

**CITY OF LONG BEACH
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 18, 2021
LONG BEACH WATER DEPARTMENT
1800 E WARDLOW ROAD, LONG BEACH CA
90807, 8:30 AM**

Joen Garnica, President
Brandon Dowling, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner
Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner
Yvonne Wheeler, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES

SPECIAL MEETING

**CHANGE IN LOCATION:
LONG BEACH WATER DEPARTMENT
1800 E WARDLOW ROAD, LONG BEACH, CA 90807**

President Garnica called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m.

FLAG SALUTE

President Garnica asked former Civil Service Commissioner Heather Morrison to lead the pledge of allegiance.

ROLL CALL

Commissioners Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond,
Present: Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.**

There were no comments from the public.

At this time, President Garnica reordered Agenda Item 12 – Recognition of Former Civil Service Commissioner Heather Morrison.

Ms. Pizarro Winting congratulated Ms. Morrison for her years of service to the Commission. Ms. Morrison thanked the Commission and staff. The Commission thanked Ms. Morrison for her service and time and wished her well in her new position.

2. [21-226CS](#) **Recommendation to approve minutes:**
Special Meeting of August 4, 2021

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 10):

President Garnica informed the Commission that staff requested to pull Agenda Item 9 on behalf of the department. Commissioner Arias pulled Agenda Items 3 and 4 for separate discussions.

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Wheeler, seconded by Vice President Dowling, to approve Consent Calendar Items (5-8 and 10), except for Items (3,4 and 9). The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez
Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

3. [21-227CS](#) **Recommendation to approve examination results:**
Construction Inspector I-II

Planner I-V
Port Security System Operator
School Guard Test #08
Traffic Signal Technician I-II

Commissioner Arias liked the format of the Examination Results and asked if it was new. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that a new format was created so that it met the needs of the Commission. President Garnica commented that the new format was helpful to understand the breakdown. Ms. Pizarro Winting complimented Employment Services staff for working together to create the new format.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond echoed the previous comments. She wanted clarification on the meaning of Insufficient Experience related to the Construction Inspector examination results. Ms. Goings responded that based on the auto score, applicants met the minimum qualifications; however, after additional screening applicants did not meet qualifications related to experience.

A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

4. [21-228CS](#)

Recommendation to approve bulletin(s):

Administrative Aide I-II
Animal Control Officer I-II

Commissioner Arias asked if Administrative Aide is a classification where there are a lot of applicants and if it has always been promotional. Ms. Davalos responded that this has typically been a promotional recruitment and confirmed there are quite a few internal applicants who apply. Commissioner Arias asked if it was an entry level position and what other positions does it lead to. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that it is an entry level position that serves as a bridge classification to the analyst series.

A brief discussion with Commissioner Arias and Ms. Tamura took

place regarding the edits to the bulletin. It was discussed that the color of the font as it relates to track changes does not have any significant meaning. It was also confirmed that the duties are reflective of the Classification Specification.

A motion was made by Vice President Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Wheeler, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

5. [21-229CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):

Martin Acosta, Library Clerk I, Library Services (15 yrs., 3 mos.)

Luis Possie, Maintenance Assistant I, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine (20 yrs., 10 mos.)

Simeon Rodriguez, Power Equipment Repair Mechanic II, Department of Parks, Recreation and Marine (30 yrs., 1 mo.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

6. [21-230CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file disability retirement(s):

David Faris, Police Lieutenant, Police Department (26 yrs., 6 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

7. [21-231CS](#)

Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):

Jessica Antes, Communications Center Supervisor, Department of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Communications (15 yrs., 5 mos.)

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

8. [21-232CS](#) **COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Frances Ginder, Public Health Associate
Communication from Kelly Colopy, Director, Department of Health and Human Services
Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

9. [21-233CS](#) WITHDRAWN
~~**COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours**~~ - Connie Rivera, Public Health Associate
~~*Communication from Kelly Colopy, Director, Department of Health and Human Services*~~
~~*Staff report prepared by Maria Cano, Personnel Analyst*~~

This CS-Agenda Item was withdrawn.

