

October 26, 2021

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS
City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Certificate of Appropriateness to convert an existing 651-square-foot, three-car garage into a 385-square-foot, two-car garage with a 266-square-foot accessory office and to construct a new 800-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) on the second floor with a 130 square-foot deck. The property is located at 352 Carroll Park West. No changes are proposed to the existing primary residence located on the front half of the lot, which is a contributing structure within the Carroll Park Historic District. (District 2)

APPLICANT: Julie Lopez
1205 Pine Avenue Suite 201
Long Beach, CA 90813
(Application No. COAC2104-02)

THE REQUEST

The applicant is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to convert an existing 651-square-foot, three-car-garage into a two-car garage with a 266-square-foot accessory office and to construct a new second floor, 800-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU). The two-car garage will be retrofitted in the same location as the original garage and will remain detached from the principal structure.

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on the east side of Carroll Park West, between Carroll Park North to the north and Carroll Park South to the south (Attachment A – Vicinity Map) within the R-1-N zoning district (Single-Family Residential District with Standard Lots). The project site is located on a 5,800-square-foot lot and is developed with a single-story, 1,118 square-foot single-family residence built in 1919 built in the Craftsman Colonial architectural style; the primary structure is a contributing structure in the Carroll Park Historic District. The detached 651 square-foot three car garage was built in 2007.



The garage is currently set back approximately 110 feet from the front property, four (4) feet from the side property line to the north, five (5) feet from the side property line to the south and maintains an approximate 34-foot separation from the principal structure. Per City records, a building permit was issued on November 16, 2007, for the removal of the existing garage to construct a new 651 square-foot three car garage with a half bathroom, which makes this garage non-original to the property. The existing garage currently takes access from a shared driveway to the north of the property.

As previously noted, the existing primary residence is a contributing structure in the Carroll Park Historic District and was constructed in 1919, based on City and assessor records. The existing main dwelling is designed in the Craftsman Colonial architectural style. The overall height of the primary structure is 17 feet to the top of the highest peak of the gabled roof. The garage has an overall height of 12 feet to the peak of the gabled roof and is designed with similar architectural features as those found on the principal structure. The exterior cladding of the main dwelling consists of horizontal wood siding, single-hung and picture wood windows, clipped cross gable roof system, eaves and exposed roof rafters, and vertical slat attic vents. The primary dwelling is currently painted in a Roycroft Bronze Green color for the base, light gray within the wood window mullion and sash, and a dark green along the window trim and eaves. The existing residence is well-preserved and retains most of the original features of the structure's Craftsman Colonial architectural style (Attachment B – Site Photos).

ANALYSIS

The proposed project requires approval of the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) because the proposed new construction exceeds 250 square feet, and, as a two-story structure, will have some visibility from the street. To be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the findings for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

PROPOSAL

The applicant proposes to convert the existing 651-square-foot, three-car garage into a 385-square-foot, two-car-garage with a 266-square-foot accessory space to be used as an office. In addition, the applicant proposes to build an 800-square-foot ADU above the accessory space, in order to maximize use of the lot, while ensuring compliance with applicable development standards and historic standards relating to site planning and design of infill development. No changes are proposed to the primary residence.

The proposed ADU is permitted by-right by State law and the R-1-N zoning district of the property, subject to compliance with unit size requirements and other ADU development standards. This application is limited to design review by the CHC, pursuant to Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (CHC), for consistency with historic district standards. An ADU can be accommodated on the site due to the fact that it is not subject to the same rear yard setback requirement applicable to the principal dwelling unit and is instead permitted to observe a significantly smaller setback, in accordance with State law.

The proposed project will require the 651-square-foot garage to be retrofitted to accommodate the structural weight of and support the second story ADU. Although demolition is not within the proposed scope of work, if necessary, the non-contributing garage could be demolished and rebuilt to accommodate new second floor ADU. This has been clarified within a condition of approval. The existing garage has horizontal wood siding, similar to that found on the principal structure and has garage doors with panels and windows which will be maintained, and a gabled roof system with a maximum height of 12 feet to the peak of the roof. The reinforced garage will be converted into a 385-square-foot, two-car garage with a 266-square-foot accessory office space which will include a laundry room and a half bathroom. The existing single garage door will be removed, infilled with siding to match the existing garage, and a new pedestrian door and window added to accommodate the office space. A total of five single-hung wood windows are proposed on the first floor west, south and east elevations of the accessory structure. An open staircase is proposed directly behind the accessory structure along the east elevation that will lead to the second floor ADU and will be setback four (4) feet from the side property line to the north and five (5) feet from the rear property line to the east (Attachment C – Plans).

The proposed ADU over the detached accessory structure will consist of two bedrooms, two bathrooms, a kitchen and a living room. The ADU will also include a 130 square-foot deck on the second floor, which is located on the east elevation to provide private open space for the unit. The 800-square-foot ADU will maintain the same side yard setbacks as the garage. The ADU will cantilever 2 feet, 4 inches along the west side of the garage and a portion of the second floor along the east elevation will cantilever four (4) feet. As designed, the second floor ADU will maintain an approximate separation of 31 feet from the principal structure.

Several architectural features found on the primary structure are proposed to be incorporated as part of the second floor ADU, including the horizontal wood siding, single-hung wood windows and the same exterior paint color palate as found on the principal structure. The structure will also incorporate vertical slat vents similar to those found on the primary dwelling to further ensure compatibility in architectural design. The overall height of the proposed structure will be 22 feet, 8 inches to the top of the roof pitch. To help mitigate visual impacts of the two-story structure, the project proposes lower ceiling heights including 8-foot floor-to-ceiling heights for the first-floor garage and office, and 8 foot, 6 inches within the second-floor ADU, in order to minimize the overall height of the structure. The proposed structure's massing and height is generally consistent with the variable building heights found in the vicinity of the subject site and throughout the district. The new construction of the structure has been designed in such a way to be consistent with the principal structure's architectural style and form and is screened substantially by the principal structure's roof line.

