

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 11, 2019
411 WEST OCEAN BOULEVARD, CIVIC
CHAMBERS, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND MINUTES

Vice President Morrison called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

Vice President Morrison asked Commissioner Arias to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica and Heather
Present: Morrison

Commissioners Susana Gonzalez Edmond
Excused:

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer
Marla Camerino, Executive Assistant
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst
Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst
Veronica Robles Scott, Administrative Analyst
Sylvana Tamura, Administrative Analyst

Ramanjit Brar, Assistant Director of Construction Management, Harbor Department
Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney
Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works Department
Elizabeth Calixtro, Human Resources Officer, Human Resources Department
Jessica Stoudenmire, Administrative Analyst, Water Department
Dana Anderson, Labor Relations Manager, Human Resources Department
Rachel Rock, Energy Services Officer, Energy Resources Department
Ken Roberts, Superintendent, Public Works Department
Donald Tarango, Construction Inspector, Harbor Department Retiree

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

There were no comments received.

1. [19-226CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
Regular Meeting of December 4, 2019

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 8):

Ms. Pizarro Winting requested to pull the Laboratory Analyst bulletin from the Consent Calendar. The Commission will vote on this bulletin after they vote on the Classification Specification.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to approve Consent Calendar Items (2 - 8), except for the Laboratory Analyst bulletin in Agenda Item No. 3. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

2. [19-227CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Office Systems Analyst (IMDCE) Test #04 (Established 12/02/19)

Office Systems Analyst (IMDCA) Test #05 (Established 12/02/19)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

3. [19-228CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Laboratory Analyst

Library Assistant

Marine Safety Officer

A motion was made to approve recommendation, as amended, to remove the Laboratory Analyst bulletin on the Consent Calendar.

A brief discussion ensued with Vice President Morrison, Commissioner Arias, Ms. Pizarro Winting, Ms. Valdoria and Ms. Stoudenmire regarding a difference in the language under the Minimum Qualifications section of the Classification Specification and the Requirements to File section of the bulletin. Staff will remove the word "or" from the bulletin so that it is uniform with the Classification Specification. The Commission ultimately approved the bulletin as amended.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve the Laboratory Analyst bulletin as amended. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

4. [19-229CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Amanda Bentley, Accounting Technician, Financial Management (38 yrs., 5 mos.)

Michael Moniz, Petroleum Engineer II, Energy Resources (5 yrs., 7 mos.)

Angela Ta, Senior Accountant, Economic Development (30 yrs., 3 mos.)

Donald Tarango, Construction Inspector II, Harbor Department (33 yrs., 8 mos.)

Marie Vander Laan, Public Health Nurse III, Health and Human Services Department (39 yrs., 1 mo.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [19-230CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Brian Eldridge, Public Safety Dispatcher I, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (11 yrs., 4 mos.)

Jed Gregg, Garage Service Attendant, Financial Management (7 mos., 7 days)

Jason Johnson, Refuse Operator I, Public Works (2 yrs., 5 mos.)

Omid Modaghegh, Traffic Engineering Associate, Public Works (9 mos., 24 days)

Andrea Olea, Clerk Typist II, Fire Department (2 yrs., 4 mos.)

Bahram Solhjoui, Capital Projects Coordinator III, Public Works (2 yrs., 8 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [19-231CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

Benjamin Paramo - Administrative Analyst III, Harbor

*Department to Administrative Analyst III, Disaster
Preparedness and Emergency Communications*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

7. [19-232CS](#)

Recommendation to approve schedule for hearing(s):

*Dismissal Appeal 06-D-1819, Suggested Dates: March 4 and
11, 2020*

*Suspension Appeal 07-S-1819, Suggested Dates: March 18, 25
and April 1, 2020*

*Dismissal Appeal 11-D-1819, Suggested Dates: April 8 and 15,
2020*

*Dismissal Appeal 10-D-1819, Suggested Dates: April 22, 29,
May 6 and 13, 2020*

*Suspension Appeal 13-S-1819, Suggested Dates: May 20 and
27, 2020*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

8. [19-233CS](#)

Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):

*Reduction Appeal 03-R-1718, Suggested Date: February 26,
2020*

*Suspension Appeal 05-S-1718, Suggested Dates: June 17 and
24, 2020*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the
Consent Calendar.**

REGULAR AGENDA

9. [19-234CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION FOR PROVISIONAL APPOINTMENT -
(Safety Specialist I)**

*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public
Works*

Staff Report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from Public Works was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know whether or not Public Works has decided to require a writing exercise. Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer for Public Works, informed the Commission that the department has yet to decide. Commissioner Arias wanted to know what the determining factor would be. Mr. Ficker stated that a conversation will take place between Civil Service and the Bureau Manager from Public Works to determine if it is necessary. It is Mr. Ficker's inclination that there will not be a writing exercise as the position does not necessitate a significant amount of professional writing.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

10. [19-235CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED

CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Laboratory Analyst

Communication from Alex Basquez, Director, Human

Resources Department

Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting reintroduced Ms. Valdoria, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the Water Department was present to answer questions.

Vice President Morrison commented regarding the number of changes to the specification and that it is probably due in part by the fact that it is outdated.

