

Attachment D
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAC2104-02
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
352 Carroll Park West

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission) and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site, 352 Carroll Park West, is located within the Carroll Park Historic District, which was established in 1990 (C-6761). The property is currently improved with a 1,118 square foot, single-story house and a detached three-car garage. The dwelling unit is designed in a Craftsman Colonial architectural style and was constructed in 1919.

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), staff has analyzed the proposed project and finds that the project meets these requirements and those of the City's Municipal Code.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. All work will be conducted pursuant to the guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The existing 651-square-foot, three-car garage is proposed to be reconfigured to include a 385-square-foot, two-car garage with a 266-square-foot accessory office space and a new 800-square-foot, second story accessory dwelling unit (ADU) and will be detached and located in the same location as the original garage footprint. The ADU will cantilever 2 feet, 4 inches along the west of the garage and a portion of the second floor ADU along the east elevation will cantilever 4 feet. As designed, the second floor ADU will maintain an approximate separation of 31 feet to the principal structure and the existing accessory structure will maintain a 34-foot separation as the existing 2007 structure does. The applicant has worked to minimize visual impacts as it relates to visibility from the street and massing impacts to the property.

The design and exterior materials of the proposed accessory structure are compatible with the primary structure's Craftsman Colonial architectural style and the overall context of the district. The reconfigured garage space with an ADU

above will maintain an overall height of 22 feet, 8 inches measured to the top of ridge of the new roof. The reconfigured garage with a second floor ADU will be compatible with the original residence on the property by matching the architectural style, window style, attic vents and exterior paint color and materials. The size, placement, and height of the new ADU above the reconfigured garage is designed to minimize impacts to historic character and features of the existing structure and properties in the district and would not adversely affect the subject property's status as a contributing structure. As proposed, the project will maintain an appropriate scale within the property, with the context of the Carroll Park Historic District and the context of the block, which consists of a mix of one- and two-story structures and a variety of architectural styles ranging from Craftsman, Spanish Colonial Revival and Minimal Traditional structures. Five properties have been identified on the subject block that are developed with two-story structures, either in the form of second-story additions to the primary structures or detached two-story structures at the rear of the property. Furthermore, the subject site directly abuts a property to the north that has a detached two-story rear building with a garage and a dwelling unit on the second floor.

As it pertains to the proposed project, additional effort has been made to ensure that the reconfigured garage and ADU has been designed through the massing and use of materials and architectural features to maximize compatibility with the architecture of the site and surrounding properties and thus to minimize visual impacts to the extent feasible.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The proposed ADU is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- Use – The existing use is a single-family residence consisting of a one-story structure. The use of the existing structure as a single-family home will remain unchanged with the proposed scope of work.
- Character – The character-defining features of the original residence will remain unchanged. The proposed accessory garage/ADU structure and all features will be compatible in size, scale and exterior building materials to the existing residence, adjacent properties, and other buildings in the District.

- Changes to Historic Features – There are no changes to the primary residence as part of the proposed project. The proposed ADU will be detached from and constructed behind the primary structure. The design of and exterior materials used for the ADU will be compatible with the historic features of the primary structure.
- Historic Significance – The proposed accessory structure will not change the historic significance of the property or affect the integrity of the district. As proposed, the scale and size of the ADU does not detract from the existing primary residence as a contributing structure or as a primary structure.
- Distinctive Features – The proposed detached accessory structure will not change the distinctive features of the existing contributing building or property. The existing features of the primary residence will remain in place. The ADU would be constructed in an appropriate scale, location, and design that would not obscure existing distinctive features of the primary residence, which is the contributing structure on the property.
- Deteriorated Historic Features – There are no deteriorated historic features addressed as part of this proposal. As conditioned, all windows to be installed on the new accessory structure are to be wood windows. Historic features and materials of the existing primary residence, such as horizontal wood siding and window trim, remain intact.
- Damage to Historic Materials – The new detached accessory structure will not cause damage to the historic features of the existing structure.
- Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known. No major excavations or grading is proposed.
- Historic Materials that Characterize the Property – The reconfigured garage and ADU constructed above will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. Generally, the proposed project was designed to maintain the historic features of the site, including the site layout and the orientation of the site.
- Form and Integrity – The reconfigured garage and ADU would be detached and located in the same rear location and largely within the same footprint as the existing garage. In doing so, it maintains the basic site layout and orientation and will not cause damage to the essential form nor the integrity of the existing structure or the District. Although the new ADU above the reconfigured garage is not an original characteristic found on the property, the new construction of the structure has been designed in such a way to

be compatible with the principal structure's architectural style while minimizing visibility in its rear location.

In accordance with Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Standard No. 9, which states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features...". As designed, the new two-story accessory structure has been designed to complement and match the architectural style of the main dwelling, but also incorporates treatments that delineate the new construction and differentiate the proposed project from the original main dwelling as well as from the garage, which is not an original development feature of the site. Those treatments include a gabled roof instead of clipped gable roof system found in the principal structure and adding 1 foot, 6 inches eaves along the north and south elevations. As such, the proposed project will provide a cohesive design between the garage/ADU structure and the existing structure without giving a false sense of history.

The new ADU will have a size, scale, and profile that is compatible with the scale of the existing residence and has been designed with consideration of the context of the structures adjacent to the subject site and other properties in the Carroll Park Historic District. The overall scale, size, and design of the detached accessory structure does not detract from the existing primary residence as a primary structure or as a contributing structure in the Carroll Park Historic District.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The subject property is a contributing property within the Carroll Park Historic District. The District ordinance requires that projects comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. In addition, the Carroll Park Design Guidelines address the design of accessory buildings, including ADUs. The proposed project would comply with the design guidelines, as the proposed accessory garage/office/ADU structure is detached from the principal structure, located in the rear half of the property, largely utilizes the footprint of the existing three-car garage, and includes features and materials compatible with the contributing structure on the lot. The reconfigured garage space with an ADU above would not obscure or damage existing character-defining features or structures on the property. The proposed style of architecture, use of materials, and exterior finishes are not uncharacteristically different from the predominant style of the existing residence and of the immediate surroundings. The historic character of the existing primary structure would remain intact with construction of the new detached structure.