [22-188CS](#) **REQUEST TO EXTEND ARTICLE VIII, SECTION 115(3) OF THE CIVIL SERVICE RULES AND REGULATIONS**

*Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission on this item.

President Garnica asked whether it would be time to consider making it a permanent change since it's been extended for quite a long time. A discussion between the Commissioners, Ms. Pizarro Winting, and Mr. Anderson took place about looking at this matter and the requirement that all rule revisions be approved by the City Council. President Garnica reiterated that it is worth looking at to see if this can be made permanent. It was recommended that this item be referred to the Executive Committee to review with other Civil Service Rules being scheduled for review.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Fallis, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Erik Fallis, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Yvonne Wheeler and Joen Garnica

15. **STANDING COMMITTEES**

- A. Executive Committee**
- B. Recruitment and Selection Committee**
- C. Special Projects Committee**

*A. Executive Committee*

There were no updates at this time.

*B. Recruitment and Selection Committee*

There were no updates at this time.

*C. Special Projects Committee*

There were no updates at this time.

**16. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

- A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division – Crystal Slaten**
- B. Employment Services Division – Caprice McDonald**
- C. Administration and Support Services Division – Maria Alamo**
- D. Executive Director – Christina Pizarro Winting**

*A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Slaten introduced the Commission to the new addition to the team, Ociris Lugo who previously worked at the Police Department. Ms. Lugo introduced herself and shared her excitement to join the team.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. Goings provided the division update on behalf of Ms. McDonald. Ms. Goings updated the Commission on upcoming examinations such as the post Pellet B examination and Fire Engineer Performance examination.

*C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo informed the Commission that the team is still working on getting the answers to the questions from the Non-Career presentation. Answers to the questions are expected for the July 6th meeting.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced the commission to the newest members of the City's Management Assistant Program and provided a brief detail about the program. Aubri Qian, Brenda Soriano-Villa and Sidney Thompson introduced themselves to the Commission.

**17. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

No unfinished business at this time.

**18. NEW BUSINESS**

President Garnica made a comment about the interesting weather on this day. She acknowledged Father’s Day to everyone who celebrates as a father and as a father figure. She acknowledged Independence Day and reminded everyone that fireworks are illegal in the City of Long Beach. She acknowledged Juneteenth in what she considers our true independence because we’re not independent unless we are all independent and free. And lastly, she thanked Ms. Pizarro Winting and Mr. Modica for arranging the day’s “meet and greet” with Commissioner Wheeler and Vice President Fallis, and she asked the audience to join everyone in the lobby for refreshments and some one-on-one time with our new Commissioners.

**19. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 9:21 a.m.

I, Julia Smay, Executive Assistant, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។