

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAC2105-02
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
2711 East 1st Street
October 26, 2021**

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The project site is located within the Bluff Park Historic District, which was adopted in 1982 and amended under Ordinance number C-6835 (adopted in 1990). The project proposes to construct a one-story rear addition (118 square feet) to a single-family residence, demolish an existing detached three-car garage, and construct a new two-story rear structure on the property located at 2711 East 1st Street in the R-2-L Zoning District within the Bluff Park Historic District. The demolition of an existing detached three-car garage located at the rear of the property serves to allow for the construction of a new detached two-story structure, consisting of a four-car garage (1,080 square feet), accessory storage area (138 square feet), and a 1,439-square-foot dwelling unit located on the second floor with 454-square-feet of deck area. The project meets these requirements and those of the City's Zoning Code, subject to conditions.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. All work will be conducted pursuant to the Guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The proposed rear addition would not be visible from the street and the four-car garage and second unit will replace an existing detached garage structure located at the rear of the lot. The scope of work on the primary contributing structure also includes removal of existing aluminum clad siding (non-historic material) and replacement with wood siding (historic material) throughout the entire primary dwelling, removal of a rear trellis/patio cover, and replacement of non-historic aluminum windows with steel or wood windows. The scope of work related to siding and window restoration would result in the removal of non-historic materials on the primary dwelling.

The new two-story structure will be located in the same location as the existing garage and will maintain approximately 35 feet distance from the primary contributing dwelling located on the front of the lot along 1st Street. The new garage structure is proposed with a zero setback along the (east) side yard, a nine-foot

setback along the (west) side yard and five-foot setback along the rear property line. The new dwelling unit located above the garages will maintain the Zoning Code required four-foot setbacks along the (west and east) side yards and a four-foot setback along the rear property line. The new building is located in the rear of the lot and is not visible from East 1st Street.

The new building is compatible with the existing building scale and massing of the neighborhood as the historic district is developed with predominantly two-story buildings and with rear dwelling units located on the second floor above garages. The proposed rear structure is designed in a contemporary interpretation of the Craftsman architectural style. The building features a simple rectangular shaped building with a second floor that includes a cross-gable roof design. The second story is almost entirely the same dimensions as the structure's ground floor garage and footprint. The new building incorporates architectural features found within the district. The size, placement, and height of the two-story building will not adversely impact the adjacent properties or properties located in the district.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The proposed one-story addition to the primary structure and new two-story structure (garage and second floor dwelling unit) are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- Use – The site is currently developed with a single-family residential use and its function serving as a residential use will not change. The Zoning Code allows two residential units by-right in the R-2-L zoning district. The project will replace a detached garage with a Code-compliant, four-car garage and a second unit on the second floor above the new garage.
- Character – The existing residential structure is a two-story structure, and two-story rear structures are found in the vicinity of the subject site and throughout the Bluff Park Historic District. The one-story addition to the rear of the primary dwelling would not be visible from the public right-of-way. The 4"/12" roof pitch over the new one story addition would be compatible with the sloped roof planes on the primary structure, which maintain a combination of roof slopes, including 4"/12" slope, 6"/12" slope, and 12"/12" slope.

The new two-story structure will not change the character of the neighborhood or the district and will be located at the rear of the property,

screened from view from the street by the primary structure. The new building will incorporate similar features found on the primary structure and on contributing structures located in Bluff Park, such as gabled roof, metal windows (compatible with primary structure), wood siding, stucco exterior, and shingled roof. The conditions of approval will require that new windows be of high-quality materials. The new structure is differentiated in design and material from the primary structure but would not be visible from the street. The proposed building is compatible in size, scale and exterior building materials with the adjacent properties and other buildings in the district.

- **Changes to Historic Features** – The proposed addition to the primary structure would be located at the rear of the primary dwelling, which is a contributing resource for the district. The modifications to the rear include demolition of approximately 19-feet-4-inches of exterior walls at the northwest corner and rear of the structure and removal of a rear trellis. None of the modifications to the historic structure would be visible from the public right-of-way.

The new four-car garage and second dwelling unit structure will be detached and be located approximately 35 feet from the primary structure.

- **Historic Significance** – The addition to the rear of the historic structure would not be visible from the street and would not modify visible building components. The historic significance of the structure would not be diminished with the proposed addition. Furthermore, the project includes the removal of non-historic aluminum-clad siding and replacement with historic wood siding. The original wood siding can be found beneath the aluminum clad application and is beyond repair. This scope of the project would restore historic materials and reinforce the historic significance of the structure.

The proposed two-story structure at the rear of the property will not change the historic significance of the property or impact the integrity of the district. The new structure has been designed to complement the architectural style of the contributing residential structure and is consistent with the development pattern of the neighboring properties of the district at large. The existing two-story residence will remain.

