

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAC1901-03
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
607 West 4th Street
February 23, 2021

Exhibit F

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site, 607 West 4th Street Avenue, is located within the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District, which was established in 1998 (C-7538). The property is currently vacant and enclosed with a chain-link fence.

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), staff has analyzed the proposed project and the project meets these requirements and those of applicable City zoning regulations.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. The site is currently a vacant lot that does not contain any historically significant features. All work will be conducted pursuant to the guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Drake Park/Willmore City Ordinance. The new residence will maintain a 10-foot setback from the front property line with a 20-foot setback to the one-car garage (attached). The structure will be three stories and will have a maximum height of 32 feet to the top of the ridge the roof.

The design and exterior materials of the proposed residence represent an interpretation of the Craftsman architectural style, which is a style that is found in and compatible with the overall context of the district. Although the new residence would be taller than the abutting structures, there are existing two-story contributing structures in the vicinity of the subject site with pitched roof styles compatible with the proposed structure. The property is in the vicinity of a mix of one- and two-story contributing structures and noncontributing infill development that exceeds two-stories in height. This section of West 4th Street in the vicinity of the project site features a variety of architectural styles, including Bungalows, Craftsman, Folk Victorian, and modern infill styles.

Buildings in the Drake Park Willmore City Historic district are of varying heights and closer to the front property line than existing zoning regulations would allow, given that the area was largely developed prior to current zoning regulations. The required front yard setback and garage setback for the proposed project would be consistent with current zoning requirements, which would be larger than the abutting structures.

There are Victorian style buildings with high roof pitches, historic multi-family apartment buildings, and in-fill apartment buildings with multiple floors which have been developed over time in the district. The majority of contributing properties in the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District are one or two stories in height, while some contributing architectural styles do have roof pitch designs that can resemble a third story. The introduction of a new three-story structure would be visible to West 4th Street, but due to its location within a context that includes infill development that exceeds 32 feet in height, the design of the structure would not interrupt the visual continuity or integrity of the District.

Within the block of West 4th Street between Daisy Avenue and Maine Avenue, the properties are visually oriented towards West 4th Street under existing conditions and as such the proposed project is consistent with this orientation. The front yard setback of the proposed structure is larger than, but generally consistent with similarly situated properties on West 4th Street and the applicable zoning requirements. The structures abutting the project site do not have enclosed garages with access to West 4th Street. Due to parking requirements, an enclosed garage and 20-foot driveway is required by the zoning code. The building would be setback 10 feet from the front property line in accordance with zoning requirements. Despite this increased setback, the design of the building includes a cantilevered area of living space over a portion of the driveway to ensure the increased setbacks blend in with the architecture and the continuity of the development pattern is maintained along West 4th Street. Despite constraints with the site dimensions and zoning requirements, the setback of the proposed structure would generally align with this structure and provide a sense of visual continuity.

The introduction of a new three-story structure would be consistent with the pattern of the District as a whole, but would represent a visual change for the subject site. In addition, the new structure would restore the property's visual relationship to the other properties along West 4th Street. While not designed to the same height as the abutting properties, the orientation and interpretation of the Craftsman style in the new residence will visually complement the area without creating a false sense of history.

As the site is vacant, the size, placement, and height of the new residence will not adversely impact any remaining historic character and features of the existing site. Furthermore, the infill development will provide an appropriate design that will be compatible with other properties in the district. Infill development designed to be

sensitive to the historic context at this important downtown-adjacent location within the City is supported by both the adopted plans and zoning regulations applicable to the area, including the historic district ordinance and historic design standards.

The project will meet the development standards for the PD-30 Neighborhood Overlay, including the provision of context-sensitive 3-foot side yard setbacks due to the site's narrowness.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The proposed residence is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- Use – The proposed project is a single-family residence, retaining residential use of the property, consistent with the property's current zoning. The new single-family dwelling would restore a primary use to the vacant property, which would be consistent with the context of the historic district as a whole.

The Downtown Plan (PD-30) includes zoning regulations to encourage multi-family and mixed-use development. The Neighborhood Overlay is established to ensure that primarily residential uses are maintained and commercial uses compatible with small-scale neighborhoods are appropriately permitted and regulated within specific residential areas. The addition of a primary residential unit to the property would be generally consistent with the varied single- and multi-family residential development pattern of this portion of the historic district in the downtown PD-30 area. Therefore, the property (residential) would continue to be used as it was historically (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 1).

- Character – The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses the historic character of a property. Under this standard, the removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided. The site is currently a vacant lot. Therefore, no original building features would be removed.
- Changes to Historic Features – The site is currently a vacant lot. Therefore, no original historic features would be removed. The proposed

improvements would represent a change to the site. The conditions of approval require that the chain-link fencing be removed, consistent with the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District Ordinance, and the new structure is compatible in design. The proposed new construction will incorporate appropriate features and materials for the Craftsman architectural style on all elevations (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 3).

