

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAC2007-03
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
2721 E. 3rd Street

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site, 2721 E. 3rd Street, is located within the Bluff Heights Historic District, which was established in 1982 (C-7937). The subject property is located on the north side of 3rd Street, between Molino and Colorado Avenues, within the R-2-A zone (Two-Family Residential, Standard Lot). The subject 4,542-square-foot lot is improved with a 1,972 square foot, two-story residential structure ("Subject Building") built in 1923.

The applicant is requesting to: (1) construct a new two-story residential building consisting of two Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs), each 800 square feet in size, in the front of the lot; (2) convert an existing garage and accessory recreation room into an 800-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) in an existing rear two-story structure; and (3) construct a new 478-square-foot, two-car garage attached to the existing rear structure on a lot located at 2721 E. 3rd Street. The existing two-story residential structure located at the rear of the site is a contributing structure within the Bluff Heights Historic District.

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), staff has analyzed the proposed project and the project meets these requirements and those of applicable City zoning regulations.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The proposed project, as conditioned, will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. All work will be conducted pursuant to the guidelines and recommendations of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines.

Built in 1923, the existing two-story primary residential structure is rectangular in shape, measuring 44 feet in length, 22 feet in width and 20-feet four-inches in height. The building features horizontal wood shiplap siding and a flat roof. The existing residential structure was believed to be built as an accessory structure (garages) for the three apartment buildings to the east which were all constructed

on the same lot in the early 1920s. The lot was later subdivided and resulted in the subject; the existing building is listed as a contributing structure to the historic district, likely due to age of the structure and not its architectural style.

The existing two-story structure consists of two primary residential units located on the second floor and garage and accessory area on the ground floor. The garage and accessory area will be converted into an 800-square foot ADU and a 168 square foot accessory (storage) room. A new 478-square foot, two-car garage will be constructed in the northeast corner of the lot attached to the side of the existing two-story residential structure. The proposed detached residential building will be compatible with the scale and massing of the existing rear structure on the property. The size, placement, and height of the new building will not adversely impact any remaining historic character and features of the existing structure or its status as a contributing structure nor other properties in the district.

The proposed changes to the structure will not affect any significant, historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic features of the subject property. The structure will maintain its original form and, as conditioned, only minimal changes are proposed to windows and doors. The proposed two-car garage, which will be attached to the east side of the structure, will not remove or obscure any historically significant or otherwise prominent building features, given that the building is a simple utilitarian building with little adornment. Additionally, the proposed garage will feature six-inch wide horizontal wood siding, which will match the existing building exterior. The garage is modest in size and the massing and will not diminish the integrity of the existing residential structure.

The proposed new 1,600 square foot two-story residential building has been designed with Craftsman style details and will be detached from the existing residential building. Although, the new two-story building is located directly in front of the existing primary structure it is not expected to diminish the integrity of the existing structure. The proposed two-story building features a simple design and proposes a modest two-story height and is compatible with the architectural styles and character established on the historic property and within the context of the surrounding properties. The new building has been specifically designed to be differentiated it from the original contributing structure on site and, as it is detached from the existing structure, it does not degrade the integrity of the original residence. While not designed in the same architectural style as the existing rear structure, the modern interpretation of the Craftsman style in the new residential building will visually complement the rear structure without creating a false sense of history.

The majority of contributing properties in the Bluff Heights Historic District are one or two stories in height, therefore, the introduction of a new two-story structure would not interrupt the visual continuity or integrity of the District. The front yard setback for the proposed new structure is consistent with those similarly situated properties on 3rd Street and would provide a sense of visual continuity. The introduction of a new two-story structure is consistent with the development pattern

in the vicinity of the subject site and of the District as a whole. In addition, the existing structure was likely accessory to the apartment buildings to the east and the introduction of a new residence would restore the property's visual relationship to the other properties along 3rd Street.

2. (It) will remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There are no active code enforcement cases or dangerous conditions at this site. Thus, this finding is not applicable.

