

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 4, 2023
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD
CIVIC CHAMBERS, 9:00 AM**

Joen Garnica, President
Erik Fallis, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINAL AGENDA AND MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 9:22 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

Michael Goldschmidt, representing the Harbor Department, led the flag salute.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Present:

Commissioners Erik Fallis

Absent:

President Garnica stated for the record that “Public Comments” will be more specific for future meetings. The first call for “Public Comments” will be for matters that are regarding the agenda, and the second call for “Public Comments” will be for matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

There were no comments from the public.

2. [23-001CS](#)

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of December 7, 2022

Special Meeting of December 14, 2022

Dismissal Hearing 03-D-1920 September 14, 2022

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve minutes of regular meeting of December 7, 2022. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve minutes of special meeting of December 14, 2022. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

Minutes of dismissal hearing 03-D-1920 September 14, 2022 was withdrawn.

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 - 6):

Passed the Consent Calendar

President Garnica pulled items 3, 5, and 6.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Consent Calendar Item 4, except for items 3, 5, & 6. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

3. [23-002CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Microbiologist I-III Test #06

Personnel Analyst I-IV

Public Health Nurse I-III (Homeless Services) Test #02

Public Health Nutritionist I-III Test #02

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - NTN EXAM Test #37

Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV - POST WAIVER Test #28

Refuse Operator I-III Test #36

Senior Equipment Operator - Crane Test #02

President Garnica inquired about how many openings the Public Safety Dispatcher I-IV-NTN have on average. Staff responded that there are around 17 vacancies at a time, and President Garnica asked if staff can remind the Commission on what efforts are being done to work to get a handle on the number of vacancies for this role. Ms. Slaten provided a brief report on the recruitment work being done for this role, and further discussion about recruitment, retention, and other challenges with this role continued between the Commission and staff.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

4. [23-003CS](#) **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**
Administrative Analyst I-IV

5. [23-004CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Timothy Everts, Police Sergeant, Police Department, (29 yrs., 25 days)
Steven Wright, Gas Field Service Representative III, Energy Resources, (16 yrs., 5 mos.)
David Marander, Police Sergeant, Police Department, (28 yrs., 9 mos.)
George Nogueira, Police Officer, Police Department, (21 yrs., 10 mos.)
Richard Cranston, Administrative Analyst II, Parks, Recreation, and Marine, (14 yrs., 8 mos.)
Robert Chow, Civil Engineering Associate, Harbor Department, (31 yrs., 9 mos.)
Donald Goodman, Police Officer, Police Department, (30 yrs., 9 mos.)
Donald Gordon, Water Utility Mechanic II, Water Department, (31 yrs., 6 mos.)
David Hernandez, Garage Service Attendant II, Financial Management, (17 yrs., 7 mos.)
Brett Hunter, Firefighter, Fire Department, (22 yrs., 11 mos.)
Fidel-Rodelyn Manago, Civil Engineering Associate, Harbor Department, (21 yrs., 2 mos.)
Billy Noda, Fire Engineer, Fire Department, (24 yrs., 8 mos.)
James Richardson, Police Lieutenant, Police Department, (26 yrs., 11 mos.)
Shea Robertson, Police Officer, Police Department, (19 yrs., 7 mos.)
Brad Scavone, Police Officer, Police Department, (29 yrs., 3 mos.)
Kevin Scott, Firefighter, Fire Department, (19 yrs., 2 mos.)
Willie Sims, Refuse Operator IV, Public Works, (24 yrs., 11 mos.)
Darren Strecker, Fire Engineer, Fire Department, (19 yrs., 2 mos.)
Kimarie Vestre, Marina Supervisor II, Parks, Recreation, and Marine, (38 yrs., 4 mos.)
Ray Woolhether, Principal Building Inspector, Development Services, (17 yrs., 6 mos.)
Steven Wright, Gas Field Service Representative III, Energy

Resources, (16 yrs., 5 mos.)

President Garnica inquired if all the retirements are indicative of employees retiring at the end of the year since there are quite a few on the list, and Ms. Pizarro Winting indicated that President Garnica's observation is correct. President Garnica also inquired about the work being done by departments regarding staffing after retirements, and Ms. Pizarro Winting explained that departments are advising Civil Service staff of upcoming retirements, and staff, at times, are extending the eligible list until a new list is created. Further discussion between the Commission and staff took place on this matter.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

6. [23-005CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Michael Parada, Customer Service Representative II, Public Works, (1 mos., 20 days)

Joshua Sanchez, General Librarian, Library Services, (5 yrs., 11 mos.)

Jaime Heller, General Librarian, Library Services, (3 mos.)

Alexander Cevallos, Storekeeper II, Water Department, (12 yrs., 9 mos.)

