

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 5, 2020  
400 WEST BROADWAY – LONG BEACH  
POLICE DEPARTMENT, COMMUNITY ROOM,  
8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President  
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner  
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES**

President Gonzalez Edmond called the meeting to order at 8:37 a.m.

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney, to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather  
**Present:** Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director  
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director  
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney  
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer  
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer  
Marla Camerino, Executive Assistant  
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst  
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst  
David Espinoza, Manager of Security Operations, Harbor Department  
Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works  
Daniel Cunningham, Administration Coordinator, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.**

There were no comments from the public.

1. [20-027CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve minutes:**  
*Regular Meeting of January 22, 2020*

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 10):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Vice President Morrison, to approve Consent Calendar Items (2 - 10). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

2. [20-028CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve examination results:**  
*Civil Engineering Associate Test #09 (Established 01/29/20)*  
*Electrician Test #04 (Established 01/27/20)*  
*Emergency Medical Education Coordinator Test #01 (Established 01/30/20)*  
*Laboratory Analyst Test #01 (Established 01/22/20)*  
*Office Systems Analyst (IMDCA) Test #07 (Established 01/21/20)*  
*Office Systems Analyst (IMDCE) Test #06 (Established 01/21/20)*  
*Office Systems Analyst (IMDCE) Test #07 (Established 01/27/20)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral Test #10 (Established 01/27/20)*  
*Police Recruit Test #14 (Established 01/17/20)*  
*Police Recruit Test #15 (Established 01/23/20)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

3. [20-029CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):**  
*Senior Scheduler*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

4. [20-030CS](#)      **Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**  
*Luke Forrest, Garage Service Attendant II, Financial Management (31 yrs., 7 mos.)*  
*Lance Hiraga, Fire Captain, Fire Department (23 yrs., 9 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

5. [20-031CS](#)      **Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**  
*Christopher Velasco, Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter, Energy Resources (1 yr., 2 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [20-032CS](#)      **Recommendation to approve transfer(s):**  
*Angelica Dominguez - Clerk Typist II, Airport to Clerk Typist III, Financial Management*  
*Travis Frost - Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Harbor Department to Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Airport*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

7. [20-033CS](#)      **Recommendation to receive and file withdrawal of appeal:**  
*Dismissal Appeal 03-D-1819*

*Suspension Appeal 06-S-1718*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

8. [20-025CS](#)      **Recommendation for Reassignment for Rehabilitation** - Diana Alonso, Special Services Officer-II Unarmed  
*Communication from Stacey V. Lewis, Director of Human Resources, Harbor Department*  
*Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

9. [20-035CS](#)      **Recommendation to Transfer from Unclassified to Classified Service** - Dave Roberts, Traffic Signal Coordinator, Public Works  
*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works*  
*Staff Report prepared by Sheree Valdoria*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

10. [20-036CS](#)      **Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)**  
*Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director*
- Accountant (C01AN-19) Test #01 (2/26/2019)*  
*Administrative Analyst (EA8AN-19) Test #02 (8/29/2019) - 5 Months*  
*Assistant Administrative Analyst (E03AN-19) Test #02 (2/28/2019) - 5 Months*  
*Business Systems Specialist (H67AN-19) Test #11 (2/21/2019)*  
*Civil Engineering Associate (K13NN-19) Test #04 (2/13/2019) - 5 Months*

*Electrician (I15NN-19) Test #03 (8/2/2019)*  
*Gas Pipeline Welder/Layout Fitter (I61NN-19) Test #03 (8/28/2019)*  
*General Librarian (E37NN-19) (8/9/2019)*  
*Housing Specialist (H66AN-18) (8/29/2018)*  
*Nurse Practitioner (G12NN-19) Test #01 (8/28/2019)*  
*Office Systems Analyst (IMDBA) (ND4AN-19D) Test #01 (8/6/2019)*  
*Office Systems Analyst - IMDCA (ND4AN-19B) Test #02 (8/14/2019)*  
*Office Systems Analyst - IMDNOC (ND4AN-19C) Test #03 (8/14/2019)*  
*Park Naturalist (H17NN-19) Test #01 (2/15/2019)*  
*Plan Checker - Plumbing (K41AN-19) Test #02 (2/15/2019)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19) Test #25 (2/13/2019)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19) Test #26 (2/25/2019)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #07 (8/15/2019)*  
*Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #08 (8/30/2019)*  
*Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #07 (2/28/2019)*  
*Public Health Nutritionist (G21AN-19) Test #02 (8/19/2019)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-18A) Test #03 (8/17/2018)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-18B) Test #03 (8/17/2018)*  
*Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-19B) Test #07 (8/15/2019)*  
*Recreation Assistant (H52NN-19) Test #01 (3/1/2019)*  
*Senior Librarian (E31NN-19) (8/7/2019)*  
*Senior Surveyor (K66NN-19) Test #02 (8/13/2019)*  
*Senior Traffic Engineer (K68NN-19) Test #03 (8/28/2019)*  
*Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #38 (8/15/2019)*  
*Systems Support Specialist (H69AN-18) Test #07 (8/8/2018)*  
*Water Treatment Operator (MA1AN-19B) Test #02 (8/26/2019)*  
*Water Utility Mechanic (M42AN-19) Test #01 (2/14/2019)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

