

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 6, 2019
1800 EAST WARDLOW ROAD, LONG BEACH,
CA 90807, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES

Vice President Morrison called the meeting to order at 8:34 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

Vice President Morrison asked Commissioner Dowling to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica and Heather Morrison

Present:

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

Excused:

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director
Crystal Slaten, Deputy Director
Caprice McDonald, Special Projects Officer
Maria Alamo, Special Projects Officer
Marla Camerino, Executive Assistant
Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst
Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst
Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst
Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst
Veronica Robles Scott, Administrative Analyst
Sylvana Tamura, Administrative Analyst
Maria Macias, Personnel Assistant
Alex Basquez, Director, Human Resources Department

Dana Anderson, Human Resources Officer, Human Resources Department
Paula Gallegos, Administrative Officer, Police Department
Sandra Aguilar, Administrative Officer, Energy Resources Department
Russ Ficker, Administrative Officer, Public Works Department
Paul Baum, Lieutenant, Police Department
Michael Colbert, Retiree, Police Department

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

On behalf of the Civil Service Commission, Executive Director Christina Pizarro Winting, presented a Certificate of Appreciation to Michael Colbert, Police Corporal, for 30 years, 3 months of distinguished and exemplary service to the City of Long Beach. Police Lieutenant Paul Baum of the Police Department was present to recognize and highlight Mr. Colbert’s career. The Commission congratulated Mr. Colbert on his retirement.

1. [19-194CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
Regular Meeting of October 16, 2019

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

CONSENT CALENDAR (2 – 10):

Vice President Morrison had a question regarding an exam result in Agenda Item No. 2, Nursing Practitioner. It appears that there were no applicants who qualified for this exam. Ms. Slaten stated that Civil Service is still currently accepting applications for Nursing Practitioner and stated that it could be that applicants during this screening process did not have the appropriate certifications.

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that there was a typographical error in the memo for Agenda Item No. 10. A revised memo was given to the Commission.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve Consent Calendar Items (2 - 10). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

2. [19-195CS](#)

Recommendation to approve examination results:

Civil Engineer Test #09 (Established 10/24/19)

Civil Engineering Associate Test #07 (Established 10/24/19)

Maintenance Planner (Established 10/16/19)

Nurse Practitioner Test #02 (Established 10/17/19)

Plan Checker - Fire Prevention Test #07 (Established 10/11/19)

Plan Checker - Plumbing Test #05 (Established 10/11/19)

*Police Lieutenant (Established 10/14/19) **PROMOTIONAL***

Police Recruit Test #13 (Established 10/24/19)

Public Health Nutritionist Test #03 (Established 10/23/19)

Systems Support Specialist Test #13 (Established 10/29/19)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

3. [19-196CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Commercial Diver

Deputy Chief Harbor Engineer

Environmental Specialist Associate

Fleet Services Supervisor

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

4. [19-197CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Kathleen Bangma, Administrative Aide II, Harbor Department (26 yrs., 8 mos.)

Denise Beaudoin, Clerk Typist III, Water Department, (32 yrs., 10 mos.)

John Browning, Environmental Health Specialist, Health Department (22 yrs., 1 mo.)

Cathy Chace, Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Police Department (33 yrs., 3 mos.)

Michael Colbert, Police Corporal, Police Department (30 yrs., 3 mos.)

Kevin Coy, Police Lieutenant, Police Department (30 yrs., 3 mos.)

James Foster, Police Lieutenant, Police Department (24 yrs., 11 mos.)

William Foster, Police Corporal, Police Department (29 yrs., 5 mos.)

Deborah Greene, Public Safety Dispatcher II, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (33 yrs., 2 mos.)

Noor Ismail, Assistant Administrative Analyst II, Police Department (26 yrs., 11 mos.)

Todd Johnson, Police Officer, Police Department (21 yrs., 3 mos.)

Lance Mora, Firefighter, Fire Department (29 yrs., 11 mos.)

David Richardson, Refuse Operator II, Public Works (17 yrs., 6 mos.)

Elizabeth Rogers, Senior Librarian, Library Services (19 yrs., 4 mos.)

Lynn Staats, Parking Control Checker II, Public Works (10 yrs., 5 mos.)

Leroy Staes, Police Officer, Police Department (24 yrs., 10 mos.)

Jeannie Villanueva, Police Officer, Police Department (26 yrs., 7 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

5. [19-198CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file disability retirement(s):

James Bayley, Fire Engineer, Fire Department (14 yrs., 8 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [19-199CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Austin Craig, Police Officer, Police Department (3 yrs., 6 mos.)

Maria De Leon, Public Health Nutritionist I, Health Department (1 yr., 8 mos.)

Ketzie Diaz, Senior Librarian, Library Services (10 mos., 29 days)

Lindsey Garcia, Public Safety Dispatcher II, Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (2 yrs., 15 days)

Jennifer Garcia, Administrative Analyst III, Police Department (2 yrs., 5 mos.)

