

October 26, 2021

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing rear, detached, three-car garage and to construct a one-story addition to a single-family residence and a new two-story rear structure, consisting of a four-car garage (1,080 square feet), accessory storage area (138 square feet), and a 1,439-square-foot dwelling unit with 454-square-feet of deck areas located on the second floor, on the property located at 2711 East 1st Street in the R-2-L Zoning District within the Bluff Park Historic District. The existing residential structure situated in the front half of the lot is a contributing structure to the Bluff Park Historic District. (District 3)

APPLICANT: David Huffman
2455 McCready Ave
Los Angeles, CA 90039
(Application No. COAC2105-02)

THE REQUEST

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 118-square-foot rear addition to the primary structure, demolish the existing detached garage, and construct a new detached 1,080-square-foot, four-car garage and storage area (138 square feet) and a 1,439-square-foot, residential dwelling unit located on the second floor, above the garage.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on the north side of East 1st Street, between Molino Avenue and Temple Avenue within the R-2-L zone (Two-Family Residential District with Large Lots) (Attachment A - Vicinity Map). The subject property is 8,250 square feet in area (55 feet wide by 150 feet deep). The subject property is developed with a 2,034-square-foot, two-story single-family dwelling located at the front of the lot, which is a contributing structure to the Bluff Park Historic District, and a detached 946-square-foot three-car garage located along the rear of the property. The existing primary residence fronts East 1st Street and is set back approximately 28-feet-1-inches from the front property line. Based on City and Assessor Records, the house was constructed in 1909 and the detached garage was constructed in 1925.



The existing two-story residence was constructed in the Craftsman architectural style. The home features a gable roof system, second story shed dormer, horizontal aluminum clad over original wood siding, and steel and aluminum windows (Attachment B – Photographs). While steel windows are not typical of the Craftsman architectural style, the existing steel grid windows appear to be the extant windows at the time of district survey, based on which the subject property was determined to be a contributing structure. The home features a recessed entry and porch.

The existing detached garage structure takes access from the 20-foot-wide public alley (Dodge Way) abutting the rear of the property. The existing garage structure measures 20 feet deep by 47-feet-10-inches wide (946 square feet). The 1925 building permit for the garage reflects smaller dimensions than the existing site conditions.

ANALYSIS

The proposed project requires the approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because the proposed new construction exceeds 250 square feet of new area. To be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness.

PROPOSED PROJECT

Primary Dwelling

The proposed modifications to the primary structure include a one-story, 118-square-foot addition to the rear of an existing two-story single-family dwelling. The addition would be a 12-foot-3-inch by 10-foot-7-inch rectangular addition located at the northwest corner of the existing structure. The proposed project on the primary contributing structure also includes removal of aluminum clad siding and replacement with wood siding (historic material) throughout the entire primary dwelling, removal of a rear trellis/patio cover, and replacement of non-historic aluminum windows with steel windows to match the predominant window style on the structure. As conditioned, the new windows at the rear addition may be constructed of steel or wood material. Wood windows would also be consistent with the Craftsman architectural style in the event the historic-age steel windows are restored to wood construction.

The rear addition will extend the primary structure approximately 13 feet toward the rear. The existing 9-foot-9-inch side yard setback would be maintained consistent with the existing structure. The addition would maintain wood siding to match the restored elevations, which reflects the removal of non-historic aluminum clad siding and replacement with wood siding (historic material). The new addition would accommodate a master bedroom and attic area at the sloped roof.

The new rear addition would comply with the height requirements (35 feet and two stories) for the R-2-L Zoning District. The rear addition would be one-story in height and feature a 4"/12" slope that transitions from the existing roof, which presently maintains a 12"/12" slope. Where

the rear trellis/patio cover would be removed, the existing metal roofing over the existing rear building area would be replaced with built-up asphalt roof material typical for flat or low slope roofs.

The addition has been designed to be consistent with the materials and style of the primary structure. The exterior finishes found on the existing contributing structure would be carried through to the addition, which includes horizontal wood siding to match the restored primary structure, steel (or wood) windows, and a shingle sloped roof. As conditioned, the new addition would include a vertical trim at the addition to differentiate the new building area from the original structure.