10. [21-234CS](#) **COVID-19 RELATED: Recommendation to Extend Non-Career Hours** - Justine Zapata, Clerk Typist III-NC
Communication from Sandra Kennedy, Administrative Officer, Department of Financial Management
Staff report prepared by Desiree Davalos, Personnel Analyst

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

REGULAR AGENDA

11. [21-235CS](#) **FIRE RECRUIT DEMOGRAPHICS**

Deputy Director Crystal Slaten, Personnel Analyst Shellie Goings and Fire Captain Dennis Garrett presented a PowerPoint presentation on recruitment outreach efforts, demographics and an overall summary regarding the process for Fire Recruit 2021.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked for clarification regarding the number of Hispanic applicants in 2020 versus 2021. Ms. Goings responded that the percentage will show the increase as there was a difference in the size of the candidate pool between the two years.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if staff has ever considered a filing period that was longer than a week and is it a detriment to getting a diverse pool. Ms. Goings responded that the filing period has been extended over the years beginning at 3 days to now an entire week in order to meet demand as well as to include diversity. She explained that staff was receiving over 2,000 applications and now with the extended filing period, staff can receive well over 5,000 applications. Ms. Pizarro Winting added that with the recruitment outreach efforts, staff is building relationships far in advance of opening the recruitment allowing candidates to know when the limited filing period will be.

Commissioner Dowling commented that he is encouraged by the growth in some of the numbers that were presented regarding women applicants as well as those people of color, but did not see movement regarding black applicants who applied and those that made the eligible list and were banded. He asked if there is a concern that there isn't growth in those areas and wanted to know what outreach is being done to try and grow the numbers. Captain Garrett explained they plan for outreach efforts to local churches and other communities. He stated that the pandemic halted some of the efforts, but they are going to do their best to get information out there.

President Garnica wanted to know if the Fire Department visits the high schools for Career Day. Captain Garrett responded that he hopes to, but school has been online. When the new school year begins, he will be instructing the Fire Science class at Jordan High School. He stated that in the past they have stopped by high schools as an effort to reach out to the kids.

Commissioner Wheeler commented that she also recognizes that there are few African American in the City of Long Beach especially the Fire Department and is alarmed by the fact that there are no African American women in the Fire Department. She

wanted to know if staff has reached out to black media and communities. Captain Garrett responded that they have several things that they are putting together and will show progress in the future. He stated that he has made several phone calls to various organizations but has not received a response. Commissioner Wheeler stated that she will assist Captain Garrett in reaching out.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond thanked staff for the detailed report that was presented and thanked the Fire Department for presenting a transparent process in their recruitment efforts. She stated that one observation that she made was that our numbers are down overall and there is a lot of work to be done in communities of color and in the female area. She encouraged the Fire Department to use the Commission in any way as they can help and have networks they can reach out to. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond encouraged the Fire Department to reach out to middle school youth as that is a crucial age. She stated that our brown and black kids from middle school are going to jail and providing them with a little light of hope would be wonderful.

President Garnica thanked everyone for their work and is looking forward in seeing how the numbers increase as we start becoming deliberate in our actions about diversity and demographics. She asked if the Unknown Category could be relabeled to Preferred Not to Answer as language and words matter. Ms. Goings responded that she could change the title. President Garnica noticed that Other has been changed to Another. She stated that she is hopeful that one day people of mixed races would be able to identify as such rather than be put in an Another box.

A discussion took place with President Garnica, Captain Garret and Ms. Goings regarding the number of females that participated in the interview process as well as the female workshop. It was discussed that typically two to five females participate in the interview process and this time there were seven. It was also discussed that there are plans to facilitate another female workshop.

President Garnica commented that she previously made a request to see the demographics from start to finish. She would like to see numbers from the time the recruitment process begins to a year after being hired. She stated that telling the story gives us an insight

into opportunity to what people of color may need to be successful moving through the process.

Deputy Fire Chief Dennis Buchanan provided additional information regarding recruitment efforts and demographics and thanked the Commission for their feedback.

A discussion took place with President Garnica, Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the demographics for the Police Department. Staff will request a similar demographics report from the Police Department. It was mentioned that the Commission would like to see demographics from the time the process begins to a year after being hired.

A motion was made by Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond, seconded by Commissioner Arias, to receive and file the presentation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Yvonne Wheeler, Susana Gonzalez Edmond, Brandon Dowling and Joen Garnica

12. [21-236CS](#) RECOGNITION OF FORMER CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSIONER HEATHER MORRISON

This item was previously discussed.

