

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
COAS1905-35
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS
1215 E. Hellman Street

ANALYSIS:

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards):

The subject site, 1215 E. Hellman Avenue, is located on the north side of Hellman Avenue between Orange and Walnut Avenues. The site is located within the R-2-N (Two-Family Residential District with Normal Lots) zoning district and is improved with a single-family residence. According to building permits the property is developed with a house and garage. Constructed in 1910, the house maintains the massing, orientation, and design of its original construction and is a contributing structure to the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District (Ordinance C-7051).

The applicant has requested the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a 6'-6" tall vinyl fence located along the rear property line of the property ("Proposed Project"). The approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness is subject to compliance with Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District Ordinance, The Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards).

In compliance with Section 2.63.080 of the City of Long Beach Municipal Code (Cultural Heritage Commission), the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (the Standards), and the Hellman Street Craftsman Design Guidelines, staff has analyzed the proposed project and found the project does not meet these requirements; therefore, it is appropriate to deny the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

FINDINGS: (from Section 2.63.080(D) of the Long Beach Municipal Code)

- 1. (It) will adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural or aesthetic feature of the Landmark or subject property within the Landmark District and that issuance of the certificate of appropriateness is consistent with the spirit and intent of this chapter.**

The subject property is a contributing structure within the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District. The Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District ordinance identifies replacement fencing material as wood, wrought iron, stucco or masonry and outright prohibits the use of chain line fencing. The ordinance does not address the use of vinyl as replacement materials. The

ordinance states that “the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation Historic Buildings...shall serve as standards and guidelines for future exterior changes to improvements in the district.” Standards number 6 state, “deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials...” The proposed project, the installation of a 6’-6” tall vinyl fence, is not a compatible material and would negatively affect significant historical, cultural, architectural and aesthetic features of the subject property. The original fencing material within the district would have been wood and therefore the appropriate replacement material should be wood. Replacement with substitute materials is an aesthetic and architectural alteration that is not in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. The Hellman Street Craftsman Historic District Design Guidelines state “appropriate rear fencing materials include vertical wood planks, dog eared fencing, board and batten fencing, or other vertically-oriented wood fencing. The use of prefabricated materials like concrete block, vinyl and chain link are not permitted: these materials often appear temporary and are rarely visually compatible with historic styles.” Vinyl fencing material is not considered compatible with the year of construction of the building or period of significance for the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District nor consistent with the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic District Design Guidelines.

2. (It) will not remedy any condition determined to be immediately dangerous or unsafe by the Fire Marshal and/or Building Official.

There is an active code enforcement case at this site. The existing wood fence is significantly deteriorated and has been deemed unsafe.

3. (It) will not comply with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines for Preservation, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.

The Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District ordinance does not address the use of vinyl as replacement materials. The ordinance states that “the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitation Historic Buildings...shall serve as standards and guidelines for future exterior changes to improvements in the district.” Standards number 6 state, “deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials...” The proposed project, the installation of a 6’-6” tall vinyl fence, is not a compatible material nor in conformance with the standards and would negatively affect significant historical, cultural, architectural and aesthetic features of the subject property. The original fencing material within the district

1215 E. Hellman Street
COAS1905-35
August 12, 2019

would have been wood. Replacement with substitute materials is an aesthetic and architectural alteration that is not in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

4. (It) will not comply with the Design Guidelines for Landmark Districts, for a property located within a Landmark District.

The subject property is a contributing structure within the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District. The Hellman Street Craftsman Historic District Design Guidelines state "appropriate rear fencing materials include vertical wood planks, dog eared fencing, board and batten fencing, or other vertically-oriented wood fencing. The use of prefabricated materials like concrete block, vinyl and chain link are not permitted: these materials often appear temporary and are rarely visually compatible with historic styles." Vinyl fencing is not considered compatible with the year of construction of the building or period of significance for the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic Landmark District nor consistent with the Hellman Street Craftsman Historic District Design Guidelines. The original fencing material within the district would have been wood and replacement material should be wood. Replacement with substitute materials is an aesthetic and architectural alteration that is not in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.