

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 21, 2019
415 W OCEAN BOULEVARD, LONG BEACH
HARBOR DEPARTMENT, MULTIPURPOSE
ROOM LOBBY LEVEL, 8:00 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:08 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director of Civil Service, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Joel Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana
Present: Gonzalez Edmond

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer
Marla Camerino, Executive Assistant
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst
Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst
Veronica Robles-Scott, Administrative Analyst

Maria Macias, Personnel Assistant
David Honey, Manager-Administration, Fire Department
Meg Rau, Administrative Officer, Fire Department
Dana Anderson, Manager – Labor Relations, Human Resources Department
Charlene Wynne, Manager, Harbor Department
Debbie Mills, Police Department

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

None

1. [19-141CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
Regular Meeting of July 17, 2019
Dismissal Hearing 07-D-1718 Minutes of July 10 & 17, 2019

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve the Regular Minutes of July 17, 2019. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve the Dismissal Hearing (07-D-1718) Minutes of July 10 and 17, 2019. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 12):

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve Consent Calendar Items 2-5, 7 and 10-12, as amended, except for Items 6, 8 and 9. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

2. [19-142CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Administrative Analyst Test #01 (Established 07/29/19)
Aquatics Supervisor Test #01 (Established 07/16/19)
Assistant Administrative Analyst Test #03 (Established 07/16/19)
Business Systems Specialist Test #14 (Established 08/01/19)
Civil Engineer Test #07 (Established 07/17/19)
Electrician Test #03 (Established 08/02/19)
Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter Test #01 (Established 07/19/19)
Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter Test #02 (Established 08/01/19)
General Librarian (Established 08/09/19)
Office Systems Analyst - IMDBA Test #01 (Established 08/06/19)
Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA Test #02 (Established 08/14/19)
Office Systems Analyst - IMDCE Test #02 (Established 07/25/19)
Office Systems Analyst - IMDNOC Test #02 (Established 07/24/19)
Office Systems Analyst - IMDNOC Test #03 (Established 08/14/19)
Police Officer - Lateral Test #06 (Established 07/24/19)
Police Officer - Lateral Test #07 (Established 08/15/19)
Police Recruit Test #11 (Established 07/25/19)
Port Financial Analyst Test #02 (Established 07/17/19)
Public Health Nutritionist Test #01 (Established 07/22/19)
Public Safety Dispatcher - POST WAIVER Test #07 (Established 08/15/19)
Refuse Operator Test #20 (Established 08/15/19)
Senior Librarian (Established 08/07/19)
Senior Structural Engineer Test #05 (Established 07/22/19)
Senior Surveyor Test #02 (Established 08/13/19)
Special Services Officer Test #38 (Established 08/15/19)
Structural Engineer Test #01 (Established 07/22/19)
Supervisor-Stores & Property Test #01 (Established 07/17/19)
Systems Technician Test #04 (Established 07/31/19)
Water Treatment Operator Test #01 (Established 07/31/19)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

3. [19-143CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file bulletin(s):**
Nurse Practitioner

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

4. [19-144CS](#) **Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**
Anthony Arevalo, Capital Projects Coordinator I, Public Works (30 yrs., 4 days)
Jerry Allen Carter, Police Officer, Police Department (28 yrs.)
Joanne Dolan, Emergency Med Education Coordinator, Fire Department (21 yrs., 8 mos.)
Glenn W. Fong, Hazardous Materials Specialist I, Health Department (34 yrs., 9 mos.)
Rollie Harvey III, Fleet Services Supervisor II, Public Works (19 yrs., 3 mos.)
Eric J. Lyon, General Maintenance Supervisor II, Parks, Recreation & Marine (5 yrs., 3 days)
Christopher McLinden, Gas Distribution Supervisor I, Energy Resources (34 yrs., 5 mos.)
Craig Harrison Sink, Construction Inspector II, Harbor Department (11 yrs.)

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Winting presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Anthony Arevalo, Capital Projects Coordinator I, for 30 years, 4 days, of distinguished and exemplary service to the City of Long Beach. The Commission congratulated Mr. Arevalo on his retirement. A representative from the Public Works Department recognized and highlighted Mr. Arevalo's career with the City of Long Beach.

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Winting presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Glenn Fong, Hazardous Materials Specialist I, for 34 years, 9 months, of distinguished and

exemplary service to the City of Long Beach. The Commission congratulated Mr. Fong on his retirement. A representative from the Health and Human Services Department recognized and highlighted Mr. Fong's career with the City of Long Beach.

