

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 19, 2020
411 WEST OCEAN BOULEVARD, CIVIC
CHAMBERS, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA & MINUTES

Commissioner Arias called the meeting to order at 8:43 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

Commissioner Arias led the flag salute.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joel Garnica

Present:

Commissioners Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Absent:

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director
Monica Kilaita, Deputy City Attorney
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer
JT Nagayama, City Clerk Specialist
Liz Rodriguez, Clerk Typist
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst
Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst
Veronica Robles-Scott, Administrative Analyst
Maria Macias, Personnel Assistant

Meg Rau, Administrative Officer
Robbie Grego, Deputy Chief
Stacey Lewis, Director of Human Resources
John Villarreal, Commercial Diver

1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

Rich Dines, Former Harbor Commissioner, and John Villarreal, Commercial Diver, addressed the Commission regarding Closed Session Item No. 15, Request to File for Examination by Dismissed Employee, in support of Ken Kuhlman.

2. [20-040CS](#)

Recommendation to approve minutes:

Regular Meeting of February 5, 2020

*Dismissal Hearing 05-D-1819 Minutes of September 18,
September 25, October 2 and October 9, 2019*

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve the minutes from the Civil Service Regular Meeting of February 5, 2020. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve the minutes from the Dismissal Hearing 05-D-1819 of September 18, September 25, October 2, and October 9, 2019 . The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR: (3 - 8)

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve Consent Calendar Items 3 - 8. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

3. [20-041CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Commercial Diver Test #01 (Established 02/07/20)
Engineering Technician (Established 02/14/20)
Fleet Services Supervisor (Established 02/14/20)
Maintenance Assistant Test #01 (Established 02/13/20)
Police Recruit Test #16 (Established 02/04/20)
Police Recruit Test #17 (Established 02/06/20)
Public Affairs Assistant Test #01 (Established 02/13/20)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Test #11 (Established 02/07/20)
Public Safety Dispatcher - POST WAIVER Test #11 (Established 02/07/20)
Refuse Operator Test #24 (Established 02/07/20)
Special Services Officer Test #41 (Established 02/05/20)
Structural Engineer Test #02 (Established 02/07/20)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

4. [20-042CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Plumber
Traffic Engineering Associate

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [20-043CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Clarence Cureton, Special Services Officer III, Harbor Department (11 mos., 2 days)

*Shaunna Dandoy, Public Affairs Assistant, Police Department
(1 yr., 1 mo.)
Ingrid Gizzelle Escobedo Felix, Police Recruit, Police
Department (4 mos., 23 days)
Edward L. Green, Jr., Motor Sweeper Operator, Public Works
(4yrs., 8 mos.)
Colleen Henehan, Public Safety Dispatcher II, Disaster
Preparedness and Emergency Communications (1 yr., 10
mos.)
Christopher D. Johnson, Firefighter, Fire Department (7 yrs.,
11 mos.)
Brandon Willie King, General Maintenance Assistant, Parks,
Recreation and Marine (1 mo. 23 days)
Heriberto Lopez, School Guard, Police Department (1 yr., 1
mo.)
Nick Vasuthasawat, Planner II, Development Services (4yrs., 2
mos.)
Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst II, Civil Service Department
(1 yr., 7 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

6. [20-044CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

*Fidel Garcia - Special Services Officer II, Public Works to
Special Services Officer II, Airport
Michael Penaranda - Permit Technician I, Development
Services to Permit Technician I, Public Works*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

7. [20-045CS](#)

**Recommendation for Permanent Assignment to Former
Classification -** Fermin Gracian, Construction Inspector
*Communication from Anja Jacobsen, Acting Administrative
Officer, Energy Resources*

Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

8. [20-046CS](#) **Recommendation for Provisional Appointment - Jason C. King, Building Services Supervisor**
Communication from Ruby Marin-Jordan, Special Projects Officer, Police Department
Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

9. [20-047CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION TO RESCIND THE EXTENSION OF ELIGIBLE LIST**
Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this Item.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

10. [20-048CS](#) **RECOMMENDATION TO CREATE STANDING COMMITTEES**
Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this Item.

