

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President  
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner  
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

## **FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 9:44 a.m.

### **FLAG SALUTE**

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Commissioner Dowling to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

### **ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather  
**Present:** Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director  
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer  
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer  
Marla Camerino, Executive Assistant  
JT Nagayama, City Clerk Specialist  
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst  
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst  
Veronica Robles Scott, Administrative Analyst  
Sylvana Tamura, Administrative Analyst

Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Energy Resources  
Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works  
Paula Gallegos, Administrative Officer, Police Department  
Todd Leland, Superintendent, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine  
Elsa Ramos, Public Health Professional, Department of Health and Human Services  
Fred Greco, Director of Maintenance, Harbor Department  
Ryan Van Andel, Fleet Finance Officer, Financial Management  
Stephanie Hardy, Retiree, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine  
Rosa Jackson, Retiree, Department of Health and Human Services  
Octavio Ramos, Retiree, Harbor Department  
Richard Steinhaus, Retiree, Financial Management

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.**

Krystal Allen, Administrative Aide for the Department of Public Works, addressed the Commission regarding her transfer to a different bureau within her Department. President Gonzalez Edmond informed Ms. Allen that Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director of Civil Service, would reach out to her.

1. [20-001CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of December 11, 2019*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 10):**

Commissioner Dowling requested additional information regarding Agenda Item No. 2. He mentioned that 61 applications were not accepted for the Personnel Analyst examination and wanted to know if it was due to a lack of qualifications. Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director, responded that it is due to applicants not meeting the minimum qualifications. Commissioner Arias commented that in the past staff have provided a report to the Commission for large recruitments, such as Fire and Police. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that staff will report back regarding Personnel Analyst.

Commissioner Arias commented on the Public Affairs Assistant bulletin in Agenda Item No. 3. She appreciates the explanation that was provided under Examination Weights. She commented that the language is very helpful and does not recall seeing it in the past. Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that staff have been working hard to make processes as transparent as possible so that individuals can have a better understanding.

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Consent Calendar Items (2 - 10). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

2. [20-002CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Deputy Chief Harbor Engineer Test #01 (Established 12/30/2019)*

*Fire Recruit (Established 12/18/19)*

*Nurse Practitioner Test #03 (Established 12/20/19)*

*Personnel Analyst (Established 12/20/19)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher - LATERAL Test #04 (Established 12/19/19)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN EXAM Test #10 (Established 12/19/19)*

*Public Safety Dispatcher - POST WAIVER Test #10 (Established 12/19/19)*

*Refuse Operator Test #23 (Established 12/19/19)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. [20-003CS](#)

**Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**

*Permit Center Supervisor*

*Public Affairs Assistant*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**4. [20-004CS](#)**

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Robert Kuo Cheng, Jr, Fire Captain, Fire Department (25 yrs., 4 mos.)*

*Kevin Davis, Police Officer, Police Department (27 yrs., 3 mos.)*

*Sharon Gates, Administrative Analyst III, Parks, Recreation and Marine (17 yrs., 1 mo.)*

*Robert Gonzales, Police Officer, Police Department (26 yrs., 2 mos.)*

*Stephanie Hardy, Marina Agent III, Parks, Recreation and Marine (35 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Rosa Jackson, Public Health Professional III, Health and Human Services (30 yrs., 1 mo.)*

*Joel Johnson, Police Officer, Police Department (29 yrs., 7 mos.)*

*Janet Katz, General Librarian, Library Services (13 yrs., 17 days)*

*Fernando Lujan, Equipment Mechanic I, Financial Management (10 yrs., 8 mos.)*

*Michael Manning, Business Information System, Technology and Innovation (16 yrs. 8 mos.)*

*Sandra Marrero, Systems Support Specialist IV, Technology and Innovation (20 yrs., 5 mos.)*

*Nancy Mora, Police Officer, Police Department (21 yrs., 4 mos.)*

*Octavio Ramos, Maintenance Assistant II, Harbor Department (27 yrs., 4 mos.)*

*Raoul Raymundo, Systems Support Specialist V, Technology and Innovation (36 yrs., 11 mos.)*

*Thomas Reynolds, Firefighter, Fire Department (19 yrs., 4 mos.)*

*John Simmons, Communication Specialist, Technology and Innovation (36 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Deborah Soto, Administrative Aide II, Parks, Recreation and*

*Marine (26 yrs., 5 mos.)  
Richard Steinhaus, Administrative Analyst III, Financial Management  
(35 yrs., 11 mos.)*

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Pizarro Winting, presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Stephanie Hardy, Marina Agent, for 35 years, 6 months of service to the City of Long Beach. Mr. Todd Leland, Superintendent of Marine Operations for the Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine, was present to recognize and highlight Ms. Hardy's career. The Commission congratulated Ms. Hardy on her retirement.

