

**CITY OF LONG BEACH  
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**WEDNESDAY, MAY 20, 2020  
TELECONFERENCE, 8:30 AM**

Susana Gonzalez Edmond, President  
Heather Morrison, Vice President



Phyllis O. Arias, Commissioner  
Brandon Dowling, Commissioner  
Joel Garnica, Commissioner

Christina Pizarro Winting, Executive Director

---

**FINISHED AGENDA AND DRAFT MINUTES**

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETINGS ARE HELD VIA  
TELECONFERENCE PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20  
ISSUED BY GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM.**

**THE CIVIC CHAMBERS WILL BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC.**

**FLAG SALUTE**

President Gonzalez Edmond asked Commissioner Arias to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

**Commissioners** Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joel Garnica, Heather  
**Present:** Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

- 1. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC WILL HAVE THE OPTION TO USE eCOMMENT TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION. WRITTEN COMMENTS MAY ALSO BE SUBMITTED VIA EMAIL TO CIVILSERVICE@LONGBEACH.GOV.**

There were no public comments.

- 2. [20-125CS](#) Recommendation to approve minutes:  
Regular Meeting of May 6, 2020**

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by  
Commissioner Garnica, to approve recommendation. The  
motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**CONSENT CALENDAR (3 – 6):**

Passed the Consent Calendar

**A motion was made by Vice President Morrison, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to approve Consent Calendar Items (3 - 6). The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**3. [20-126CS](#)**

**Recommendation to approve examination results:**

*Business Systems Specialist Test #19 (Established 05/14/20)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**4. [20-127CS](#)**

**Recommendation to receive and file retirement(s):**

*Andrew Busch, Fire Engineer, Fire Department (22 yrs., 9 mos.)*

*Brian Hintz, Gas Maintenance Supervisor II, Energy Resources (24 yrs., 10 days)*

*Amanda Johnson, Accountant III, Airport (10 yrs., 11 mos.)*

*Gretchen Monroe, Accountant III, Financial Management (20 yrs., 9 mos.)*

*Cathy Pingol, Senior Accountant, Financial Management (24 yrs., 5 mos.)*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**5. [20-128CS](#)**

**Recommendation to receive and file resignation(s):**

*Jamie Coba, Clerk Typist III, Fire Department (3 yrs., 6 mos.)*

*Nathan Zirges, Special Services Officer III, Police Department (2*

yrs., 1 mo.)

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

6. [20-129CS](#)

**Recommendation for Permanent Assignment to Former Classification** - Jason Ferguson, Construction Inspector  
*Communication from Russ Ficker, Personnel Officer, Public Works Department*  
*Staff report prepared by Shellie Goings, Personnel Analyst*

**A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.**

**REGULAR AGENDA**

7. [20-130CS](#)

**RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE STANDING COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS: EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION COMMITTEE AND SPECIAL PROJECTS COMMITTEE**

President Gonzalez Edmond informed the Commission that the creation and structure of the standing committees were approved at its last meeting. She stated that as part of the structure that was approved, the President and Vice President were designated as members of the Executive Committee and that appointments are needed for the Special Projects and Recruitment and Selection Committees. She also reminded the Commission that one Commissioner would need to sit on two committees. President Gonzalez Edmond advised the Commission that the standing committees would only meet when there are issues to discuss.

President Gonzalez Edmond and Commissioner Arias provided a brief overview regarding the subcommittee that reviewed protests of examination items as requested by Commissioner Dowling.

It was discussed that the Commission has one ad hoc subcommittee (Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service)

and one subcommittee (Subcommittee to Review and Make Recommendations on Protests of Examination Items) remaining. It was discussed that the ad hoc subcommittee concluded its work and now the Commission is waiting for bargaining units to review the policy.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond and Commissioner Arias on why the ad hoc committee was established.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Arias, Commissioner Garnica and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding the Recruitment and Selection Committee. It was discussed that previous ad hoc subcommittee items would have fallen under this committee. It was discussed that the Executive Committee will manage administrative and procedural side of things and the policy component of things will be housed in either Recruitment and Selection or Special Projects Committees. If it is a policy related to recruitments, then it should fall in the Recruitment and Selection Committee. It was discussed that at one point, every Commissioner will have the opportunity to sit on the Recruitment and Selection Committee.