Daniel Constable, Police Officer, Police Department, (4 yrs., 24 days)

Cody Cloughesy, Fire Recruit, Fire Department, (1 mo.)

Manny Banuelos, Spcl Scs of III-Arm Arpt PC Of, Police Department, (4 yrs., 22 days)

Jorge Caldera Rodriguez, Tree Trimmer I, Public Works, (5 mos. 24 days)

Tiffany Forte, Personnel Analyst I-Conf, Human Resources, (7 mos.)

Kosta Grubbich, Traffic Signal Technician I, Public Works, (10 yrs., 6 mos.)

Jaime Heller, General Librarian, Library Services, (3 mos.)

Lawrence Henderson, Refuse Operator I, Public Works, (1 mo. 16 days)

Valeria Madrid, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department, (5 mos. 14 days)

Victoria Moon, Administrative Analyst III, Water Department, (3 yrs., 5 mos.)

Dylan Zahnter, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department, (1 yrs., 6 mos.)

Miguel Zuniga, Survey Technician, Harbor Department, (1 yr., 2 mos.)

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond noted that there were resignations from Library Services in which the employees were with the department a short period of time, and Ms. Pizarro Winting explained that there have been safety and pay issues, and the staff is working with Library Services to address those concerns. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond suggested bringing a report to the Commission on the work being done to address safety and retention, including the work that Human Resources is doing to

support these issues. Ms. Pizarro Winting acknowledged the request.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

REGULAR AGENDA

7. [23-006CS](#)

RECRUITMENT & SELECTION COMMITTEE - RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING PROTEST OF EXAMINATION ITEM(S) - FIRE CAPTAIN

Report presented by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond

Ms. Pizarro Winting gave a brief introduction on this item and introduced Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, who briefed the Commission on the committee's recommendations regarding the protests.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

8. [23-007CS](#) **SPECIAL PROJECTS COMMITTEE - REVIEW OF BULLETIN PROCESS**

Report presented by Commissioner Arias

Commissioner Arias briefed the Commission on the committee's findings regarding this item. The committee reviewed whether job bulletins should be moved to the regular agenda, and whether such move would be excessively time consuming during the meetings. The committee has asked staff to conduct a regular agenda bulletin presentation at a future meeting for the Commission to assess what moving bulletins to the regular agenda would look like and how it would impact time. Ms. Pizarro Winting mentioned that the staff will assess whether this can be done at the next meeting in January to make sure this item continues to move forward.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to received and filed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

9. [23-008CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REDUCTION OF ELIGIBLE LIST - Payroll/Personnel Assistant (Article IV, Section 26)**

Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

10. [23-009CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE BULLETIN-**
Payroll/Personnel Assistant I-III

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

11. [23-010CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION TO REQUEST PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT** - Tracy Tafaoimalo, Clerk Supervisor
Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer, Public Works
Staff report prepared by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Moses, who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Arias commented on the overly redacted application for this item, and how important it is for the Commission to be able to review this information. Ms. Pizarro Winting acknowledged the redaction issues and will work with Mr. Anderson to provide training for staff on proper redaction.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

12. [23-011CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY
PERIOD** - Carolyn Dias-Rodriguez, Payroll/Personnel Assistant
II

*Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer,
Health and Human Services*

Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the
Commission on this item.

Commissioner Arias pointed out that the Commission did not receive
this request within the 30-day timeframe which was designed in part
to protect the employee and wanted to remind departments that
there is a reason for the 30-day requirement and to adhere to this
requirement.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by
Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve
recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen
Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

13. [23-012CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY

PERIOD - Juan Cardenas, Gas Construction Worker I

*Communication from Sandra Aguilar, Personnel Officer,
Energy Resources*

Staff report prepared by Levi Sinkler, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Sinkler, who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Arias mentioned that the Commission did not receive this request within the 30-day timeframe, and Ms. Aguilar explained that the employee took a leave of absence and has been placed on modified duty. His probationary period is forecasted to end in February, depending on when he gets cleared to return to work. While the employee is on modified duty, he's not contributing any hours toward his probationary period. Once the employee returns to his regular assigned duties, he would continue his probationary period.