3. (It) will comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The proposed ADUs are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- Use – The proposed project will construct a new two-story residential building consisting of two Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs), each 800 square feet in size, convert an existing garage and accessory area into an 800-square foot ADU and construct a new 478-square-foot, two-car garage. The use of the site will continue to be a multifamily use with the addition of a new residential building and two-car garage.
- Character – The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses the historic character of a property. Under this standard, the removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided. To accommodate the change in use on the ground floor from garage and accessory use to ADU, several changes are proposed to the ground floor elevation of the structure. Several windows will be removed, and the openings will be sealed, and new windows and doors will be installed in new openings and the garage doors will be removed and the openings will be closed entirely in order to accommodate the residential unit. These changes are considered minimal, as the building will retain its original form and no significant historic feature will be lost, due to its simple, utilitarian architecture. The new two-car garage will be located on the east side of the existing building and will feature similar exterior materials, thus will not affect the historic character of the existing structure.

The new two-story residential building will be located at the front of lot, located approximately 15 feet from the front property line and will be visible from the public right-of-way. It will not affect the historic material or features of the existing building as it will be detached, providing an 8-foot separation between structures. As an accessory building originally, the existing structure's architecture is utilitarian and unadorned, and as such, no

significant historic features will be obscured from view with the construction of the proposed structure at the front of the lot. Furthermore, the new structure is designed using the elements of the Craftsman architectural style and will be complementary to the surrounding properties. The existing two-story residential structure is listed as a contributing structure to the Bluff Heights Historic District likely due to the age of the structure rather than its architectural significance. Therefore, the character of the building will not be removed or altered in a way that will diminish its integrity to the District.

- Changes to Historic Features – The proposed improvements would limit changes to historic features on the existing building where only windows and doors will be modified to accommodate the conversion to ADU. The new two-car garage will be located on the east side of the building where the existing garage doors will be removed and sealed. The proposed new construction of the two-car garage will incorporate appropriate features and materials on all elevations (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 3).
- Historic Significance – Due to the utilitarian architecture and the location of the existing two-story residential structure it is believed that this building was constructed as accessory garages to the three apartment buildings located to the east. The existing two-story residential structure is listed as a contributing structure to the Bluff Heights Historic District, likely due to the age rather than architectural significance. The new two-story building is located directly in front of the existing contributing structure and the two-car garage is located on the east side of the structure. However, it features a careful design and modest height that is compatible with the development patterns and character established within the vicinity of the subject site and the district as a whole. There are existing two-story, contributing and non-contributing structures in the Bluff Heights Historic District. Abutting properties (east and south) and nearby properties include two-story structures. The new two-story structure would fit within the context of the District and would not affect the integrity of the district in the vicinity of the properties along 3rd Street. (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 4).
- Distinctive Features – Due to the utilitarian architecture and the location of the existing two-story residential structure, it is believed that this building was constructed as accessory garages to the three apartment buildings located to the east and as such does not contain distinctive features that would be obscured or damaged as a result of the proposed project. The proposed improvements would not change the height or features of the existing rear structure (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 5). The existing roof and building mass and details would remain in place. The new two-story building is located directly in front of the existing structure and the two-car garage is located on the east side of the existing structure. However, it features a careful design and modest height

that is compatible with the character established for the historic property and the context of the surrounding properties.

- Deteriorated Historic Features – There are no deteriorated historic features addressed as part of this proposal. A condition of approval has been added to restore or replace the non-period appropriate windows and doors on the existing rear structure (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 6).
- Damage to Historic Materials – The new addition would not include chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 7).
- Archeological Resources – Any archeological resources found will be protected and preserved. No resources are known (Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 8).
- Historic Materials that Characterize the Property – The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 addresses the destruction of historic materials that characterize the property and differentiation of new and old work. The existing structure is believed to have been built as an accessory structure to the three two story residential apartments to the east due to its location on the property and utilitarian finishes. The existing structure is listed as a contributing resource to the district due to age rather than its architectural significance. The new building would be visible from the public right-of-way, but it features a design and height that is compatible with the character established for the historic property and the context of the surrounding properties. The new two-story structure would be setback in accordance with zoning requirements and consistent with the setback and overall development patterns of the adjacent properties in the District.