It was discussed that the duties of the only outstanding subcommittee (Review and Make Recommendations on Protests of Examination Items) would be rolled into the Recruitment and Selection standing committee. It was also discussed that Commissioners will be relieved of their duties from previous subcommittees and new appointments will be made. This information was confirmed by Mr. Anderson.

A discussion took place regarding having the standing committee names reflect the names of the current divisions. It was decided to move forward with the names as they are presented, and if there is a need to change them, the Commission could make modifications later.

Commissioners Garnica and Arias were nominated for the Special Projects Committee, Commissioner Dowling and Vice President Morrison were nominated for the Recruitment and Selection Committee and President Gonzalez Edmond and Vice President Morrison were designated for the Executive Committee per the structure that was approved. It was discussed that since the committees are not on a set schedule, meeting times and dates can be decided based on the members' availabilities.

**A motion was made by Commissioner Dowling, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to appoint Commissioners Arias and Garnica to the Special Projects Committee. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**A motion was made by Commissioner Garnica, seconded by Commissioner Dowling, to appoint President Gonzalez Edmond and Vice President Morrison to the Executive Committee. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

**A motion was made by Commissioner Arias, seconded by Commissioner Garnica, to appoint Vice President Morrison and Commissioner Dowling to the Recruitment and Selection Committee. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 5 - Phyllis O. Arias, Brandon Dowling, Joen Garnica, Heather Morrison and Susana Gonzalez Edmond

## **8. REPORTS FROM MANAGERS**

### *A. Recruitment Division - Crystal Slaten*

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported on information regarding the Fire and Police academies that was presented at City Council. The current budget recommendation is to postpone the academies until next fiscal year; however, due to the extensive recruitment that was conducted to create the diverse applicant pool that was tested, the Fire Department is hoping to proceed with its academy as scheduled. Another reason for postponing the academies is the thought of bringing recruit candidates together during this pandemic could be problematic. The Los Angeles Police Department had several recruit candidates in their academy test positive for COVID-19.

A brief discussion ensued with Commissioner Dowling and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding losing top recruit candidates to outside agencies. It was also discussed that the eligible list will remain active so that if the Fire Department's academy is

postponed, they will have an opportunity to use the list.

Ms. McDonald added that one of the strategies that she is looking to implement is the polling of lists which falls under the Civil Service rules. Civil Service will do its part to periodically reach out to candidates to see how many remain interested in being referred.

A brief discussion ensued with Commissioner Garnica and Ms. Pizarro Winting regarding succession planning. The Fire Department believes there will be vacancies due to retirements, which could be another reason for them to not postpone the academy. It was discussed that the proposed postponement of the academies is primarily due to budget reasons.

Ms. Pizarro Winting informed the Commission that Ms. Cano has taken over the responsibility of producing the weekly Current and Upcoming Employment Opportunities and is doing a great job. She is also meeting with subject matter experts to evaluate recruitment sources and has been added to the Health Department recruitment team to assist staff with meeting COVID-19 emergency needs.

*B. Employment Services Division - Caprice McDonald*

Ms. McDonald is glad to have Ms. Cano assist with the Health Department recruitments. It will be a big help to Employment Services. Staff is continuing with forecasting meetings, which are moving along smoothly. These meetings assist staff in identifying the examinations that are a high priority and most critical for departments.

*C. Administration Support Services - Maria Alamo*

Ms. Alamo provided the Commission with a budget update. She provided the Commission with a list of deadlines related to budget for fiscal year 2021 as well as deadlines for closing fiscal year 2020. Ms. Alamo mentioned, staff has been looking at potential Civil Service cuts for budget savings and looks forward to meeting with the Executive Committee to share the information.

*D. Executive Director - Christina Pizarro Winting*

Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that she could not do her job without Ms. McDonald and Ms. Alamo. They both work hard in their respective areas and their subject matter expertise is a tremendous asset to the department.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she attended the Budget Workshop at City Council and explained how the City Manager plans to use a 4-prong approach to manage the

challenges and shortfalls of the coming fiscal year. The City will be looking for new or reallocated revenues. The City will explore efficiencies, innovation and new ways of doing business. The City plans to work with employee groups to identify contributions and savings that could assist in reducing layoffs and service cuts. The City intends to make reduction decisions with the City's core services, values and desired outcomes in mind.