With the addition of a new grade level, Commissioner Dowling wanted to know if this would give staff in the lower grade levels an opportunity to upgrade, and if so, would it cause vacancies in the lower grades. Jessica Stoudenmire, Administrative Analyst with the Water Department, commented that the Water Department has thought about the possibility of upgrading. If they decide to, then they would turn to the eligible list to underfill the vacancies that become available due to the upgrades.

Commissioner Arias commented that based on the title this classification specification could be used within various departments, but when you read it more closely it appears that it is related to Water.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

11. [19-236CS](#)

**JOINT RECOMMENDATION REGARDING NON-CAREERS
LMC**

Communication from Elizabeth Calixtro, Human Resources Officer

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Elizabeth Calixtro, Human Resources Officer for the Human Resources Department. Ms. Calixtro informed the Commission that this recommendation comes after many months of hard work between the City and the International Association of Machinists & Aerospace Workers (IAM). Ms. Calixtro recognized Ms. Ashley Gunckel from IAM who was present in the audience.

Ms. Calixtro provided information to the Commission regarding giving points to non-career city employees who are seeking classified employment. In accordance with the 2016 Memorandum of Understanding with IAM, the Labor Relations Bureau convened a Labor Management Committee (LMC) to discuss issues related to non-career employees. The LMC included representatives from various departments. Ms. Calixtro took a moment to recognize Ken Roberts, Caprice McDonald, Rachel Rock, Crystal Slaten and Dana Anderson. The Committee met on several occasions where

discussion took place regarding the current utilization of non-career employees within the City, challenges non-career employees face in securing classified employment within the City and efforts currently in place by City departments to assist non-career employees with the hiring process. The Committee ultimately brainstormed various options and alternatives to address issues of primary concern.

The concept being presented to the Commission gives priority points to not only current non-career city employees, but to current permanent employees as well. Employees, based on their hours of service, would receive a maximum of 3 additional points towards their final score. This would be contingent on the employee initially passing the Civil Service examination. Priority points would provide a benefit, particularly, to the examinations that are banded. The Committee believes that this concept would assist in efforts to recruit experienced non-career employees and will serve as a positive message in support of all current employees who will benefit as well.

Implementation of this concept is dependent on the approval of the Commission. It would also require a change to the Civil Service Rules and Regulations to include a rule describing the City Employee Credit system.

Commissioner Dowling wanted to know if points would be rounded up, or if there is a possibility that an employee could end up with a fraction of a point. It was discussed that an employee could end up with a fraction of a point.

Commissioner Arias asked if the next step would be to develop a new rule. Gary Anderson, Principal Deputy City Attorney, informed the Commission that they could create a Subcommittee to study the concept.

Commissioner Arias wanted clarification that the Seniority Credit and the City Employee Credit would exist together. Ms. Calixtro commented that there is also Veterans Credit. It was discussed that the employee would receive the highest benefit if they are eligible for other credits. Commissioner Garnica asked if it was one or the other. Ms. Calixtro responded that the employee would only receive one or the other. She also clarified that employees would only receive the credit once they pass the examination. It was discussed that it could possibly place the employee higher on a band. Commissioner Arias

commented that she thinks this is a good concept as it would provide a benefit to non-career employees in the City.

A motion was made to Receive and File this item, and to agendize for further discussion and formation of a Subcommittee.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to receive and file, and to agendize for further discussion and to create of a Subcommittee. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 4 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 1 - Susana Gonzalez Edmond

MANAGERS' REPORTS

Recruitment & Selection

Ms. Slaten invited Commissioners to the Fire Recruit Graduation on Saturday, December 14, 2019, at the Captain Rosa Training Center. Staff will email a flyer to the Commission. In addition, Civil Service staff will be partnering with the Police and Fire Departments to conduct outreach at the Black College Fair being held at the Long Beach Convention Center on Sunday, December 15, 2019. It is anticipated that approximately 1,000 students will be in attendance. Vice President Morrison mentioned that she will also be attending the Black College Fair.

Ms. Slaten thanked her staff for taking care of things while she was on vacation.

Special Projects

Ms. McDonald did not have any updates for the Commission.

Administration Support Services

Ms. Alamo did not have any updates for the Commission.

Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that this was the last Commission meeting of the calendar year. It has been a fast and furious final quarter and thanked the Commission.

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Civil Service received a very nice letter from Fire Captain Duaine Jackson who did not realize the Commission recognized retirees and how much he appreciated it. She believes the Commission's engagement with him made it especially nice. Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that Mr. Jackson appreciated that Fire Command staff was present, and stated that Ms. Camerino does a great job reaching out to retirees as well as staff to ensure the retirees are represented. Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked the Commission for their engagement because it does make an impact.

Ms. Pizarro Winting is looking forward to ending last day of calendar year with the Commission. She is looking forward to the teambuilding activity with the Commission this morning.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

There was no unfinished business to discuss.

NEW BUSINESS

Vice President Morrison directed staff to agendaize the Subcommittee to further discuss the concept given to the Commission by the Labor Management Committee.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission's jurisdiction.

As Ms. McDonald prepares to take a few weeks of vacation time, she just wanted to thank the Commission and Civil Service staff as well as all City departments for their support and looks forward to another great year.

ADJOURNMENT

Vice President Morrison adjourned the meeting at 9:08 a.m.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មើនគ្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។