Rear Structure

In addition to the proposed addition to the historic residential structure, the project scope includes the demolition of the existing detached, three-car garage and the construction of a new two-story rear structure consisting of a four-car garage, accessory storage area, and second story dwelling unit. The existing garage is an oversized three-car garage that is rectangular in size and takes access from the abutting public alley (Dodge Way). The one-story structure maintains a flat roof and horizontal siding. The existing detached garage was likely modified from the original garage reflected on the 1925 building permit record, as that record reflects 20-foot by 18-foot dimensions. The existing garage onsite is 20-feet-7-inches by 39-feet-1-inch (946 square feet). The garage features a recessed elevation, which may indicate the area added after the 1925 building permit.

The new two-story building spans the width of the lot (allowed setback to setback) at the rear and features a gabled roof system and cantilevered building and deck areas. The ground floor consists of a four-car garage with an interior half bathroom, a storage room, and an exterior stairwell which leads to the second-floor residential unit above. The second floor features a residential dwelling unit consisting of a living room, dining room, kitchen, two bedrooms, two bathrooms, and open deck areas. The two-story building will feature three deck areas that total 454 square feet.

The proposed rear building will be located in the same location as the existing garage. The new ground floor storage area and second floor habitable areas will be located approximately 35 feet to the rear of the existing house when accounting for the proposed rear addition. The extent of the deck areas at the rear unit and the new rear addition to the primary dwelling would be approximately 25 feet apart. The new structure complies with the required side and rear setbacks for both accessory structures and residential dwelling units. The garage and storage area are proposed with a zero setback along the (east) side yard, a nine-foot setback along the (west) side yard for the garage and five-foot setback along the rear property line. The second floor consists entirely of living area for the new dwelling and is proposed with four-foot side yard setbacks and a four-foot rear yard setback. The project would feature three open deck areas. The interior courtyard decks would maintain four-foot side yard setbacks and five feet at the rear.

The development standards for the R-2-L zone limit building heights to not more than 35 feet and two stories. The new rear addition and two-story building comply with the height requirement. The rear addition would be one-story in height and feature a 4"/12" slope that transitions from the existing roof, which maintains a 12"/12" slope. The new two-story structure is proposed with a maximum height of 26-feet-9- inches, as measured to the top of the ridge of the highest sloped roof.

The Zoning Code requires two enclosed parking spaces for each dwelling unit. The plans illustrate a four-car garage as required by code. The garage area will total 1,080 square feet in size. Vehicular access for the new garage will continue to be taken from the rear alley. The project proposes the required 24-foot vehicular back up which includes the use of the alley. A 138-square-foot accessory storage area would be attached to the garage toward the interior of the property.

The new structure has been designed in a contemporary interpretation of the Craftsman architectural style and will feature similar gabled roof areas and exterior finishes found on the existing contributing structure. The two-story structure would feature a gable roof system with shingles to complement the primary dwelling. The proposed cross-gable design includes a pop out portion of the sloped roof at a parallel slope. The combination of 4"/12" and 8"/12" slopes would complement and differentiate from the sloped roof areas on the primary structure. The new building exterior will also feature horizontal wood siding to match the restored primary structure, smooth stucco at the ground level garage areas, and roof shingles to match the primary structure. The structure will feature decorative elements such as wood columns located beneath the cantilevered deck area, metal windows, and deck areas with metal cable railings. Two 16-foot-wide garage doors are featured on the structure's rear (north) elevation facing the alley (Dodge Way). The building will feature an off-white color to match the primary structure (Attachment C - Plans).

The plans illustrate that the new building will feature a combination of sliding, casement, and awning metal windows. In effort to ensure the windows are compatible with the windows on the contributing structure, a condition was added to require the use of high-quality windows and that all of the new windows will feature wood trims and sills.

The plans illustrate that the property's on-site open space includes the existing courtyard area at the interior of the site. The project does not include new landscaping at the interior beyond restoration of disturbed areas. As conditioned, all paved driveway areas shall be constructed of Portland Cement Concrete.