13. STANDING COMMITTEES

A. Executive Committee

The Executive Committee did not have any new information to report.

B. Recruitment and Selection Committee

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that Committee members are finalizing a meeting date to discuss the educational requirements for minimum qualifications.

C. Special Projects Committee

The Special Projects Committee did not have any new information to report.

14. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS

A. Recruitment and Outreach Services Division - Crystal Slaten

Ms. Slaten reported that her division had an opportunity to attend 6th District Councilwoman Saro's Open House event last week and was able to discuss hiring processes and employment opportunities. She commented that it was nice to physically be out in the community. Ms. Slaten reported that her division will be attending a Resource Fair and Backpack Giveaway at Drake Park on Thursday, August 19th that is being hosted by Centro Cha. She stated that her division is also working on the logistics to attend the Uptown Jazz Festival.

B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald

Ms. McDonald was not available to provide a report.

C. Administration and Support Services Division - Maria Alamo

Ms. Alamo provided updates on the building of fiscal year 2022 and closing of fiscal year 2021 and stated that several budget hearings have taken place. She stated that Economic Development, Fire and Civil Service presented their budgets at the budget hearing last night. The next one to take place is on August 24th.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know what budget information was presented to City Council. Ms. Alamo stated that it was related to key services that Civil Service provides and accomplishments. She stated that once the budget for fiscal year 2022 is adopted, it will be brought to the Commission. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked if the needs of Civil Service were shared. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the presentation was more reflective on how the pandemic impacted services. She stated that we are still in the process of gathering information on how it will impact the budget and that specific requests were not made. Ms. Alamo stated that once fiscal year 2022 is adopted, she will make a presentation to the Commission. She will provide another presentation once fiscal year 2021 closes. Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond stated that it is important to see both. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that staff can provide a presentation.

D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that staff is in the process of gathering information on technical platforms. She reported that staff is finding that the costs of utilizing some

of these vendors are going up. She stated that we are able to come within budget due to current vacancies and that we are still gathering data to possibly request a mid-year adjustment if more money is needed. She stated that this information has been shared with the City Manager. She also shared information with City Council regarding the new normal. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Ms. Alamo and Ms. McDonald are working together to see which platforms will be used and the cost. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that the presentation did go well and there were compliments received in terms of the outreach that has been taking place with the Recruitment and Outreach Division.

A discussion took place with Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the value of social engagement and target media being important. It was discussed that staff is utilizing social media to spread the word.

Commissioner Arias asked if the Commission will have an opportunity to review the budget before it becomes final. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that staff submitted the proposed budget a couple of weeks ago, which has not been adopted. It was discussed that the proposed budget will be presented to the Commission at the next meeting.

Ms. Pizarro Winting will be providing copies of notes from the last planning meeting and asked Commissioners to think about ideas for the next planning meeting.

Commissioner Gonzalez Edmond asked if the website was finished. Ms. Slaten reported that staff is working with Technology and Innovation regarding the design and the movement of content. She is hopeful to have it finalized within the next 2 to 3 months as it has been difficult getting together due to busy schedules.

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Civil Service needs to restore the staffing levels to previous levels. President Garnica asked if it was reflective in the budget. Ms. Pizarro Winting responded that it was not. She stated that the focus was more on the Long Beach Recovery Act funding which is helping us minimize financial challenges in the coming year.

Commissioner Arias asked if the planning meeting was an agenda meeting. President Garnica stated that it was. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that a calendar invite was sent.

15. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Commissioner Arias asked if there were dates for upcoming hearings. Ms. Pizarro Winting

stated that dates will be placed on the September 1st agenda. Commissioner Arias wanted to confirm that there was no hearing scheduled for August 25th due to the settling of a case but is there a possibility of adding another one. Ms. Camerino responded that the attorneys did not mention anything.

President Garnica asked Ms. Camerino to cancel the meeting invite for the hearing that was settled. Ms. Camerino will send a notification.

16. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business discussed.

17. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION WILL HEAR FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON MATTERS WITHIN THE COMMISSION’S JURISDICTION.

ADJOURNMENT

President Garnica adjourned the meeting at 9:55 a.m.

HEARING 9:30 A.M.

NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។