- **Distinctive Features** – The new one-story addition would feature steel (or wood) windows to match the existing conditions, wood siding, and shingle roof. As conditioned, the materials would be of high quality and match the existing materials on the primary structure. The scope of work for siding replacement would restore original wood materials to the historic property. The removal of the rear trellis/patio cover would not be visible from the street.

The new two-story building will feature a combination of wood siding and smooth stucco exteriors, high-quality metal windows, and a shingle roof, similar to character defining features of structures found within the district and on the primary structure.

- **Deteriorated Historic Features** – No deteriorated historic features are found on the lot. Non-historic aluminum slider windows on the primary structure would be replaced with steel casement windows to match the predominant and historic windows on the primary structure. The condition of approval allows for restoration of wood windows on the primary structure in the future for further consistency with the Craftsman architectural style.
- **Damage to Historic Materials** – The aluminum clad siding on the primary structure would be replaced with wood siding, which would be consistent with the historic materials originally found on the primary structure. The rear trellis/patio cover would also be removed as part of the project, and this work would not be visible from the street. The addition to the primary structure would be only at the rear of the building and would require the removal of a portion of the exterior walls and sloped roof at the northeast corner of the structure.
- **Archeological Resources** – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known. No major excavations or grading is proposed.
- **Historic Materials that Characterize the Property** – The contributing resource, a two-story main residential dwelling on the lot, maintains a steep gable roof, a front-facing shed dormer, and a recessed porch and entry. The structure features aluminum-clad siding over original wood siding, steel windows, roof shingles, metal awnings, and brick steps and walkway. The proposed addition would be at the rear and would not alter or destroy existing historic materials that characterize the property. The scope of work to restore the wood siding would be an enhancement to materials that characterize the property. Non-historic aluminum slider windows would be restored to steel (or wood) windows to match the remainder of the windows on the residence.

The proposed two-story building will be detached from the primary structure and would not result in the removal or modification of historic materials that characterize the property.

- **Form and Integrity** – The rear addition and new two-story building will not cause damage to the essential form and integrity of the District. The rear one-story addition would include a 4"/12" sloped roof to complement the existing form of the historic property. The new addition, as conditioned, will provide a trim to differentiate original construction from the new addition. The form and integrity of the primary structure would not be compromised

with the rear addition. The two-story building is consistent in massing and size with the adjacent two-story buildings and the other two-story buildings found within the district.

In accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states the new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property or the district as a whole. The primary house is the historic resource on the lot. The proposed changes to the structure include a rear addition (118 square feet), removal of a rear trellis/patio cover, restoration of non-historic windows, and restoration of wood siding to the entire structure (removal of non-historic aluminum clad siding). No changes are proposed to the front of the structure beyond siding replacement/restoration. The new rear structure will replace a detached three-car garage with a four-car garage and a second unit located above. As proposed, subject to conditions, the rear addition, four-car garage and second unit meet current zoning regulations, the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance, and the Bluff Park Historic District Design Guidelines.

Standard No. 9. also states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." The new addition and building will have a size, scale, and profile that is compatible with the scale of the surrounding buildings and has been designed with consideration of the context of the structures adjacent to the subject site and other properties in the Bluff Park Historic District. The new building will be distinguished by contemporary materials that are differentiated from but complementary to the district.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The subject property is a contributing property within the Bluff Park Historic District. The Design Guidelines for the Bluff Park Historic District require that projects comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The Design Guidelines specify that "New construction should be generally compatible with the existing contributing buildings in size, scale, setbacks, height, massing, design, materials and architectural style to protect the overall character of the historic district...New construction is expected to reasonably 'blend in' with its surroundings, where feasible, but is not required to exactly match the contributing buildings." The Design Guidelines further notes, "The contributing residences within the Bluff Park Historic District are varied in style, but they are primarily two stories in height. Property owners planning new construction should consider including features like a gabled, pitched or flat roof with a parapet, wood or stucco cladding, traditional decorative features, prominent porches, rectangular window and door openings in their design and anticipate conforming to the prevailing height and setback in the district." The new two-story building has been designed similar in height to structures on nearby properties located along 1st Street. There is a precedent for two-story structures along Dodge Way and alleys in the Bluff

Park Historic District. The new addition to the primary structure is one-story and features a roof slope compatible with the historic structure. The new two-story structure along the alley would be compatible with other detached two-story structures along the alley. The new building will be compatible in size, mass, and scale to the existing buildings within the district. The new building features wood siding and stucco walls, rectangular and square shaped windows, and roof shingles. The building has additionally been conditioned to incorporate high-quality materials, such as windows. The proposed deck areas would feature contemporary features such as metal cable railing and a sliding glass door, neither of which would be visible from 1st Street.