

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President  
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner  
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE HELD VIA  
TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20  
ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM.**

**THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC.**

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Commissioner Garnica to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana

**Present:** Gonzalez Edmond

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias

**Excused:**

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION BY SUBMITTING WRITTEN COMMENTS VIA EMAIL TO [MARLA.CAMERINO@LONGBEACH.GOV](mailto:MARLA.CAMERINO@LONGBEACH.GOV).**

There were no public comments received.

2. [21-034CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of January 20, 2021*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 7):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve Consent Calendar Items (3 - 7). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

3. [21-035CS](#) **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Battalion Chief (**PROMOTIONAL**)*  
*Civil Engineer Test #18 (Established 01/27/21)*  
*Personnel Assistant (**PROMOTIONAL**)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral Test #18 (Established 01/25/21)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN EXAM Test #19 (Established 01/27/21)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - POST WAIVER Test #20 (Established 01/27/21)*  
*Senior Program Manager - Harbor Test #01 (Established 01/26/21)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [21-036CS](#) **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**  
*Planning Aide*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. [21-038CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**  
*Brian Campos, Refuse Operator I, Public Works Department (1 yr., 9 mos.)*  
*Heriberto Duarte, Gas Construction Worker II, Energy Resources Department (1 yr., 8 mos.)*  
*Donna Johnson, Public Safety Dispatcher I, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (3 mos., 28 days)*  
*Rebecca King, Clerk Typist II, Development Services Department (1 yr., 3 mos.)*  
*Shahram Samia Kalantari, Civil Engineer, Harbor Department (1 yr., 9 mos.)*  
*Andrew Theisen, Administrative Analyst I, Harbor Department (10 yrs., 8 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [21-039CS](#) **COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours - Mario Raygoza, Refuse Operator I**  
*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works*  
*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [21-040CS](#) **Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**  
*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

---

*Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #11  
(2/21/2019) 5 Months*

*Civil Engineer (K11NN-20) Test #11 (2/19/2020) 5 Months*

*Commercial Diver (I46AN-20) Test #01 (2/7/2020)*

*Electrician (I15NN-19) Test #01 (5/16/2019)*

*Electrician (I15NN-19) Test #03 (8/2/2019)*

*Electrician (I15NN-20) Test #08 (8/7/2020)*

*Engineering Technician (K95AN-20) (2/14/2020)*

*Fleet Services Supervisor (I69AN-20) (2/14/2020)*

*Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter (I61NN-19) Test #03  
(8/28/2019)*

*Maintenance Assistant (JA3AN-20) Test #01 (2/13/2020)*

*Marine Safety Officer (H14NN-20) (2/25/2020)*

*Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-19) Test #01 (8/28/2019)*

*Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-20) Test #04 (2/20/2020)*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-19B) Test #02  
(8/14/2019) 5 Months*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-19B) Test #03  
(9/17/2019) 5 Months*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-20B) Test #04  
(10/7/2019) 5 Months*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-20B) Test #11  
(8/18/2020) 5 Months*

*Park Naturalist (H17NN-19) Test #01 (2/15/2019)*

*Parking Control Checker (F19AN-20) (2/25/2020)*

*Plan Checker - Plumbing (K41AN-20) Test #05 (10/11/2019)*

*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19) Test #25 (2/13/2019)*

*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19) Test #26 (2/25/2019)*

*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #08 (8/30/2019) 5  
Months*

*Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #16 (2/4/2020)*

*Police Recruit (F63NN-20) Test #17 (2/6/2020)*

*Public Affairs Assistant (EF3NN-20) Test #01 (2/13/2020)*

*Public Health Nurse (G19AN-20) Test #06 (8/13/2020)*

*Public Health Nurse Supervisor (G20NN-20) Test #04  
(8/6/2020)*

*Public Health Nutritionist (G21AN-19) Test #02 (8/19/2019)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral (J45AN-20C) Test #06  
(8/20/2020)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-18A) Test #03 (8/17/2018)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test #11 (2/7/2020)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-20A) Test #14 (8/20/2020)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-18B) Test #03 (8/17/2018)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-19B) Test #07 (8/15/2019)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #11 (2/7/2020)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #14 (8/7/2020)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-20B) Test #15 (8/20/2020)*  
*Recreation Assistant (H52NN-19) Test #01 (3/1/2019)*  
*Refuse Operator (JA2AN-20) Test #24 (2/7/2020) **4 Months***  
*Senior Electrical Inspector (K56NN-20) Test #01 (2/24/2020)*  
  
