



CITY OF LONG BEACH

DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

333 West Ocean Boulevard, 5th Floor • Long Beach, CA 90801 • (562) 570-6194 • Fax (562) 570-6068

January 8, 2018

CHAIR AND CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSIONERS

City of Long Beach
California

RECOMMENDATION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness request for demolition of an existing one-car garage and construction of a new detached 668-square-foot, three-car garage with a 567-square-foot second floor Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) on a property with an existing one-story single-family residence located at 535 Orizaba Avenue. The existing front home on the site (not a part of this action) is a contributing property within the Rose Park South Historic District.

APPLICANT: Jason Herriven
950 North Kings Road
West Hollywood, CA 90069
(Application No. HP17-576)

THE REQUEST

The applicant requests approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow demolition of an existing one-car garage and construction of a new detached 668-square-foot, three-car garage with a 567-square-foot second floor Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU).

BACKGROUND

On December 11, 2017, this Certificate of Appropriateness request was presented to the Cultural Heritage Commission (CHC) for consideration. A motion was made and the CHC voted to continue this item to a future hearing date to allow the applicant to address the massing of the rear structure.

The subject property is located on the west side of Orizaba Avenue between East 6th Street to the north and East 5th Street to the south (Exhibit A – Location Map). The site is located within the R-2-N Zoning District (Two Family Residential District) and is currently developed with one single-family residence with a detached one-car garage. While the R-2-N Zoning District allows for a maximum of two residential units on lots over 6,000 square feet, the lot size of the subject site is 4,500 square feet and would not allow for a second dwelling unit. The proposed project includes the construction of an ADU, which is allowed in a residential zoning district when the site is developed with

only one single-family dwelling. The ADU and garage will be required to adhere to the development standards of the R-2-N Zoning District and California Government Code Section 65852.2 pertaining to ADUs (which became effective January 1, 2017).

Based on City records, the original primary residence consists of a 1,016-square-foot one-story residence with a detached one-car garage built in 1939. The property is a contributing structure within the Rose Park South Historic District.

The existing primary residence is the Altered Bungalow architectural style. The house has a gable roof, composition shingles, and lace-patterned stucco exterior. The building has been modified from its historic style. A City building permit was issued in 2003 to complete work started on a pre-existing permit, which included placing stucco over wood, modification to windows, upgrading electrical, and rewiring the electrical in the home. The historic windows have been replaced with non-period appropriate windows and stucco trim and window ledges were placed around the replaced windows.

The design of the rear ADU is slightly differentiated from the front residence given the massing of the structure and incorporation fascia trim (Exhibit B – Plans, Renderings & Photographs). The proposed ADU will include double hung wood windows at a similar size to the window openings on the existing residence.

ANALYSIS

The proposed project requires approval of the CHC because the size of the new garage and ADU exceeds 250 square feet. To be granted approval, the project must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Staff and a CHC subcommittee, Chair Burks and Vice Chair Highberger, met with the applicant on December 18, 2017 to review options for addressing the CHC's concerns about the massing and design of the proposed structure. The subcommittee discussed the applicant's proposed revisions to the height, massing, design, and materials of the proposed garage and ADU. They further reviewed the scope of modifications to the primary residence, including installation of wood windows, smooth stucco, hardie plank siding. The extent of the proposed hardie plank siding was discussed within the context of the architectural style of the primary structure, as well as the context of the adjacent properties. In addition, the subcommittee discussed the preservation of the existing octagon window on the façade of the primary residence. As conditioned, the octagon window will remain in place and the window will be replaced with a wood window of the same size and shape. The revised plans and renderings (Exhibit B – Plans, Renderings & Photographs) reflect the proposed modifications to the design of the new garage and ADU, in addition to the modifications to the primary residence included in the conditions of approval.

The proposed two-story structure will be located in the rear half of the lot and will stand alone from the existing single-family residence (Exhibit B – Plans, Renderings & Photographs). The proposed three-car garage will be 668-square-feet in size. As a

result of the modifications to the design and massing of the proposed rear structure, the revised plans reflect that the ADU will be 567-square-feet in area. The second floor ADU will be accessed by exterior stairs along the north property line and will consist of one bedroom, one bathroom, an open kitchen/living room, and a covered entry. The proposed garage will take access from the Orizaba Avenue via a concrete ribbon driveway similar to existing conditions. As part of the project, the concrete ribbon driveway will be extended approximately 13 feet to a new wood gate that would extend across the driveway. Permeable pavers will be placed in the driveway area behind the proposed gate and would not be visible from the public right-of way.

As a condition of approval, the applicant will be required to replace the existing non-period appropriate stucco on the primary residence with new smooth stucco. New hardie plank lap siding shall also be placed on the façade of the primary structure. The new hardie plank siding will wrap the front (east) elevation and continue along the side (north and south) elevations. The exterior design of the garage and ADU will be consistent with the new materials to be installed on the primary residence, and include smooth stucco, hardie plank siding, a gable roof system, composition roof shingles, and wood double-hung windows.

