

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, MAY 13, 2020  
TELECONFERENCE, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President  
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner  
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES**

**SPECIAL MEETING**

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE HELD VIA  
TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20  
ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM.**

**THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC.**

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Gonzalez Edmond led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather

**Present:** Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC WILL HAVE THE OPTION TO USE eCOMMENT TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION. WRITTEN COMMENTS MAY ALSO BE SUBMITTED VIA EMAIL TO CIVILSERVICE@LONGBEACH.GOV.**

There were no comments from the public.

2. [20-118CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Special Meeting of April 29, 2020*

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 5):**

Commissioner Arias pulled Agenda Item No. 4 for a separate discussion.

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve Consent Calendar Items 3 and 5, except for Item 4. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

3. [20-119CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Civil Engineer Test #13 (Established 05/07/20)*  
*Office Systems Analyst - SD Test #03 (Established 05/06/20)*  
*Public Health Nurse Supervisor Test #01 (Established 05/08/20)*  
*Public Health Nutritionist Test #06 (Established 05/06/20)*  
*Senior Civil Engineer Test #06 (Established 05/01/20)*  
*Senior Traffic Engineer Test #07 (Established 05/08/20)*  
*Water Treatment Operator Test #05 (Established 05/07/20)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [20-120CS](#)      **Recommendation for Transfer and Permanent Assignment to Former Classification** - Pamela Buckner, Housing Aide II  
*Communication from Jodie Griner, Administrative Officer, Department of Health and Human Services*  
*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

Commissioner Arias noticed that in the Executive Director's staff report, the transfer was retroactive to April 25, 2020, and the department was unaware of the requirement that Commission action is required. She wanted to know if training will be offered to departments. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she plans to provide training during an Administrative Officers meeting to review the process. Commissioner Arias also noticed that the received date was missing on the form and is glad the training will take place.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported to the Commission that staff will be revamping the forms as they are in need of updating.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

5. [20-121CS](#)      **Recommendation for Transfer and Permanent Assignment to Former Classification** - Christopher Jones, Plumber  
*Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Human Resources Director, Harbor Department*  
*Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

#### REGULAR AGENDA

6. [20-124CS](#)      **COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT** - Personnel Assistant II  
(Confidential)

*Communication from Alex Basquez, Director, Human Resources Department*  
*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Goings who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

President Gonzalez Edmond commented that when the Commission gave authority to the Executive Director to approve Provisional Appointments, it was because the Commission was not meeting weekly. She noted that the normal process regarding the approval of appointments should be followed now that the Commission is meeting weekly. President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know what the next steps would be. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that once the department makes its selection, the request would then be placed on the Consent Calendar.

Commissioner Arias wanted to clarify the application process end date. She stated that it ends on Friday, May 15th, and wanted to know if that was correct. Ms. Goings stated that the date is going to change as the recruitment process will not begin until the Commission approves the request.

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

7. [20-122CS](#)

**COVID-19 RELATED: RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE EXAMINATION PLAN** -Library Assistant

*Staff report prepared by Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. McDonald who briefed the Commission regarding this item, which would typically be placed on the Consent Calendar; however, staff thought it was important enough to share with the Commission.

Ms. McDonald stated that typically there is language regarding the change of examination plans on bulletins. Since this bulletin did not

have that information on it, staff wanted to bring it to the Commission for transparency.

Representatives, Glenda Williams, Director of Library Services and Susan Jones, Hiring Manager for Library Services were available for questions.

Vice President Morrison thanked Ms. McDonald for thinking outside the box and working around issues during COVID-19.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

8. [20-123CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REPORT FROM  
SUBCOMMITTEE REVIEWING THE CITY EMPLOYEE CREDIT  
SYSTEM**

President Gonzalez Edmond stated that the Subcommittee consisted of Commissioner Dowling and herself. She stated that there were a few meetings that took place with the Executive Director to review the presentation and other documentation. She informed the Commission that Commissioner Dowling will be providing the Subcommittee's recommendations.

Commissioner Dowling reported that the Subcommittee met several times resulting in its final meeting on May 6th. Upon further review of the Joint Labor Management Committee's recommendation made to the Commission on December 11, 2019, the Subcommittee does not support their recommendations as presented. He stated that the mission of the Civil Service Commission is to uphold the merit system for the classified service as stated in Article I, Section I of the Civil Service Rules and Regulations. While the Commission earnestly values the contributions of non-career employees, the Commission cannot support a policy that would give preferential treatment to non-career employees in a merit based Civil Service process, as it would always undermine the Commission's mission to assure fair and impartial treatment of all classified employees.

The Subcommittee encourages Civil Service staff to work with the Joint Labor Management Committee to research ways to support non-career employees to prepare for and become classified employees through the Civil Service process.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if the Commission received the recommendation from the joint committee. She believes she may have been absent at the time the presentation was made. Staff confirmed that the recommendation from the Joint Labor Management Committee was received by the Commission.