Commissioner Arias asked that an explanation be added to the report when employee extensions do not meet the 30-day timeframe. Staff acknowledged the request.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

14. [23-013CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY

PERIOD - Shannon Dotson, Tree Trimmer I

*Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer,
Public Works*

Staff report prepared by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Moses, who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Arias pointed out that this request did not meet the 30-day timeframe and asked the department to provide an explanation. Joshua Hickman, Public Works Department Business Operations, explained that the bulletin required a commercial license at the time of hire, but the employees did not have a commercial license at the time of hire, but the department continued with the onboarding process, which was an oversight by the department. Further discussion between the Commission and staff continued regarding this oversight and certification requirement for this role.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

15. [23-014CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY

PERIOD - Cristian Vizcarra, Tree Trimmer I

*Communication from Dawn Henderson, Personnel Officer,
Public Works*

Staff report prepared by Tarsha Moses, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Moses, who briefed the Commission on this item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

16. [23-015CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION
OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Andrew Galindo, Harbor Patrol

Officer II

*Communication from Sandy Witz, Director of Human
Resources, Harbor Department*

Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the
Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond,
seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve
recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen
Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

17. [23-016CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION
OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Francisco Jimenez, Harbor

Patrol Officer II

*Communication from Sandy Witz, Director of Human
Resources, Harbor Department*

Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the Commission on this item.

Commissioner Gonzalez commented that training has been hard to provide due to COVID-19 closures and asked how the Commission will know if an employee has completed the required training for the position. Michael Goldschmidt, Harbor Department Security Division, explained that the trainings were being offered at El Camino College, and many of the academy staff contracted COVID, which led to training being canceled for weeks. These individuals have since completed their required academy training and are actively engaged in the internal field training program within the Harbor Department.

Commissioner Arias commented that this is the position that was changed to extend the probationary period in the first place, because in the past, the Commission had to extend multiple times. Mr. Goldschmidt agreed and explained that Harbor Patrol officers had to come for probationary extensions, because the length of the training exceeded the length of probation.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

18. [23-017CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION
OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Armando Yanez Jimenez,

Harbor Patrol Officer II

*Communication from Sandy Witz, Director of Human
Resources, Harbor Department*

Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the
Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by
Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve
recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen
Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

19. [23-018CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION
OF PROBATIONARY PERIOD** - Anthony Zankich, Harbor Patrol
Officer II

*Communication from Sandy Witz, Director of Human
Resources, Harbor Department*

Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Cano, who briefed the
Commission on this item.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by
Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve
recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen
Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

20. [23-019CS](#)

**PRESENTATION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE FY2022 YEAR-END
BUDGET**

*Presentation by Maria Alamo, Administrative Support Services
Division*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Alamo to present the Civil Service FY 2022 Year-End Budget.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked if the gaps in the 3.5 million versus to 3.1 million is because the department was not fully staffed the entire fiscal year. Ms. Alamo agreed and provided examples of the vacancies and its impact on the budget. Further discussion between the Commission and staff continued regarding budgeting, Commission expenditures, and total allocated budget for the fiscal year. The commission requested a Commission Specific Budgeting report. Staff acknowledged the request. The Commission thanked Ms. Alamo for her thorough report.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to received and filed. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Susana Gonzalez Edmond and Joen Garnica

Absent: 1 - Erik Fallis

21. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

C. Special Projects Committee

A. Executive Committee

President Garnica informed the Commission that the committee met before the holiday break and will produce a full report at the next Commission meeting.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

No report at this time.

C. Special Projects Committee

Commissioner Arias informed that Commission that a report has already been provided.

22. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division – Crystal Slaten

B. Employment Services Division – Caprice McDonald

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Since Ms. Slaten was not available to provide a report, Ms. Pizarro Winting provided the Executive Director report.

Ms. Pizarro Winting provided information on the Emergency Homeless meetings that are occurring with department heads and contributions that the department and Commission will be providing to these efforts.

Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked the Commission and staff on the work that was done for this agenda.

Ms. Pizarro Winting noted the Commission's recommendations regarding extensions and will update the forms regarding the 30-day timeframe, she will work with Mr. Anderson in providing a proper training on redacting documents, and will invite Cathy DeLeon, Director of Library Services, to share with the Commission the hiring challenges happening throughout the library system.

Ms. Pizarro Winting is still working on inviting Human Resources to discuss the pre versus post pandemic staffing and hopeful to have that discussion on the January 18th agenda. Ms. Pizarro Winting provided an update on the staffing efforts within the department.

President Garnica asked, regarding the redacted documents discussion, if the staff can provide important documents, such as performance evaluations, as part of the documents packet that they receive prior to the meeting. Ms. Pizarro Winting reiterated that she will work with Mr. Anderson and staff to make sure that Commissioners receive the most pertinent information that is needed for each item.

President Garnica inquired about the status of the annual report, and Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that she met with the designer the day before and will provide a draft in the coming weeks.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald introduced the newest member of her team, Tiffany James, and the Commission welcomed her to the team.

23. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

No unfinished business.

24. NEW BUSINESS

No new business.

25. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

No comments from the public.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 11:14 a.m.

I, Julia Smay, Executive Assistant, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។