*Senior Electrical Inspector (K56NN-20) Test #02 (2/28/2020)*  
*Senior Scheduler (NJ0NN-20) Test #01 (2/25/2020)*  
*Senior Surveyor (K66NN-19) Test #02 (8/13/2019)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-18) Test #31 (9/24/2018)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #38 (8/15/2019)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-20) Test #41 (2/5/2020)*  
*Structural Engineer (KA1NN-20) Test #02 (2/7/2020)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

8. [21-041CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Matthew Deeter, Special Services Officer III-Armed Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Human Resources Director, Harbor Department  
*Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Valdoria who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from the Harbor Department were on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

9. [21-042CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY**

**PERIOD** - Miguel Munoz-Miranda, Special Services Officer III-Armed

*Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Human Resources Director, Harbor Department*

*Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Valdoria who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from the Harbor Department were on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

10. [21-037CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY**

**PERIOD** - Torry Richmond, Special Services Officer III-Armed

*Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Human Resources Director, Harbor Department*

*Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Valdoria who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from the Harbor Department were on the call to answer questions.

President Gonzalez Edmond asked if the employees will be coming back for an additional extension. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that if the employees continue to be successful, an additional extension will be necessary to complete their field training.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

11. [21-043CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED**

**CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION** - Equipment Operator I-III

*Communication from Fred Verdugo, Acting Director, Human Resources Department*

*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Goings who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from the Parks, Recreation and Marine, Water, Public Works, Harbor and Human Resources Departments were on the call to answer questions.

President Gonzalez Edmond thanked Ms. Goings for informing the Commission of where the revisions were located. It made it easier to locate them in the document.

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

12. [21-044CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED**

**CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Motor Sweeper Operator**

*Communication from Fred Verdugo, Acting Director, Human Resources Department*

*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Goings who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from the Public Works, Harbor and Human Resources Departments were on the call to answer questions.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Dowling, Ms. McDonald and Ms. Goings regarding the language related to recent paid experience under Minimum Requirements. Ms. McDonald requested to pull this item as there is a need for further discussion. Commissioner Dowling stated that he was not opposed to pulling the item.

President Gonzalez Edmond was under the impression that items coming before the Commission have been vetted out and discussions have taken place with affected departments. She stated that items should not be brought to the Commission if they are not ready as she does not want to give departments the impression that the Commission is delaying a process. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that there are no current plans to start the recruitment process for this classification specification, so there will not be a delay.

Commissioner Dowling made a motion to withdraw this item from the agenda and to bring it back in a couple of weeks after discussion has taken place.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, that the item be laid over to a future meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**



**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

13. [21-045CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED**

**CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION** - Personnel Assistant I-II

*Communication from Fred Verdugo, Acting Director, Human Resources Department*

*Staff report prepared by Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Ramos who briefed the Commission regarding this request.

Representatives from the Human Resources Department were on the call to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Phyllis O. Arias

14. **STANDING COMMITTEES**

*A. Executive Committee*

President Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that the Executive Committee met with Chief Luna to discuss items from the Racial Equity and Reconciliation Initiative report related to Civil Service. She stated that the Committee is still conducting its research and will be following up on some action items. Vice President Morrison stated that it was a good meeting. Commissioner Dowling, who was in attendance as an observer, stated that it was a fantastic effort from both the Police Department and staff.

*B. Recruitment and Selection Committee*

Commissioner Dowling stated that, in tandem with the work of the Executive Committee, the Recruitment and Selection Committee met to discuss items from the

Racial Equity and Reconciliation Initiative report related to Civil Service. The Committee requested that Civil Service staff work with the Police Department to provide a written response to some of the issues and concerns in the report specifically related to Recruitment and Selection. He stated that the Committee looks forward to working with the Police Department and having staff come back with the answers so that we can ensure that all recruitment is fair, equitable and free of bias.