John Kim, Port Planner V, Harbor Department (2 yrs., 8 mos.)

Ricky Kloppe II, Safety Specialist I, Public Works (3 yrs., 1 mo.)

Michael Munoz, Permit Technician II, Development Services (4 yrs., 1 mo.)

Josue Saldana, Registered Nurse II, Health Department (8 mos., 22 days)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [19-200CS](#)

Recommendation to approve transfer(s):

Russell Catanzaro - Administrative Analyst III, Fire Department to Administrative Analyst III, Harbor Department

Ernesto Adolfo Echeverria - Administrative Analyst II, Financial Management to Administrative Analyst III, Fire Department

Julie In - Accounting Clerk III, Library Services to Accounting Clerk III, Police Department
Natalie Vargas - Payroll/Personnel Assistant II, Public Works to Payroll/Personnel Assistant III, Health Department

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

8. [19-201CS](#)

Recommendation to approve schedule for hearing(s):

Reduction Appeal Hearing 01-R-1819, Suggested Date: November 13, 2019

Reduction Appeal Hearing 03-R-1718, Suggested Date: November 20, 2019

Reduction Appeal Hearing 02-R-1718, Suggested Date: December 4, 2019

Dismissal Appeal Hearing 03-D-1819, Suggested Dates: January 8, 15, & 22, 2020

Dismissal Appeal Hearing 04-D-1819, Suggested Dates: January 29 & February 5, 2020

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

9. [19-202CS](#)

Recommendation to approve reschedule for hearing(s):

Suspension Appeal Hearing 04-S-1718, Suggested Dates: February 12 & February 19, 2020

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

10. [19-203CS](#)

Recommendation to Approve Extension of Expiring Eligible Lists (6 months)

Staff report prepared by Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

Accounting Technician (C50NN-18) (11/9/2017)

Capital Projects Coordinator (EC6AN-19B) Test #01 (5/9/2019)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-19) Test #01 (11/8/2018)

Civil Engineer (K11NN-19) Test #02 (11/30/2018)
Civil Engineer (K11NN-19) Test #06 (5/9/2019)
Civil Engineering Assistant (K12NN-19) (11/6/2018)
Combination Building Inspector Aide (K88AN-19) Test #01 (11/6/2018)
Communication Specialist (H68AN-19) Test #04 (5/2/2019)
Communication Specialist (H68AN-19) Test #05 (5/28/2019)
Customer Services Supervisor (D76AN-18) (11/21/2017)
Electrician (I15NN-19) Test #01 (5/16/2019)
Equipment Mechanic (I06AN-18) (5/3/2018)
Fingerprint Classifier (F07NN-19) (11/28/2018)
Garage Service Attendant (J23AN-19) Test #02 (5/20/2019)
Gas Field Technician (EG2AN-19) Test #01 (5/10/2019)
Marina Agent (H59AN-19) (11/27/2018)
Mechanical Engineering Associate (K33NN-19) (11/14/2018)
Office Services Assistant (I70AN-18) (5/17/2018)
Office Systems Analyst - SD (ND4AN-19) Test #01 (5/10/2019)
Plan Checker - Fire Prevention (KA4NN-19) Test #06 (5/8/2019)
Plan Checker - Plumbing (K41AN-19) Test #04 (5/8/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #02 (5/6/2019)
Police Officer - Lateral (F23NN-19B) Test #03 (5/16/2019)
Police Recruit (F63NN-19) Test #03 (11/29/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Lateral (J45AN-19C) Test #03 (11/14/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-18A) Test #02 (6/1/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-19A) Test #05 (11/20/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - NTN Exam (J45AN-19A) Test #07 (5/6/2019)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-18B) Test #02 (6/1/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-19B) Test #04 (11/14/2018)
Public Safety Dispatcher - Post Waiver (J45AN-19B) Test #06 (5/6/2019)
Recycling Specialist (EC5AN-19) Test #01 (5/20/2019)
Registered Nurse (G11AN-19) Test #09 (5/24/2019)
Safety Specialist (D69AN-19) (11/16/2018)

School Guard (F31N1-19) Test #08 (5/24/2019)
Senior Structural Engineer (K65NN-19) Test #04 (5/8/2019)
Senior Surveyor (K66NN-19) Test #01 (5/6/2019)
Senior Traffic Engineer (K68NN-19) Test #02 (5/9/2019)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-18) Test #27 (5/15/2018)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #33 (11/8/2018)
Special Services Officer (F33AN-19) Test #37 (5/6/2019)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

11. [19-204CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE

- James Langdon

Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works

Staff Report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the Public Works Department was available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

12. [19-205CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO REAPPOINT RESIGNED EMPLOYEE

- Paige White

Communication from Paula Gallegos, Administrative Officer, Police Department

Staff Report prepared by Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Carolyn Pen, Administrative Analyst, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

A representative from the Police Department was available to answer questions.