The new garage and ADU will be consistent with the development standards for the R-2-N zone and California Government Code Section 65852.2 pertaining to ADUs. The new structure will be set back 72 feet from the front property line and will maintain a 21-foot separation distance between the existing primary residence. The second floor ADU would be setback 5-feet from the side and rear property lines. The garage will maintain space for two standard parking spaces and one compact parking space.

As designed, the proposed two-story structure will have visual impacts when viewed from the front of the street along Orizaba Avenue. The overall height of the existing primary residence is approximately 15-feet-6 inches measured from top of curb to the top ridge of the existing roof. The proposed garage and second floor ADU has been reduced in height from the previous design presented to the CHC on December 11, 2017 and will have an overall height of 22-feet 0-½-inches measured from top of curb to the top of ridge of the new roof.

With regard to scale, the proposal will alter the existing scale and massing established for the property. The scale and context of the adjacent properties varies in structure height and style. The properties to the north and west (rear) of the subject site feature two-story structures, while the property to the south is a one-story single-family residence. The property to the rear (west) is a two-story multi-family structure that spans the entire width of the subject site. The property to the north of the subject site is a two-story single-family residence with a flat roof. The property to the south is a one-story single-family residence at a similar scale to the existing primary residence on the subject site.

While the second floor of the proposed ADU would be visible above the ridgeline of the existing residence, the design would provide relief considering the context of the adjacent properties. The proposed garage would be 1-foot-9-inches from the south side

property line and the second floor ADU would be setback 5-feet from the south property line. This step back of the second floor ADU would reduce the massing of the structure adjacent to the one-story structure south of the subject property. The massing of the new garage and ADU will be oriented toward the existing adjacent two-story structure to the north, which would provide a contextual transition. In addition, the design of the ADU has been modified from the previous design presented to the CHC on December 11, 2017 and will have a single dormer. The dormer will be directly behind the existing porch of the primary structure and provide a symmetrical roof pitch when viewed from Orizaba Avenue. The new structure would complement the roofline of the primary residence and provide relief from the flat roof structures to the north and west (rear). The new garage and ADU will be in full compliance with the City's residential development standards and the zoning regulations applicable for this property.

Several architectural features are incorporated into the building design to integrate the proposed garage and ADU with the existing structure, including the similar roof slope established on the existing primary residence, same composition shingle roof. As conditioned, the primary residence will have similar smooth stucco siding, hardie plank siding, and wood double-hung windows. The design of the ADU has been modified from the previous design presented to the CHC on December 11, 2017 and will have a fascia trim, rather than the exposed rafter tails that were previously proposed.

The primary window style throughout the existing residence is single-hung non-period appropriate windows. As conditioned, all exiting non-period appropriate windows in the primary residence will be replaced with wood double-hung windows. In the new ADU, all new proposed windows will be wood double-hung windows with a similar size to complement the new windows on the primary residence. The proposed three-car garage will have two flat panel wood roll-up garage doors. Staff has included a Condition of Approval to allow the applicant to continue to work with staff on the final selection of the garage door.

While the new improvements represent a change from existing conditions, they are generally compatible with the existing residence's Altered Bungalow architectural style. The improvements should not give a false sense of the property's historical development. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Standard No. 9 states that "new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features..." Because the primary residence has been altered from its historic style and materials, the new garage and ADU will not include historic style, materials, and treatments that give the new structure a sense of false history. The conditions of approval include modifications to the primary residence in order to provide a cohesive design between the proposed ADU and the existing structure. Materials that have since been altered from the primary residence, such as wood siding, have been incorporated back into the design of the primary residence to provide for a cohesive design for the structures on the subject property and along Orizaba Avenue. The new structure will be utilizing a different fascia trim to the original trim on the primary residence.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff has analyzed the proposed project and has determined that the project meets the requirements set forth in Title 21 of the City's Zoning Code, Government Code Section 65852.2, Section 2.63.080 (Cultural Heritage Commission) of the Long Beach Municipal Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Rose Park South Historic District Ordinance. With conditions, Staff supports approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of an existing one-car garage and construction of a new detached 668-square-foot, three-car garage with a 567-square-foot second floor ADU. All the findings can be made in the affirmative for the proposed improvements, as these improvements are compatible in overall scale, massing, proportions, materials and colors to the architectural style of the existing structure on the property and in the context of the District. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the conditions of approval (Exhibit C – Findings and Conditions of Approval).

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

In accordance with Section 15301(e), Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), environmental review is not required for construction of small additions to single-family residences.

PUBLIC HEARING NOTICE

Public notices were distributed on November 21, 2017. As of this date, three letters were received in response to this project.

Respectfully submitted,



CHRISTOPHER KOONTZ, AICP
ADVANCE PLANNING OFFICER



LINDA F. TATUM, AICP
PLANNING BUREAU MANAGER

LFT:CK:mc

Attachments: Exhibit A – Location Map
Exhibit B – Plans, Renderings & Photographs
Exhibit C – Findings & Conditions of Approval