

Joen Garnica, President  
Brandon Dowling, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner  
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**SPECIAL MEETING**

**HELD VIA TELECONFERENCE  
PURSUANT TO AB 361  
(GOV. CODE SECTION 54953(e)(1)-(2))**

**WEB LINK: <https://longbeach-gov.zoom.us/j/91474523671>  
DIAL IN NUMBER: (213) 338-8477 / MEETING ID: 914 7452 3671**

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Garnica asked Maria Alamo, Administrative Officer, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Present:**

**Commissioners** Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

**Absent:**

At this time, President Garnica extended condolences to family, friends and colleagues of Officer Zamora. She also provided information regarding mental health assistance for city employees as well as the public. City employees in need of help can reach out by texting HOME to 741741. They can also call (888) 426-0025 or go to [crisistextline.org](http://crisistextline.org) for more information. Members of the public can reach out to the National Suicide Prevention Lifeline at (800) 273-8255. She encouraged anyone in need to reach out for help.

**1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 12):**

The Commission pulled Agenda Items 5, 7, 9, 10 and 11 for separate discussions.

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve Consent Calendar Items (2-4, 6, 8 and 12), except for Items (5, 7 and 9-11). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

- 2. [21-329CS](#) Recommendation to approve examination results:  
*Personnel Analyst I-IV*  
*X-Ray Technician Test #02***

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

- 3. [21-330CS](#) Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**

*Maintenance Assistant I-III*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [21-331CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Gilbert Alzona, Microbiologist II, Department of Health and Human Services (24 yrs., 22 days)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. [21-332CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**

*Cesar Castellanos, Payroll/Personnel Assistant II, Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (1 yr., 6 mos.)*

*Livingston Joseph, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department (11 mos. 1 day)*

*Nicholas Morper, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department (1 yr., 5 mos.)*

*Pin Natalie, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department (1 yr. 7 mos.)*

A discussion took place with President Garnica, Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias and Ms. McDonald regarding resignations for Ambulance Operator. It was mentioned staff has been working closely with the Fire Department as they are continuously hiring for the Ambulance Operator classification. The department also provided dispositions for candidates on the current eligible list, so staff will be working to open the recruitment. It was mentioned this is a difficult position to recruit for and raises concern when there are so many leaving. It was noted that Ambulance Operator is a pathway position to Fire Recruit and the salary is at or below minimum wage which could be the reason for the resignations.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

6. [21-333CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve downgrade (voluntary):**

*Martin Martinez - Communication Specialist VI to Communication Specialist III, Department of Technology and Innovation*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [21-334CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve schedule for hearing(s):**

*Dismissal Appeal (01-D-2021), Suggested Dates: May 4 and 11, 2022*

*Dismissal Appeal (03-D-2021), Suggested Dates: May 18 and 25, 2022*

*Dismissal Appeal (04-D-2021), Suggested Dates: June 15 and 22, 2022*

*Suspension Appeal (04-S-1920), Suggested Date: July 6, 2022*

*Suspension Appeal (05-S-1920), Suggested Dates: July 13 and 20, 2022*

*Suspension Appeal (11-S-1920), Suggested Date: August 3, 2022*

*Reduction Appeal (07-R-1920), Suggested Date: August 10, 2022*

*Suspension Appeal (09-S-1920), Suggested Date: August 17, 2022*

*Suspension Appeal (12-S-1920), Suggested Dates: August 24 and 31, 2022*

*Suspension Appeal (02-S-2021), Suggested Date: September 7, 2022*

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond wanted to confirm the suspensions were over 5 days. Ms. Camerino confirmed they were.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

8. [21-335CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):**

*Dismissal Appeal (04-D-1819), Suggested Dates: February 23, March 2 and 9, 2022*

*Dismissal Appeal (06-D-1920), Suggested Dates: April 20 and April 27, 2022*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

9. [21-336CS](#)

**Recommendation to Approve Provisional Appointment - Dalia**

**Gonzalez, Recycling Specialist**

*Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer, Department of Public Works*

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

For the record, Commissioner Arias wanted to make it clear that the Commission is approving a request for a third Provisional Appointment due to an unexpected resignation. In addition, the Commission is also approving three provisional appointments to the Recycling Specialist classification.