A brief discussion ensued with Vice President Morrison, Commissioner Garnica and Ms. Pen, with the Commission ultimately approving the request.

A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

13. [19-206CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED

CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Personnel Analyst

Communication from Alex Basquez, Director, Human

Resources Department

Staff report prepared by Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Ms. Sheree Valdoria, Personnel Analyst, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Representatives from the Human Resources and Civil Service Departments were available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

14. [19-207CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO RECEIVE AND FILE BULLETIN:

Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that there was a typographical error in the wording of the agenda item. It should have

read "Approved" and not "Receive and File."

Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked staff from both Civil Service and Human Resources for all their hard work in putting together the information for Personnel Analyst.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

15. [19-208CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE REVISED

CLASSIFICATION SPECIFICATION - Transportation Planner

Communication from Alex Basquez, Director, Human Resources Department

Staff report prepared by Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst

Ms. Pizarro Winting introduced Mr. Stanley Wang, Personnel Analyst, who briefed the Commission regarding this item.

Representatives from the Public Works Department were available to answer questions.

Vice President Morrison asked if this position was related to Traffic Engineer. Mr. Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer for Public Works, stated that the positions are related. He explained that this position will bridge the gap between the divisions in the Transportation Mobility Bureau. The position will focus on the mobility aspects of the City.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

16. [19-209CS](#)

RECOMMENDATION TO RECEIVE AND FILE REPORT FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE REVIEWING THE WONDERLIC TEST INSTRUMENT

Vice President Morrison and Commissioner Arias were part of the Wonderlic Subcommittee. Since Commissioner Arias was not available, Vice President Morrison read her report. She informed the Commission that the Wonderlic Subcommittee met four times to review the various components of the Wonderlic testing instrument. The subcommittee also reviewed examination results from various administered analyst exams. The subcommittee specifically compared results from the last Wonderlic exam to the last in-house created exam for the position of Administrative Analyst. The subcommittee could not substantiate any adverse impact from the use of the Wonderlic exam as administered. It was reported that candidates performed better on the exam that included the Wonderlic administration. The subcommittee did agree that some of the components of Wonderlic may need to be reconsidered so that the exam criteria can better match the skillsets required of the position. The subcommittee proposes the Commission make such a recommendation to staff to ensure all job skills are measured appropriately and within the suitable segment of the selection process.

Further discussion regarding the subcommittee's findings will be take place at the next Commission meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to receive and file the report from the Wonderlic Subcommittee. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 3 - Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica and Heather Morrison

Excused: 2 - Phyllis O. Arias and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

MANAGERS' REPORTS

Recruitment & Selection

Ms. Slaten updated the Commission on several events. Civil Service staff plan to conduct outreach at the following events: the Wonder Women Tech event on November 7th and November 8th at the Long Beach Convention Center, the 2nd Annual Legion Sports Festival on November 9th and 10th at the Long Beach Convention Center and the 23rd Annual Veterans Day Parade and Celebration on

Saturday, November 9th in North Long Beach. Staff will also be attending Tech Day at California State University, Long Beach that is scheduled for today, November 6th. Ms. Slaten also informed the Commission of a Fire Recruit orientation taking place this evening. She stated that this recruitment will be open until the end of this week.

Ms. Slaten thanked staff for their hard work in processing exam results and bulletins.

Special Projects

Ms. McDonald did not have any updates for the Commission.

Administration Support Services

Ms. Alamo did not have any updates for the Commission.

Executive Director

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she has completed her meet and greets with Department Heads, as well as with elected officials. Ms. Pizarro Winting will now see how Civil Service can innovate, collaborate and work together with departments regarding streamlining processes or even creating new ones. She is very excited for the next phase.

Ms. Pizarro Winting thanked staff for the amazing job they did in putting together the first Halloween event.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

No unfinished business was discussed.

NEW BUSINESS

Vice President Morrison announced changes in upcoming meeting dates. The Commission's regularly scheduled meeting on Wednesday, December 18, 2019 will be moved to Wednesday, December 11, 2019. Also, due to the New Year's holiday, the Commission will be moving its regularly scheduled meetings in January to the 2nd and 4th Wednesday. In January, the Commission will now meet on the following dates: Wednesday, January 8, 2020, and Wednesday, January 22, 2020.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – The Civil Service Commission will hear from members of the public on matters within the Commission’s jurisdiction.

There were no comments from the public.

ADJOURNMENT

Vice President Morrison adjourned the Commission meeting at 9:02 a.m., in memory of Joseph Awaida, his wife Raihan Dakhil and their son Omar who tragically lost their lives after being struck by a drunk driver on Halloween night.

NO HEARING

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។