COMPATIBILITY

The proposed addition is a rear addition that is sited to minimize visibility from the street. It has been designed to complement the existing primary dwelling. The new rear structure has been designed in a contemporary interpretation of the Craftsman architectural style, which is the style of the primary dwelling and is present within the context of the district.

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

October 26, 2021

Page 5 of 7

The proposed detached structure will feature a combination of wood siding and stucco exterior walls. The new windows would be of metal materials similar but differentiated from the primary structure. The deck areas would feature metal cable railings and accented with wood columns. The gable roof system would feature a cross-gable design where a portion of the sloped roof feature pops out at a parallel slope. The rear structure includes a combination of 4"/12" slope and 8"/12" slopes, which complement and differentiate from the sloped roof areas on the primary structure.

The proposed two-story structure is designed to be compatible with the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance and the Bluff Park Design Guidelines and to complement the neighborhood at large. The new building will be located at the rear of the property adjacent to the alley and the design of the building will not negatively impact the appearance or character of the neighborhood. The Bluff Park Historic Ordinance states that "Construction...shall conform to the bulk, mass, scale, and height of the majority of existing structures on both sides of the block...The style of architecture, use of materials...shall not be uncharacteristically different from the predominant style of the immediate surroundings." The new two-story building is compatible with the existing neighborhood development patterns found within Bluff Park, in which it is typical to have residential dwelling units located above detached garages.

The Bluff Park Design Guidelines specify that:

"new construction should be generally compatible with the existing contributing buildings in size, scale, setbacks, height massing, design, materials and architectural style to protect the overall character of the historic district...New construction is expected to reasonably blend in...The contributing residences within the Bluff Park Historic District are varied in style, but they are primarily two stories in height. New construction should include features like a gabled, pitched or flat roof with a parapet, wood or stucco cladding, traditional decorative features, prominent porches, rectangular windows and door openings and conform to the prevailing height and setback in the district, especially that of the contributing properties immediately adjacent to the proposed new construction."

Consistent with the above, the new building has been designed similar to the adjacent properties and the properties located on the same block of 1st Street. The adjacent properties are developed with two-story structures and a number of the structures located adjacent to the alley (Dodge Way) are developed with dwelling units located above garages. The new building will be compatible in size, mass, and scale to the existing buildings on the block and within the district.

The design of the new structure is compatible with the existing development within the neighborhood and the district in general. The building has been conditioned to incorporate specific design features such as the use of high-quality windows and that all of the new windows will feature wood trims and sills.

The proposed project is compatible with the existing residence's scale, mass and architectural style as well as the district. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." In compliance with Standard No. 9, the proposed two-story structure is designed in a contemporary architectural style that borrows from the materials and features of the primary, contributing structure on the lot, but is also differentiated by its roof design and materials, as compared to that of the primary historic structure. Moreover, the new building will be located at the rear of lot and will be properly screened from view from 1st Street.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, the Bluff Park Historic District Ordinance and the Bluff Park Design Guidelines. With conditions, Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of an addition to the primary structure (118 square feet), demolition of the existing detached garage, and construction of a new detached accessory structure located at the rear of the lot comprised of a 1,080-square-foot, four-car garage and storage area (138 square feet) and a 1,439-square-foot, residential dwelling unit located on the second floor, above the garage. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions and materials to the architectural style of the existing structure on the property and with the context of the District (Attachment D – Findings). Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the conditions of approval (Attachment E – Conditions of Approval).

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorically Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

A total of 845 public notices were distributed on October 11, 2021. As of the preparation of this staff report, no public correspondence has been received in response to the noticing of this project.

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

October 26, 2021

Page 7 of 7

Respectfully submitted,



MARYANNE CRONIN
PROJECT PLANNER



ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER



ALISON SPINDLER- RUIZ, AICP
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER



PATRICIA A. DIEFENDERFER, AICP
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

PD:ASR:AP:mc

Attachments: Attachment A – Vicinity Map
Attachment B – Photographs
Attachment C – Plans
Attachment D – Findings
Attachment E – Conditions of Approval