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Ms. Pizarro Winting, presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Rosa Jackson, Public Health Professional, for 30 years, 1 month of service to the City of Long Beach. Ms. Elsa Ramos, of the Health and Human Services Department, was present to recognize and highlight Ms. Jackson's career. The Commission congratulated Ms. Jackson on her retirement.

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Ms. Pizarro Winting, presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Octavio Ramos, Maintenance Assistant, for 27 years, 4 months of service to the City of Long Beach. Mr. Fred Greco, Director of Maintenance for the Harbor Department, was present to recognize and highlight Mr. Ramos' career. The Commission congratulated Mr. Ramos on his retirement.

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Ms. Pizarro Winting, presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Richard Steinhaus, Administrative Analyst, for 35 years, 11 months of service to the City of Long Beach. Mr. Ryan Van Andel, Fleet Finance Officer for the Financial Management Department, was present to recognize and highlight Mr. Steinhaus' career. The Commission congratulated Mr. Steinhaus on his retirement.

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. [20-005CS](#)

**Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**  
*Anthony Haskins, Water Utility Mechanic II, Water Department*

*(5 yrs., 3 mos.)  
Kara Nielsen, General Librarian, Library Services (17 yrs., 8 mos.)  
Kirstin Parker, Port Records Center Supervisor, Harbor Department (14 yrs., 1 mo.)  
Noel Santacruz, Special Services Officer III-Armed, Harbor Department (1 yr., 6 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [20-006CS](#) **Recommendation to approve transfer(s):**  
*Lourdes Alexander - Accounting Technician, Development Services to Accounting Technician, Public Works*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [20-007CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**  
*Reduction Appeal 02-R-1718  
Reduction Appeal 01-R-1819*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. [20-008CS](#) **Recommendation for Permanent Assignment to Former Classification - Kevin Gamble, Maintenance Assistant**  
*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works  
Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

9. [20-009CS](#) **Recommendation for Permanent Assignment to Former Classification - Thomas Murray, Street Maintenance Supervisor**  
*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public*

*Works*

*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**10. [20-010CS](#)**

**Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**

*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

*Administrative Analyst (EA8AN-19) Test #01 (7/29/2019)*

*Ambulance Operator (F63N1-19) Test #01 (7/8/2019)*

*Aquatics Supervisor (H31AN-19) Test #01 (7/16/2019)*

*Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #01 (1/24/2019)*

*Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #03 (7/16/2019)*

*Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #10 (1/9/2019)*

*Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #14 (8/1/2019)*

*Capital Projects Coordinator (EC6AN-19) Test #01 (1/10/2019)*

*Clerk Typist (D04AN-19) (1/4/2019)*

*Electrical and Instrumentation Supervisor (MG4NN-19) Test #01 (7/2/2019)*

*Fire Recruit (F64NN-19) (1/14/2019) - **3 Months***

*Garage Service Attendant (J23AN-19) Test #01 (1/18/2019)*

*Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter (I61NN-19) Test #01 (7/19/2019)*

*Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter (I61NN-19) Test #02 (8/1/2019)*

*Office Systems Analyst (IMDCE) (ND4AN-19A) Test #01 (7/2/2019)*

*Office Systems Analyst (IMDCE) (ND4AN-19A) Test #02 (7/25/2019)*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-19B) Test #01 (7/9/2019)*

*Office Systems Analyst - SD (ND4AN-19) Test #02 (7/3/2019)*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDNOC (ND4AN-19C) Test #01 (7/3/2019)*

*Office Systems Analyst - IMDNOC (ND4AN-19C) Test #02 (7/24/2019)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #05 (7/10/2019)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #06 (7/24/2019)*  
*Police Property & Supply Clerk (D51AN-19) (1/10/2019)*  
*Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #05 (1/10/2019)*  
*Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #06 (1/23/2019)*  
*Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #10 (7/9/2019)*  
*Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #11 (7/25/2019)*  
*Port Financial Analyst (ND1AN-19) Test #01 (7/3/2019)*  
*Port Financial Analyst (ND1AN-19) Test #02 (7/17/2019)*  
*Public Health Nutritionist (G21AN-19) Test #01 (7/22/2019)*  
*Real Estate Project Coordinator (ED5AN-19) (1/22/2019)*  
*Senior Accountant (C32NN-19) Test #01 (1/17/2019) - 2 Months*  
*Senior Civil Engineer (K52NN-19) Test #03 (1/29/2019)*  
*Senior Librarian (E31NN-18) Test #02 (1/23/2018)*  
*Senior Structural Engineer (K65NN-19) Test #02 (1/14/2019)*  
*Senior Structural Engineer (K65NN-19) Test #05 (7/22/2019)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-18) Test #23 (1/30/2018)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-18) Test #29 (7/12/2018)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #35 (1/16/2019)*  
*Supervisor-Stores & Property (C35NN-19) Test #01 (7/17/2019)*  
*Systems Technician (H70AN-19) Test #04 (7/31/2019)*  
*Water Treatment Operator (MA1AN-19B) Test #01 (7/31/2019)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

11. [20-011CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Brenda Ramirez, Customer Service Representative III  
*Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Energy Resources Department*  
*Staff Report prepared by Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Stanley Wang, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.



Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer with the Department of Energy Resources, was available to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias commented that the clarification she is seeking is for all four Extension of Probations being requested. She stated that in the appraisals, under Quantity of Work, it appears that none of the employees were rated appropriately as it relates to their talk time and "Ready" position and asked if this was accurate. Ms. Aguilar commented that the employees did not receive appropriate training due to an unapproved change in the curriculum. It is the department's expectation that once the employee receives the proper training, the employee will meet the performance standard by the end of their probation.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

12. [20-012CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Joshua Vazquez, Customer Service Representative III  
*Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Energy Resources Department*  
*Staff Report prepared by Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

13. [20-013CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Radiance Green, Customer Service Representative III  
*Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Energy Resources Department*  
*Staff Report prepared by Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**14. [20-014CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Yasmeen Ramirez, Customer Service Representative III

*Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer, Energy Resources Department*

*Staff Report prepared by Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**15. [20-015CS](#)**

**RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT** - Building Services Supervisor

*Communication from Paula Gallegos, Personnel Administrator, Police Department*

*Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Carolyn Pen, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the Police Department was available to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias asked staff when they anticipate having an Eligible List. Ms. Slaten responded that she anticipates the process beginning in Spring of 2020.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

16. [20-016CS](#)

WITHDRAWN

~~**RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE**~~

~~—Austin Craig, Police Officer~~

~~Communication from Robert G. Luna, Chief of Police, Police  
Department~~

~~Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst~~

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that the department requested to pull this item.

President Gonzalez Edmond asked if a reason was given. Ms. Slaten responded that the individual decided to stay with his current organization.

**This CS-Agenda Item was withdrawn.**

17. [20-017CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO ESTABLISH A COMMISSION  
SUBCOMMITTEE TO REVIEW THE CONCEPT OF THE CITY  
EMPLOYEE CREDIT SYSTEM**

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

President Gonzalez Edmond requested clarification on this item as she was not present at the last meeting. Ms. Pizarro Winting provided an overview of the information that was reported by Elizabeth Calixto. Commissioner Arias commented that this matter was brought to the Commission more than a year ago. It was discussed that perhaps Commissioner Arias could provide useful information to Subcommittee members.

President Gonzalez Edmond moved to approve President Gonzalez Edmond and Commissioner Dowling to the Ad-Hoc Subcommittee to study the City Employee Credit System.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by  
Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The  
motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

## **MANAGERS' REPORTS**

### **Recruitment & Selection**

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that staff are conducting Police Recruit testing. Staff facilitated a Pellet B test on Tuesday, January 7, 2020. Another one will be facilitated on Thursday, January 16, 2020, at the Water Treatment Plant. Staff plan to facilitate Pellet B testing at least twice a month.

### **Special Projects**

Ms. McDonald did not have any new information to report.

### **Administration Support Services**

Ms. Alamo did not have any new information to report.

### **Executive Director**

Ms. Pizarro Winting welcomed the Commission to a new year.

Ms. Pizarro Winting is happy to report that she attended City Council on Tuesday, January 7, 2020 where an item on the agenda to modify an old salary schedule for Commissioners was approved and updated. The Mayor acknowledged that Civil Service has a unique commitment to conduct hearings. He asked that when the documentation is brought back to City Council that it reflects the needs of the Civil Service Commission specifically. President Gonzalez Edmond asked if this item would ever come to the Commission. Mr. Anderson said it would not because it would be amending the citywide Salary Resolution that affects all Commissions. President Gonzalez Edmond stated that hearings are a big part of the Commission. She also thanked staff for pulling together the information she requested so quickly. Commissioner Garnica wanted clarification as to whether the modification would apply to all Commissions or if it is specific to Civil Service. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that it was specific to Civil Service.

Ms. Pizarro Winting acknowledged Ms. Camerino for taking the initiative to utilize all technology available in the Civic Chambers.

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission it is her hope, with their approval, that we conduct quarterly Commission meetings offsite. She will provide them with a list of locations so that they can prioritize which ones they would be interested in visiting first. President Gonzalez Edmond stated that it would be a great idea. Commissioner Garnica stated that the tour of the Water Department was very insightful.

Ms. Pizarro Winting looks forward to meeting everyone on the 4th floor to follow up on the logo.

President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to thank the Department for including the Commission in the offsite teambuilding.

### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

There was no unfinished business discussed.

### **NEW BUSINESS**

There was no new business discussed.

### **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.**

There were no comments from the public.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 10:42 a.m.

### **NO HEARING**

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។