The project proposes a total of 10 windows on the second floor ADU, eight of which are single-hung windows and two horizontal fixed windows which are compatible with the district. To ensure privacy standards are met per LBMC 21.51.276, the project will be conditioned to include obscured glazing on the single-hung wood windows along the north and south elevations of the second floor ADU. All proposed wood windows will have wood trim to match the existing main dwelling, in accordance with the Craftsman Style Guide. Lastly, as

conditioned, any future change of windows in the proposed ADU are required to be historically appropriate wood windows.

COMPATIBILITY

The Carroll Park Historic District Design Guidelines permit ADUs subject to meeting the City's Zoning Code and applicable development standards. The guidelines contemplate both attached and detached ADUs and provide guidance for both, and generally require that proposed ADUs be compatible with the primary structure's design, materials and architectural style. The guidelines also state that ADUs shall appear as secondary to the primary structure and should minimize the visibility from the public right-of-way.

As proposed, the scale and size of the accessory structure comprised of the reconfigured to a two-car garage and office and a second-story ADU does not detract from the existing main dwelling as a contributing structure or as a primary structure, and it preserves the primary structure's historic character, in compliance with Secretary of Interior Standards.

The proposed structure is generally compatible with the existing residence's architectural style and is designed both to be compatible with and differentiated from the original development on the site. In accordance with Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation Standard No. 9, which states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." the new two-story structure has been designed to complement and match the architectural style of the main dwelling but also incorporates treatments that delineate the new construction and differentiate the project from the original main dwelling and the garage, which is not an original development feature of the site. Those treatments include a gabled roof instead of clipped gable roof system found in the principal structure and adding 1-foot, 6-inch eaves along the north and south elevations. As such, the proposed project will provide a cohesive design between the garage/ADU and the existing structure without giving a false sense of history.

As outlined above, the proposed second story ADU is consistent with the applicable guidelines, complies with applicable Zoning Code requirements, and is permitted by the provisions of State law governing ADUs. As proposed, the project will maintain an appropriate scale with the context of the Carroll Park Historic District and the context of the block, which consists of a mix of one- and two-story structures and a variety of architectural styles ranging from Craftsman, Spanish Colonial Revival and Minimal Traditional structures. Five properties have been identified on the subject block that are developed with two-story structures, either in the form of second-story additions to the primary structures or detached two-story structures at the rear of the property. Furthermore, the subject site directly abuts a property to the north with a detached two-story rear structure consisting of a garage and a dwelling unit on the second floor.

In consideration of the above, staff has worked with the applicant to ensure a project that meets applicable guidelines and regulations and results in the most compatible design. The proposed project has resulted in reduced massing to the extent feasible and adheres to historic

preservation standards, in that it has been designed to incorporate elements and materials that match the principal structure's historic features, and it appropriately differentiates the new construction from the historic structure while maintaining existing site planning patterns such as maintaining the location of the garage and vehicular access to the garage at the rear of the lot and designing a structure that is secondary to the primary structure in terms of its scale and massing. This same development pattern is found in the vicinity of the proposed project, such as the neighboring property located at 365-368 that has a similar site layout with a rear two-story structure comprised of a second dwelling unit above a two-car garage, located behind an existing single-story Craftsman house. As it pertains to the proposed project, additional effort has been made to ensure that the reconfigured garage/ADU has been designed through the massing and use of materials and architectural features to maximize compatibility with the architecture of the site and surrounding properties and thus to minimize visual impacts to the extent feasible.

In conclusion, the proposed ADU above the two-car garage and accessory office space will have minimal visual impacts when viewed from the front of the lot along Carroll Park West. The proposed ADU will be consistent and in full compliance with the City's residential development standards for the R-1-N (Single-Family Residential District with Standard Lots zoning district, the Carroll Park Historic District Ordinance (C-6761), the Carroll Park Historic District Design Guidelines and the Craftsman Style Guide. The proposed ADU is located in the rear half of the property and will be compatible in massing and size and will be architecturally compatible yet distinguishable from the original building.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Carroll Park Historic District Ordinance (Attachment D – Findings). Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the conditions of approval (Attachment E – Conditions of Approval), to convert an existing 651-square-foot, three-car garage into a two-car garage with a 266-square-foot accessory office space and to construct a new second story 800-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) above the accessory space. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions and materials to the architectural style of the existing structure on the property and with the context of the District.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This project has been reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Based on that assessment, the City has determined the project to be Categorically Exempt from the provisions of CEQA pursuant to the provisions of Article 19 Section 15303 (a) (new construction or conversion of small structures) of the CEQA Guidelines. No further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

Public notices were distributed on October 12, 2021. As of this date, no responses were received to this project at the time of this report.

Respectfully submitted,



SERGIO GUTIERREZ
PROJECT PLANNER



ALEJANDRO PLASCENCIA
PRESERVATION PLANNER



ALISON SPINDLER- RUIZ, AICP
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER



PATRICIA DIEFENDERFER, AICP
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

PD:ASR:AP:sg

Attachments: Attachment A – Vicinity Map
Attachment B – Site Photos
Attachment C – Plans
Attachment D – Findings
Attachment E – Conditions of Approval