A discussion with President Garnica and Ms. McDonald took place regarding the supplemental application. This discussion pertains to Agenda Items 9, 10 and 11. It was explained the blank supplemental questionnaire that was attached is part of the bulletin packet for each candidate. It was confirmed a completed supplemental questionnaire was included in the application packet for each candidate.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve the recommendation as amended to include granting a third Provisional Appointment. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

10. [21-337CS](#)

**Recommendation to Approve Provisional Appointment -**

Michelle Anna Keshishian, Recycling Specialist

*Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer,  
Department of Public Works*

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive  
Director*

Commissioner Arias acknowledged additional information was received regarding the applicant's education.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

11. [21-338CS](#)

**Recommendation to Approve Provisional Appointment -**

Britny Coker Moen, Recycling Specialist

*Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer,  
Department of Public Works*

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

12. [21-339CS](#)

**Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive*

*Director*

*Business Systems Specialist I-VII (H67AN-21) Test #23  
(12/28/2020)*

*Civil Engineer (K11NN-21) Test #23 (6/23/2021)*

*Deputy Chief Harbor Engineer I-II (N16AN-20) Test #01  
(12/30/2019)*

*Development Project Manager I-III (E80AN-20) (6/24/2020) - 1  
month\**

*Electrical And Instrumentation Supervisor (MG4NN-21) Test  
#01 (6/9/2021)*

*Electrical And Instrumentation Technician I-II (MG6AN-21)  
Test #01 (6/9/2021)*

*Electrical Engineer (K89NN-21) Test #03 (6/23/2021)*

*Geographic Information Systems Technician I-II (EF1AN-21)  
(12/28/2020)*

*Geologist I-II (K25AN-21) Test #01 (6/23/2021)*

*Library Assistant (F87NN-20) (6/12/2020)*

*Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-20) Test #03 (12/20/2019)*

*Permit Technician I-II (ED6AN-21B) Test #01 (6/23/2021)*

*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-21) Test #17 (12/18/2020)*

*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-21) Test #21 (6/23/2021)*

*Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #19 (7/1/2020) - 4 months \**

*Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-20) Test #03 (6/5/2020) - 5  
months \**

*Public Health Nurse I-III (G19AN-20) Test #04 (6/23/2020) - 5  
months \**

*Public Health Nurse Supervisor (G20NN-20) Test #03  
(6/24/2020) - 5 months \**

*Public Safety Dispatcher I - IV - Lateral (J45AN-20C) Test #04  
(12/19/2019)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher I - IV - Lateral (J45AN-21C) Test #10  
(6/23/2021)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-19A) Test  
#06 (3/11/2019) - 3 months \**

*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-21A) Test  
#17 (12/10/2020)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-21A) Test  
#18 (12/29/2020)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN Exam (J45AN-21A) Test #23 (6/23/2021)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-19B) Test #05 (3/11/2019) - 3 months \**  
*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #10 (12/19/2019)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-21B) Test #18 (12/7/2020)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-21B) Test #19 (12/29/2020)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - Post Waiver (J45AN-21B) Test #23 (6/23/2021)*  
*Recreation Assistant (H52NN-19) Test #01 (3/1/2019) - 3 months \**  
*School Guard (F31N1-21) Test #03 (6/9/2021)*  
*School Guard (F31N1-21) Test #04 (6/23/2021)*  
*Senior Civil Engineer (K52NN-20) Test #06 (5/1/2020) - 3 months \**  
*Senior Librarian (E31NN-21) Test #03 (6/9/2021)*  
*Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-20) Test #44 (6/12/2020)*  
*Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-21) Test #48 (12/9/2020)*  
*Special Services Officer I-IV (F33AN-21) Test #54 (6/23/2021)*  
*Street Landscaping Supervisor I-II (J90NN-20B) (6/17/2020) - 2 months \**  
*Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1AN-20) Test #03 (11/6/2019) - 2 months \**  
*Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1AN-20) Test #04 (3/9/2020) - 2 months \**  
*Water Treatment Operator I-IV (MA1AN-20) Test #05 (5/7/2020) - 2 months \**

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

**13. [21-340CS](#)**

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD - Jose Espinoza, Water Utility**



Supervisor II  
*Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager,  
Water Department  
Staff Report prepared by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director*

Ms. McDonald briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was on the call to answer questions.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond commented that although evaluations were received, they were not noted on the form as being received. In addition, the next three items are due to the State's backlog.