*C. Special Projects Committee*

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that a Mock Hearing is scheduled for February 17th.

**15. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

*A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Slaten thanked Margaret Madden, Neighborhood Services Officer with the Department of Development Services, for collaborating with the division regarding outreaching to individuals in the community.

Ms. Slaten reported that she has been taking part in the Fire Recruit webinars. These are weekly sessions with an average of 30 people in attendance.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald stated that she is looking forward to great things this year. She stated that her division brought forth several classification specification revisions last year and will continue to bring them forward. She also plans to train her staff on how to apply rules and the rationale behind it so that they can provide an explanation to departments.

Ms. McDonald reported that planning meetings have taken place with various department and have included staff from the Recruitment and Outreach division. She stated that they have been going well.

Ms. McDonald thanked Vice President Morrison for her service.

*C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo thanked the Executive Committee for allowing her and Ms. Pen-Chhuon the opportunity to make a presentation regarding the closing of fiscal year 2020 along with any areas of savings that occurred.

Ms. Alamo reported that the LB Coast Project team has resumed its liaison program as well as its Change Champion meetings. Ms. Alamo will share any updates as they are received. She informed the Commission that she is fortunate to be a module lead for the LB Coast Project team.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Ms. Alamo did not mention this, but she is the project lead in the Performance Management System. She stated that we are very fortunate that she has been asked to be a part of the team.

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that two staff members have been assigned to work on revising forms, which is a discussion that has taken place at past Commission meetings. She stated that staff members have also been assigned to the Website Logo Committee. This committee will be responsible for looking at the Civil Service website and where logos are placed. Staff members have also been assigned to the Policies and Procedures Committee. Members of this committee will be looking at internal policies and procedures as some are outdated. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Ms. McDonald's group also has committees working on internal online testing processes.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that representatives from the Fire Department will be making a presentation at the first meeting in March.

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that staff will be taking part in a planning meeting to set our course for the year.

**16. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

*A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service*

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the revised draft policy is still being reviewed by the bargaining units. She will update the Commission as soon as she receives information.

**17. NEW BUSINESS**

President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to take this time to recognize Vice President Morrison as this is her last meeting. She highlighted Vice President Morrison's

career from the time she was a city employee to her time as a Commissioner. She thanked Vice President Morrison for her service. Vice President Morrison has resigned to become a full-time Special Education teacher. She is excited to know we have a teacher with passion and empathy and care for students and learning.

Commissioner Dowling thanked Vice President Morrison for her service. He has learned a great deal from her example especially in some of the hearings with her line of reasoning and questioning. He wished her the best and looks forward to hearing about some of her amazing work.

Commissioner Garnica echoed previous acknowledgements made by President Gonzalez Edmond and Commissioner Dowling. She stated she enjoys Vice President Morrison's points of view and listening and understanding from her perspective. She also stated that Vice President Morrison participated and contributed a great deal to the Commission. She is excited to have such a passionate person going into the classroom.

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she is appreciative to work with a Commission with members who are engaged, conscientious and active. She stated that Vice President Morrison's impact during hearings will be missed with her attention to detail and her objective nature. She enjoyed working with Vice President Morrison and wished her well on her new career.

Ms. Slaten shared with Vice President Morrison that is has been a pleasure working with her over the last few years. She appreciated her words of wisdom and feedback while working with her on the various committees. She stated that Vice President Morrison has been a wealth of knowledge with a different perspective.

Mr. Anderson congratulated Vice President Morrison on her career and thanked Vice President Morrison. He stated that is has been a pleasure working with her and she will be missed.

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated to Vice President Morrison that this is not the typical send off for a Commissioner. We will work with her schedule to be able to recognize her and provide her with a gift.

Vice President Morrison stated that this happened very quickly. She will be teaching at Nelson Academy as part of the Long Beach Unified School District. She is happy to obtain a teaching job but very sad to be leaving the Commission. She stated that it has been a pleasure and appreciates everything that staff does daily and enjoyed getting to know everyone. She is going to miss hearings as well because she believes in the importance of them.

President Gonzalez Edmond stated to Vice President Morrison that she will be missed. As a Special Education teacher, she will make a difference in the lives of her students and their families.

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 9:28 a.m.

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យអ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។