

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, MAY 10, 2023
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
CIVIC CHAMBERS, 9:00 AM**

Erik Fallis, President
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

President Fallis called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

David Espinoza, representing the Harbor Department, led the flag salute.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Present:

Commissioners Joel Garnica

Absent:

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS REGARDING THE AGENDA.**

There were no comments from the public.

2. [23-141CS](#)

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of April 26, 2023

*Dismissal Hearing 03-D-1920 Minutes of September 14, 21,
28, & October 5, 12, 21, 2022*

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, to approve Regular Meeting Minutes of April 26, 2023. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, to approve Dismissal Hearing Minutes 03-D-1920 of September 14, 21,28 & October 5, 12, 21, 2022. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 - 6):

Vice President Gonzalez Edmond requested items 3 & 4 be pulled for discussion.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Consent Calendar Items 5 & 6, except for items 3 & 4. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

3. [23-142CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Administrative Analyst I-IV

Ambulance Operator Test #01

Building Maintenance Engineer Test #03

Capital Projects Coordinator I-IV Test #05

Civil Engineer Test #32

Environmental Health Specialist I-IV Test #07

Public Health Nutritionist I-III Test #05

*Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV 911 Dispatcher (Entry Level -
NTN Exam) Test #44*

Senior Mechanical Engineer Test #01

There was a discussion between the Commission and staff on the difference between “disqualified” and “failed to qualify” on the Administrative Analyst exam results. In addition, the Commission requested that the number of approved candidates be added to exam results where there are multiple tests in a fiscal year.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

4. [23-143CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Malcolm Evans, Police Sergeant, Police Department, (25 yrs., 5 mos.)

Mercedes Prado, Administrative Analyst III, Development Services, (17 yrs., 9 mos.)

Salvador Ramirez, Building Maintenance Engineer, Harbor, (30 yrs., 2 mos.)

Leona Utu, Clerk Typist III, Harbor Department (34 yrs., 10 mos.)

Ryan Watson, Police Lieutenant, Police Department, (26 yrs., 6 mos.)

Ronney Wong, Spcl Scs Of IV-Arm Arpt Pc Of, Police Department, (24 yrs., 7 mos.)

Eduardo Liwanag, Clerk Typist III, Police Department, (36 yrs., 4 mos.)

The Commission inquired if staff is reaching out to retirees, and Ms. Smay explained that retirees have been contacted but the method has not worked. Mrs. Smay will be reaching out to all retirees with a new method and hopes to have more participation at future meetings. The Commission wants to thank all retirees for their years of service.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

5. [23-144CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Jimmy Luera, Police Officer, Police Department, (3 yrs. 2 mos.)

Jacqueline Ventura, Clerk Typist III, Police Department, (6 yrs., 6 mos.)

Zorah Flanagan, Accounting Clerk III, Airport, (17 yrs., 8 days)

Patricia Alvarado, Accounting Clerk III, Public Works, (3 yrs., 3 mos.)

Armando Gonzalez, Commercial Diver II, Harbor, (3 yrs., 7 mos.)

Maritza Bravo, Civil Engineering Assistant, Harbor, (4 mos., 9 days)

Luis Vital Valles, Maintenance Assistant III, Public Works, (3 yrs., 2 mos.)

Charlette Streater, Refuse Operator I, Public Works, (8 mos., 21 days)

Edgar Mijares, Refuse Operator I, Public Works, (4 yrs., 7 mos.)

Kendra Meadows, Police Officer, Police Department, (3 yrs., 7 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [23-145CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

Samuel Zapata IV - Maintenance Assistant III, Parks, Marine, and Recreation, to Maintenance Assistant III, Public Works

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

7. [23-146CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED

CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Accounting Clerk I-III

Staff report prepared by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Barajas, who briefed the Commission on this item.

The Commission and staff discussed the format of the “requirements to file” section of classification specifications and suggested that there be consistency in the format for the bulletins as well. Staff acknowledged the request.