A brief discussion took place with Commissioner Arias and Ms. McDonald regarding the potential for additional requests to come to the Commission due to the State's backlog in the administration of Water Operator certification examinations due to the pandemic. It was mentioned staff will be discussing this with the department as this is the first time having a situation like this. It was commented that the more information staff can provide in advance, the better.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

14. [21-341CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Richard Fuentes, Water Utility Supervisor I  
*Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager,  
Water Department  
Staff Report prepared by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director*

Ms. McDonald briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was on the call to answer

questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

15. [21-342CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Dale Krick, Water Utility Supervisor I

*Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager, Water Department*

*Staff Report prepared by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director*

Ms. McDonald briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

16. [21-343CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Juan Ramirez, Water Utility Supervisor I

*Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager, Water Department*

*Staff Report prepared by Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director*

Ms. McDonald briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

17. [21-344CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION** - Gardener I-II  
*Communication from Joe Ambrosini, Director, Human Resources Department*  
*Staff report prepared by Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. McDonald introduced Ms. Ramos who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the department was on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

18. [21-345CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN(S):**  
*Gardener I-II*

President Garnica announced that the Commission is now approving the bulletin for Gardener I-II as the revised classification specification was just approved.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

19. [21-346CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN(S):**

*Police Recruit*

Ms. McDonald introduced Ms. Ramos who provided a presentation regarding the recruitment and examination process for Police Recruit.

Representatives from the Police Department were on the call to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias thanked Ms. Ramos for an excellent report. She asked for clarification regarding when the first list will come to the Commission for approval. Ms. Ramos answered on January 5, 2022, the Commission will be approving the first list.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond thanked Ms. Ramos for her report. She stated that as long as she has been serving on the Commission, this is one of the best reports she has seen for the Police Department. She thanked her for thinking outside of the box on outreach efforts and provided additional information regarding outreach.

President Garnica thanked Ms. Ramos for an amazing presentation. She asked to not forget about the bumper stickers. She also provided additional information regarding outreach.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

**Absent:** 2 - Yvonne Wheeler and Brandon Dowling

20. STANDING COMMITTEES

*A. Executive Committee*

President Garnica reported that there is an upcoming meeting scheduled for December 7th.

*B. Recruitment and Selection Committee*

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond reported that the committee is still in the process of scheduling its next meeting.

*C. Special Projects Committee*

Commissioner Arias reported that a recommendation was brought to the Commission at the last business meeting and should be on the agenda for the next business meeting.

**21. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

*A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Slaten was not available to report; however, Ms. McDonald shared information on her behalf. She reported Ms. Cano will be participating in a job fair at Community Hospital to reach out to displaced workers.

Ms. McDonald reported this is Jessica Ayala's last meeting and thanked her for assisting with the educational requirements. Ms. Ayala thanked the department for having her and stated it has been a pleasure.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald provided an update on various exam activities taking place. She had the opportunity to observe the performance exam for Marine Safety Sergeant Boat Operator. She reported Ms. Ramos has been preparing for Police Lieutenant and conducted the first of two candidate orientations. Ms. McDonald also reported on appraisal interviews taking place today for Traffic Engineer and Combination Building Inspector Aide.

*C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo reported on training she and Ms. Kerr-Jenkins attended related to Position Control, which is important as they help to identify city positions, how they

are filled and which ones are vacant.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting was not present to report.

President Garnica thanked Ms. Ayala for her time and wished her the best. She hopes she considers one of the city positions for a career.

**22. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

There was no unfinished business to discuss.

**23. NEW BUSINESS**

President Garnica wished everyone a happy Thanksgiving and commented she is thankful for all stakeholders as well as Civil Service staff for all that is done. She thanked Ms. Camerino for her work in keeping the Commission together.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond mentioned that November 26th is Native American Heritage Day and wanted to wish all Native Americans a happy cultural month and day.

**24. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

President Garnica reiterated the information provided at the beginning of the meeting. If anyone finds themselves in a time of need, she encouraged city employees to reach out by texting HOME to 741741. They can also call (888) 426-0025 or go to [crisistextline.org](http://crisistextline.org) for more information. She encouraged members of the public to reach out to the National Suicide Prevention Lifeline at (800) 273-8255. She commented that there is someone out there that cares for each one of us.

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 10:04 a.m.

**NO HEARING**



**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។