- Historic Significance – The existing site is a vacant lot in the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District. The design of the new three-story residence would be designed in manner and architectural style that is consistent with context of the District as a whole. There are existing two-story, contributing structures in the Historic District and noncontributing infill development that exceed 32-feet in height. Abutting properties (east, west, and north) and nearby properties are one-story structures, while multi-story structures are located across West 4th Street and along Daisy Avenue. The new three-story structure would fit within the context of this portion of the District and would not affect the integrity of the district in the vicinity of subject site along West 4th Street (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 4).
- Distinctive Features – The site is currently a vacant lot and is, consequently, not a contributing property to the district. As it does not contain any historic features, no original distinctive features of the site would be removed. (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 5). The proposed single-family house will provide compatible massing in the design of the new three-story structure as the building will include a gable roof consistent with the Craftsman style found in the vicinity and throughout the district.
- Deteriorated Historic Features – The subject site is a vacant lot. Consequently, there are no deteriorated historic features addressed as part of this proposal. A condition of approval would be included to remove the existing chain-link fence and install appropriate perimeter fencing (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 6).
- Damage to Historic Materials – The subject site is a vacant lot. As such, the proposed project would not include chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 7).
- Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 8).
- Historic Materials that Characterize the Property – The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 addresses the

destruction of historic materials that characterize the property and differentiation of new and old work. While the site is a vacant lot, the proposed structure has been designed to be compatible with the context of the district in style and orientation on a narrow/shallow lot, while also meeting modern zoning code requirements. The spatial relationship of the vacant lot would be modified with the proposed project. The new three-story structure would be setback in accordance with zoning requirements and consistent with the context of the adjacent properties in the District.

The proposed structure is complementary to the existing styles within the District. The improvements would not give a false sense of the property's historical development. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." The proposed single-family dwelling is a modern interpretation of the Craftsman style and has been designed to complement the context of the District, but has also been designed with features such as a deck areas at the front elevation that differentiate the project from a typical Craftsman and provides usable open space that cannot otherwise be accommodated on the small lot. The proposed project will provide a cohesive design in the district on a constrained lot.

- Form and Integrity – The site is a vacant lot. The new structure would not modify any existing structure. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses that additions or new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. The proposed single-family dwelling would be detached, and therefore, would allow for its removal without impairment of the essential form and integrity of any existing structure. As noted above, while, the proposed structure is visible from the public right-of-way, the design, massing, and orientation to West 4th Street would be generally consistent with existing development patterns and compatible with the surrounding context of the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District. The introduction of the new structure would not interrupt the form or integrity of the District.

The proposed single-family residence will have a size, scale, and profile that is compatible with the scale of the District as a whole and has been designed with consideration of the context of the structures adjacent to the subject site and other properties in the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District. The overall scale, size, and design of the residence does not detract from the existing site.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

While the subject property is not a contributing property within the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic District, the District ordinance requires that projects within the district comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. In addition, the District formation Ordinance address the design of infill development:

- a) Construction of the new buildings in the Drake Park/Willmore City Historic Landmark District shall conform to the bulk, massing, scale, setbacks, height, materials, color, and design of the majority of existing historic structures on both sides of the street on the block on which the building is to be erected.

The existing block along West 4th Street features a context of one- and two-story structures and multi-family buildings that are four stories in height. The existing abutting properties to the subject site feature one-story structures with narrow setbacks. The proposed setbacks, while reduced to 3 feet, are consistent with the context of the existing development pattern surrounding the site.

The design of the three-story structure intends to provide articulation on the front elevation to break up the massing of the front elevation. The garage entry is recessed under cantilevered building area, which meets zoning code requirements, while recessed 2nd and 3rd floor deck areas provide plane breaks and recess the 3rd floor building face from the front elevation. The side and rear elevations are constrained by setback requirements to provide step backs along those elevations. The overall height of the 32-foot structure exceeds the context of the surrounding properties but does not represent the only structure along West 4th Street with buildings of that height.

- b) The style of architecture and use of materials shall conform to the predominant style of existing structures on the same block.

The existing block features Bungalows, Folk Victorian, Craftsman, and infill development. The proposed Craftsman-inspired design would be consistent with this context. The Craftsman Design Guidelines were utilized in the inspiration of the proposed structure.

- c) New structures shall be finished on the exterior with materials, colors and architectural details that are consistent with the architectural style predominant on the same block.

As described above and shown on plans, the proposed materials on the new structure shall include materials and design consistent with the Craftsman Design Guidelines. Conditions of approval are included in the application to ensure high-quality and compatible materials are selected and installed.

- d) Driveways and garage entrances shall conform to the existing standard on the same block.

The site does not feature a rear alley for garage access. The property across West 4th Street (600 West 4th Street) is also a single-family residence that takes garage access from West 4th Street. The abutting properties to the side and rear do not have garages or driveways. Therefore, the required garage and driveway access, as proposed, would be consistent with the context on the block for residential uses without alley access.

- e) Existing mature trees should be preserved if feasible.

The vacant site is void of vegetation. No trees will be removed as part of the project.

- f) Fences shall be compatible in materials and style with the architecture of the house. Chain link and unfinished concrete block are not acceptable materials.

As a condition of approval, consistent with this requirement, the existing chain-link fence shall be removed, and new historically appropriate perimeter fencing shall be installed on the side and rear property lines. Any replacement or new fencing on the site shall require approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The proposed project would comply with the design guidance, as the new residence would feature building components inspired by the Craftsman architectural style, which is a style found within the District.

The new structure incorporates several architectural features of the Craftsman style that integrates the proposed structure with the overall District, while also varying the design sufficiently to avoid creating a false sense of history. The structure would feature horizontally oriented siding at all elevations, hung windows, gabled roof, and column porch elements. A condition of approval has been included to ensure the rear bathroom windows are converted to appropriate awning windows. In a modern interpretation of the Craftsman style, the residence will feature a front entry with a minor overhang projection to form a small porch with tapered columns. The roof is designed with a front-facing gable and a cross gable at the midpoint. The front elevation of the third floor would be recessed from the front elevation. This design would be generally consistent with the Craftsman Design Guidelines, while not representing a false sense of history. The building is infill construction and would not remove historic building components.

The scale and massing of the structure would be compatible with the existing structures in the vicinity of the site and throughout the District.