The proposed new building has been designed with Craftsman style details which is substantially different from the Folk Victorian architectural style of the existing building. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." and the standards also state that improvements should not give a false sense of the property's historical development. Standard No. 10 states that "New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired." The new building maintains simple design elements of the Craftsman style to complement the district, but it does not replicate true period Craftsman style buildings found in the district. The new building has been specifically designed to differentiate it from the

original structure on the site and, as it is detached from the existing, it does not degrade the integrity of the structure. While the new garage structure is attached to the existing structure, as proposed, the addition of the garage will not remove or obscure any historically significant or otherwise prominent building features, given the building is a simple utilitarian building with little adornment.

- **Form and Integrity** – The new residential structure would not be structurally integrated into the existing structure as it is detached. The new garage will be attached to the side of the existing structure but will not degrade the form or integrity of the structure. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 2 addresses that additions or new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. The new residential structure would be detached from the existing structure, and therefore, would allow for its removal without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the existing structure at the rear. The new two-car garage will be attached to side of the existing building where the existing garage door will be removed and sealed which would allow for its removal without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the existing structure. As noted above, while, the new structure is visible from the public right-of-way, the design, massing, and orientation to 3rd Street would be generally consistent with existing development patterns and compatible with the surrounding context of the Bluff Heights Historic District. The introduction of the new structure would not interrupt the form or integrity of the District.

4. (It) will comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

While the existing building is listed as a contributing building to the Bluff Heights Historic District, the existing structure is believed to have been built as an accessory structure to the three, two story residential apartments to the east due to its location on the property and utilitarian finishes. The existing structure is listed as a contributing resource to the district, likely due to age and not architectural significance. The District ordinance requires that all projects within the district comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. In addition, the Design Guidelines address the design of infill development. The proposed project would comply with the design guidance, as the proposed residential structure would feature building components inspired by the Craftsman architectural style, which is a style commonly found within the District.

The new structure incorporates several architectural features of the Craftsman style that integrates the proposed structure with the overall District, while also deviating from the prescribed design standards to avoid creating a false sense of history. The new building features a front facing gable roof system, horizontal wood siding and double hung sash wood windows. The front elevation features a 16-foot

10-inch wide porch with a matching front facing gable roof system. The porch system is offset and features two square columns. The columns will feature a stucco finished base with wood post. This design would be consistent with the Bluff Heights Historic District Design Guidelines, in that the building is infill construction and would not remove historic building components.

The scale and massing of the new residential structure and two-car garage would be compatible with the existing two-story structure at the rear and other two-story structures that are predominate throughout the District.

While the existing rear structure is minimal in architectural style, it is considered a contributing structure to the District. The construction of the proposed detached residential structure would not remove or damage any remaining character-defining features on the existing building. The proposed style of architecture, use of materials, and exterior finishes are not uncharacteristically different from the predominant style of the immediate surroundings. With the project as proposed, the original character of the existing structure would remain intact.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAC2007-03
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL
2721 E. 3rd Street

1. This approval is for (1) the construction of a new two-story residential building consisting of two Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs), each 800 square feet in size, in the front of the lot; (2) the conversion of an existing garage and accessory recreation room into an 800-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) in an existing rear two-story structure; and (3) the construction of a new 478-square-foot, two-car garage attached to the existing rear structure on a lot located at 2721 E. 3rd Street. The existing two-story residential structure located at the rear of the site is a contributing structure within the Bluff Heights Historic District. (District 2)
2. The improvements to the property shall be as shown on plans received by the Department of Development Services – Planning Bureau submitted on 09/15/20, as amended by the conditions of approval. These plans are on file in this office, except as amended herein.
3. The project must be completed per the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission, including all conditions listed herein. Any subsequent changes to the project must be approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission or by Planning Bureau staff before implementation. Upon completion of the project, a staff inspection must be requested by the Applicant to ensure that the proposed project has been constructed in accordance with approved plans and in compliance with all conditions before occupancy hold can be released.
4. There is a ten calendar-day appeal period that will lapse at 4:30 p.m., ten calendar days after the action by the Cultural Heritage Commission is made. Appeal of the Commission's action will not be accepted after this time. A separate fee will apply to appeal an action taken by the Cultural Heritage Commission.
5. This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in full force and effect from and after the date of the rendering of the decision by the Cultural Heritage Commission. Pursuant to the Cultural Heritage Commission Ordinance Section 2.63.080(I), this approval shall expire within three years if the authorized work has not commenced. Should the applicant be unable to comply with this restriction, an extension may be granted pursuant to Section 2.63.080(I) for an additional 12 months maximum. The applicant must request such an extension prior to expiration of this Certificate of Appropriateness. After that time, the applicant will be required to return to the Cultural Heritage Commission for approval. In addition, this Certificate of Appropriateness shall expire if the authorized work is suspended for a 180-day period after being commenced.
6. All required building permits shall be obtained by the applicant, as needed. Building permits must be obtained prior to the implementation of any construction or rehabilitation work. Separate plan check and permit fees will apply.