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

9. [20-048CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO CREATE STANDING COMMITTEES**

*Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*

President Gonzalez Edmond stated that this item has been tabled a few times for various reasons. This is an opportunity for the Commission to look at different ways of structuring committees. The Commission creates a lot of subcommittees, and sometimes it is the same Commissioner serving on those subcommittees. This is an opportunity to build an efficiency process, allowing Commissioners to be engaged in different areas that require committee work. She stated that it also allows Commissioners an opportunity to work with staff that are subject matter experts in specific areas. A proposed structure was outlined in the agenda item. It is a draft that is for discussion. She stated that there would be an Executive Committee, a Recruitment and Selection Committee and a Special Projects Committee. President Gonzalez Edmond stated that Commissioners would rotate between each of the committees so that everyone has an opportunity to understand the Civil Service process as well as work on topics that are more detailed.

Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that she did make modifications as requested. She added terms of committee members. She also added "as needed" to the Recommendation section. Commissioner Arias

stated that it should be placed elsewhere within the Recommendation section. President Gonzalez Edmond asked that it be placed in the Proposed Structure section as well. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she will add it in both places.

Vice President Morrison would like the apostrophe removed from the word "committee's" that is located in the first as well as the last paragraphs.

Vice President Morrison wanted to know when committee members will be decided. President Gonzalez Edmond referred this to Mr. Anderson who informed the Commission that it could be done today based on the language of the agenda item.

A brief discussion took place with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias and Mr. Anderson regarding how to vote on the item. It was decided that the Commission will vote on creating the structure as well as each committee separately.

Mr. Anderson suggested that the Commission wait for Commissioner Garnica to vote on the memberships to the separate committees. Commissioner Dowling stated that if there are no time sensitive items and since the subcommittee reported back today, the Commission could wait a week. The rest of the Commission agreed with Commissioner Dowling's recommendation.

Mr. Anderson suggested that the Commission table the item so that the vote could take place at one time. Commissioner Arias stated that the votes should be kept separate as this is a process that will take place annually. President Gonzalez Edmond entertained a motion to support the creation of the structure of standing committees for the Civil Service Commission.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve the recommendation to create the structure of the standing committees. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**Absent:** 1 - Joen Garnica

## 10. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

*A. Recruitment Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Ms. Slaten's work at the Emergency Operations Center has picked up significantly. Ms. Macias will be moving over to the Emergency Operations Center on a full-time basis to assist Ms. Slaten with managing some of her responsibilities. Ms. Cano who is assigned to the Recruitment Division, will be reassigned to the Employment Services Division so that she can continue to train on examinations while providing recruitment services within that division.

Since the staff in the Recruitment Division is separated right now, Ms. Pizarro Winting will not have a separate report for the Recruitment Division unless the Commission states otherwise. Any recruitment activity will be reported within the Employment Services Division.

President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know who was working on day to day items for the Recruitment Division. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the work will be divided between Civil Service staff.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald thanked the Commission for approving the Change in Examination Plan. She reported that staff are looking at examinations one at a time. There are a couple of examinations that are being looked at closely that will be brought to the Commission for a Change of Examination Plan.

Ms. McDonald reported that Ms. Cano was able to assist the Employment Services Division with the upload of salary changes to some of the classifications that were recently approved by City Council.

*C. Administration Support Services - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo provided the Commission with a budget update. The City is still in the process of building fiscal year 2021. Once the information is released, the budget process will move swiftly. Staff is currently analyzing areas where the department can save should the City give the department a savings target.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting shared that staff participated in a Staff Report training for Commission agenda items. Hopefully the Commission will benefit from the training that



was conducted.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she continues to check in with the Emergency Operations Center Civil Service team. In addition to Ms. Slaten, she was able to spend time with Ms. Ramos just to make sure she is connecting with them and that she still feels connected to the department.

Ms. Pizarro Winting mentioned that Financial Management's requests to extend probation will be coming to the Commission soon. In addition, staff received the spreadsheet from the Harbor Department regarding their extensions.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that staff had a very successful forecasting meeting with the Harbor Department. She stated that priorities may change as departments receive financial numbers. The forecasting meetings allow for Civil Service to better plan and be of service to departments.

## **11. UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

*A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service*

Ms. Pizarro Winting is working with Human Resources to schedule a meeting.

It was discussed that Vice President Morrison and Commissioner Arias were part of the Subcommittee to develop the policy which concluded. The policy is now going through the Meet and Confer process. Once the process is complete, it will come back to the Commission to adopt.

## **12. NEW BUSINESS**

There was no new business discussed.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 9:27 a.m.

## **NO HEARING**

---

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។