Commissioner Arias requested that the item be laid over to the next meeting so the item could be heard by the whole Commission. Commissioner Garnica asked where the standing Ad-Hoc Committees fall into so the work that is currently being done is evenly divided between the Commissioners.

Commissioner Dowling commented that it sounded like there were going to be a lot of efficiencies built into the process, and if the Commission does decide to move forward, it will be a good thing that will allow the Commission to work more efficiently on urgent items, and thanked staff for the report. Commissioner Arias expressed concerns regarding the expectation of Standing Committees meeting regularly. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that the Standing Committees don't have to meet unless an item is referred to the Committee and that there is no expectation to meet if there are no items.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, that the item be laid over to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

11. [20-049CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE PROVISIONAL
APPOINTMENT PROCESS**

*Staff Report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive
Director*

Ms. Pizarro Winting briefed the Commission regarding this Item.

Commissioner Arias clarified the changes to the process will create consistency. Ms. Pizarro Winting agreed with Commissioner Arias and commented the written documentation is very helpful for people to follow.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

12. **REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

Recruitment and Selection

Ms. Slaten introduced Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst, and Jason Hosea, Captain, Long Beach Fire Department, who provided a PowerPoint presentation on the Fire Recruit Recruitment outreach efforts, the FY 2020 demographics and an overall summary for the Fire

Recruit process for the year 2020.

Commissioner Arias commented it will be exciting to see what the numbers look like after a full year. Commissioner Garnica commented she was happy to see non-binary was added, and asked if there was a way to capture mixed race individuals. Ms. Goings responded that was most likely where the Another category comes from, and that staff can look into the EEO report. Commissioner Garnica asked if a student is interested in Fire Science, is Jordan High School the best school to go to for the Fire Pathway program. Mr. Hosea responded that Jordan High School is the flagship for the Fire Pathways program and that is the only one currently in the district. Commissioner Dowling thanked Ms. Goings and Mr. Hosea for the presentation and asked if staff could come back later in the year with a full report on tracking age, residency, education, and whether they were a first time or prior applicant. Commissioner Arias asked if the percentage of overall female applicants could be included in the next report. Mr. Hosea responded they could and that staff knows it is an area that they need to improve in, and they are reaching out to colleges, universities, and veterans programs. Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked the Fire Department for their partnership and the resources they are putting towards this effort.

Special Projects

Ms. McDonald did not have any new information to report.

Administration Support Services

Ms. Alamo did not have any new information to report.

Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced the department's newest member of the team, Elsa Ramos, Personnel Analyst, who came from the Health and Human Services Department. Ms. Pizarro Winting also announced that Ms. Ramos will be joined by four other colleagues on March 2, 2020 and at the March 5, 2020 meeting, the department will be fully staffed with 5 Personnel Analysts. Ms. Ramos thanked the Civil Service Department for bringing her on to the team.

13. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

- A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service
- B. Subcommittee to Study City Employee Credit System

There were no updates provided.

14. NEW BUSINESS

15. [20-050CS](#) **CLOSED SESSION - REQUEST TO FILE FOR EXAMINATION BY DISMISSED EMPLOYEE** - Special Services Officer III (*Pursuant to Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code*)

The Commission went into Closed Session for discussion at 9:41 p.m.

After discussion, Commissioner Arias reconvened the meeting at 10:05 a.m. and reported out of Closed Session that the Commission unanimously approved the request to file by Mr. Ken Kuhlman.

16. [20-039CS](#) **CLOSED SESSION** - Executive Director's Performance Evaluation (*Pursuant to Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code*)

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, that the item be laid over to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

Absent: 2 - Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

- 17. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.**

Stacey Lewis, Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department, thanked Ms. Pizarro Winting for presenting at the Board of Harbor Commissioners Human Resources Subcommittee.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Arias adjourned the meeting at 10:06 a.m.

NO HEARING

jn

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។