

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, MARCH 18, 2020
411 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD CIVIC
CHAMBERS, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING VIA TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO
EXECUTIVE ORDER N-25-20 ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM**

**THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE ACCESSIBLE FOR PUBLIC OBSERVATION AND PUBLIC
COMMENT**

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:36 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Gonzalez Edmond led in the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather
Present: Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director
Monica Kilaita, Deputy City Attorney
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer
Marla Camerino, Executive Assistant
JT Nagayama, City Clerk Specialist

Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst
Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst
Sylvana Tamura, Personnel Analyst
Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst
Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst
Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Financial Management
Dan Cunningham, Administration Coordinator, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications
Eliana Nieto, Human Resources, Harbor Department

1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

There were no comments from the public.

**2. [20-063CS](#) Recommendation to approve minutes:
*Regular Meeting of March 4, 2020***

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 6):

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**3. [20-064CS](#) Recommendation to approve examination results:
Civil Engineering Associate Test #10 (Established 03/03/20)
*Criminalist Test #01 (Established 03/06/20)***

Permit Center Supervisor (Established 03/03/20)
Plan Checker - Fire Prevention Test #09 (Established 03/03/20)
Senior Electrical Inspector Test #02 (Established 02/28/20)
Senior Electrical Inspector Test #03 (Established 03/10/20)
Senior Traffic Engineer Test #06 (Established 03/10/20)
Traffic Engineering Associate (Established 03/10/20)
Water Treatment Operator Test #04 (Established 03/09/20)

4. [20-065CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Gardener

5. [20-066CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Diane Bentley, Office Services Assistant II, Technology and Innovation (21 yrs., 6 mos.)

Rudy Romero, Police Officer, Police Department (26 yrs., 5 mos.)

6. [20-067CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Wendy Andersen, Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Harbor Department (9 yrs., 11 mos.)

Laura Lozano Barboza, Customer Service Representative II, Police Department (1 yr., 4 mos.)

Danielle Fermin, Special Services Officer III-Armed, Police Department (3 yrs., 5 mos.)

Thanh Nguyen, Systems Technician III, Technology and Innovation (8 mos., 25 days)

Alan Pan, Public Health Nurse II, Health Department (1 yr., 30 days)

Eric Paulsen, Senior Program Manager, Harbor Department (8 yrs., 2 mos.)

Frank Pulice, Ambulance Operator, Fire Department (3 yrs., 11 mos.)

Kousal Sok, Housing Specialist II, Health Department (16 yrs., 5 mos.)

Chad Sisco, Special Services Officer III-Armed, Harbor Department (2 yrs., 8 mos.)

REGULAR AGENDA

7. [20-068CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION FOR EXTENSION OF PROBATIONARY

PERIOD - Michelle Salas, Public Safety Dispatcher

Communication from Daniel Cunningham, Acting

Communications Center Officer, Disaster Preparedness and

Emergency Communications

Staff Report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Shellie Goings who briefed the Commission regarding the request.

Mr. Dan Cunningham from the Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias wanted to remind staff that requests should be submitted 30 days prior to completion of probation. This request was submitted 16 days prior to completion. Mr. Cunningham responded that they are aware of the deadline, but unfortunately this one fell through the cracks. He assured the Commission that the department will do a better job at meeting criteria and deadlines.

Commissioner Arias asked why Ms. Salas did not begin her position as other Public Safety Dispatchers would and why she was not provided with the classroom training. Mr. Cunningham informed the Commission that the department was impressed with Ms. Salas' interview and did not want to take the chance of losing her as a candidate and potentially losing her to another agency. The department decided to hire Ms. Salas and assign her to a veteran Public Safety Dispatcher in the Police Communication Center where she could observe the ins and outs of the job. Once the other candidates were finished with background process and were approved for hire, Ms. Salas would start classroom training with them. It would have been difficult to operate two academies concurrently. It was easier to have everyone begin at the same time.

President Gonzalez Edmond asked if this type of situation has come before the Commission previously where a candidate does not go through the same process as the rest. Commissioner Arias stated

that this happens often with Special Services Officers where the timing of the training does not match with the probationary period and is not sure how many the Commission has seen. She does want to make sure that the Commission is doing its due diligence especially when filling out forms and following policy guidelines that are stated on the forms. President Gonzalez directed staff to highlight in presentation of the item the due diligence that staff has already done. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the information will be included in either the staff report or notes moving forward.