7. All conditions of approval must be printed verbatim on all plans submitted for plan review to the Department of Development Services. These conditions must be printed on the site plan or a subsequent reference page.
8. On the west elevation of the existing contributing building, the proposed new door openings from each of the new bedrooms shall be eliminated and the two doors leading to the new storage room shall be reduced to one door.
9. The front walkway shall consist of Portland cement concrete.
10. All perimeter fencing shall consist of vertically oriented wood plank fencing and otherwise comply with fence height requirements of the City's Zoning Code.
11. All utility apparatuses shall be fully screened from view from adjacent public rights-of-way. Such apparatuses include but are not limited to rain barrels, air conditioning units, utility meters and electrical panels. The applicant shall work with Planning Bureau staff on the final design of utility screening and /or enclosures.
12. All windows on the new two-story building consisting of two ADUs shall to be constructed of wood. To ensure the proposed windows are of high quality and non-reflective materials, the window manufacturer specifications and samples shall be submitted to the Planning Bureau staff prior to the issuance of building permits. Vinyl windows are not permitted as a building material.
13. The three ground floor windows located on the rear elevation of the existing building shall remain as is or shall be removed and the openings shall be closed, as required by building code regulations. The replacement of the windows with glass blocks, as shown on plans, shall be prohibited.
14. The applicant shall conduct an assessment of the existing windows and doors on the rear contributing structure and replace any non-period-appropriate windows and doors with historically appropriate windows and doors, in order to bring the existing structure into conformance with the historic district guidelines, prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for the new primary residence. To ensure the proposed windows are of high quality and non-reflective materials, the window manufacturer specifications and samples shall be submitted to the Planning Bureau staff prior to the issuance of building permits. Vinyl windows are not permitted as a building material.
15. The existing two-story structure at the rear and the proposed attached garage shall be painted with a compatible color palette, in accordance with the Bluff Heights Historic District Guidelines. The applicant shall obtain a certificate of appropriateness to paint the exterior of the existing rear structure and new garage prior to plan check approval. No Certificate of Occupancy for the proposed project may be issued until a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint is approved by the Planning Bureau.

16. The applicant shall obtain a separate Certificate of Appropriateness for any additional proposed exterior changes.
17. Any proposed changes to the plans approved by the Cultural Heritage Commission and staff will need to be reviewed and approved by the Director of Development Services or their designee prior to implementation. Significant changes to the project's design will require review and approval by the Cultural Heritage Commission before permits are issued by the Department of Development Services.
18. A building inspection must be completed by Planning Bureau staff to verify compliance with the plans approved by Cultural Heritage Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy from the Building Bureau.
19. All proposed landscaping shall be subject to Chapter 21.42 of the Zoning Code.
20. A roof sample and specifications shall be submitted to the Planning Bureau staff prior to the issuance of building permits.
21. As a condition of any City approval, the applicant shall defend, indemnify and hold harmless the City and its agents, officers and employees from any claim, action or proceeding against the City or its agents, officers or employees to attack, set aside, void or annul the approval of the City concerning the processing of the proposal/entitlement or any action relating to, or arising out of, such approval. At the discretion of the City and with the approval of the City Attorney, a deposit of funds by the applicant may be required in an amount sufficient to cover the anticipated litigation costs.