11. [20-038CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE**

- Lindsey Garcia, Public Safety Dispatcher  
*Communication from Reginald Harrison, Director, Disaster  
Preparedness and Emergency Communications  
Staff Report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Shellie Goings who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Daniel Cunningham, Administration Coordinator for the Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications, was present to answer questions.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Vice President Morrison, Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Garnica, Ms. Pizarro Winting, Mr. Cunningham, Ms. McDonald and Ms. Goings regarding the reappointment. It was discussed that Ms. Garcia left her previous agency in good standing and it was confirmed that she had not passed probation. It was discussed that Public Safety Dispatcher is a difficult position to fill. Staff is working on ways to outreach. In 2019, a total of 19 dispatchers left for various reasons. From the eligible lists that are currently in place, the department was able to select 17 individuals to go through the hiring process.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

**Recruitment & Selection**

Ms. Slaten informed the Commission that staff will be attending the Spring 2020 Career and Internship Expo at California State University Dominguez Hills on Wednesday, February 19, 2020, from 12:00 p.m. to 3:00 p.m. Civil Service staff will be partnering with the Fire

Department to provide outreach to the students.

### **Special Projects**

Ms. McDonald did not have any updates for the Commission.

### **Administration Support Services**

Ms. Alamo informed the Commission that Phase 2 of Munis will be going live in October. She informed the Commissioners that Phase 2 will consist of timesheets and personnel actions.

### **Executive Director**

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that she attended the annual Major City/County Human Resources Directors' Meeting in San Diego. She was able to listen to many ideas and best practices. She mentioned that there were approximately 30 to 40 Directors present.

### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

#### **Ad Hoc Subcommittees:**

**Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service**

**Subcommittee to Study City Employee Credit System**

There were no updates provided.

### **NEW BUSINESS**

President Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that she has been meeting with Ms. Pizarro Winting to streamline and organize the agenda. She would like to propose creating Standing Committees for Recruitment and Selection, Special Projects and Administrative Support Services/Executive that will include the current staff, as well as a Commissioner. The Committee will only meet as topics are referred. This will provide Commissioners with an opportunity to learn more about the department and to interact with Ms. Pizarro Winting and her management staff. This topic will be placed on the agenda for further discussion.

Commissioner Arias requested to form an Ad-Hoc Subcommittee to review the list of items that were moved from the Regular Agenda to the Consent Calendar. President Gonzalez Edmond asked that this be placed on hold until they can streamline the standing committees so that this discussion can be sent to the appropriate committee for review.

President Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that there are plans to have trainings for the Commissioners and will speak with Mr. Anderson for further direction. Training will include looking at some policies that we have per Civil Service rules, but the practice has been different. She wants to make sure that the Commission is operating in a way that is more efficient and in compliance with the existing rules.

Discussion took place regarding Provisional Appointments. It was discussed that this will be placed on the agenda for further discussion. President Gonzalez Edmond asked staff to provide a history so that the Commission can be made aware of what the process is now versus how it was in the past.

Any questions related to the aforementioned topics will be formerly discussed at the next meeting.

A discussion took place regarding the order of the agenda.

At this time, President Gonzalez Edmond moved Comments from the Public before Closed Session.

**COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.**

There were no comments from the public.

**12. [20-039CS](#)**

**CLOSED SESSION - Executive Director’s Performance**

*Evaluation (Pursuant to Paragraph (b)(1) of Section 54957 of the California Government Code)*

This item will be held over until the next meeting. President Gonzalez Edmond requested that staff secure a separate room so that the Commission can discuss Closed Session items privately.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to hold this discussion to the next meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**



**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**ADJOURNMENT**

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 9:04 a.m.

**NO HEARING**

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មើនគ្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។