Mr. Jerry Carter was not available to attend; however, a representative from the Police Department was available to highlight Mr. Carter's career and accepted his Certificate of Appreciation on his behalf.

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [19-145CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Abdullatif Weems Ahmad, Refuse Operator I, Public Works (8 mos., 8 days)

Kristen Anne Berg, Environmental Specialist I, Harbor Department (11 yrs., 2 mos.)

Katherine-Lynn Caramucci, Public Safety Dispatcher II, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (1 yr., 4 mos.)

Vincent Tyler Castillo, Police Officer, Police Department (7 mos.)

Julie Farrell, Customer Service Representative, Energy Resources (7 yrs., 11 mos.)

Tommy Gonzales, Equipment Mechanic I, Public Works (11 mos., 20 days)

Bryce Alan Hurley, Special Services Officer III, Police Department (7 mos., 11 days)

Maria Millares, Customer Service Representative, Energy Resources (2 yrs., 5 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [19-150CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

Nickolas Colbert - Special Services Officer III, Airport to Special Services Officer III, Police

Christopher Dannan - Special Services Officer III, Airport to

Special Services Officer III, Police
Matthew Depew - Storekeeper II, Fire to Storekeeper II,
Water
Adam Jensen - Special Services Officer III, Airport to Special
Services Officer III, Police
Patricia Kampa - Special Services Officer III, Airport to
Special Services Officer III, Police
Roeun Khiev - Special Services Officer III, Airport to Special
Services Officer III, Police
Jeffrey Litzinger - Special Services Officer III, Airport to
Special Services Officer III, Police
Robert Ware - Special Services Officer III, Airport to Special
Services Officer III, Police

Commissioner Arias informed the Commission that she is hesitant to approve this item without any background information as with other agenda items. A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, Ms. Winting, Mr. Honey, Ms. Debbie Mills, Ms. Alamo and Ms. Dana Anderson regarding transfers for the Special Services Officers and the Civil Service Policy related to transfers.

The transfers of the Special Services Officers will be held until further information is received.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to postpone the transfers of the Special Services Officers. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve the transfer of Matthew Depew. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

7. [19-146CS](#) **Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):**
Reduction Appeal 01-R-1718, Suggested Dates: August 28 and September 4, 2019

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

8. [19-147CS](#) **Recommendation for Permanent Reassignment After Rehabilitation**
- Esteban Hernandez-Rojas, Refuse Operator I to Parking Control Checker I
a. *Communication from Alejandrina Basquez, Director of Human Resources*
b. *Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Commissioner Arias wanted to know how far back a Department is allowed to use requisitions and wanted to know what the rule was. A discussion ensued with Commissioner Arias, Ms. Winting, Ms. Slaten, Ms. McDonald, and Ms. Alamo regarding requisitions and the Civil Service Policy related to requisitions.

Commissioner Arias made a motion to approve this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

9. [19-151CS](#) **Recommendation to Transfer from Unclassified to Classified Service** - Danielle Ornelas, Port Security Systems Operator
Communication from Stacey Lewis, Human Resources Director, Harbor Department
Staff report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and
Susana Gonzalez Edmond

10. [19-152CS](#) **Recommendation to Transfer from Unclassified to Classified Service** - Miguel Zatarain, Jr., Electrical Supervisor, Harbor Department
Communication from Stacey Lewis, Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department
Staff report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

11. [19-153CS](#) **Recommendation for Extension of Provisional Appointment** - Nathaniel Buck, Fernando Gallegos, Ruben Garcia, Seward Khem, and Bradley Smith, Fire Engineers
Communication from Meg Rau, Administrative Officer, Fire Department
Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

12. [19-148CS](#) **Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**
Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Accountant (C01AN-19) Test #01 (2/26/2019)
Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #02 (2/28/2019)
Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-18) Test #06 (8/9/2018)
Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #11 (2/21/2019)
Civil Engineering Associate (K13NN-19) Test #04 (2/13/2019)
Communication Specialist (H68AN-19) Test #02 (2/28/2019)
Housing Specialist (H66AN-18) (8/29/2018)
Park Naturalist (H17NN-19) Test #01 (2/15/2019)
Plan Checker - Plumbing (K41AN-19) Test #02 (2/15/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19) Test #25 (2/13/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19) Test #26 (2/25/2019)

Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #07 (2/28/2019)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-18A) Test #03 (8/17/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-18B) Test #03 (8/17/2018)
Recreation Assistant (H52NN-19) Test #01 (3/1/2019)
Street Maintenance Supervisor (J61AN-18) (8/8/2018)
Systems Support Specialist (H69AN-18) Test #07 (8/8/2018)
Water Utility Mechanic (M42AN-19) Test #01 (2/14/2019)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

13. [19-154CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE -**
Emma Kursar, Public Health Nurse III
Communication from Jodie Griner, Administrative Officer, Health and Human Services
Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

Ms. Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

14. [19-155CS](#) WITHDRAWN
~~**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD**~~ Brenda Gastelum, Water Utility Mechanic I
~~Communication from Christopher J. Garner, General Manager, Water Department~~
Staff Report prepared by Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst

This CS-Agenda Item was withdrawn.

15. [19-156CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD - Nash Theofanos, Special Services Officer III-Armed
Communication from Stacey Lewis, Human Resources Director, Harbor Department
Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

Ms. Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

16. 19-157CS

RECOMMENDATION TO FORM A COMMISSION SUBCOMMITTEE TO REVIEW USE OF WONDERLIC TEST INSTRUMENT

Ms. Winting informed the Commission that at this time they are only appointing Commissioners to the Subcommittee who will meet at a later date to discuss in detail.

President Gonzalez Edmond nominated Vice President Morrison and Commissioner Arias to the Subcommittee.

A motion was made by President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

17. [19-149CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR CONSIDERATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S REPORT - Disability Retirement Appeal 09-DR-1617 / Mailed to CSC on June 21, 2019
Report prepared by Carmen D. Snuggs, Administrative Law Judge

Ms. Winting advised the Commission that they received a copy of the

ALJ report in their agenda packet.

Due to the sensitivity of the information being discussed, it was suggested that the Commission move this item to the end of the agenda so that they can go into closed session.

A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to hear this item at the end of the agenda in Closed Session. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

After hearing all comments from the public, a motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to move into closed session. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

After returning from closed session, the Commission voted to adopt the ALJ report.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

MANAGERS' REPORTS

Recruitment and Selection

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that on September 6 and 7, 2019 staff will be conducting Police Recruit testing.

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that staff will be attending Fleet Week at the Port

of Los Angeles on August 30 through September 2, 2019. This is an opportunity for staff to reach out to military vets and first responders.

Ms. Slaten thanked Fire Department and her team for their work with the Fire Engineer exam.

Special Projects

Ms. McDonald welcomed Ms. Winting to Civil Service.

Ms. McDonald congratulated Keion Bryant who was recently hired by Public Works as their Non-Career Administrative Analyst. Mr. Bryant will continue to work in Civil Service under the Recruitment and Selection Division.

Administration Support Services

Ms. Alamo welcomed Ms. Winting to Civil Service as well.

Ms. Alamo informed the Commission that the division is currently working on closing out Fiscal Year 2019. The division is working on estimates to close and looking at salary savings as well as impacts to balance out the budget. This information is due to the Budget Office at the end of August. Civil Service will be presenting its proposed budget for Fiscal Year 2020 on September 3, 2019, to City Council.

Ms. Alamo would like to thank Administration Support Services staff for taking care of a lot of work while she was out on vacation.

Executive Director

Ms. Winting is happy to be back and thanked the Commission for the opportunity to serve as Executive Director. She has been meeting with staff and also had the opportunity to attend the Fire Engineer exam. In addition, she attended a brainstorming meeting with the Office of Innovation regarding Police Recruit and it is only Day 3. She did make it clear that she loves working for the city and is here to stay.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Commissioner Arias informed the Commission that she is a bit troubled by the

meeting situation. She wanted to know if the Civil Service Commission has a permanent meeting location. It was discussed that staff will agendaize this as an item for the Commission to discuss at its next regularly scheduled meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

None

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

Charlene Wynne, Manager with Harbor Department, wanted to thank the Commission for forming a Subcommittee to evaluate the Wonderlic testing component and expressed her concern regarding the motivation and personality questions that are a part of the Administrative Aide, Assistant Administrative Analyst and Administrative Analyst exams.

Commissioner Garnica thanked David Honey for his time and service to the Commission and welcomed Ms. Winting to Civil Service.

ADJOURNMENT

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 9:19 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

**បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។**