Commissioner Garnica asked staff to include any nuances in their staff report that would assist the Commission in their considerations.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

8. [20-069CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REINSTATEMENT OF NAME TO ELIGIBLE LIST - Jmesha Love, Customer Service Representative
Communication from John Gross, Director, Financial Management
Staff report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Carolyn Pen who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer for the Department of Financial Management was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Dowling wanted to know if other positions were considered and if there was any disciplinary action taken. Ms. Kennedy informed the Commission that the department does not have any vacancies and that there was no disciplinary action taken.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

9. [20-070CS](#)

REQUEST TO APPEAL DISQUALIFICATION FROM EXAMINATION PROCESS - Guadalupe Moreno, Maintenance Assistant
Staff Report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Carolyn Pen who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if the Maintenance Assistant recruitment was run often. Ms. Pen stated that the recruitment takes place every couple of years. Commissioner Arias wanted to clarify that the recommendation was to approve staff's recommendation to deny Ms. Moreno's appeal. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that it was to deny Ms. Moreno's appeal.

Ms. Guadalupe addressed the Commission.

Commissioner Arias commented that she admires Ms. Moreno's persistence.

Commissioner Garnica requested that the Harbor Department weigh in on the matter. Ms. Eliana Nieto of the Harbor Department informed the Commission that Ms. Moreno would be a good candidate for the list and provided history regarding Ms. Moreno's background.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

10. [20-048CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO CREATE STANDING COMMITTEES
Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

President Gonzalez Edmond requested to table this item for a future meeting.

A brief discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Vice President Morrison and Commissioner Garnica regarding tabling this item with a timeframe in mind. This item will be brought back for discussion at the April 15th Commission meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, that this item be laid over until the April 15, 2020, Commission meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

11. [20-071CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO CHANGE CIVIL SERVICE RULE 116 TO INCLUDE SPECIFIC LANGUAGE PERTAINING TO THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S PERFORMANCE EVALUATION AND TO DIRECT STAFF TO BEGIN THE NECESSARY PROCESS FOR CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Ms. Pizarro Winting to provide background information regarding this item. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that currently there is no clarification as to when evaluations are conducted. The Commission wanted to insert language that the Executive Director would be evaluated annually in the month of January. This would be a rule change that would need to go to City Council for approval.

President Gonzalez Edmond clarified that the motion today would be to give the direction to staff to initiate the procedure for that change. The correct language to be used for the Agenda Item is as follows: Direct Staff to Initiate Language for a Change to Civil Service Rule 116. Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that she would prepare a draft for the Commission to approve.

Commissioner Garnica asked if there was a conflict of interest in having the Executive Director draft the language when the change is regarding the Executive Director. Monica Kilaita, Deputy City Attorney, suggested that the Commission form a Subcommittee to draft the language. This has taken place with other Commissions where they formed a Subcommittee to work on changing language

related to rules and regulations as well as by-laws. President Gonzalez Edmond stated that language was developed at the last meeting. Ms. Kilaita informed the Commission that if language was requested to be placed in the rule, staff could be directed to insert the same language and there would not be a conflict.

President Gonzalez Edmond requested to table this item to the next meeting. She will pull up the motion that was made on the floor and look through her notes. She will share the language with Vice President Morrison and bring back a recommendation to the Commission for City Council approval.

President Gonzalez Edmond entertained a motion to Direct the President and Vice President to draft the language for the Civil Service Rule 116 change as it retains to the appointment of the Executive Director and bring it back to the Commission's next meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve recommendation as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

12. [20-072CS](#)

DISCUSSION REGARDING UPDATES ON COVID-19

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding updates on COVID-19 as it relates to the Commission and what has been taking place around the city.

Commissioner Arias stated that the Commission's work is critical especially during this time and wanted clarification if meetings should be cancelled. Ms. Pizarro Winting clarified that meetings should continue as there will be time sensitive items that would need approval by the Commission.

Commissioner Arias asked for clarification regarding the work needed for the Emergency Operations Center. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the Human Resources Director and the City Manager asked if Civil Service would take on the task of identifying staff, citywide, to be placed at the Emergency Operations Center. It was discussed that

Commission approval is not needed to assign employees to assist. None of the placements are permanent or fulltime.

President Gonzalez Edmond asked if Labor was in support of this. Ms. Pizarro Winting was not certain if Human Resources has had the conversation with Labor.