A motion was made by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

8. [23-148CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN- Accounting Clerk I-III

Presentation by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Barajas, who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

9. [23-149CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN- Clerk

Supervisor

Presentation by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Herrera, who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

10. [23-150CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN- Combination

Building Inspector Aide I-II

Presentation by Donnell Russell Jauregui, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Russell Jauregui, who briefed the Commission on this item.

The Commission and staff discussed the requirements to file and commented that there was more consistency and clarity when college units are defined as a specific number of semester or quarter units.

A motion was made by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

11. [23-151CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND NON-CAREER HOURS -

Austin Watkins, Ambulance Operator, NC

Communication from Sarah Green, Administrative Officer, Fire Department

Staff report prepared by Stephanie Herrera, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Herrera, who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

12. [23-152CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO CONVERT ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF MAINTENANCE FROM CLASSIFIED TO UNCLASSIFIED SERVICE

Communication from Sandy Witz, Director of Human Resources, Harbor

Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the Commission on this item.

A discussion began between the Commission and staff about the Civil Service Rules definition of the unclassified service, and whether the Commission should review the rules to determine if changes are needed to accommodate the evolving and changing needs of the City. There were additional comments regarding how position titles can sometimes be misleading for applicants, and the Commission recommended that staff look at the appropriateness of job titles as classifications come up.

A motion was made by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

13. [23-153CS](#)

**RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION COMMITTEE -
RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING PROTEST OF EXAMINATION
ITEM(S) - Fire Engineer**

Report presented by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond

Vice President Gonzalez Edmond briefed the Commission on the recommendation regarding the protest of examination item(s).

The Commission agreed with the recommendations of the subcommittee to approve staff's recommendations.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Gonzalez Edmond, to approve the subcommittee's recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Erik Fallis

Absent: 1 - Joen Garnica

14. STANDING COMMITTEE

Recruitment and Selection Committee

Vice President Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that the Committee is looking for dates to reconvene the Labor Management Committee. She is looking forward to the selection of a new chair for the Recruitment and Selection Committee following the completion of this series of meetings with the Labor Management Committee.

15. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Administration and Support Services Division – Maria Alamo

B. Executive Director – Christina Pizarro Winting

A. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo introduced her new Administrative and Support Services team, which now includes Ms. Isela Gonzalez who was working in the Recruitment and Outreach Services Division in the Civil Service Department.

The Commission highlighted the work the division is doing and congratulated Ms. Alamo on her leadership and great work.

B. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the department values promoting team members and is happy to promote staff from within the department. There were also updates on the revision of The Civil Service Annual Report and Ms. Pizarro Winting advised the Commission that it will be shared with the organization. Long Beach has been designated as a Fair Chance City which will break down barriers in applying for the open positions, and Civil Service job bulletins will be updated to reflect the change. Mr. Atoy Wilson was introduced as the newest Deputy City Attorney who will assist Mr. Anderson with the Civil Service Commission. Mr. Wilson introduced himself and mentioned that he comes from the private sector in the area of employment law.

Vice President Gonzalez Edmond thanked the staff for the work that is being done with recruitment.

16. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Commissioner Arias wanted an update on the next planning meeting, and Ms. Pizarro Winting will be looking at dates for the meeting before Commission Arias leaves the Commission.

Commissioner Arias asked Human Resources about the Exit Interview data, and Mr. Ficker, Human Resources Officer, informed the Commission that the department is working with the Technology Services department who is working on formatting the data. Mr. Ficker stated that the data will be available to share within the next two months.

17. NEW BUSINESS

No new business at this time.

18. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

President Fallis wished all the mothers a very happy Mother’s Day.

ADJOURNMENT

Vice President Gonzalez Edmond requested that the Commission adjourn in memory of Rick Cameron who worked for the Harbor Department for 23 years. President Fallis adjourned the meeting in memory of Mr. Cameron at 10:03 a.m.

I, Julia Smay, Executive Assistant, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។