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that the city is currently in a hiring freeze. She and Ms. McDonald recently met with Human Resources, and they confirmed that any previously approved examinations will move forward. Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that any new examinations will be evaluated using a Hiring Freeze Form through the requisition process. Although non-City Manager departments are not obligated to abide with the freeze, the City Manager has asked that they consider it. Ms. Pizarro Winting mentioned that there is plenty of work to be completed.

Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Civil Service is contributing almost 20% of staff to the COVID-19 effort. She was able to meet with Ms. Slaten and Ms. Ramos at the Emergency Operations Center to connect with them and let them know that they are still a part of the Civil Service team. Ms. Slaten is using her skills as the Director of Volunteers to manage a new grant process that connects local restaurants with older adults in the community who qualify for a free home meal delivery service. It will also provide essential economic stimulus to local eateries during COVID-19. Ms. Slaten created the Request for Proposal process and will work with a team to identify restaurants and match them with volunteers in her database to provide the free delivery. This is a critical service to the community and we are happy that Ms. Slaten can take the skills developed at Civil Service and apply them at the Emergency Operations Center during this pandemic. Ms. Ramos is using her recruitment and staffing skills to get several shelters operational. Shelters are used for individuals who are experiencing homelessness. Due to the second food program beginning, Ms. Macias has been spending time live scanning volunteers. Ms. Camerino has been assisting Financial Management with purchasing cards. Ms. Pizarro Winting wanted to update the Commission on how members of the Civil Service team are contributing to the COVID-19 efforts.

President Gonzalez Edmond wanted to know if Ms. Slaten was the lead in the meal distribution for senior adults and if Ms. Ramos is the lead for the shelters. Ms. Pizarro Winting confirmed that they were. Ms. Pizarro Winting commented that the National Guard is leaving at the end of May. Human Resources will be assisting Ms. Ramos to find staff to work the shelters. President Gonzalez Edmond thanked Ms. Slaten, Ms. Ramos, Ms. Macias and Ms. Camerino for their work.

Commissioner Garnica commented that it is incredible to hear the things that the

department is doing, and the talent in the department and how it is helping us citywide with the pandemic. She is beyond proud of everyone who works in the department and all of the work they are doing whether it is with new tasks related to the pandemic or holding down the fort and wearing multiple hats.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if Ms. Ramos' position was backfilled at the Health Department. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that it had not been, which is why they rely heavily on her. Commissioner Arias wanted to know if they are trying to fill the position. Ms. Pizarro Winting believes they are trying to, but it is an unclassified position and Civil Service is not a part of the process.

Vice President Morrison commented that she is proud of staff and that they are awesome.

## 9. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Ad Hoc Subcommittees:

*A. Subcommittee to Develop Civil Service Commission Policy regarding requests to Utilize Classified Positions in the Unclassified Service*

Ms. Pizarro Winting reported that she has a meeting scheduled this afternoon with Human Resources and IAM regarding the policy. Since there have been several examples of the need to use this during COVID-19, she is hopeful that she can provide more realistic answers to any questions the union may have regarding the policy and timelines. Staff will also be tracking requests to ensure departments stay within the timeline that they were given.

Commissioner Arias wanted to know if the policy stipulates a timeframe. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that the policy states that the Commission will define a timeframe.

## 10. NEW BUSINESS

Vice President Morrison wanted to know if we were going to begin hearings in June or was it going to be revisited in June. Ms. Pizarro Winting stated that Mr. Peters has reached out to Ms. Camerino. We will provide the Commission with an update as soon as we receive information.

A discussion ensued with President Gonzalez Edmond, Commissioner Garnica, Ms. Pizarro Winting and Mr. Anderson regarding moving forward in times of the pandemic and what it would look like for the next four weeks. It was discussed that the attorneys are hesitant to meet if they are not in person hearings. It was discussed that the Executive Committee will discuss the phases of reconvening, which will be guided by



the Health Department. The City has developed a committee that is discussing returning to work procedures while keeping safety in mind. More information will be provided as it is received.

It was discussed that an Executive Committee would be scheduled soon.

President Gonzalez Edmond thanked everyone for the appointments. She appreciates the thoughts and comments of all the Commissioners. She is blessed to have such a great group of people to work with and such amazing staff. She thanked Mr. Anderson for putting up with her questions and appreciates him as well.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

President Gonzalez Edmond adjourned the meeting at 9:49 a.m.

### **NO HEARING**

---

**NOTE:**

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបរាវ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ  
អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ  
ការិយាល័យស្មៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង  
ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណៈកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។