Commissioner Garnica asked if there was a shift in pay or benefits, or would they be asked to perform the temporary duties based on their existing benefits or salaries. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that employees will remain within their classification and doing the same duties. It was discussed that employees should not be working in a higher classification, and that Civil Service would be responsible for ensuring this does not happen.

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Ms. Pizarro Winting to look at the Commission's calendar of items to see if there were any pressing items. She stated that there are some items on schedule that should not be delayed, but if there are any other items that could wait until after April when there is more information that could be provided to the Commission. She suggested keeping agendas light until more information in terms of where staff are located and needs. The Commission is crucial to how the hiring will be happening for a lot of the departments.

Commissioner Garnica stated that there is uncertainty regarding how long the current normal will last. It could be at least a couple of months. She would be hesitant to alter Commission business in any way because at the end of the day, we need to keep things going. Not only for the reasons that Commissioner Arias mentioned, but for the sake of not creating another situation once we get back to "normal." She would be in favor of conducting business as usual, with the exception of teleconference.

Vice President Morrison wanted to know if it would be easier to video conference or if it would add another layer of complexity.

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the Chambers is marked off so that there is social distancing. She said that the Commission could come in once a month and sit with enough distance in between each other. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that if a meeting is going to be teleconferenced, we do need to agendize it.

President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know if we should be noting a call-in number for the public. Ms. Kilaita informed the Commission that the state requires meetings be held in a publicly accessible area. She mentioned that City Council allows for eComments, which allows the public to submit comments via electronic email. President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know how the public provided the eComment. Ms. Kilaita stated that the public has access to watch the meetings online, because of this, a number is not provided.

Commissioner Garnica commented that she appreciates all of the systems that are in place to have meetings conducted business as usual. Commissioner Dowling agreed with Commissioner Garnica's comments.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to receive and file this item. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

13. [20-073CS](#)

**DISCUSSION REGARDING TELECONFERENCING OR VIDEO
CONFERENCING FOR HEARINGS**

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this item. She updated the Commission regarding upcoming hearings. She did mention that the challenge is with City Hall and the Port being closed to the public, it would be difficult for witnesses to come to the hearings. There is a possibility of developing video conferencing but wanted to get the Commission's thoughts on how to move forward with the hearings.

Commissioner Garnica wanted to know if witnesses were considered part of the public, or would they be considered part of business to keep hearings going. Ms. Kilaita would need to investigate it further, but some of them could be considered members of the public and some could be considered city staff.

Commissioner Garnica wanted to know if Mr. Trott or Mr. Peters had any thoughts on video conference hearings. Ms. Camerino stated that the attorneys would like to postpone hearings for March and April.

Discussions have not taken place regarding the attorneys' thoughts.

Commissioner Arias asked to invite the attorneys to a Commission meeting to discuss what they would be willing to do. It was discussed that this would be placed on the agenda for discussion and invite them to the next meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to receive and file this item. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

14. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment & Selection - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Ms. Slaten had to attend the Department Head meeting but wanted to report that at the Administrative Officers meeting it was discussed that the city will operate business as usual.

B. Special Projects - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald reported that since the Commission last met, her responsibilities have transitioned into overseeing the Exam Analysts. In addition, a single point of contact was introduced where each analyst would be assigned to a specific department. She mentioned that her meeting with the Water Department went well. In the next coming weeks, she plans to meet with various departments to identify priorities. She also plans to conduct training for analysts.

C. Administration Support Services - Maria Alamo

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Ms. Alamo had to leave early. She did want to report that Ms. Alamo is tasked with assisting Human Resources in trying to figure out how to go paperless with HR-1s, which documents every movement of the classified service.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Sylvana Tamura and Maria Cano, who recently joined the Civil Service Department. We have one more position to hire but we are almost full.

Analysts are working in teams so that there is always a designated backup. She reiterated that we have created a single point of contact. She reiterated that the meeting with the Water Department was successful. She stated that departments are pleased with this concept. We are partnering with them to prioritize how items are completed.

The Commission welcomed the new analysts.

President Gonzalez Edmond thanked Christina and staff for everything that they are doing. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that she has an amazing team and feels fortunate every day.

15. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service

There were no updates to provide.

B. Subcommittee to Study City Employee Credit System

The Subcommittee will be scheduling a meeting to discuss.

16. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business discussed.

17. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

There were no comments from the public.

ADJOURNMENT

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 10:13 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។